

# Minimal first countable spaces

Jack R. Porter

A topological space is  $E_0$  (resp.  $E_1$ ) provided every point is the countable intersection of neighborhoods (resp. closed neighborhoods). For  $i = 0$  and  $i = 1$ , characterizations of minimal  $E_i$  spaces ( $E_i$  spaces with no strictly coarser  $E_i$  topology) and  $E_i$ -closed spaces ( $E_i$  spaces which are closed in every  $E_i$  space containing them) are given; for example, the properties of minimal  $E_i$  and minimal first countable  $T_{i+1}$  are shown to be equivalent. Minimal  $E_0$  spaces are characterized as countable spaces with the cofinite topology, and minimal  $E_1$  spaces are characterized as  $E_1$ -closed and semiregular spaces.  $E_0$ -closed spaces are shown to be precisely the finite discrete spaces.

## 1. Introduction

In a recent paper [2], Au11 mixed the Hausdorff separation axiom with the first countable axiom to yield a new separation axiom denoted as  $E_1$ ; a space is  $E_1$  provided every point is the countable intersection of closed neighborhoods. Clearly, an  $E_1$  space is Hausdorff, and Au11 proved the interesting fact that a countably compact  $E_1$  space is minimal  $E_1$  (a space with a topological property  $P$  is *minimal*  $P$  provided there are no strictly coarser  $P$ -topologies).

In Section 2 of this paper, we derive several characterizations of minimal  $E_1$  spaces. In particular we prove that a space is minimal  $E_1$

Received 28 March 1970. This research was partly supported by University of Kansas research grant No. 3416-5038.

exactly when it is first countable Hausdorff and has no strictly coarser first countable Hausdorff topology; such spaces have been investigated by Stephenson [12]. Also, in this section we characterize  $E_1$ -closed spaces (a space with a topological property  $P$  is  $P$ -closed whenever it is closed in every  $P$  space containing it).

Closely associated with  $E_1$  spaces are spaces in which every point is  $G_\delta$ ; these spaces have been studied and designated as  $G_\delta$ -spaces by Anderson [1] and as  $E_0$  spaces by Aull [2]. In Section 3 we prove that a space is minimal  $E_0$  if and only if it is countable with the cofinite topology (a space has the *cofinite topology* provided the nonvoid open sets are complements of finite sets).

We now list some definitions and facts that will be used throughout the sequel.

A filter base consisting of open sets is called an *open filter base*. A space is said to be *feebly compact* [13] or *lightly compact* [3] provided every locally finite family of nonvoid open sets is finite. A space  $X$  is *Hausdorff except* for a subset  $A \subseteq X$ , cf. [1], provided each pair of distinct points of which one is in  $X \setminus A$  can be separated by disjoint open sets.

(1.1) The following are equivalent for a space  $X$  :

- (a)  $X$  is feebly compact;
- (b) every countable open filter base has at least one adherent point;
- (c) every countable open cover has a finite subfamily whose closures cover  $X$  ;
- (d)  $X$  is closed in every space  $Y$  which contains  $X$  as a subspace, is Hausdorff except for  $X$ , and is first countable at each point of  $Y \setminus X$ .

The equivalence of (a) and (c) is established in [3]. The equivalence of (b), (c) and (d) is similar to the proof in the Hausdorff case [7, pp. 145-146]. We now list two facts by Aull [2].

(1.2) A countably compact  $E_1$  space is minimal  $E_1$  .

(1.3) A first countable Hausdorff space is  $E_1$  .

The natural numbers will be denoted by  $N$  . The symbol  $(X, \tau)$  will denote a topological space whose set is  $X$  and whose topology is  $\tau$  . For a space  $(X, \tau)$  , the regular-open sets (sets equal to the interior of their closure) form an open base for a topology denoted by  $\tau_s$  and called the *semiregularization* of  $\tau$  , cf. [7, p. 138]. A space  $(X, \tau)$  is *semiregular* provided  $\tau = \tau_s$  and is *semiregular at a point*  $p$  , or  $p$  is a *semiregular point* of  $(X, \tau)$  , provided the regular-open sets containing  $p$  form a base at  $p$  .

## 2. $E_1$ spaces

We first characterize  $E_1$ -closed spaces and then minimal  $E_1$  spaces.

**THEOREM 2.1.** *For an  $E_1$  space  $(X, \tau)$  , the following are equivalent:*

- (a)  $(X, \tau)$  is  $E_1$ -closed;
- (b)  $(X, \tau)$  is feebly compact;
- (c)  $X$  is a closed set in every  $E_1$  space  $Y$  which contains  $(X, \tau)$  as a subspace and is first countable at each point of  $Y \setminus X$  ;
- (d)  $(X, \tau_s)$  is minimal  $E_1$  .

Most of the proof is straightforward; the rest is essentially the same as the proof in the Hausdorff case [10; 7, pp. 145-146].

For a topological property  $P$  , let  $P(1)$  denote the combined topological properties of first countable and  $P$  ; so, a Hausdorff(1) space is a first countable Hausdorff space. The next corollary extends Theorem 2.5 of [12].

**COROLLARY 2.2.** *A space is Hausdorff(1)-closed if and only if it is  $E_1$ -closed and first countable.*

Let  $X$  be the space of real numbers with the topology whose base is the usual open intervals minus countable subsets. The subspace  $[0, 1]$

of  $X$  is an example of an  $H$ -closed  $E_1$  space that is not first countable at any point [1, Example 2]. The same type of topology placed on the "long line" yields an  $E_1$ -closed space that is neither  $H$ -closed nor **first** countable at any point.

DEFINITION. A point  $p$  in a space is an  $E_1$  point provided  $p$  is a countable intersection of closed neighborhoods.

LEMMA 2.3. *A semiregular,  $E_1$  point in a feebly compact space has a countable fundamental system of neighborhoods.*

Proof. Let  $X$  be a feebly compact space which is semiregular at an  $E_1$  point  $p$ . There is a decreasing family  $\mathcal{B} = \{B_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  of open sets of  $p$  such that  $\{p\} = \bigcap \bar{B}_n$ . To show that  $\mathcal{B}$  is a base at  $p$ , let  $V$  be a regular-open set containing  $p$ .  $X \setminus V$  is the closure of an open set and by Theorem 14 in [3] is feebly compact. By (1.1) (b), the trace of  $\mathcal{B}$  on  $X \setminus V$  cannot be an open filter base on  $X \setminus V$ ; so, there is  $B \in \mathcal{B}$  such that  $B \subseteq V$ .

THEOREM 2.4. *The following are equivalent for a space  $X$ :*

- (a)  $X$  is minimal  $E_1$ ;
- (b)  $X$  is  $E_1$ -closed and semiregular;
- (c)  $X$  is feebly compact,  $E_1$ , and semiregular;
- (d)  $X$  is  $E_1$  and every countable open filter base with a unique adherent point and nonvoid intersection converges;
- (e)  $X$  is minimal Hausdorff(1).

Proof. By Theorem 2.1, (b) and (c) are equivalent and (b) implies (a). The proof that (a) implies (b) and (d) is similar to the proof in the Hausdorff case [10; 7, pp. 146-147]. Since a minimal Hausdorff(1) space is equivalent to being first countable, Hausdorff, feebly compact, and semiregular by Theorem 2.4 in [12], then by (1.3), (e) implies (c) and by Lemma 2.3, (c) implies (e). The proof is completed if we show that (d) implies (a). Suppose  $(X, \tau)$  satisfies (d) and  $\sigma$  is a coarser  $E_1$  topology on  $X$ . For each  $p$  in  $X$ , there is a decreasing family  $\mathcal{B} = \{B_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  of  $\sigma$ -open sets containing  $p$  with the property that

$\{p\} = \bigcap \text{Cl}_\sigma(B_n)$ . Since  $\sigma \subseteq \tau$ , then by (d),  $B$  converges to  $p$  in  $(X, \tau)$ . This shows that  $(X, \tau)$  is minimal  $E_1$ .

**COROLLARY 2.5.** *A first countable, minimal Hausdorff space is minimal  $E_1$ .*

**DEFINITION.** For a topological property  $P$ , a space is said to be *Katětov  $P$*  provided it has a coarser minimal  $P$  topology.

**COROLLARY 2.6.** *A space is Katětov  $E_1$  if and only if it is Katětov Hausdorff(1).*

By (1.2), countably compact  $E_1$  spaces are minimal  $E_1$ ; the converse is false as shown by Example 3.2 in [12] of a completely regular, locally compact, minimal Hausdorff(1) (and hence minimal  $E_1$ ) space which is not countably compact. Also, there are first countable, minimal Hausdorff spaces [4, Example 1.5] which are not countably compact. By Theorem 2.4, minimal  $E_1$  spaces are  $E_1$ -closed; the converse is false as shown by the examples following Corollary 2.2. By Theorem 2.4, a necessary and sufficient condition for an  $E_1$ -closed space to be minimal  $E_1$  is semiregularity. We now develop a necessary and sufficient condition for an  $E_1$ -closed space to be countably compact.

A regular space has the property that each pair of disjoint closed sets of which one is finite can be separated by disjoint open sets. A space which satisfies this property with finite replaced by countable is called *hyperregular*. So, every hyperregular  $T_1$  space is  $T_3$ . It is easy to verify the following fact.

(2.7) A countably compact  $T_3$  space is hyperregular.

Dugundji [8] has defined a space to be *weakly normal* precisely when it is completely regular and hyperregular  $T_1$ . There exists a countable compact  $T_3$  space that is not completely regular (modify the space in Section 3 of [6] by replacing  $Z_n$  with  $\{n\} \times \Omega' \times \Omega' \setminus \{(n, \Omega, \Omega)\}$ ); this example shows there is a hyperregular  $T_1$  space which is not weakly normal.

**THEOREM 2.8.** *For hyperregular spaces, feeble compactness is equivalent to countable compactness.*

Proof. [8, p. 232]

**COROLLARY 2.9.** *An  $E_1$ -closed space is countably compact if and only if it is hyperregular.*

As a consequence of Theorem 4.1 in [12] and Theorem 2.4, we have the next result.

(2.10) A product of nonvoid spaces is minimal  $E_1$  if and only if each coordinate space is minimal  $E_1$  and there is at most a countable number of coordinate spaces with more than one point.

(2.11) A product of nonvoid spaces is  $E_1$ -closed if and only if each coordinate space is  $E_1$ -closed and there is at most a countable number of coordinate spaces with more than one point.

Proof. The proof follows from (2.10), Theorems 2.1 and 2.4, and the easily proven fact that if  $\{(X_\alpha, \tau_\alpha) \mid \alpha \in A\}$  is a family of spaces, then  $(\pi\tau_\alpha)_S = \pi(\tau_\alpha)_S$  where  $\pi\tau_\alpha$  denotes the product topology on  $\pi X_\alpha$ .

By proofs of Theorems 5.7, 5.9, and 5.10 of [12], the next three facts follow.

(2.12) Any  $E_1$  space  $X$  can be densely embedded in an  $E_1$ -closed space  $Y$  which is first countable at each point of  $Y \setminus X$ .

(2.13) An  $E_1$  space can be densely embedded in a minimal  $E_1$  space if and only if it is first countable and semiregular.

(2.14) An  $E_1$  space can be embedded in a minimal  $E_1$  space if and only if it is first countable.

We conclude this section by giving a cotopological characterization of minimal  $E_1$  spaces. The definitions and notation used are defined in [5].

**LEMMA 2.15.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be an  $E_1$  space and  $F$  a countable open filter base with nonvoid intersection and with a unique adherent point  $p$ . Let  $\mathcal{B} = \{B \in \tau \mid p \in \bar{B} \text{ or } B \subseteq X \setminus \bar{F} \text{ for some } F \in F\}$ .*

(a)  $\mathcal{B}$  is a base for  $\tau$ ;

(b)  $\{X \setminus \bar{B} \mid B \in \mathcal{B}\}$  is a base for a topology labeled  $\tau(\mathcal{B})$  and  $\tau(\mathcal{B}) \subseteq \tau$ ;

- (c) if  $\sigma$  is the topology defined on  $X$  by  $U \in \sigma$  if and only if  $U \in \tau$  and  $p \in U$  implies  $F \subseteq U$  for some  $F \in \mathcal{F}$ , then  $\tau(B) = \sigma_s$ ;
- (d)  $(X, \tau(B))$  is  $E_1$ ;
- (e) if  $\mathcal{F}$  does not converge, then  $\tau(B) \neq \tau$ .

The proofs of parts (a), (b), (d) and (e) are similar to the proof of Lemma 1 in [14]. The proof of part (c) is straightforward and left to the reader. Part (c) shows that the cotopological method of obtaining coarser topologies in this particular case is a combination of the filter method and semiregularization, cf. [5, Section 2].

**THEOREM 2.16.** *An  $E_1$  space is minimal  $E_1$  if and only if there are no strictly coarser  $E_1$  cotopologies.*

*Proof.* Necessity follows from the definition of minimal  $E_1$ . Sufficiency follows from Lemma 2.15 and Theorem 2.4.

### 3. $E_0$ spaces

Berri [4] and Hewitt [9] proved that a space is minimal  $T_1$  if and only if the space has the cofinite topology. In [5], it is observed that a space is  $T_1$ -closed if and only if it is a finite discrete space.

**THEOREM 3.1.** *A space  $X$  is  $E_0$ -closed if and only if  $X$  is a finite discrete space.*

*Proof.* The sufficiency is obvious. For the necessity, it is enough to observe the following:

- (i) the intersection of each countable open filter base in  $X$  is nonvoid and
- (ii) each point of  $X$  is isolated.

We now proceed to characterize minimal  $E_0$  spaces.

**LEMMA 3.2.** *If  $(X, \tau)$  is a minimal  $E_0$  space and  $\mathcal{F}$  is a countable open filter base with void intersection, then  $\mathcal{F}$  converges to each point.*

Proof. Let  $p \in X$ . Define a topology  $\sigma$  on  $X$  by  $U \in \sigma$  if and only if  $U \in \tau$  and  $p \in U$  implies  $F \subseteq U$  for some  $F \in \mathcal{F}$ .  $(X, \sigma)$  is an  $E_0$  space and  $\sigma \subseteq \tau$ . Since  $(X, \tau)$  is minimal  $E_0$ , then  $\sigma = \tau$ . This shows that  $\mathcal{F}$  converges to  $p$ .

LEMMA 3.3. *If a minimal  $E_0$  space  $X$  has one nonisolated point, then every point is nonisolated.*

Proof. Let  $p$  in  $X$  be nonisolated. There is a decreasing sequence  $\{U_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  of open sets containing  $p$  whose intersection is  $p$ . Now  $\mathcal{F} = \{U_n \setminus \{p\} \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a countable open filter base with void intersection. By Lemma 3.2,  $\mathcal{F}$  converges to each point of  $X$ ; this shows that each point is nonisolated.

LEMMA 3.4. *A minimal  $E_0$  space  $X$  contains at most a finite number of isolated points.*

Proof. Assume  $X$  is a minimal  $E_0$  space with a denumerable number of isolated points, say  $\{x_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  such that  $x_n = x_m$  only if  $n = m$ . Let  $U_n = \{x_m \mid m \geq n\}$  for each  $n$  in  $\mathbb{N}$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{U_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a countable open filter base with void intersection. By Lemma 3.2,  $\mathcal{F}$  converges to the point  $x_1$  which is a contradiction as  $x_1$  is an isolated point.

THEOREM 3.5. *A space is minimal  $E_0$  if and only if the space is countable with the cofinite topology.*

Proof. Since a countable space with the cofinite topology is  $E_0$  and minimal  $T_1$  [4, Theorem 2.2], then it is minimal  $E_0$ . Conversely, suppose  $X$  is a minimal  $E_0$  space. Assume  $X$  is not countable. By Lemmata 3.3 and 3.4,  $X$  contains no isolated points. Let  $p \in X$ ; as in the proof of Lemma 3.3, there is a countable open filter base  $\mathcal{F} = \{F_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  with void intersection. We now show that  $U \subseteq X$  is a nonvoid open set if and only if  $F_n \subseteq U$  for some  $F_n \in \mathcal{F}$ . If  $U$  is an open set and  $q \in U$ , then since  $\mathcal{F}$  converges to  $q$  by Lemma 3.2, there



is a  $F_n$  in  $F$  such that  $F_n \subseteq U$ . Conversely, suppose  $U \subseteq X$  and  $F_m \subseteq U$  for some  $F_m \in F$ . Let  $q \in U$ . There is a decreasing sequence  $\{U_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  of open sets containing  $q$  whose intersection is  $q$ . By Lemma 3.2,  $\{U_n \setminus \{q\} \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  converges to  $p$ . There is  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $U_k \setminus \{q\} \subseteq F_m \cup \{p\}$  and  $p \notin U_k$ . Since  $q \in U$ , then  $U_k \subseteq U$ . This shows that  $U$  is open.

Since  $X \setminus \{p\} = \bigcup X \setminus F_n$ , then for some  $m$ ,  $X \setminus F_m$  is infinite. Let  $\{p_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a subset of  $X \setminus F_m$ , and for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , let  $W_n = F_n \cup \{p_k \mid k \geq n\}$ . Then  $G = \{W_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a countable open filter base with void intersection. By Lemma 3.2,  $G$  converges to  $p$ . So,  $W_k \subseteq F_m \cup \{p\}$  for some  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ . This implies that  $\{p_r \mid r \geq k\} \subseteq F_m \cup \{p\}$  which is a contradiction. This shows that  $X$  is countable.

Since the cofinite topology on a countable set is an  $E_0$  topology which is coarser than any other  $E_0$  topology on the set, then  $X$  must possess the cofinite topology. This completes the proof of the theorem.

**THEOREM 3.6.** *The following are equivalent for a space  $X$ :*

- (a)  $X$  is minimal  $E_0$ ;
- (b)  $X$  is first countable and minimal  $T_1$ ;
- (c)  $X$  is minimal  $T_1(1)$ .

**Proof.** The equivalence of (a) and (b) follows from Theorem 3.5. Clearly, (b) implies (c). The proof that (c) implies (a) is similar to the proof in the  $E_1$  case.

## References

- [1] Frank W. Anderson, "A lattice characterization of completely regular  $G_\delta$ -spaces", *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 6 (1955), 757-765.

- [2] C.E. Aull, "A certain class of topological spaces", *Prace Mat.* 11 (1967), 49-53.
- [3] R.W. Bagley, E.H. Connell and J.D. McKnight, Jr, "On properties characterizing pseudocompact spaces", *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 9 (1958), 500-506.
- [4] Manuel P. Berri, "Minimal topological spaces", *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 108 (1963), 97-105.
- [5] Manuel P. Berri, Jack R. Porter and R.M. Stephenson, Jr, "A survey of minimal topological spaces", (submitted).
- [6] Manuel P. Berri and R.H. Sorgenfrey, "Minimal regular spaces", *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 14 (1963), 454-458.
- [7] Nicolas Bourbaki, *General topology, Part 1* (Addison-Wesley, Reading, Massachussets; London, Ontario, 1966).
- [8] James Dugundji, *Topology* (Allyn and Bacon, Boston, 1966).
- [9] Edwin Hewitt, "A problem of set-theoretic topology", *Duke Math. J.* 10 (1943), 309-333.
- [10] Miroslav Katětov, "Über  $H$ -abgeschlossene und bikompakte Räume", *Časopis Pěst. Mat. Fys.* 69 (1940), 36-49.
- [11] Chen-Tung Liu, "Absolutely closed spaces", *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 130 (1968), 86-104.
- [12] R.M. Stephenson, Jr, "Minimal first countable topologies", *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 138 (1969), 115-127.
- [13] A.H. Stone, "Hereditarily compact spaces", *Amer. J. Math.* 82 (1960), 901-916.
- [14] Giovanni Viglino, "A co-topological application to minimal spaces", *Pacific J. Math.* 27 (1968), 197-200.

The University of Kansas,  
Lawrence, Kansas, USA.