

THE  
**BULLETIN**  
OF  
**SYMBOLIC LOGIC**

EDITED BY

RICHARD A. SHORE, Managing Editor

ANDREAS R. BLASS     JOHN P. BURGESS     ALEXANDER S. KECHRIS  
H. DUGALD MACPHERSON     PHILIP J. SCOTT

VOLUME 5 · NUMBER 2 · JUNE 1999  
ISSN 1079-8986

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

*Copyright ©1999 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

New directions in descriptive set theory, by ALEXANDER S. KECHRIS .....	161
Tarski's system of geometry, by ALFRED TARSKI and STEVEN GIVANT .....	175

### COMMUNICATIONS

The logic of bunched implications, by PETER W. O'HEARN and DAVID J. PYM .....	215
Church's problem revisited, by ORNA KUPFERMAN and MOSHE Y. VARDI .....	245
Gap forcing: Generalizing the Lévy-Solovay theorem, by JOEL DAVID HAMKINS .....	264

---

1998–1999 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Antonio, Texas, January 15–16, 1999 .....	273
Notices .....	284

---

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN 1079-8986) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. at 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820-6903, USA. Second class postage is paid at Champaign, IL and additional offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC; the 1999 annual subscription price for the two journals is \$340. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic, Journals Division UIP, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820-6903, USA*. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, C. Ward Henson (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN and the JOURNAL are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in symbolic logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, philosophers, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field.

The BULLETIN invites submission of *Articles* and *Communications*. *Articles* should be expository or survey papers of broad interest that are accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may deal with any areas of logic including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. *Communications* should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final versions.

*Continued on inside back cover*

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1    04 03 02 01 00 99

THE  
**BULLETIN**  
OF  
**SYMBOLIC LOGIC**

EDITED BY

RICHARD A. SHORE, Managing Editor  
ANDREAS R. BLASS      JOHN P. BURGESS      ALEXANDER S. KECHRIS  
H. DUGALD MACPHERSON      PHILIP J. SCOTT

VOLUME 5  
1999

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

The four numbers of Volume 5 were issued at the following dates:

- Number 1, pages 1–160, April 20, 1999
- Number 2, pages 161–288, June 17, 1999
- Number 3, pages 289–432, October 14, 1999
- Number 4, pages 433–584, December 15, 1999

Numbers 1–4 of this volume are copyrighted ©1999 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the BULLETIN by photostat, photoprint, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission, to be obtained from the Secretary of the Association, C. Ward Henson, Department of Mathematics, University of Illinois, 1409 W. Green St., Urbana, IL 61801.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.

This BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U. S. Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME 5

### ARTICLES

KECHRIS, ALEXANDER S. New directions in descriptive set theory .....	161
MANCOSU, PAOLO. Between Russell and Hilbert: Behmann on the foundations of mathematics .....	303
PECKHAUS, VOLKER. 19th century logic between philosophy and mathematics	433
RUSSINOFF, SUSAN I. The syllogism's final solution .....	451
SIEG, WILFRIED. Hilbert's programs: 1917–1922 .....	1
TARSKI, ALFRED, and GIVANT, STEVEN. Tarski's system of geometry .....	175
UZQUIANO, GABRIEL. Models of second-order Zermelo set theory .....	289
ZACH, RICHARD. Completeness before Post: Bernays, Hilbert, and the devel- opment of propositional logic .....	331

### COMMUNICATIONS

HAMKINS, JOEL DAVID. Gap forcing: Generalizing the Lévy-Solovay theorem	264
KUPFERMAN, ORNA, and VARDI, MOSHE Y. Church's problem revisited .....	245
O'HEARN, PETER W., and PYM, DAVID J. The logic of bunched implications ..	215
SOLOMON, REED. Ordered groups: a case study in reverse mathematics .....	45
WAINER, STANLEY S. Accessible recursive functions .....	367
ZAPLETAL, JINDŘICH. Terminal notions .....	470

### IN MEMORIAM

Dragalin, Albert G. By S. Artemov, B. Kushner, G. Mints, E. Nogina and A. Troelstra .....	389
Goodman, Nelson. By Joseph S. Ullian .....	392

### MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION

1998 European Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Prague, Czech Republic, August 9–15, 1998 .....	59
1998–1999 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Antonio, Texas, January 15–16, 1999 .....	273
1998–1999 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Diego, California, March 20–23, 1999 .....	395
1999 Spring Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, New Orleans, Louisiana, May 6–7, 1999 .....	479

### MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION

WoLLIC '98, 5th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation, Sao Paulo, Brazil, July 28–31, 1998 .....	422
WoLLIC '99, 6th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, May 25–28, 1999. ....	424
Australasian Association for Logic, 29th Annual Conference, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia, July 10–12, 1998 .....	485

XI Latin American Symposium on Mathematical Logic, Mérida, Venezuela, July 6–10, 1998 .....	495
Notices .....	154, 284, 426, 573
Erratum .....	160
List of Officers and Committees of the Association for Symbolic Logic .....	525
List of Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic .....	529

#### ERRATUM

Vol. 4 (1998), No. 4, p. 461, line 11, replace  $\prod_1^0$  by  $\prod_2^0$ , so that the last theorem in the Abstract by Coles, Downey and Khoussainov reads as follows:

*Theorem:* There exists a computable linearly ordered set with a  $\prod_2^0$ -initial segment which does not possess a computable presentation.