

Volume 111 ■ 2017

ISSN 0272-5037

PROCEEDINGS

Proceedings of the 111th Annual Meeting

What International Law Values

American Society of International Law

April 12–15, 2017

Washington, DC



American Society
of International Law

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 111TH ANNUAL MEETING

What International Law Values April 12–15, 2017 Washington, DC

Proceedings of the ASIL Annual Meeting (Proceedings) is the official record of the American Society of International Law's Annual Meeting. It documents the array of presentations, addresses and discussions among scholars, practitioners, judges, government officials, and advocates from around the world who meet each year to discuss the most salient international legal issues of the day. For over a century, the Annual Meeting has been among the most important gatherings of international law professionals, bringing together more than 1,200 participants from some 75 countries. *Proceedings* serves as an indispensable account of the state of international law throughout the world.

Proceedings does not accept unsolicited submissions. Each Volume documents the year's Annual Meeting. Shortly after each Meeting, presenters are invited to submit a written version of their presentation by a particular deadline.

It is the policy of the American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the addresses, remarks, and discussions delivered at the ASIL Annual Meeting and appearing in *Proceedings* are those of the individual speakers and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Society.

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law (ASIL) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan, educational membership organization founded in 1906 by U.S. Secretary of State Elihu Root and chartered by Congress in 1950. Headquartered in Washington, D.C., its mission is "to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice." ASIL holds Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations and is a constituent society of the American Council of Learned Societies.

ASIL's nearly four thousand members hail from more than one hundred nations with nearly 40 percent residing outside the United States. Its members include scholars, jurists, practitioners, government officials, leaders in international and nongovernmental organizations, students, and others interested in international law. Through its many publications, conferences, briefings, and educational events, ASIL seeks to serve the needs of its diverse membership and to advance understanding of international law among policymakers and the public.

ASIL is a volunteer-led organization governed by a sixty-member Executive Council elected by its membership. In partnership with the elected leadership, ASIL is led by an executive director and supported by a professional staff.

Become a Member

asil.org/membership

Join one of the Society's Partner Programs and Receive Complimentary Ad Space in *Proceedings*

asil.org/financial-support/sponsors-and-institutional-supporters

Follow the Society on Twitter

twitter.com/asilorg

Like us on Facebook

facebook.com/AmericanSocietyofInternationalLaw

JOURNAL INFORMATION

Proceedings is published annually in print and online by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of International Law. To reduce time between acceptance and publication, contributions may appear online as *FirstView* publications in advance of their scheduled publication in an issue. Discover the entire *Proceedings* back archive at cambridge.org/core/journals/proceedings-of-the-asil-annual-meeting/all-issues

Subscriptions

The electronic version of *Proceedings* is available to all members of the American Society of International Law by login to the ASIL website www.asil.org. Print copies are available to members for an additional fee.

To subscribe as a non-member or recommend a subscription to your librarian go to cambridge.org/core/journals/proceedings-of-the-asil-annual-meeting.

Claims and Address Updates

subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada and Mexico)
journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere)

Copyright and Permissions

cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

To Advertise in the Journal

ad_sales@cambridge.org

Abstracting and Indexing Services

cambridge.org/core/journals/proceedings-of-the-asil-annual-meeting/information/abstracting-indexing-services

For Other ASIL Publications

www.asil.org

Proper Citation

Proceedings shall be cited according to the following example:
111 ASIL PROC. 214 (2017)

ISSN: 0272-5037

E-ISSN: 2169-1118

© American Society of International Law

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 111TH ANNUAL MEETING

CHAIRS OF THE COMMITTEE
OF THE ANNUAL MEETING
Aloysius Llamzon
Julie Maupin
Saira Mohamed

CO-EDITORS OF THE PROCEEDINGS
Aloysius Llamzon
Julie Maupin
Saira Mohamed

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	ix
An Introduction: What International Law Values <i>Aloysius Llamzon, Julie Maupin, and Saira Mohamed</i>	1
Nineteenth Annual Grotius Lecture	
Civil War Time: From Grotius to the Global War on Terror <i>David Armitage</i>	3
On the Civil-Ness of Civil War: A Comment on David Armitage's <i>Civil War Time</i> <i>Mary L. Dudziak</i>	14
International Law and the Trump Administration: National and International Security	
Opening Remarks by: <i>Lucinda Low</i>	21
Introductory Remarks by: <i>Oonagh Fitzgerald</i>	22
<i>Benjamin Wittes</i>	22
Remarks by: <i>Shireen Hunter</i>	23
<i>John Bellinger</i>	25
<i>Elisa Massimino</i>	26
Balancing Rights and Obligations of States and Investors	
Introductory Remarks by: <i>R. Doak Bishop</i>	43
Balancing Rights and Obligations of States and Investors: Is Reform Real or Imagined? <i>Donald McRae</i>	44
Rebalancing Rights and Duties of States and Investors <i>Marcos Orellana</i>	46
Heading Off Disputes by Paying Attention to Human Rights in Foreign Investor/Host State Contract Negotiations <i>John F. Sherman III</i>	48
Protecting Human Rights and Preserving the Benefits of ISDR <i>Hewitt Pate</i>	51
Changes in the Balance of Rights and Obligations: Toward Investor Responsibilization <i>Laurence Boisson de Chazournes</i>	53

International Law and Cyberspace: Challenges for and by Non-State Actors

Introductory Remarks by:

Laura Dickinson 57

Remarks by:

Col. Gary Corn 57

Lt. Col. Sean Watts 59

Jeannie Rhee 62

How International is International Law?

Remarks by:

Lori F. Damrosch 69

Maria Teresa Infante Caffi 71

Jacques deLisle 75

The Right to Fair Trials Under International Law

Remarks by:

Mark Ellis 79

TPP, Brexit, and After: The Uneasy Future of Deep Economic Agreements

WTO Procedures to Monitor RTAs

Rohini Acharya 89

Foreign Policy and Trade Law: Japan's Unexpected Leadership in TPP

Negotiations

Christina L. Davis 90

Stocktaking and Glimpsing at Trade Law's Next Generation

Kathleen Claussen 92

Are International Claims Commissions Effective Dispute Resolution Mechanisms?

Introductory Remarks by:

Natalie Klein 97

Remarks by:

John R. Crook 97

Crafting a Successful International Mass Claims Commission

Chiara Giorgetti 100

The Future of International Claims Commissions: Conceptualizing the EU'S

Proposed Multilateral Investment Court as an International Claims Tribunal

Jeremy K. Sharpe 102

Does International Law Value Regionalism in Criminal Law Enforcement?

Introductory Remarks by:

Erika de Wet 107

The Shared Goals but Distinct Roles of Criminal and Human Rights Courts

Alexandra Huneus 108

Late Breaking Panel: Missile Strikes Against Syria

Introductory Remarks by:

Catherine Powell 113

Remarks by:

Harold Hongju Koh 114

President Trump's Declaration of War Against Syria

Saikrishna Bangalore Prakash 119

Remarks by:	
<i>Jennifer Daskal</i>	121
<i>Stephen Pomper</i>	123
Debate: Compulsory Jurisdiction in International Dispute Settlement: Beyond David Versus Goliath?	
Introduction	129
Remarks by:	
<i>Ben Juratowitch QC</i>	129
<i>Loretta Malintoppi</i>	131
<i>Gleider I. Hernández</i>	134
<i>Tai-Heng Cheng</i>	137
<i>Ina Popova</i>	138
<i>Judge James Crawford</i>	140
<i>Judge Stephen Schwebel</i>	141
<i>Ben Juratowitch QC</i>	141
Arms Control and The Challenges of New Technologies	
Cyber Defense Norms and NATO	
<i>Steven Hill</i>	145
Keynote Address	
<i>Philippe Sands QC</i>	147
International Law and The Trump Administration: Trade and Investment	
Opening Remarks by:	
<i>Mark Agrast</i>	161
Remarks by:	
<i>Oonagh Fitzgerald</i>	162
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Gary Hufbauer</i>	163
Remarks by:	
<i>Aaditya Mattoo</i>	163
<i>Warren Maruyama</i>	166
<i>Rachel Brewster</i>	167
<i>Michael Smart</i>	168
Vagts Roundtable: Lawyering in The Age of Transnational Government	
Opening Remarks by:	
<i>Lucinda Low</i>	185
Remarks by:	
<i>Karen Vagts</i>	185
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Hannah Buxbaum</i>	186
Remarks by:	
<i>Kath Hall</i>	187
<i>Sally March</i>	191
<i>Laura Stein</i>	192
<i>Jonathan Welch</i>	194
The Rise of Multistakeholder Global Governance	
The Rise of Multistakeholder Partnerships	
<i>Ayelet Berman</i>	205

Hudson Medal Luncheon: A Conversation With Georges Abi-Saab

Opening Remarks by:	
<i>Lucinda Low</i>	209
Remarks by:	
<i>Paul Reichler</i>	209
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Philip Alston</i>	210
Remarks by:	
<i>Georges Abi-Saab</i>	211

Military Intervention by Consent

Remarks by:	
<i>Ashley S. Deeks</i>	221
Consent, Forcible Intervention, and Internal Justification to Use Force	
<i>Eliav Lieblich</i>	222
Military Intervention by Consent and Its Relationship to International Human Rights Law	
<i>Jonathan Horowitz</i>	225
Remarks by:	
<i>Robert Taylor</i>	227

Fifth Annual Charles N. Brower Lecture on International Dispute Resolution: The Multiple Functions of International Courts and the Singular Task of the Adjudicator

Remarks By:	
<i>David D. Caron</i>	231

Regulating the Global Commons: The BBNJ Negotiations and Ocean Spaces Beyond National Jurisdiction

Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Catherine Redgwell</i>	241
Capacity Building and Technology Transfer for Marine Biodiversity in Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction	
<i>Harriet Harden-Davies</i>	243
Marine Genetic Resources, Including Sharing of Benefits	
<i>Angel Horna</i>	245
Area-Based Management Tools, Including Marine Protected Areas	
<i>Penelope Nevill</i>	247
Environmental Assessment in Marine Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction: Practice and Prospects	
<i>Robin Warner</i>	252

The Inter-American Human Rights System: Latest Jurisprudential Advances and Setbacks

Remarks by:	
<i>Thomas Antkowiak</i>	257
Women's Rights in Recent Inter-American Human Rights Jurisprudence	
<i>Bernard Duhaime</i>	258
Remedies of the Inter-American Human Rights System	
<i>Viviana Krsticevic</i>	261
Remarks by:	
<i>Alejandra Gonza</i>	263

Friday Keynote: Seen and not Heard	
<i>Sandie Okoro</i>	267
International Law and the Trump Administration: Global Engagement on Environmental Law	
Opening Remarks by:	
<i>Lucinda Low</i>	269
Remarks by:	
<i>Sylvia Maciunas</i>	269
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Paul Joffe</i>	270
Remarks by:	
<i>E. Donald Elliott</i>	272
<i>Susan Casey-Lefkowitz</i>	275
<i>Carl Bruch</i>	278
<i>Jean Krasno</i>	284
<i>Kevin Mead</i>	286
<i>Dan Wade</i>	286
<i>Alicia Cate</i>	287
Valuing Women in International Adjudication	
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Susan Franck</i>	289
Valuing Women as Counsel in International Adjudication	
<i>Kate Parlett</i>	293
Valuing Diversity in All Forms in International Courts	
<i>Josephine Jarpa Dawuni</i>	296
The Value and Purpose of International Law	
The Purpose of International Law Is to Advance Justice—and International Law Has No Value Unless It Does So	
<i>Mortimer N.S. Sellers</i>	301
Remarks by:	
<i>Maxwell Chibundu</i>	305
Peace is the Fundamental Value that International Law Exists to Serve	
<i>Cecilia M. Bailliet</i>	308
New Voices: Jurisdictional Issues in International Law	
Rethinking Compulsory Jurisdiction: The Case for U.S. Reentry into the ICJ'S Optional Clause System	
<i>Brian McGarry</i>	313
Jurisdiction over Incidental Questions in International Law	
<i>Ben Love</i>	316
Designing Transnational Litigation: The Case Against Forum Non Conveniens	
<i>Maggie Gardner</i>	321
Closing Plenary: Building Trust in International Law and Institutions	
Opening Remarks by:	
<i>Lucinda Low</i>	325
Introductory Remarks by:	
<i>Ernst Hirsch Ballin</i>	325
Remarks by:	
<i>Christine van den Wyngaert</i>	327

<i>Bruno Simma</i>	330
<i>Maurice Kamto</i>	333
<i>Philip Alston</i>	335
<i>Jean Yu-Wen</i>	338
<i>Mark Wojcik</i>	338
<i>Katie Lundy</i>	338
<i>Chuck Newcomb</i>	339
<i>Saskia Bruines</i>	342
<i>Benjamin Ferencz</i>	343
111th Annual Meeting Program	347
ASIL 2017 Annual Meeting Daily Program	349
Fifty-Eighth Annual Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition	379
Appendices	
ASIL Assembly and Annual General Meeting	385
In Memoriam	
Sir Elihu Lauterpacht (1928–2017)	
<i>Stephen M. Schwebel</i>	387
Memorial Notice	389
ASIL Officers and Executive Council	391
American Journal of International Law	393
International Legal Materials	395