# Contents

List of Tables and Figures v
Acknowledgements viii

## 1 Evidence in Times of Crisis 1
1.1 The Status of Evidence in Evidence-Based Medicine 3
1.2 Organization of Chapters 5

## 2 Narrative Rationality and the Logic of Good Reasons 8
2.1 The Narrative Paradigm: Basic Tenets 8
2.2 Narrative Paradigm vs Rational World Paradigm 11
2.3 Narrative Probability, Narrative Fidelity and the Logic of Good Reasons 14
   2.3.1 Narrative Probability (Coherence) 15
   2.3.2 Narrative Fidelity 23

## 3 Whose Evidence? What Rationality? The Face Mask Controversy 28
3.1 Structural and Material (In)coherence in Expert Narratives 28
3.2 Transcendental Values, Narrative Accrual and Narrative Identification 35
   3.2.1 The Logic of Good Reasons, Narrative Accrual and Identification: Public Safety and Structural Racism 36
   3.2.2 Good Reasons, Precarious Manhood and Homophobia 40
3.3 Beyond Precariousness: Personal Freedom vs Social Responsibility 42

## 4 Whose Lives? What Values? Herd Immunity, Lockdowns and Social/Physical Distancing 45
4.1 Structural/Material (In)coherence or Science vs Values in the Great Barrington and John Snow Declarations 47
4.2 Health, the Economy and the State: Resonance and Lived Experience 53
4.3 Transcendental Values and Conceptions of Freedom 56
4.4 Public Health Recommendations and the Values and Principles of Evidence-based Policy Making 59

## 5 The Rational World Paradigm, the Narrative Paradigm and the Politics of Pharmaceutical Interventions 61
5.1 Structural and Material (In)coherence: Science and Public Policy under Pressure 62
5.2 Characterological Coherence and Public Confidence in Vaccines 66
5.3 Transcendental Values and Conceptions of Freedom 69
5.4 Pure Bodies, Microchips and Genetically Modified Organisms 73
5.5 Resonance, Lived Experience and Trust 77

## 6 Objectivist vs Praxial Knowledge: Towards a Model of Situated Epistemologies and Narrative Identification 81
6.1 Limitations of Fisher’s Narrative Paradigm 82
6.2 Revisiting and Extending the Narrative Paradigm 85
6.3 Narrative Identification in the Age of Fragmented Narratives 88
6.4 A Final Note on Critical Appraisal in the EBM Model 90

References 92
Index 103