# Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation Volume 25, Number 3, Summer 2000

The University of Chicago Press

### Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation
Dedicated to the Study of Law,
Legal Institutions, and Legal Processes
Published by The University of Chicago Press

Editors John Hagan

Carol A. Heimer

Victoria Saker Woeste

Symposium Editor Elizabeth Mertz

Review Editor Howard S. Erlanger

Associate Editors John L. Comaroff

Austan Goolsbee

Editorial Coordinator Vikki Webster

Manuscript Editors Susan F. Messer

Sandy L. Pittman

#### **Editorial Board**

Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles Richard Bernstein, Adjunct Professor of Law, New York University Law School John Braithwaite, Professor of Law and Sociology, The Australian National University Peter Carstensen, Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin School of Law Marianne Constable, Associate Professor of Rhetoric, University of California John J. Donohue, Professor of Law, Stanford Law School Sarah Gatson, Assistant Professor of Sociology, Texas A&M University

Howard Gillman, Associate Professor of Political Science, University

Howard Gillman, Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Southern California

Sarah Barringer Gordon, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania Law School

Carol J. Greenhouse, Professor of Anthropology, Indiana University

Sally Hadden, Assistant Professor of History, Florida State University

Valerie P. Hans, Professor of Criminal Justice, University of Delaware

Allan Lind, Professor of Business Administration and Management, Fuqua School of Business, Duke University

Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Sally Engle Merry, Professor of Anthropology, Wellesley College

Eric Posner, Professor of Law, University of Chicago School of Law

Nancy Reichman, Associate Professor of Sociology, University of Denver

Judith Resnik, Professor of Law, Yale University

Michael Silverstein, Professor of Anthropology, University of Chicago

Peter Siegelman, Ph.D., Economist

Eve Darian-Smith, Associate Professor of Anthropology, University of California, Santa Barbara

Susan Sterett, Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Denver Mark Suchman, Associate Professor of Sociology, University of Wisconsin, Madison John Sutton, Professor of Sociology, University of California, Santa Barbara

Neil Vidmar, Professor of Law, Duke University

## Law & Social Inquiry

Volume 25, Number 3, Summer 2000

| ARTICLES   |     |
|--|-----|
| Law & Social Inquiry Graduate Student Paper Competition<br>Winning Essay   |     |
| From Loss of Services to Loss of Support: The Wrongful Death Statutes, the Origins of Modern Tort Law, and the Making of the Nineteenth-Century Family  John Fabian Witt | 717 |
| Investment Rules and the New Constitutionalism David Schneiderman  | 757 |
| When Businesses Sue Each Other: An Empirical Study of State<br>Court Litigation<br>Ross E. Cheit and Jacob E. Gersen   | 789 |
| The Purchase of Intimacy Viviana A. Zelizer  | 817 |
| A Community Divided: Defense Attorneys and the Ethics of Death<br>Row Volunteering<br>C. Lee Harrington  | 849 |
| REVIEW ESSAYS  |     |
| Language, Law, and Power: Ethnomethodology, Conversation<br>Analysis, and the Politics of Law and Society Studies<br>Robert Dingwall                                     | 885 |
| The Pay Gap between Male and Female Jobs: Organizational and<br>Legal Realities<br>Paula England   | 913 |
| Religion, Education, and the State: The Contrasting Views of James<br>Dwyer and Warren Nord<br>Francis Schrag  | 933 |
| BOOK NOTES   | 961 |

### Law & Social Inquiry Graduate Student Paper Competition

The editors of Law & Social Inquiry are pleased to announce a competition for the best journal-length paper in the field of sociolegal studies written by a graduate student. The winning paper will be published in Law & Social Inquiry, and the author will receive a cash prize of \$500. Submissions will be judged by the editorial board, and the winning submission will be internally reviewed for publication. The author must be a graduate student or law student at the time of submission. Entries should be received by March 1, 2000. The winner will be selected by May 1 and the prize will be awarded at the annual meeting of the Law and Society Association.

Law & Social Inquiry publishes both empirical and theoretical studies of sociolegal processes from a variety of disciplinary perspectives.

Please send your best work to:

The Editors, Law & Social Inquiry, American Bar Foundation, 750 N. Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611. For further information send e-mail to lsi-abf@abfn.org, or call (312) 988-6517.

### **Publication Policy**

The American Bar Foundation (ABF) is an independent research institute committed to sociolegal research. Consistent with its mandate to create and disseminate knowledge about law, the legal profession, and legal institutions, Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation invites the submission of articles that make original contributions to understanding sociolegal processes. Law and Social Inquiry publishes both empirical and theoretical studies from a variety of disciplinary perspectives. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions are those of the authors alone.

Manuscript Evaluation: Law and Social Inquiry is a refereed journal. Manuscripts that the Editors deem appropriate for the journal are evaluated by two or more reviewers with expertise in the relevant subject matter and methodology. Manuscripts produced by ABF research fellows are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

Submission of Manuscripts: Law and Social Inquiry uses the author/date citation system, as described in The Chicago Manual of Style, 14th Edition. You may obtain our style guidelines via surface mail by writing to us at: Editorial Coordinator, Law and Social Inquiry, American Bar Foundation, 750 N. Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, Illinois 60611; or from our Web site at: http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/LSI/. Manuscripts submitted to Law and Social Inquiry should be typed double-spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. The review process is anonymous; all identifying information should appear only on a separate cover sheet and not in the body of the manuscript. Law and Social Inquiry does not accept multiply submitted articles. The Editors endeavor to make decisions promptly, usually about two months after

submission. **Editing of Manuscripts:** All manuscripts accepted for publication are edited for style by professional copy editors in consultation with the author. Copy editors

do not check citations. Authors see edited manuscripts and/or proofs.

Off-Prints to Authors: Without charge, we provide authors with 25 off-prints of their articles, essays, or exchanges (but not symposia) that appear in *Law and Social Inquiry*. Additional off-prints may be ordered at the author's expense. Authors receive 1 copy of the issue in which their contributions appear.

**Republication Rights:** The Foundation normally permits authors to republish their manuscripts in books or use their manuscripts after publication, but *Law and Social Inquiry* has the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The journal retains the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

Copying Beyond Fair Use: The code on the first page of a contribution in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the contribution may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for classroom use without charge, copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to the Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

Comments and Responses: Comments on or responses to articles or review essays in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

Send article manuscripts to:
The Editors
Law & Social Inquiry
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding review essays to: Howard S. Erlanger Review Editor Law & Social Inquiry Institute for Legal Studies Law School University of Wisconsin Madison, WI 53706 (608) 263-7405

For further information via the Internet—

Web site: http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/LSI/

E-mail: lsi-abf@abfn.org

Law & Social Inquiry is available for full-text search on the LEXIS™/

NEXIS<sup>TM</sup> and WESTLAW<sup>TM</sup> on-line services.

#### Annual U.S. subscription rates:

|              | 1 yr. | 2 yr.    | 3 yr.    |
|--------------|-------|----------|----------|
| Individuals  | \$36  | \$66.25  | \$91.80  |
| Academic     | \$29  | \$53.35  | \$73.95  |
| Institutions | \$59  | \$108.55 | \$150.45 |

Outside U.S. please add a postage charge of \$6.00 per year to the U.S. rates. Canadians please add 7% GST tax to above rates as follows: One-year rates: Individuals \$2.52; Academic \$2.03; Institutions \$4.13. Two-year rates: Individuals \$4.64; Academic \$3.73; Institutions \$7.60. Three-year rates: Individuals \$6.43; Academic \$5.18; Institutions \$10.53.

Single copies: \$14.75 for institutions, \$9.00 for individuals. Checks should be made payable to Law & Social Inquiry, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, Illinois 60637. (Fax: 773-753-0811; E-mail: subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu) Volumes 1-12 available from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. (800) 828-7571.

Volumes available in microfilm from University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

© 2000 American Bar Foundation. All rights reserved.

Law & Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation (ISSN: 0897-6546) is published quarterly—winter, spring, summer, and fall—by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 South Woodlawn Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and at additional mailing office. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to: Law & Social Inquiry, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

### The 2000 LSI Graduate Student Paper Prize

The winner of the 2000 LSI Student Essay Prize Competition is John Fabian Witt, for "From Loss of Support to Loss of Service: The Wrongful Death Statutes, the Origins of Modern Tort Law, and the Making of the Nineteenth-Century Family." This essay makes a novel point about the intersection of tort law, family roles, and work in the 19th century. In it Witt argues that the wrongfuldeath statutes enacted in many states after 1865 reflected the shift to a free-labor economy, with its emphasis on separate spheres for women's and men's labor and the two-tiered valuation that came with it. The article concludes that the new tort laws cemented the cultural belief that women's domestic work was not worth compensating; thus, the laws denied husbands and widowers the right to recover damages for loss of income, injuries, or death. The editors of Law & Social Inquiry award this essay the 2000 LSI Student Essay Prize for its originality in relating two heretofore distinct areas of legal and historical inquiry.

—The Editors

\*\*\*