

BBS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary
Volume 34 | Issue 5 | October 2011 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 34 (2011) for *institutions* is US \$1136.00 for print and online, US \$957.00 for online only, and US \$1024.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £645.00 for print and online, UK £546.00 for online only, and UK £590.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$323.00 for print and online and US \$295.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £190.00 for print and online and UK £173.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$121.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £76.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$99.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £60.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$218.00 (UK £108.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 34:5 October 2011

Elqayam, S. & Evans, J. St. B. T. Subtracting “ought” from “is”: Descriptivism versus normativism in the study of human thinking	233
--	-----

Open Peer Commentary

Achourioti, T., Fugard, A. & Stenning, K. Throwing the normative baby out with the prescriptivist bathwater	249	Pfeifer, N. Systematic rationality norms provide research roadmaps and clarity	263
Bonnefon, J.-F. Norms for reasoning about decisions	249	Pothos, E. M. & Busemeyer, J. R. A case for limited prescriptive normativism	264
Brase, G. L. & Shanteau, J. The unbearable lightness of “Thinking”: Moving beyond simple concepts of thinking, rationality, and hypothesis testing	250	Proust, J. Epistemic normativity from the reasoner’s viewpoint	265
Buckwalter, W. & Stich, S. Competence, reflective equilibrium, and dual-system theories	251	Quintelier, K. J. P. & Fessler, D. M. T. Naturalizing the normative and the bridges between “is” and “ought”	266
Douven, I. A role for normativism	252	Schurz, G. Truth-conduciveness as the primary epistemic justification of normative systems of reasoning	266
Dutilh Novaes, C. The historical and philosophical origins of normativism	253	Spurrett, D. Reason is normative, and should be studied accordingly	267
Foss, J. Just the facts, and only the facts, about human rationality?	254	Stanovich, K. E. Normative models in psychology are here to stay	268
Fuller, T. & Samuels, R. Overselling the case against normativism	255	Sternberg, R. J. Understanding reasoning: Let’s describe what we really think about	269
Giroto, V. Undisputed norms and normal errors in human thinking	255	Stuppel, E. J. N. & Ball, L. J. Normative benchmarks are useful for studying individual differences in reasoning	270
Gold, N., Colman, A. M. & Pulford, B. D. Normative theory in decision making and moral reasoning	256	Sun, Y. & Wang, H. Probability theory and perception of randomness: Bridging “ought” and “is”	271
Hahn, U. Why rational norms are indispensable	257	Thompson, V. A. Normativism versus mechanism	272
Hrotic, S. Defending normativism	258	Waldmann, M. R. Neurath’s ship: The constitutive relation between normative and descriptive theories of rationality	273
Kim, K. & Park, Y. Cultural and individual differences in the generalization of theories regarding human thinking	259	Weinberg, J. M. What is evaluative normativity, that we (maybe) should avoid it?	274
McNair, S. & Feeney, A. Norms and high-level cognition: Consequences, trends, and antidotes	260		
Nickerson, R. S. Norms, goals, and the study of thinking	261	Authors’ Response	
Oaksford, M. & Chater, N. The “is-ought fallacy” fallacy	262	Evans, J. St. B. T. & Elqayam, S. Towards a descriptivist psychology of reasoning and decision making	275

Erratum

Speekenbrink, M. & Shanks, D. R. Is everyone Bayes? On the testable implications of Bayesian Fundamentalism – Erratum	291
--	-----