

## ON THE ALGEBRAIC CONVERGENCE OF FINITELY GENERATED KLEINIAN GROUPS IN ALL DIMENSIONS

XI FU

(Received 10 May 2011)

### Abstract

Let  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  be a sequence of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups acting on  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$ . In this paper, we prove that if  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies the  $F$ -condition, then its algebraic limit group  $G_r$  is also a Kleinian group. The existence of a homomorphism from  $G_r$  to  $G_{r,i}$  is also proved. These are generalisations of all known corresponding results.

2010 *Mathematics subject classification*: primary 30F40; secondary 20H10, 57S30.

*Keywords and phrases*: Kleinian group,  $WY(G)$ , loxodromic element, algebraic convergence.

### 1. Introduction

In this paper, we will adopt the same definitions and notation as in [5, 7, 8], such as discrete groups  $G$  of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}^n})$ , limit sets  $L(G)$  of  $G$ , nonelementariness and so on. For example,  $G$  is a *Kleinian group* if  $G$  is discrete and nonelementary.

Let  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  be a sequence of subgroups in  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}^n})$  and each  $G_{r,i}$  be generated by  $g_{1,i}, g_{2,i}, \dots, g_{r,i}$  ( $0 < r < \infty$ ). If, for each  $t \in \{1, 2, \dots, r\}$ ,

$$g_{t,i} \rightarrow g_t \in M(\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}) \quad \text{as } i \rightarrow \infty,$$

then we say that  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  converges algebraically to  $G_r = \langle g_1, g_2, \dots, g_r \rangle$  and  $G_r$  is called the *algebraic limit group* of  $\{G_{r,i}\}$ . If, for each  $i$ ,  $G_{r,i}$  is a Kleinian group, then the question when  $G_r$  is still a Kleinian group has attracted much attention. For example, in [3], Jørgensen and Klein established the following classical algebraic convergence theorem.

**THEOREM A** [3]. *Let  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  be a sequence of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}^2})$  converging algebraically to the group  $G_r$ . Then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.*

In higher dimensions, Martin observed that if the sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  contains elliptic elements  $g_{t,i}$  such that  $g_{t,i} \rightarrow g_t$  with  $\text{ord}(g_{t,i}) \rightarrow \infty$  as  $i \rightarrow \infty$ , then the algebraic limit

The research was partly supported by NSF of China (No. 11071063).

© 2011 Australian Mathematical Publishing Association Inc. 0004-9727/2011 \$16.00

group is not a Kleinian group, where ‘ord( $g$ )’ denotes the order of  $g$ . This shows that to study when the algebraic limit group of a sequence of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups is Kleinian some restriction is needed. In [5], Martin introduced the following restriction.

A set  $X$  of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  is said to have *uniformly bounded torsion* if there is an integer  $N > 0$  such that for each  $g \in X$ ,

$$\text{ord}(g) \leq N \quad \text{or} \quad \text{ord}(g) = \infty.$$

By using this restriction, Martin generalised Theorem A to the higher dimensional case.

**THEOREM B** [5, Proposition 5.8]. *Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  with uniformly bounded torsion. Then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.*

Recently, Wang [7] and Yang [10] introduced the restrictions ‘EP-condition’ and ‘Condition A’, respectively, to weaken ‘uniformly bounded torsion’. Their results are as follows.

**THEOREM C** [7, Theorem 1.1]. *Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . If  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies the EP-condition, then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.*

Here a sequence  $\{G_i\}$  is said to satisfy the *EP-condition* if the following two conditions are satisfied.

- (1) For any sequence  $\{f_{ik}\}$ ,  $f_{ik} \in G_{ik}$  ( $\in \{G_i\}$ ), if  $\text{card}(\text{fix}(f_{ik})) = \infty$  and  $f_{ik} \rightarrow f$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ , where  $f$  is the identity map  $I$  or a parabolic element, then  $\{f_{ik}\}$  has uniformly bounded torsion.
- (2)  $\{G_i\}$  satisfies *Property A*, that is,  $\{G_i\}$  contains no sequences  $\{f_{ik}\}, \{g_{ik}\}$  which satisfy that both  $f_{ik}, g_{ik} \in G_{ik}$  ( $\in \{G_i\}$ ) are elliptic and

$$\begin{aligned} \text{fix}(f_{ik}) \cap \text{fix}(g_{ik}) &= \emptyset, \quad \text{card}(\text{fix}(f_{ik})) = \text{card}(\text{fix}(g_{ik})) = 2, \\ f_{ik} &\rightarrow I \quad \text{and} \quad g_{ik} \rightarrow I \end{aligned}$$

as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ .

**THEOREM D** [10, Theorem 2.4]. *Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . If  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies Condition A, then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.*

Here we say that a sequence  $\{G_i\}$  satisfies *Condition A* if there is no sequence  $\{f_{ik}\}$ ,  $f_{ik} \in G_{ik}$  ( $\in \{G_i\}$ ) with  $\text{card}(\text{fix}(f_{ik})) = \infty$  and  $f_{ik} \rightarrow I$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$  (see [2]).

**EXAMPLE 1.1.** Suppose that  $G_2 = \langle f_1, f_2 \rangle$  is a two-generator purely hyperbolic nonelementary subgroup of  $\text{PSL}(2, \mathbb{R})$  and that, for each natural number  $i$ ,

$$f_i = \begin{pmatrix} a_i & 0 \\ 0 & a_i \end{pmatrix},$$

where  $a_i = \cos(\theta_i\pi) + e_2e_3 \sin(\theta_i\pi)$  and each  $\theta_i$  is a rational number. Let

$$G_{2,i} = \langle G_2, f_i \rangle.$$

Then, for each  $i$ ,  $G_{2,i}$  is a Kleinian group in  $\text{PSL}(2, \Gamma_4)$ . If the sequence  $\{\theta_i\}$  converges to a rational number  $\theta$ , then the algebraic limit group  $G_3$  of  $\{G_{2,i}\}$  is also a Kleinian group; but, if the sequence  $\{\theta_i\}$  converges to an irrational number  $\theta$ , then  $G_3$  is nondiscrete. Moreover, in the former case, if  $\theta_i = 1/3^i$ , then we know that the sequence  $\{G_{2,i}\}$  does not satisfy the *EP*-condition nor Condition A, but  $G_3$  is still a Kleinian group.

Motivated by Example 1.1, we introduce the following restriction.

**DEFINITION 1.2.** We say that a sequence  $\{G_i\}$  satisfies the *F*-condition if there is no sequence  $\{f_{ik}\}$ ,  $f_{ik} \in \text{WY}(G_{ik}) (\in \{G_i\})$  such that  $f_{ik} \rightarrow f$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ , where  $f$  is an elliptic element with  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ .

Let us recall the important notation  $\text{WY}(G)$  for a Kleinian group  $G$ , which was first put forward by Wang and Yang in [8]:

$$\text{WY}(G) = \{f : f|_{M(G)} = I, f \in G\},$$

where  $M(G)$  is the smallest  $G$ -invariant hyperbolic space whose boundary contains the limit set  $L(G)$  of  $G$  (see [6]). It is obvious that  $\text{WY}(G)$  is  $\{I\}$  or a purely elliptic subgroup of  $G$ .

**REMARK 1.3.** Obviously, if a sequence of Kleinian groups satisfies the *EP*-condition or Condition A, then it must satisfy the *F*-condition. From Example 1.1, we see that there are sequences of Kleinian groups which satisfy the *F*-condition but do not satisfy the *EP*-condition nor Condition A. Also, if a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\} (\{\text{WY}(G_{r,i})\})$  of Kleinian groups has uniformly bounded torsion, then  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies the *F*-condition.

By using the *F*-condition, we get the following generalisation of Theorems B, C and D.

**THEOREM 1.4.** Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . If  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies the *F*-condition, then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.

We have the following corollary, which is easily derived from Theorem 1.4 and Remark 1.3.

**COROLLARY 1.5.** Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . If  $\{\text{WY}(G_{r,i})\}$  has uniformly bounded torsion, then  $G_r$  is a Kleinian group.

Moreover, we prove the following result, which is a generalisation of [5, Theorem 6.1].

**THEOREM 1.6.** *Let  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  be a sequence of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  converging algebraically to the group  $G_r$ . Suppose that the corresponding sequence  $\{WY(G_{r,i})\}$  of  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  has uniformly bounded torsion and that  $G_r$  is finitely presented. Then  $G_r$  is also a Kleinian group and the correspondence from the generators of  $G_r$  to their approximants in  $G_{r,i}$  extends for all sufficiently large  $i$  to a homomorphism of  $G_r$  onto  $G_{r,i}$ .*

## 2. Proofs of Theorems 1.4 and 1.6

**2.1. Several lemmas.** The following result due to Waterman is from [9].

**LEMMA E** [9, Theorem 11]. *If  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is a Kleinian group of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ , then*

$$\|f - I\| \cdot \|g - I\| > \frac{1}{32}.$$

The following two lemmas are crucial for the proofs of Theorems 1.4 and 1.6.

**LEMMA 2.1.** *Let  $G_r$  be the algebraic limit group of a sequence  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  of  $r$ -generator Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . Then:*

- (1)  $G_r$  is nonelementary; and
- (2)  $G_r$  is nondiscrete if and only if there exists an elliptic element  $f \in WY(G_r)$  with  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ .

**PROOF.** The first part of this lemma follows from [4, Theorem 1.4]. Now we come to prove the second part. It suffices to show that if  $G_r$  is nondiscrete, then there is an element  $f \in WY(G_r)$  with  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ , since the converse is obvious. Now we assume that  $G_r$  is nondiscrete. Recall that  $G_r$  is a finitely generated subgroup of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . By applying the Selberg lemma, we know that  $G_r$  contains a torsion free subgroup  $G'_r$  of finite index which is nondiscrete as well. Then there exists a sequence  $\{f_j\}$  in  $G'_r$  such that  $f_j \rightarrow I$  as  $j \rightarrow \infty$ . As  $G'_r$  is nonelementary, there are finitely many loxodromic elements  $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_s$  in  $G'_r$  such that the set  $\{\text{fix}(g_1), \text{fix}(g_2), \dots, \text{fix}(g_s)\}$  spans the boundary of  $M(G'_r)$ . Then, for all sufficiently large  $j$ , we have

$$\|f_j - I\| \cdot \|g_k - I\| < \frac{1}{32},$$

where  $k \in \{1, 2, \dots, s\}$ . Let  $f_{i,j}$  and  $g_{i,k}$  be the corresponding elements of  $f_j$  and  $g_k$  in  $G_{r,i}$ , respectively. Then, for large enough  $i$ ,

$$\|f_{i,j} - I\| \cdot \|g_{i,k} - I\| < \frac{1}{32}.$$

Lemma E implies that the subgroups  $\langle f_{i,j}, g_{i,k} \rangle$  are elementary. It follows that  $\text{fix}(g_{i,k}) \subset \text{fix}(f_{i,j})$ , which shows that for  $k \in \{1, 2, \dots, s\}$  and all sufficiently large  $j$ ,  $\text{fix}(g_k) \subset \text{fix}(f_j)$ . Hence,  $f_j \in WY(G'_r)$ , from which the conclusion follows. □

**LEMMA 2.2.** *Let  $\{G_i\}$  be a sequence of finitely generated Kleinian groups of  $M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  converging algebraically to a group  $G$ . If there exists a sequence  $\{f_{ik}\}$ ,  $f_{ik} \in G_{ik}$  ( $\in \{G_i\}$ ), such that  $f_{ik} \rightarrow I$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ , then, for sufficiently large  $k$ ,  $f_{ik} \in WY(G_{ik})$ .*

**PROOF.** By [4, Lemma 4.2], we know that for large enough  $k$ ,  $f_{ik} = I$  or there is a  $G_{ik}$ -invariant hyperbolic space  $\Pi_{ik}$  which is fixed pointwise by  $f_{ik}$ . So, the closed set  $\overline{\Pi_{ik}} \cap \overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  is also  $G_{ik}$ -invariant. Since the limit set  $L(G_{ik})$  of  $G_{ik}$  is the smallest  $G_{ik}$ -invariant subset in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$ , similar reasoning as in [1, Theorem 5.3.7] shows that  $L(G_{ik}) \subset \overline{\Pi_{ik}} \cap \overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$ , which implies that  $M(G_{ik}) \subset \Pi_{ik}$ . It follows that  $f_{ik} \in WY(G_{ik})$ .  $\square$

**2.2. Proof of Theorem 1.4.** By Lemma 2.1, we only need to prove that there is no elliptic element  $f \in WY(G_r)$  with  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ . Suppose on the contrary that there is some elliptic element  $f \in WY(G_r)$  such that  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ . Then there exists an integer sequence  $\{n_j\}$  such that  $f^{n_j} \rightarrow I$  as  $n_j \rightarrow \infty$ . For each  $n_j$ , let  $f_i^{n_j}$  be the corresponding element in  $G_{r,i}$ . By Lemma 2.2 and the hypothesis that  $\{G_{r,i}\}$  satisfies the  $F$ -condition, we know that  $f_i^{n_j} = I$  for large enough  $i$ . It follows that  $f^{n_j} = I$ , which contradicts the assumption that  $f \in WY(G_r)$  with  $\text{ord}(f) = \infty$ .

**2.3. Proof of Theorem 1.6.** The proof easily follows from Lemma 2.2 and a similar argument as in the proof of [5, Theorem 6.1].

### Acknowledgement

The author would like to thank the referee for a careful reading of this paper as well as for many useful comments and suggestions.

### References

- [1] A. F. Beardon, *The Geometry of Discrete Groups*, Graduate Texts in Mathematics, 91 (Springer, New York, 1983).
- [2] A. Fang and B. Nai, 'On the discreteness and convergence in  $n$ -dimensional Möbius groups', *J. Lond. Math. Soc.* **61** (2000), 761–773.
- [3] T. Jørgensen and P. Klein, 'Algebraic convergence of finitely generated Kleinian groups', *Q. J. Math. Oxford* **33** (1982), 325–332.
- [4] M. Kapovich, 'On the sequences of finitely generated discrete groups, in the tradition of Ahlfors–Bers. V', *Contemp. Math.* **510** (2010), 165–184.
- [5] G. Martin, 'On discrete Möbius groups in all dimensions: a generalization of Jørgensen's inequality', *Acta Math.* **163** (1989), 253–289.
- [6] X. Wang, 'Dense subgroups of  $n$ -dimensional Möbius groups', *Math. Z.* **243** (2003), 643–651.
- [7] X. Wang, 'Algebraic convergence theorems of  $n$ -dimensional Kleinian groups', *Israel J. Math.* **162** (2007), 221–233.
- [8] X. Wang and W. Yang, 'Discreteness criteria of Möbius groups of high dimensions and convergence theorems of Kleinian groups', *Adv. Math.* **159** (2001), 68–82.
- [9] P. Waterman, 'Möbius transformations in several dimensions', *Adv. Math.* **101** (1993), 87–113.
- [10] S. Yang, 'Algebraic convergence of finitely generated Kleinian groups in all dimensions', *Linear Algebra Appl.* **432** (2010), 1147–1151.

XI FU, Department of Mathematics, Shaoxing College of Arts and Sciences,  
Shaoxing, Zhejiang 312000, PR China  
e-mail: [fuxi1000@yahoo.com.cn](mailto:fuxi1000@yahoo.com.cn)