

VOLUME 20

NUMBER 4

OCTOBER 2011

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,

<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantton/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to TKushner@aol.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 20 (2011) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$333/£195; online only: \$278/£166; print only: \$319/£185. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$88/£51. Students and retirees: \$82/£41. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$70/£35. Student and retiree: \$82/£41. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com. ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 20, Number 4, October 2011

CONTENTS

Contributors 509

Special Section: From Informed Consent to No Consent?

Guest Editorial: A Call for Contextualized Bioethics:
Health, Biomedical Research, and Security
MARGIT SUTROP AND KADRI SIMM 511

Informed Consent: Its History, Meaning, and
Present Challenges
TOM L. BEAUCHAMP 515

Limits of Autonomy in Biomedical Ethics?
Conceptual Clarifications
THEDA REHBOCK 524

Changing Ethical Frameworks: From Individual Rights
to the Common Good?
MARGIT SUTROP 533

The Communitarian Turn: Myth or Reality?
RUTH CHADWICK 546

The Concepts of Common Good and Public Interest:
From Plato to Biobanking
KADRI SIMM 554

Database Research: Public and Private Interests
VILHJÁLMUR ÁRNASON 563

Ethical Endgames: Broad Consent for Narrow Interests;
Open Consent for Closed Minds
JAN REINERT KARLSEN, JAN HELGE SOLBAKK,
AND SØREN HOLM 572

Tackling Epistemological Naivety: Large-Scale
Information Systems and the Complexities
of the Common Good
KJETIL ROMMETVEIT 584

A Social Justice Framework for Health and
Science Policy
RUTH FADEN AND MADISON POWERS 596

Health Ideologies, Objectivism, and the Common Good:
On the Rights of Dissidents
ROGER STRAND 605

Contents continued

Contents continued

Departments and Columns

Responses and Dialogue

Too Quick to Judge REBECCA L. VOLPE AND ERICA RANGEL SALTER A response to "The Humanities and the Future of Bioethics Education" by Joseph J. Fins (CQ 19(4))	612
In Defense of Bioethics and the Humanities JOSEPH J. FINS	615
<i>CQ Review</i> Greg S. Loeben <i>Educating Nurses: A Call for Radical Transformation,</i> by Patricia Benner, Molly Sutphen, Victoria Leonard, and Lisa Day REVIEWED BY MAURA C. SCHLAIRET	617
<i>Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature</i> BARRY MORENZ	620
Author Index and Contents for Volume 20	I