# Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory with open peer commentary Volume 33 | Issue 5 | October 2010 | ISSN: 0140-525X



//doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X10003043 Published online by Cambridge University Press

# **Behavioral and Brain Sciences**

Editors

Paul Bloom Barbara L. Finlay

URL: http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs

# E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences Journals Department Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of The Americas New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

# **Editorial Administrator**

Ralph DeMarco

Chief Copy Editor Sumitra Mukerji

### Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## **Editorial Board**

Atypical Neurodevelopment Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

*Computational Neuroscience* Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001) Stevan Harnad Editorial Policy Behavioral and Brain Sciences (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/ BBSAssoc).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc and then email bbsjournal@ cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2010. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, http://www.copyright.com, email:info@copyright.com. Specific written permission must be obtained for republication; contact the nearest Cambridge University Press office.

**Subscriptions** Behavioral and Brain Sciences (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 33 (2010) for institutions is US \$1061.00 for print and online, US \$894.00 for online only, and US \$957.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £603.00 for print and online, UK £510.00 for online only, and UK £551.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$302.00 for print and online and US \$276.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £177.00 for print and online and US \$161.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$113.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £171.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$93.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £56.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$218.00 (UK £94.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A. Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals\_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail:journals\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at http://journals.cambridge.org.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see http://cambridge.journals.org.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal Current Anthropology.

# Contents Volume 33:5 October 2010

# Jones, D. Human kinship, from conceptual structure to grammar

# **Open Peer Commentary**

Behme, C. Does kinship terminology provide 381 evidence for or against universal grammar? Bennardo, G. Space, kinship, and mind 382Biró, T. Will Optimality Theory colonize all of higher cognition? 383 Bloch, M. Kinship terms are not kinship 384El Guindi, F. The cognitive path through 384 kinship Gerkey, D. & Cronk, L. Why do we need to coordinate when classifying kin? 385 Hogeweg, L., Legendre, G. & Smolensky, P. Kinship terminology: polysemy or categorization? 386 Hudson, R. Conceptual structure is constrained functionally, not formally 387 Jordan, F. M. & Dunn, M. Kin term diversity is the result of multilevel, historical processes 388 **Kay, P.** Some facts of Seneca kinship semantics 388 Knight, C. Language and kinship: We need some Darwinian theory here 389 Kronenfeld, D. B. Conceptual implications of kinship terminological systems: Special problems and multiple analytic approaches 390 Leaf, M. J. Pragmatic and positivistic analyses of kinship terminology 390 Levinson, S. C. Advancing our grasp of constrained variation in a crucial cognitive domain 391

kinship: An experimental investigation of Chinese	
kin terms	í
Lyon, S. M. Genealogy, kinship, and knowledge:	
A cautionary note about causation	÷
McConvell, P. Getting the constraints right	ć
Miers, P. Typological variation of kinship	
terminologies is a function of strict ranking of	
constraints on nested binary classification trees	:
Musgrave, S. & Dowe, D. L. Kinship,	
optimality and typology	(
Nevins, A. The applicability of theories of	
phonological contrast to kinship systems	ć
<b>Read</b> , <b>D</b> . <b>W</b> . The algebraic logic of kinship	
terminology structures	(
Salazar, Č. Genealogy (and the relationship	
between opposite-sex/same-sex sibling pairs)	
is what kinship is all about	2
Seyfarth, R. M. & Cheney, D. L. The shared	
evolutionary history of kinship classifications	
and language	2
Wierzbicka, A. Lexical universals of kinship	
and social cognition	2

367

# Author's Response

Jones, D.	Thinking a	lbout kins	hip and tl	hinking 4	404
-----------	------------	------------	------------	-----------	-----