

European Constitutional Law Review

2012 VOLUME 8 ISSUE 2

Contributions by

Antje von Ungern-Sternberg, Pavel Molek, Mirjam de Mol, Jan Komárek, Ester Herlin-Karnell, Leendert Erkelens, Janneke Gerards, Marc Bossuyt, Steven Blockmans, Samantha Besson

Subjects

Suggestions for improvement for THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: a greater focus on fundamental rights; also changing its approach to asylum; THE EUROPEAN UNION, its External Action Service, and institutional balance; THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION and the question of horizontal direct effect; THE GERMAN FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONAL COURT and the Euro rescue package; THE CZECH CONSTITUTIONAL COURT declares a decision of the CJEU to be *ultra vires*; also the implementation of the Data Retention Directive to be unconstitutional; BOOK REVIEWS

EuConst

2012/2



ASSER PRESS



T · M · C · A S S E R P R E S S

Freedom, Security and Justice after Lisbon and Stockholm

Edited by

Sarah Wolff, Flora Goudappel and Jaap de Zwaan

This book introduces the main changes induced by the Lisbon Treaty and the Stockholm Programme in the field of Justice and Home Affairs (JHA). The Lisbon Treaty has brought important changes to decision making at EU level, while the Stockholm Programme has set policy objectives for the next five years.

The contributions to this book assess briefly the *acquis* so far and elaborate on the future challenges that remain, in order to turn the *area of freedom, security and justice* into a reality, both for citizens and practitioners. Written by experts with different backgrounds – academics, policy makers and practitioners – they make this book a very useful tool for a broad audience, including EU officials, judges, lawyers, academics, students and police officers.

Dr. **Sarah Wolff** is research fellow at the Clingendael European Studies Programme, The Hague, The Netherlands. Dr. **Flora A.N.J. Goudappel** is associate professor of the Law of the European Union at the Erasmus School of law, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands. Prof. dr. **Jaap W. de Zwaan** is professor of the Law of the European Union at the Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam.

2011, ISBN 9789067043175

280 pages, paperback

Price € 29.00

www.asserpress.nl

Distributie: Boom Distributiecentrum, Postbus 400, 7940 AK Meppel,
Tel. 0522-237555, Fax 0522-253864, bdc@bdc.boom.nl

EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm

journals.cambridge.org/EuConst

Recommended citation: EUCONST

The journal is edited in the HOGENDORPcentre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is based in the University of Amsterdam. Published three times a year.

Indexed in the following Thomson Reuters products and services: *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Social Scisearch*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Journal Citation Reports/Social Sciences Edition*. Furthermore in the *Index to Foreign Legal Publications*, *International Bibliography of the Social Sciences*, *Westlaw UK Legal Journals Index*.

Editorial Office

European Constitutional Law Review c/o HOGENDORPcentre, University of Amsterdam, Department of Public Law, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam. Tel. +31 20 5253310/3966. E-mail: EuConst@uva.nl.

Distribution

The *European Constitutional Law Review* is distributed for T-M-C-ASSER PRESS by Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK. The journal is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service. This service can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/EuConst>.

Subscription rates and specimen copies

Subscription to the *European Constitutional Law Review*, Volume 8 (2012): Print + online: GBP 139.00 / USD 252.00 / EUR 199.00. Print only: GBP 127.00 / USD 228.00 / EUR 181.00; Online only: GBP 121.00 / USD 218.00 / EUR 166.00. Subscription orders, changes of address and requests for specimen copies should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK, E-mail: journals@cambridge.org; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 0021 2237, E-mail: subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org.

Advertising

To advertise in the journal please contact the relevant Advertising Promoter for your area: in the USA, Canada or Mexico: USAdSales@cambridge.org; in the UK, Europe or rest of the world: ad_sales@cambridge.org.

Photocopying and permissions

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Permission inquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; permission inquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission inquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm. Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com. For republication specific written permission should be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to press@asser.nl.

ISSN 1574-0196

© 2012 T-M-C-ASSER PRESS, The Hague, and contributors.

BOARD OF EDITORS

W.T. Eijsbouts, editor-in-chief

Professor of European constitutional law and history,
University of Amsterdam and professor of European
law, Leiden University

Jan-Herman Reestman, associate editor-in-chief

Associate professor of public law, University of
Amsterdam

Leonard F.M. Besselink

Professor of European constitutional law, University
of Utrecht

Monica Claes

Professor of European and comparative constitu-
tional law, University of Maastricht

John W. Sap

Professor of European Union law, Open University
in the Netherlands, Heerlen, and associate professor
of European Union law, VU University Amsterdam

Jeremy B. Bierbach, managing editor

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

David Nederlof, associate managing editor

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Junior editors

Thomas Beukers

University of Utrecht

Lars Hoffmann

University of Maastricht

Jan Komárek

London School of Economics

Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme

University of Amsterdam

Gerhard van der Schyff

University of Tilburg

Geerten Boogaard

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Laurens Westendorp, student editor

University of Amsterdam

Special language adviser

Russell E.M. Lawson

Oxford

BOARD OF ADVISORS

Andreas Auer

Professor of public law, University of Zurich

Paul Craig

Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca

Professor of law, Harvard Law School

Bruno de Witte

Professor of European Union law, European University
Institute, Florence; Professor of European Union law,
University of Maastricht

Olivier Duhamel

University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis

Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerkrath

Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

P.J.G. Kapteyn

Former judge in the ECJ

Tim Koopmans

Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General at
the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands),
The Hague

Rick Lawson

Kirchheiner Chair, Department of Public Law, Leiden
University

Koen Lenaerts

Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law,
University of Leuven

Ingolf Pernice

Professor of public law and of international and Euro-
pean law, Humboldt University, Berlin

Jit Peters

Professor emeritus of public law, University of Am-
sterdam

Lucas Prakke

Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law,
University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal

Judge at the ECJ and Professor of international and
European institutional law, University of Utrecht

Hjalte Rasmussen

Professor of European Union law, University of
Copenhagen

W.H. Roobol

Professor emeritus of European history, University of
Amsterdam

Dominique Rousseau

Professor of public law, University of Montpellier 1

Andrés Sajó

Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

Miroslaw Wyrzykowski

Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw University,
Poland and judge in the Trybunał Konstytucyjny (Pol-
ish Constitutional Court)

Peter G. Xuereb

Professor of European and comparative law, University
of Malta

Jiří Zemánek

Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law,
Charles University, Prague

EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2012 VOLUME 8 ISSUE 2

CONTENTS

Editorial

The European Council and the National Executives: Segmentation, Consolidation and Legitimation 165

Articles

Janneke GERARDS – The Prism of Fundamental Rights 173

Marc BOSSUYT – The Court of Strasbourg Acting as an Asylum Court 203

Leendert ERKELENS & Steven BLOCKMANS – Setting up the European External Action Service: An Act of Institutional Balance 246

Case Notes

Mirjam DE MOL – A Deafening Silence. Court of Justice of the European Union (Grand Chamber). Judgment of 24 January 2012, Case C-282/10, *Maribel Dominguez v. Centre informatique du Centre Ouest Atlantique and Préfet de la région Centre* 280

Antje VON UNGERN-STERNBERG – Parliaments – Fig Leaf or Heartbeat of Democracy? German Federal Constitutional Court. Judgment of 7 September 2011 – *Euro Rescue Package* 304

Jan KOMÁREK – Playing with Matches: the Czech Constitutional Court Declares a Judgment of the Court of Justice of the EU *Ultra Vires*. Judgment of 31 January 2012, Pl. ÚS 5/12, *Slovak Pensions XVII* 323

Pavel MOLEK – Unconstitutionality of the Czech Implementation of the Data Retention Directive. Czech Constitutional Court. Decision of 22 March 2011, Pl. ÚS 24/10 338

Book Reviews

Nico KRISCH – *Beyond Constitutionalism, The Pluralist Structure of Postnational Law* (Samantha BESSON) 354

A. HINAREJOS – *Judicial Control in the European Union, Reforming Jurisdiction in the Intergovernmental Pillars* (Ester HERLIN-KARNELL) 362

EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

In the tradition of the HOGENDORPcentre, the *European Constitutional Law Review* (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of the member states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

Submission of Material

Authors are requested to send their manuscript to the Editorial Office European Constitutional Law Review, c/o HOGENDORPcentre, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam, E-mail: EuConst@uva.nl. All submitted materials should be in English. Detailed instructions and style sheet can be found on <<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayJournal?jid=ECL>>. Materials may be submitted at any time of the year and, if accepted for publication, will be published at the earliest available opportunity.

Copyright

Copyright is exclusively vested in EuConst and the author(s) jointly. Acceptance of the Board of Editors' offer to publish implies, however, that authors agree to an embargo on publication elsewhere, either in English or another language, for a period of two years following the date of publication in EuConst. The agreement of the Board of Editors will be necessary before the article can be subsequently published elsewhere.

Revision

Articles accepted will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to author's approval.

Books for Review

These should be sent to Dr. Lars Hoffmann, University of Maastricht, International and European Law Department, Bouillonstraat 1-3, 6211 LH Maastricht, The Netherlands. E-mail: lars.hoffmann@maastrichtuniversity.nl.



The G.K. VAN HOGENDORPcentre FOR EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL STUDIES, short: HOGENDORPcentre, is a Jean Monnet centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam. Founded in 1996, it promotes research and course development in the field of European Constitutional Studies, bringing together the disciplines of constitutional (including comparative) law, history, political theory. Gijsbert Karel van Hogendorp, 1762-1834, is the *auctor intellectualis* of the Dutch Kingdom's first constitution, of 1814.

Apart from editing the *European Constitutional Law Review*, the HOGENDORPcentre hosts or co-hosts yearly conferences and runs a series of publications, the Hogendorp-papers, published by Europa Law Publishing <http://www.europalawpublishing.com/european_law/erad.htm>.