APPRECIATING C. L. R. JAMES, A MODEL OF MODERNITY AND CREOLIZATION

Kathleen M. Balutansky Saint Michael's College

- C. L. R. JAMES, THE ARTIST AS REVOLUTIONARY. By Paul Buhle. (New York: Verso, 1988. Pp. 197. \$35.00 cloth, \$13.95 paper.)
- C. L. R. JAMES'S CARIBBEAN. Edited by Paget Henry and Paul Buhle. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1992. Pp. 287.)
- THE C. L. R. JAMES READER. Edited by Anna Grimshaw. (Oxford: Blackwell, 1992. Pp. 451.)
- SPECIAL DELIVERY: THE LETTERS OF C. L. R. JAMES TO CONSTANCE WEBB, 1939–1948. Edited by Anna Grimshaw. (Oxford: Blackwell, 1996. Pp. 393.)
- C. L. R. JAMES: HIS INTELLECTUAL LEGACIES. Edited by Selwyn R. Cudjoe and William E. Cain. (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1995. Pp. 476. \$55.00 cloth, \$19.95 paper.)

I had studied Lenin in order to write The Black Jacobins, the analysis of a revolution for self-determination in a colonial territory. I had studied Lenin to be able to write my book on World Revolution. I had studied Lenin to be able to take part with George Padmore in his organization that worked for the independence of all colonial territories, but particularly the territories of Africa. I therefore was in a position from the very beginning to state my position and to state it in a discussion that some of us had with Trotsky on the Negro question in 1939. Let me restate that [position] as crudely as possible: the American Negroes in fighting for their democratic rights were making an indispensable addition to the struggle for socialism in the U.S.

C. L. R. James, "Black Power"

Born nearly a century ago in 1901, Cyril Lionel Robert James was an exemplary model of the black intellectual pioneers and revolutionaries whom he wrote about. In the five works under review here, he is portrayed as one of the earliest intellectuals of the English-speaking Caribbean to theorize about the black diaspora experience in any analysis of the major philosophical, social, and political issues of our time. A student of Marx and Lenin, James was a Trotskyist who eventually rejected Trotskyism as unwilling to recognize the revolutionary potential of the black experience. In "Black Power" (the essay just cited), James made his position clear: the struggle of blacks for equality is an independent struggle but an "indispensable one" that cannot be ignored by those theorizing about the socialist revolution in the United States. Throughout James's writings reprinted in The C. L. R. James Reader, edited by Anna Grimshaw, James made the point from both cultural and political perspectives that the black diaspora experience cannot be marginalized if the major philosophical and political issues of our time are to be understood. In essays focusing on the experiences of blacks in the Caribbean as well as in those in which he wrote about "the Negro problem" in the United States, James argued that the historical fragmentation that gives blacks a personal experience of the modern condition also endows them with a fundamentally revolutionary spirit. James's appendix to the 1980 edition of The Black Jacobins, his book about the Haitian Revolution and his most impressive early claim for the modernity and agency of the Africans in the New World, is also reprinted in the Reader and reinforces his early articulation of this concept. "From Toussaint L'Ouverture to Fidel Castro" reads like a litany of the pioneering powers and achievements of revolutionary thinkers and activists from the Caribbean who initiated intellectual and political revolutions that reshaped the Western world.

In "Black Studies and the Contemporary Student," a 1969 essay first published in 1984 in *At the Rendezvous of Victory* and reprinted in the *Reader*, James used author Richard Wright's evaluation of Soren Kierkegaard's philosophy to decentralize the Eurocentric view of modernity and create a pivotal space for the Black American experience in the modern world: "Dick [Richard Wright] assured me that he was reading Kierkegaard because everything he read in Kierkegaard he had known before. What he was telling me was that he was a black man in the United States and that gave him an insight into what today is the universal opinion and attitude of the modern personality" (*Reader*, p. 399). James's broader point in the essay is that the concerns about Black Studies miss the fact that White Studies are incomplete without an understanding of the vital role played by blacks in all aspects of the modern world. Most of the essays reprinted in the *Reader* illustrate this interconnection among James's literary, cultural, and Marxist theories.

In C. L. R. James's Caribbean, Paget Henry and Paul Buhle have

assembled letters, interviews, and critical essays that ground these theories in James's essentially Caribbean identity and his ability to deconstruct, demystify, and subvert the hegemony of the Western civilization in which he lived without rejecting its many valuable elements. The editors point out in their preface that prominent in James's works

is an interpretation of Caribbean identity that associates a high degree of Europeanization with a corresponding degree of modernity at the symbolic level. Instead of focusing on the losses that resulted from de-Africanization, James considers the potential gains of Europeanization. Consequently, his scholarly and ideological works constitute a mode of literary praxis that boldly appropriates for the Caribbean nation the modern possibilities that Westernization opens. . . . James confidently appropriated [Western language, science, religion, art and philosophy] for Caribbean service, too. (P. x)

The essays in this anthology illustrate this aspect of James's thought most clearly, what Sylvia Wynter has called his "pluri-consciousness."

Paul Buhle's C. L. R. James, the Artist as Revolutionary follows James from his early development in Trinidad to his last musings as an old man in a Brixton flat in London. Intended as an intellectual biography, the book focuses on James's political development and theories. Buhle shows James emerging from his youthful Eurocentric literary interests to produce stories fully grounded in Trinidadian life at the bottom rung. Buhle then follows James from his years in England and his discovery of Marxism and Trotskyism (1932-1938) to his years in the United States (1938-1953) and his engagement with issues facing the U.S. Left, labor organizations, and blacks in the United States. The last two sections cover James's return to England in 1953 and to Trinidad in 1958, his brief return trips to the United States, and his last return to Trinidad in 1981. These sections offer a compelling portrait of a powerful cultural critic, a Caribbean political player, a "Pan-African éminence grise," a radical celebrity, and a mentor of young intellectuals and heads of states, such as Kwame Nkrumah of Ghana and Eric Williams of Trinidad.

Works that claim the primacy of one facet of a writer's work and highlight it to the neglect of others always risk incurring the ire of others claiming the primacy of the neglected aspects. To varying degrees, four of the five books under review here open themselves to such criticism. Grimshaw's Special Delivery: The Letters of C. L. R. James to Constance Webb focuses on the intimate journey of James's love affair with an American woman and with U.S. culture between 1939 and 1949. Buhle's Artist as Revolutionary in its focus on James's political development, his theories, and their impact on the political developments of his time could be faulted for not showing enough of James the artist. In contrast, Grimshaw's The C. L. R. James Reader and Henry and Buhle's James's Caribbean have been criticized for concentrating too much on James the literary artist. In a review of these two books entitled "C. L. R. James Misbound," Selwyn

Cudjoe took Grimshaw to task for making James look "more like a cultural critic than the political thinker, philosopher, and revolutionary organizer that he was, which, in my opinion, is what gives James his claim to our scholarly attention." Cudjoe even questioned Grimshaw's claim to have planned the reader with James's collaboration "because it lacks so much that is vitally James, so much of the James that grabs our attention and rivets our intellectual concerns."

Cudjoe's review raises important questions about what, indeed, was left out of the anthology. Cudjoe presents two listings showing by year which of James's publications failed to appear in Grimshaw's Reader. Most significant for those interested in the development of James's Marxist thought is Grimshaw's omission of James's political writings from 1938 to 1947, a decade represented in the Reader by only four letters to Constance Webb (whom he married in 1946). Cudjoe nonetheless paid the Reader a significant compliment: "Rather than being the James reader, however, it fills important gaps in James's oeuvre, gives a better sense of his diversity, and testifies to the immensity of his intellectual gifts" (p. 132). Cudjoe's critique of the focus of James's Caribbean was much gentler, limited to comments on specific points within the essays and to the observation that the book tends to examine James "from a linguistic/cultural rather than a social/dialectical framework" (p. 136).

Despite these criticisms, Cudjoe's own anthology of essays on C. L. R. James, co-edited with William Cain, C. L. R. James: His Intellectual Legacies, covers the diversity of James's intellectual output. The volume resulted from a conference on James's intellectual legacies held at Wellesley College in April 1991. Grimshaw contributes a personal memoir to this collection, and Buhle an afterword that evaluates the trajectory of James scholarship. Cudjoe's contribution to the collection is a chapter on James's love letters to Webb in the section on the literary dimension of James's legacies. Other sections of the book include essays on James's short stories and his novel, Minty Alley, on The Black Jacobins, on the political, philosophical, literary, and theoretical dimensions of his writings and activities during his years in the United States as well as essays on his writings on cricket. The wide scope of the anthology will be appreciated by those wishing to introduce James to their students in courses on Caribbean literature. Teachers wishing to introduce James to students of Caribbean political theory will find Buhle's books more focused.

In addition to the full outline of James's political thought that Buhle provides in C. L. R. James, the Artist as Revolutionary, teachers and students of contemporary Caribbean politics and history will also find

^{1.} Selwyn Cudjoe, Transition, no. 58 (1992):126.

² Ibid

much to feed their interest in James's political thought in James's Caribbean. The last section of the anthology, entitled "Praxis," contains essays by Paget Henry, Walton Look Lai, and Kent Worcester that explore James's theories about and involvement in Caribbean political and economic affairs and his influence on them. Interestingly, Cudjoe's contribution to this collection, an essay grounding James in the intellectual world of nineteenth-century Trinidad, is included in the section dealing with James's cultural work rather than the one on James's revolutionary praxis. Cudjoe argues in the essay that although James seldom acknowledged it, his "audacity" (meaning his ability to use his knowledge of Western culture to challenge and decenter Western thought) can be traced back to the achievements of such nineteenth-century Trinidadian precursors as John Jacob Thomas and A. R. F. Webber.

These Trinidadian intellectuals gave the lie to "Froudacity," the Eurocentric declarations made by nineteenth-century English historian James Anthony Froude in The English in the West Indies in 1888. James later ridiculed implicitly and countered this "Froudacity" in his seminal piece "The Case for West Indian Self-Government," reprinted in the Reader. Thomas's and Webber's achievements gave James a sense of confidence in his own intellectual powers that, according to Cudjoe, "prepared [James] for the work he undertook for most of the twentieth century" (p. 53). James's "audacity" in later years is well illustrated in his own writings and in others' analyses of his relations with prominent figures of his time, including Russian revolutionary Leon Trotsky, U.S. actor Paul Robeson, Ghanian leader Kwame Nkrumah, childhood friend and prominent Pan-Africanist George Padmore, and former pupil and Trinidadian leader Eric Williams. What is interesting in the "audacity" of the younger James, who felt self-assured, recognized, and sought out, is its similarity to aspects of other Caribbean writers, such as George Lamming's descriptions of his precocious alter ego G. in In the Castle of My Skin or the defiant thoughts of Jamaica Kincaid's alter ego Annie in Annie John.

All five books under review here portray a life of remarkable intellectual achievement. Grimshaw's introduction to the reader, subtitled "A Revolutionary Vision for the Twentieth Century," Stuart Hall's "Portrait" in James's Caribbean, and all of Buhle's The Artist as Revolutionary offer excellent overviews of James's intellectual trajectory throughout most of the twentieth century. And an extraordinary trajectory it was. At the age of nine, James won a scholarship to Queen's Royal College. After graduating in 1918 at the age of seventeen, he began a career as a successful teacher, helping organize a literary club called "The Maverick." Between 1920 and 1926 (from nineteen to twenty-five), James taught such pupils as Eric Williams, organized a school theatrical group to perform Shakespeare, spoke publicly for Arthur Cipriani (a labor activist and successful candidate for mayor of Port of Spain), and wrote occasional pieces on

cricket for the *Labour Leader*, a newspaper published by Cipriani's Trinidad Workingmen's Association.

After leaving Trinidad for Nelson in Lancashire, England, James published at thirty-one *The Life of Captain Cipriani: An Account of British Government in the West Indies.* A year later, he created a stir with *The Case for West-Indian Self Government*, a chapter taken from his book on Cipriani and published by the Hogarth Press of Leonard and Virginia Woolf. That year James joined the Trotskyist movement and went to France to study the 1791 revolution in Santo Domingo, Haiti. In 1936 and 1937, he published his novel *Minty Alley* (written in 1928), and his play *Toussaint L'Ouverture* was staged in London with Paul Robeson as the lead. During those two years, James was also active in the Pan-African Movement with fellow Trinidadian George Padmore and others. He edited several issues of *International African Opinion*, and his *World Revolution*, 1917–1936: *The Rise and Fall of the Communist International* appeared.

With the publication of *The Black Jacobins*: Toussaint L'Ouverture and the San Domingo Revolution and A History of the Negro Revolt in 1938, James made his mark as a historian of the Caribbean and slavery. But his life took a turn that transformed him from scholar to activist when he left England for the United States, met with Trotsky in Mexico, and went on a speaking tour to promote the Trotskyist movement. After becoming a leader in the U.S. branch of the movement, James created his own political group, the Johnson-Forest Tendency (he was writing at the time under the pseudonym of J. R. Johnson). Although a book written in collaboration with Grace Lee and Raya Dunayevskaya, State Capitalism and World Revolution, and his own Notes on Dialectics offered trenchant critiques of mainline Marxism and Trotskyism, James's political writings and activities branded him as an undesirable alien in the United States, and he was expelled despite his efforts to convince authorities of his understanding of and concern with U.S. culture in Mariners, Renegades, and Castaways, a study of Herman Melville.

After living in London and traveling to the West Indies between 1954 and 1958, James became a mentor for groups of young West Indian intellectuals, including novelist George Lamming. When James returned to Trinidad as editor of *PNM Go Forward*, he became the confidant of former student Eric Williams, now the leader of independent Trinidad, and active in the People's National Movement. In 1960, however, James broke with Williams and stopped editing *The Nation*. He published *Modern Politics*, from which he derived *Party Politics in the West Indies* (based on his recent experiences in Trinidad), then returned to England. *Beyond a Boundary* was published in England in 1963, and *The Black Jacobins* was reprinted in the United States that same year. The reception of these two books reestablished James's critical reputation as a pioneering Caribbean scholar. In 1965 and 1966, James returned to Trinidad as a cricket journal-

ist, was placed under house arrest, led the formation of the Workers' and Farmers' Party, and lived for a time in Toronto with young West Indian intellectuals.

James returned to the United States in the late 1960s for lecture tours and a teaching assignment at Federal City College in Washington, D.C. In the following productive decade, James wrote critically on African and Caribbean independence movements as well as on the Black Power movement in the United States, and he published *Nkrumah and the Ghana Revolution*. After a brief attempt to live in San Fernando, Trinidad, James returned to the Brixton area of London in 1981, where he died in May of 1989.³

This biographical profile highlights James's writings about twentieth-century affairs, but the books under review also provide a glimpse of James's sense of himself, in his own words, as in his letters to Constance Webb and an interview with Buhle in *James's Caribbean*. He gave Webb (his future wife) an account of his early development:

My mother says that I was a very lively child, moving about continuously in the womb. I am very proud of that, though my pride has no scientific basis. . . . My life [in North Trace] until I was nine centered around books and games. When I was about seven I sat up late one night and wrote a poem. About eight verses of four lines each in imitation of a poem in my reading-book. Why I felt to write I do not know. No one wrote that I knew. . . . White people meant little to me. . . . So I lived my life till I was eight years old and four months. I was a happy boy I think, active and very intelligent. (Pp. 18–23)

What is remarkable in this account of a young boy's happiness is that it includes, almost in passing, a startling statement: "I had no love for anyone" (p. 23).

James told Buhle about his emergence as an intellectual: "I was the person [whom Cipriani and his labor movement] could depend upon. Everybody knew I was sympathetic to them. They used to think that James was a very bright boy. When they wanted a piece of writing they came to me and that was an understanding" (p. 60). Confident in his intellectual powers, the young James found that he had no problems taking on the British intellectuals. A revealing example of this young man's "audacity" (as Cudjoe terms it) is James's account of his meeting with Edith Sitwell, a brilliant and eccentric British writer. In "Bloomsbury: An Encounter with Edith Sitwell," reprinted in Grimshaw's Reader, James tells of hearing Sitwell speak of a young American writer who, although only thirty-one or thirty-two, was a far better writer than D. H. Lawrence, whose novels Sitwell found to be "very much overrated." "However," James wrote, "wild horses would not draw" the name of the young American writer from her. He smugly adds, "Of course that was easy. I

^{3.} This chronology is based on information provided in *James, the Artist as Revolutionary*, 174–76; *James's Caribbean*, 271–73; and the introduction to the *James Reader*, 2–22.

told her at once that it was William Faulkner and she rather blinked at it, though honestly I do not think that there was much in it. Anyone who is really interested in fiction would at least have heard Faulkner's name" (p. 45). Later, when James turned to Marxism, political theory, and international affairs, his writings continued to convey this same confidence, unflinching and acute.

The first three of the books under review focus on James's intellectual and political life to the exclusion of his personal life. Only passing references are made to his marriages and his son. Readers may come away with the sense that while James relished cricket, music, films, participated in numerous political activities, traveled, and lectured unrelentingly, he mainly lived intellectually. Although those who knew James personally and who read the letters to Constance Webb feel differently, this impression is strong in these texts by and about James. He transformed his relish of the game of cricket—both as a player and a sports reporter—into an anticolonial metaphor, articulated most fully in Beyond a Boundary (1963). He turned his love of films and manifestations of U.S. popular culture into theories about popular culture, articulated in the writings brought together in American Civilization (1993). Even in Special Delivery, where James reveals his desires, his vulnerability, and his personal failures, his love for Webb becomes the vehicle for his journey in U.S. culture. Readers will find that the letters document the intellectual progression of ideas that reached maturity in American Civilization.

The perception of James as experiencing the world mainly intellectually also arises in his writing about the proletariat (whether defined as the Trinidadian poor, the Russian masses, or U.S. laborers). But this detachment appears most distinctly in the patterns of his relationships with the women in his life. At an early age, James became aware of the duality of his position as an intellectual drawn to the plight of the exploited masses, but he seems to have placed this duality in the same context as his duality of being a man of "classical learning" who was drawn to calypso. Certainly, this duality is well articulated in his only novel, Minty Alley, whose intellectual protagonist understands that his privileged position is sustained by the hard labor of the underclass. But as Buhle points out in James, the Artist as Revolutionary, when it came to women and his mother in particular, James held a vision "uncomplicated and uncompromised by reality" (p. 167). James's views of his mother and of Constance Webb are fascinating examples of his ability to transform experiences into symbols. Just as the man of classical musical interests could be drawn to calypso, so James who reported that as a young boy he had "had no love for anyone," could later say about his mother in his interview with Buhle that she was the "center" of his life. Readers may tend to agree with Buhle that James "admired his mother the literary personality" (p. 167) and that "the emotional aloofness of his mother helped him to substitute art for life (or love), and that when politics supplanted art the hierarchy remained nevertheless in place" (p. 168). As for Webb, although the letters included in *Special Delivery* convey James's genuine infatuation with her beauty and youthful potential, she remains what Grimshaw describes as "a sort of mirror in which James contemplates his own reflection" (p. 26).

Whether or not this aspect of James's character would be appealing on a personal level, it is nonetheless central to the development of his intellectual powers, if this tendency is viewed as the ability to create symbolic meanings that counter unsatisfactory realities. According to Henry and Buhle, this is the quality that gave James (along with such writers as Marcus Garvey, Franz Fanon, and Aimé Césaire) the ability to create the "epistemic and other symbolic explosives that rocked the cultural hegemony of Western imperialism" (p. 112). This ability thus laid the foundation for his "counterdoctrine," as Sylvia Wynter calls it. Her contribution to *James's Caribbean* shows that this

"doctrine" produced by the autosociography of *Beyond a Boundary* constitutes that act of definition which is itself part of the social universe it defines. . . . The stubborn young boy was pushed into theoretical and esthetic marginality when he blurred the categories—an intellectual wanting to play cricket, a scholarship winner reading for discovery rather than to pass examinations. These rebellious acts disturbed the governing categories of the colonial bourgeois cultural model, the categories of head/body, reason/instinct, and transgressed the separation between them. (Pp. 64–65)

Viewed from this perspective, James emerges, as Aimé Césaire did before him, as Caliban, the quintessential symbol of the Caribbean, the fundamentally poststructuralist deconstructor of colonial meanings. But as Henry and Buhle point out, James achieved this feat "without recourse to semio-linguistics" (p. 136).

Following James's lead, intellectuals have produced literary and cultural theories about the Caribbean and Caribbean identity that set out to stretch the parameters of poststructuralist or postcolonial theories, explicitly or implicitly, embracing or challenging their discursive realms. One of the issues, at least in Caribbean literary and cultural studies, has been to situate the experiences of blacks of the diaspora within theories of modernity. One of the latest seminal works in this vein, though it does not focus solely on the Caribbean, is *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness* by black English critic Paul Gilroy.⁴ He sets out to create a space for the "Black Atlantic"—his term for blacks in Europe and the New World—within current discussions of modernity. Gilroy rejects theories that marginalize the "language of 'race' and ethnic identity" and argues that the experiences of blacks in Europe and the Americas charac-

^{4.} Paul Gilroy, The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993).

terize the modern condition: "though largely ignored by recent debates over modernity and its discontents, these ideas about [black] nationality, ethnicity, authenticity, and cultural integrity are characteristically modern phenomena that have profound implications for cultural criticism and cultural history." 5

Until recently, much of the attention on James has focused on his radical politics and Marxist theories (recall Cudjoe's statement that James's claim to scholarly attention is his work as a political thinker, philosopher, and revolutionary organizer). It is therefore unsurprising that James does not appear prominently in Paul Gilroy's discussion of the "Black Atlantic." The surprising part is Gilroy's rejection of creolization and other older theories about Caribbean identity—such as *metissage*, *mestizaje*, and hybridity—all of which he finds as inadequate as the Manichean dynamics of black and white in defining black identity.

Although James's literary and political work predated Edouard Glissant's formulations of creolization,6 James's cultural and political theories manifestly fit within its theoretical framework and should contribute to that discourse. Most Caribbeanists are familiar with the concept of "creoleness," which in its broadest cultural sense stands for the ethnic plurality of the Caribbean. The concept of "creolization" is more elusive, however. It is the theoretical formulation of the cultural syncretism that gives rise to the subversive and transformative revolutionary activity and artistic creativity of the region. More precisely, Glissant defines creolization in the Caribbean as the cultural construct that distills the dehumanizing experiences of transportation or migration (from Africa, Asia, and Europe), slavery, colonialism, and racism—the main constituents of Caribbean history. Thus creolization encompasses not only the ethnic and cultural pluralism that is the legacy of the colonial encounter but also the integration of radical historical experiences into a self-consciously decentered Caribbean identity. The timely connection between Gilroy's The Black Atlantic and the books reviewed here is that the latter show that C. L. R. James epitomizes creolization in many ways: as a Trinidadian profoundly impressed by the vitality of Caribbean life but who continually felt the need to leave the Caribbean, an anti-imperialist classicist, an intellectual who argued for the power of the masses, and a Caribbean intellectual who refused to replace the colonizer's Eurocentrism with the colonized's Afrocentrism. Indeed, James's life and his work offer a rich corpus for studying both modernity and creolization.

In the years preceding James's death in 1989, he seems to have indeed become the éminence grise that Buhle describes at the end of

^{5.} Ibid., p. 2.

^{6.} See Édouard Glissant, *Le discours antillais* (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1981); and Glissant, *Poetique de la relation* (Paris: Gallimard, 1990).

James, the Artist as Revolutionary. His larger reputation in the academic world seemed to rest on the ideas he set forth in The Black Jacobins and Beyond a Boundary. This generalization does not apply, however, to the small group of fervent Jamesian scholars and political followers, among them Paget Henry, Paul Buhle, Anna Grimshaw, Kent Worcester, William Cain, and Selwyn Cudjoe, who have produced over the years a substantial amount of Jamesian scholarship. Because James's writing ranges over vast intellectual and geographical areas, spans many years, and challenges numerous aspects of Western hegemony, no single book can provide a comprehensive analysis of his life and thought. Buhle ambitiously attempted to do so in a single anthology boldly titled C. L. R. James: His Life and Work, published in 1986 (three years before James died). The value of the five books reviewed here for the larger academic community and for Caribbean literary and cultural studies is that although they in no way diminish James's stature as a political thinker, they collectively portray in sharper relief the relevance of James's life and thought to current discussions about the identity and agency of blacks in the diaspora, whether these discussions are grounded in the discourse of modernity or in that of creolization.