

# Approximative compactness and continuity of metric projections

**B.B. Panda and O.P. Kapoor**

In the paper "Some remarks on approximative compactness", *Rev. Roumaine Math. Pures Appl.* 9 (1964), Ivan Singer proved that if  $K$  is an approximatively compact Chebyshev set in a metric space, then the metric projection onto  $K$  is continuous. The object of this paper is to show that though, in general, the continuity of the metric projection supported by a Chebyshev set does not imply that the set is approximatively compact, it is indeed so in a large class of Banach spaces, including the locally uniformly convex spaces. It is also proved that in such a space  $X$  the metric projection onto a Chebyshev set is continuous on a set dense in  $X$ .

## Introduction

The important concept of the approximative compactness of a set, which was first introduced by Efimov and Stečkin [2], arises quite naturally in the theory of best approximation in normed linear spaces. We recall that a set  $K$  in a normed linear space  $X$  is called approximatively compact if, for any  $x$  in  $X$  and any sequence  $\{g_n\}$  in  $K$ , the relation  $\|x - g_n\| \rightarrow \inf\{\|x - g\| : g \in K\}$  implies that  $\{g_n\}$  is compact in  $K$  in the sense that there is a subsequence of  $\{g_n\}$  which converges in  $K$ . Every boundedly compact set is approximatively compact, and in a uniformly convex Banach space every weakly sequentially closed set is approximatively

---

Received 25 March 1974. The first author was on leave at the IIT Kanpur.

compact. Singer [8] characterised those spaces which share this property of uniformly convex Banach spaces. In the same paper Singer proved that an approximatively compact Chebyshev set supports a continuous metric projection ([8], Corollary 2). This came as a generalization of various continuity properties of the metric projection given by Klee ([5], Propositions 2.3 and 2.4) and Ky Fan and Glicksberg ([3], Theorem 8). In the present paper we prove that in a large class of Banach spaces which we call "spaces with property (M)" a converse of Singer's result holds: namely, the continuity of the metric projection onto a Chebyshev set  $K$  implies the approximative compactness of the set  $K$ . We also prove that in such a space  $X$  the metric projection supported by a Chebyshev set is always continuous on a subset dense in  $X$ . Again it is shown that a proximal sun in such a space is approximatively compact and hence in a Banach space with property (M) every Chebyshev subspace supports a continuous metric projection.

Throughout this paper we shall denote a real normed linear space by  $X$  and its conjugate space by  $X^*$ . Let

$$B[x, r] = \{y \in X : \|x-y\| \leq r\}, \quad U(X) = \{y \in X : \|y\| \leq 1\},$$

and

$$S(X) = \{y \in X : \|y\| = 1\}.$$

The distance from a point  $x$  in  $X$  to a subset  $K$  of  $X$  is defined by  $d_K(x) = \inf\{\|x-y\| : y \in K\}$ . The metric projection  $P_K$  supported by a subset  $K$  of  $X$  is a mapping defined by

$$P_K(x) = \{y \in K : \|x-y\| = d_K(x)\} \text{ for } x \text{ in } X.$$

$K$  is a *proximal* (respectively *Chebyshev*) set provided  $P_K(x)$  contains at least (respectively exactly) one point for each  $x \in X$ . It is called a *sun* if for each  $x \in X$ , there is a  $v \in P_K(x)$  such that  $v \in P_K(v+\lambda(x-v))$  for every  $\lambda \geq 0$ .  $P_K$  is said to be *upper semicontinuous* at  $x$  if for every open set  $M \subset K$  such that  $P_K(x) \subset M$ , there exists in  $M$  an open neighborhood  $V$  of  $x$  such that  $P_K(y) \subset M$  for every  $y \in V$ .

A *subgradient* of a proper convex function  $f$  at a point  $x \in X$  is an  $x^* \in X^*$  such that

$$f(y) \geq f(x) + x^*(y-x), \text{ for all } y \in X.$$

In particular, the norm being a proper convex function, an element  $x^* \in X^*$  is a subgradient of the norm at  $x \neq \theta$  ( $\theta$  will denote the null element of  $X$ ), if and only if  $\|x^*\| = 1$  and  $x^*(x) = \|x\|$ .

A normed linear space  $X$  is said to have *property (M)* if the following holds:

For any  $x$  in  $S(X)$ , each sequence  $\{g_n\}$  contained in  $U(X)$  with  $\|g_n - x\| \rightarrow 2$  has a convergent subsequence in  $U(X)$ .

Clearly every locally uniformly convex normed linear space has property (M). Indeed it can be easily proved that  $X$  is locally uniformly convex if and only if it is strictly convex and has property (M). The spaces with property (M) have been discussed in another paper by the authors [7]. Lemma 2 of the present paper contains one geometric property of the unit sphere of such spaces.

### The main result

We now prove our main result, the 'only if' part of which was proved by Singer as mentioned above.

**THEOREM 1.** *Let  $K$  be a Chebyshev subset of a normed linear space  $X$  which has property (M). Then  $K$  is approximatively compact if and only if the metric projection  $P_K$  is continuous on  $X$ .*

For the proof of the theorem we need the following lemma due to Vlasov ([9], Lemma 1), a proof of which is given below for the sake of completeness.

**LEMMA 1.** *Let  $X$  be a normed linear space, and let  $K$  be a Chebyshev subset of  $X$ . If  $x \in X$  is a point of continuity of the metric projection  $P_K$  then*

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow 0} \frac{d_K(x+t(x-P_K(x))) - d_K(x)}{t} = d_K(x).$$

**Proof of Lemma 1.** Let  $z \in X$  and let  $\{t_n\}$  be any sequence of positive real numbers converging to zero. Let  $\phi_n$  be a subgradient of the

norm at  $x - P_K(x+t_n z)$ . Then for all  $n \geq 1$ ,

$$(1) \quad \phi_n(x - P_K(x+t_n z)) = \|x - P_K(x+t_n z)\|,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|x+t_n z - P_K(x+t_n z)\| &\geq \|x - P_K(x+t_n z)\| + \phi_n(t_n z) \\ &\geq d_K(x) + \phi_n(t_n z), \end{aligned}$$

so that

$$(2) \quad d_K(x+t_n z) - d_K(x) \geq \phi_n(t_n z).$$

Again let  $\phi'_n$  be a subgradient of the norm at  $x + t_n z - P_K(x)$ . Then for all  $n \geq 1$ ,

$$(3) \quad \phi'_n(x+t_n z - P_K(x)) = \|x+t_n z - P_K(x)\|$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|x - P_K(x)\| &\geq \|x+t_n z - P_K(x)\| - \phi'_n(t_n z) \\ &\geq d_K(x+t_n z) - \phi'_n(t_n z) \end{aligned}$$

so that

$$(4) \quad d_K(x+t_n z) - d_K(x) \leq \phi'_n(t_n z).$$

Now let  $\phi$  and  $\phi'$  be any weak\*-cluster points of  $\{\phi_n\}$  and  $\{\phi'_n\}$  respectively. Then by (1) and (3) and the continuity of  $P_K$  we have

$$(5) \quad \phi(x - P_K(x)) = \|x - P_K(x)\| = \phi'(x - P_K(x))$$

and thus  $\phi$  and  $\phi'$  are subgradients of the norm at  $x - P_K(x)$ . From (2) and (4) we get

$$\phi_n(z) \leq \frac{d_K(x+t_n z) - d_K(x)}{t_n} \leq \phi'_n(z).$$

Putting  $z = x - P_K(x)$  and taking account of (5) we conclude that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow 0} \frac{d_K(x+t(x - P_K(x))) - d_K(x)}{t} = d_K(x).$$

In the same way we can prove that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{d_K(x+t(x-P_K(x))) - d_K(x)}{t} = d'_K(x) ,$$

and hence the result is proved.

Proof of Theorem 1. Let  $\{g_n\} \subset K$ ,  $x \in X \sim K$  and  $\|x-g_n\| \rightarrow d_K(x)$ .

Suppose that  $P_K$  is continuous. Set  $t_n = (\|x-g_n\| - d_K(x))^{\frac{1}{2}}$ . Clearly  $t_n$  tends to zero through nonnegative values. We can assume without loss of generality that  $t_n > 0$  by passing on to a subsequence, if necessary. Let  $\phi_n$  be a subgradient of the norm at  $x + t_n(x-P_K(x)) - g_n$  so that

$$(6) \quad \phi_n(x+t_n(x-P_K(x))-g_n) = \|x+t_n(x-P_K(x))-g_n\| ,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|x-g_n\| &\geq \|x+t_n(x-P_K(x))-g_n\| - t_n\phi_n(x-P_K(x)) \\ &\geq d_K(x+t_n(x-P_K(x))) - t_n\phi_n(x-P_K(x)) . \end{aligned}$$

Hence

$$(7) \quad \frac{d_K(x+t_n(x-P_K(x))) - d_K(x)}{t_n} \leq \phi_n(x-P_K(x)) .$$

Applying Lemma 1 to (7) we see that  $\|x-P_K(x)\| \leq \phi_0(x-P_K(x))$ , where  $\phi_0$  is any weak\*-cluster point of the sequence  $\{\phi_n\}$ . This implies that  $\phi_0(x-P_K(x)) = \|x-P_K(x)\|$ . We assume without loss of generality that  $\{\phi_n\}$  converges to  $\phi_0$  in the weak\*-topology. Now set

$$z_n = \frac{x+t_n(x-P_K(x))-g_n}{\|x+t_n(x-P_K(x))-g_n\|} \quad \text{and} \quad z = \frac{x-P_K(x)}{\|x-P_K(x)\|} .$$

Then

$$2 = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \phi_n(z_n+z) \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|z_n+z\| \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|z_n+z\| \leq 2$$

and hence  $\|z_n+z\| \rightarrow 2$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Since  $X$  has property (M), the sequence  $\{z_n\}$  has a convergent subsequence. Moreover,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|x + t_n(x - P_K(x)) - g_n\| = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|x - g_n\| = d_K(x), \quad x \in X \sim K,$$

and hence  $\{g_n\}$  also has a convergent subsequence.

The converse is well known and holds even in a metric space setting (see [8]).

The following example shows that, in general, continuity of the metric projection does not imply that the Chebyshev set is approximately compact.

**EXAMPLE.** Let  $X$  be the dual space of the Banach space constructed by Klee [6] by suitably renorming  $l^2$ . Lambert (unpublished) has shown that in the space  $X$  the metric projection  $P_K$  supported by any Chebyshev subspace  $K$  of  $X$  is continuous. However,  $X$  does not satisfy the Efimov-Stečkin property and hence contains a closed hyperplane  $X$  which is not approximately compact (Singer, [8], Theorem 3). Since  $X$  is strictly convex and reflexive,  $K$  is a Chebyshev subspace and thus supports a continuous metric projection. The space  $X$  of course would not have property (M) (see also Holmes [4], p. 165).

### Some further results

We give next a geometric property of the unit sphere of spaces with property (M). This property will be used to obtain some more results about continuity behaviour of metric projections.

**LEMMA 2.** *Let  $X$  be a normed linear space with property (M). Let  $x$  be a nonzero element of  $U(X)$ , and let*

$$K_n = B[x, 1 - \|x\| + 1/n] \sim \text{int}U(X).$$

*Then each sequence  $\{g_n\}$  with  $g_n \in K_n$  has a convergent subsequence in  $X \sim \text{int}U(X)$ .*

**Proof.** From

$$1 - \|x\| \leq \|g_n\| - \|x\| \leq \|x - g_n\| \leq 1 - \|x\| + 1/n,$$

it follows that  $\|g_n\| \rightarrow 1$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Now there exists  $\psi_n \in S(X^*)$  such that  $\psi_n(g_n) = \|g_n\|$  and hence

$$(8) \quad \|g_n\| = \psi_n(g_n - x + x) \leq \|x - g_n\| + \psi_n(x) .$$

If  $\psi_0$  is any weak\*-cluster point of the sequence  $\{\psi_n\}$  then from (8) we get  $1 \leq 1 - \|x\| + \psi_0(x)$ ; that is,  $\|x\| \leq \psi_0(x)$ . As

$$\|\psi_0\| \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|\psi_n\| = 1, \text{ this implies that } \psi_0(x) = \|x\| \text{ and } \|\psi_0\| = 1 .$$

Now set  $z_n = g_n / \|g_n\|$  and  $z = x / \|x\|$ . Then taking a subsequence  $\{\psi_{n_i}\}$  such that  $\psi_{n_i} \rightarrow \psi_0$  in the weak\*-topology, we get

$$2 = \lim_{i \rightarrow \infty} \psi_{n_i}(z_{n_i} + z) \leq \liminf_{i \rightarrow \infty} \|z_{n_i} + z\| \leq \limsup_{i \rightarrow \infty} \|z_{n_i} + z\| \leq 2 ,$$

and thus  $\lim_{i \rightarrow \infty} \|z_{n_i} + z\| = 2$ . As  $X$  has property (M) the sequence  $\{z_{n_i}\}$

has a convergent subsequence in  $U(X)$ . Hence  $\{g_{n_i}\}$  has a convergent

subsequence in  $X \sim \text{int}U(X)$ . This in turn implies that the original sequence has a convergent subsequence in  $X \sim \text{int}U(X)$ . This proves the lemma.

**THEOREM 2.** *Let  $X$  be a space with property (M), and let  $K$  be a proximal sun in  $X$ . Then*

- (i)  $K$  is approximatively compact, and
- (ii)  $P_K$  is upper semicontinuous on  $X$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\{g_m\} \subset K$  be a sequence such that  $\|g_m - x\| \rightarrow d_K(x)$ . Since  $K$  is a sun, there is a point  $y \in P_K(x)$  such that all points on the ray  $\overrightarrow{yx}$  are projected on  $y$ . Take  $z_0 = x + \lambda_0(x - y)$  where  $\lambda_0 > 0$  and set

$$K_n = B[x, \|x - y\| + 1/n] \sim \text{int}B[z_0, \|z_0 - y\|] .$$

Since  $\|g_m - x\| \rightarrow \|x - y\| = d_K(x)$ , there exists for each  $n$  a  $g_{m_n}$  such that

$g_{m_n} \in K_n$ . By Lemma 2, there exists a subsequence of  $\{g_{m_n}\}$  which is

convergent in  $K$  ( $K$  is closed). Thus  $K$  is approximatively compact.

Since the metric projection supported by an approximatively compact set is upper semi-continuous (Singer [8], Theorem 1), (i) implies (ii).

REMARK. As a consequence of Theorem 2 all proximal subspaces in a space  $X$  with property (M) are approximatively compact. Thus all reflexive spaces having property (M) satisfy the Efimov-Stečkin property (see Singer [8]). However, it is known that the converse is not true (see [7]).

In the following we use Lemma 2 to obtain another result about the continuity behaviour of the metric projection onto a Chebyshev set which may not be a sun.

**THEOREM 3.** *Let  $K$  be a Chebyshev set in a normed linear space  $X$  with property (M). Then  $P_K$  is continuous on a subset dense in  $X$ .*

Proof. Let  $x \in X \setminus K$  and let  $z \neq x$  be any point on the line segment between  $x$  and  $P_K(x)$ ; that is,  $z = \lambda x + (1-\lambda)P_K(x)$  for  $0 \leq \lambda < 1$ . Let  $\{z_n\}$  be any sequence converging to  $z$ . It can be easily proved that  $\|P_K(z_n) - z\| \rightarrow \|P_K(z) - z\|$ . Now an application of Lemma 2 in the manner it was done in Theorem 2 shows that the sequence  $\{P_K(z_n)\}$  is compact in  $K$ . As  $K$  is Chebyshev this means that  $P_K(z_n) \rightarrow P_K(z)$  in norm. On the other hand, if  $x \in K$  then  $P_K(x) = x$  and hence  $P_K$  is continuous on  $K$ . Combining these two we get the required result.

The assumption in Theorem 3 that  $K$  is Chebyshev can be relaxed provided the norm in  $X$  has some additional properties.

**THEOREM 4.** *Let  $K$  be either*

- (a) *a closed subset of a uniformly convex Banach space, or*
- (b) *a proximal subset of a locally uniformly convex Banach space.*

*Then there exists a subset  $G$  dense in  $X$  such that the restriction of the metric projection  $P_K$  to the set  $G$  is singlevalued and continuous.*

Proof. First, let  $K$  be a closed subset of a uniformly convex Banach space. Then by a result of Edelstein [1], there exists a subset  $D$  dense in  $X$  such that every point in  $D$  admits a nearest point in  $K$ . The

union  $G$  of all sets  $\{\lambda x + (1-\lambda)y : 0 \leq \lambda < 1, x \in D, y \in P_K(x)\}$  is clearly dense in  $X$ . Moreover, every element of  $G$  admits a unique nearest point in  $K$ . An application of Lemma 2 in the way it was done in Theorem 3 yields the required result.

In the case of (b) the set  $D$  is the whole space  $X$  and the proof is the same. Hence the theorem is proved.

### References

- [1] M. Edelstein, "On nearest points of sets in uniformly convex Banach spaces", *J. London Math. Soc.* 43 (1968), 375-377.
- [2] N.V. Efimov and S.B. Stečkin, "Approximative compactness and Čebyšev sets", *Soviet Math. Dokl.* 2 (1961), 1226-1228.
- [3] Ky Fan and Irving Glicksberg, "Some geometric properties of the spheres in a normed linear space", *Duke Math. J.* 25 (1958), 553-568.
- [4] Richard B. Holmes, *A course on optimization and best approximation* (Lecture Notes in Mathematics, 257. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York, 1972).
- [5] Victor Klee, "Convexity of Chebyshev sets", *Math. Ann.* 142 (1961), 292-304.
- [6] V. Klee, "Two renorming constructions related to a question of Anselone", *Studia Math.* 33 (1969), 231-242.
- [7] B.B. Panda and O.P. Kapoor, "A generalization of local uniform convexity of the norm", *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* (to appear).
- [8] Ivan Singer, "Some remarks on approximative compactness", *Rev. Roumaine Math. Pures Appl.* 9 (1964), 167-177.
- [9] L.P. Vlasov, "On Čebyšev sets", *Soviet Math. Dokl.* 8 (1967), 401-404.

Department of Mathematics,  
Regional Engineering College,  
Rourkela, Orissa,  
India.

Department of Mathematics,  
Indian Institute of Technology, Kanpur,  
Kanpur,  
India.