

from one's nostrils, it is evident that real issues are at stake here. The divergent implications of the Gerschenkron and Carr views of twentieth-century and Soviet Russian history far transcend the particular disputes between the two men.

This reviewer found the book to be marvelously stimulating, both for the insights provided and for a dozen fascinating questions it opened for exploration.

HENRY L. ROBERTS  
*Dartmouth College*

ORIGINES D'UNE BOURGEOISIE RUSSE, XVI<sup>e</sup> ET XVII<sup>e</sup> SIÈCLES:  
MARCHANDS DE MOSCOVIE. By *Jacqueline Kaufmann-Rochard*. Paris:  
Flammarion, 1969. 307 pp. 29 F.

Evidently a doctoral dissertation, this smallish book is uncommonly ambitious in its reach. It strives for a comprehensive treatment of Muscovy's merchant class—its origins and modes of development, its various strata, its social relations, economic activities, interplay with the state, and even its family life. Since we have heretofore had no such work in any language, the volume is to be welcomed, for it constitutes a handy, informative, and mainly sound introduction to the subject.

The work's deficiencies are in good part a result of its large scope. The author relies heavily on secondary rather than primary sources, particularly on the studies of such able Soviet historians as Bakhrushin, Baklanova, Serbina, Tikhonov and Merzon, and Vvedensky. Indeed it is not much of an exaggeration to characterize her work as a synthesis of these and some other writings. She not only has not used the archival sources which she lists in the bibliography but has dipped into the published documents only sporadically, incomprehensibly has neglected such important contemporary accounts as Rodes and Kilburger, has not consulted (or slighted) important works of Smirnov and Zaozersky, Bazilevich's articles, and also the German and English literature on the subject. Accordingly, many aspects of this complex theme are treated too cursorily, and the author sometimes (in chapter 2 for example) falls prey to schematism. She also appears now and then to be the captive of her sources, whose categories and modes of analysis she tends to adopt uncritically. Fresh questions and probings are not much in evidence. The book is well organized and well written, but one notes occasional errors of fact and, from time to time, the absence of necessary qualifications.

The body of the work is largely descriptive, with interpretation saved for the crucial and interesting last chapter. Here the author brings into relief the Russian merchants' many disabilities, and contrasts their circumstances with those of their Western counterparts. In spite of the great differences, she insists on the applicability of the term "bourgeoisie"—a proposition which is certainly debatable. Debatable too, and deserving further investigation, are other theses advanced: that the Russian merchants left the conduct of external trade to foreign merchants because all their energies were consumed in organizing the internal market; that social differentiation among the merchants was so marked, and hostility of the lesser elements to the superior so intense, that the latter were driven into alliance with a landowning-servitor class whose interests were basically contrary to theirs. Whatever the book's deficiencies, it pulls together more than enough evidence to persuade anyone of the existence and significance of the merchants in Muscovite society.

SAMUEL H. BARON  
*University of California, San Diego*