Aarhus Convention, 4, 16, 49, 70, 149 advisory function, 108–9 civic engagement in implementation of, 272 compliance committee, 151 compliance mechanism, 277 dispute settlement under, 158 and European Court of Justice, 283 monitoring under, 87 NGO participation in non-compliance mechanism under, 89 non-compliance procedures, 122 Lithuania/Belarus, 126, 141 Romania/Ukraine (Bystroe Canal), 72, 82, 85, 125 public participation in non- compliance procedure, 67, 102, 104, 107, 150, 282 recommendation as compliance measure, 68 accountability mechanisms, 208, 211, 215 Inter-American Development Bank, 210 multilateral development banks, 195	Water Convention, 106, 108–17, 119 See also facilitative compliance/ implementation African Union, 395 after-action review, 20, 24 Agreement under the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea on the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Marine Biological Diversity of Areas beyond National Jurisdiction. See BBNJ Agreement arbitration under Aarhus Convention, 158 arbitrage consultatif, 114 under Bern Convention, 246 Chagos case, 148 under CITES, 159 interstate vs international commercial, 472 investor-state, 480 and monetary disputes, 227
World Bank, 189–91, 193, 197	under multilateral environmental
adjudication, 41, 136 absence from new trade non-	agreements, 129 under Southern Bluefin Tuna
compliance mechanisms, 185	Convention, 158
inappropriateness in international criminal law, 411	under UNCLOS, 158 See also South China Sea Arbitration
international monetary system's	
need for, 217	Bartolini, Giulio, 20, 21, 35
trade agreements' traditional reliance on, 173	Basel Convention, 4, 123, 149 implementation and compliance
weaknesses of, 79, 438	committee, 33
advisory procedure, 105	expertise requirements, 136
facilitative vs judicial advisory function,	lack of transparency, 139
116	BBNJ Agreement, 16, 46, 120, 481, 483

BBNJ Agreement (cont.) Churchill, Robin, 56, 480 non-compliance provision, 46-48 CITES, 4, 16, 50, 53 potential for advisory procedure, 118 implementation and compliance Berman, Ayelet, 35 bodies, 138, 155 Bern Convention, 244 non-compliance procedure, 49, 70, case file system, 239, 248 159 Commission for the Conservation of compared to European Southern Bluefin Tuna, 146, Commission infringement procedure, 250-54 154 - 55complaints received under, 242, Commission on the Limits of the 248, 249 Continental Shelf. See UNCLOS legal opportunity under, 250 overhead power line in Committee on the Elimination of Lithuanian-Polish borderland, Racial Discrimination, 366 state-to-state complaints before, 127, overlap with European 128, 366 Commission activities, 260 compliance soft recommendations, 246, 250, dispute settlement as broader aspect 256 - 58enforcement monitoring through, and global interdependence, 37, 40, 256, 257 41, 43, 44, 45 overlap with EU Birds and Habitat and human rights treaties, 331-32 interlinkage with capacity-building, Directives, 245-46 spring hunting complaint against Maltese government, 258–60 in health domain, 28 wind farms in Balchik and Kaliakra, theoretical basis for, 18, 37, 41 254 - 57managerial theory, 38-39 Birdlife International, 241, 242, 250, rationalist theory, 40 252, 257. See also Bern compliance committee(s) Convention under Aarhus Convention, 151, 277, Bodansky, Daniel, 51–52 Bystroe Canal, 86, 125 Camenzuli, Louise Kathleen, 54 under Basel Convention, 123 capacity-building under BBNJ Agreement, 47, 118 and compliance tools, 183 closed meetings of, 139 of Commission for the Conservation interlinkage with compliance, 46 in health domain, 28 of Bluefin Tuna, 155 and pandemic preparedness, 26, 28 compared to international courts and Paris Agreement, 31, 34, 57, 63 and tribunals, 142, 152 and Water Convention, 110 effect of findings of, 45 and World Bank Dispute Resolution environment-related, 149 Services, 214 under Escazú Agreement, 151, 279, 281 Cassese, Antonio, 385 under Espoo Convention, 152 Chayes, Abram and Antonia Handler expertise of, 135 on implementation challenges in facilitative aim of, 142 international regulatory facilitative measures decided by, 141 feature of multilateral environmental systems, 38 The New Sovereignty, 37, 41 agreements, 276

independence of, 137–38, 150 and international environmental law, 3 initiation of procedures before, 121, 125, 127 under Minamata Convention, 151 monitoring by, 122 under Montreal Protocol, 58 nomenclature, 67 under Paris Agreement, 30, 32-35, 57, 61–64, 68, 124, 152, 277 facilitative character of, 5 outcome, 140-42, 150 powers of, 150 under Rotterdam Convention, 64 state responsibility and, 44 state-to-state procedures before, 132, 143 corroboration of claims, 135 in human rights context, 128 prerequisites, 134 South African submission under Kyoto Protocol, 133 conciliation, 488 under 1954 Hague Convention, 453, 454-58 as part of World Bank dispute resolution, 201 conferences of the parties (COPs), 50, under Escazú Agreement, 271-73 facilitative approach of, 70 and multilateral environmental

Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict. See Hague Convention (1954)

procedure-based legitimacy of, 70

See also meetings of the parties

role in non-compliance procedures, 53

agreements, 53

origin of, 53

powers of, 54-56

(MOPs)

Convention on Access to Information,
Public Participation in DecisionMaking and Access to Justice in
Environmental Matters. See
Aarhus Convention

Convention on Biological Diversity, 83, 145

Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety, 272 dispute resolution under, 159 Nagoya Protocol on Access and Benefit-Sharing, 108, 272, 278

Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice, 155

Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions, 400, 402

Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context. See Espoo Convention

Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora. See CITES

Convention on Mercury. See Minamata Convention

Convention on Psychotropic Substances, 393, 419

Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources, 149

Convention on the Control of
Transboundary Movements of
Hazardous Wastes and their
Disposal. See Basel Convention

Convention on the Prior Informed
Consent Procedure for Certain
Hazardous Chemicals and
Pesticides in International Trade.
See Rotterdam Convention

Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes. See Water Convention

Council of Europe, 395 Committee of Ministers, 299 enforcement of European Court of

Human Rights judgments, 302, 326
Conference of the Parties to the

Warsaw Convention, 399
Convention against Trafficking in
Human Organs, 403

Council of Europe (cont.) Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 334, 337, 340, 396, 402, 418 Committee of the Parties, 400, 402 Convention on Cybercrime, 398 Committee, 401 Convention on Laundering, Search, Seizure and Confiscation of the Proceeds from Crime and on the Financing of Terrorism, 397 Conference of the Parties report, 397 Convention on Laundering, Search, Seizure and Confiscation of the Proceeds of Crime, 397 Convention on Offences relating to Cultural Property, 397 Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence, 397 Convention on the Counterfeiting of Medical Products and Similar Crimes Involving Threats to Public Health, 398 Convention on the Prevention of Terrorism, 399, 401 Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse, Committee of the Parties, 400 Convention on the Suppression of Terrorism, 398 Criminal Law Convention on Corruption, 398 European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice, 416 Group of States against Corruption, 400, 403, 416 non-binding anti-corruption instruments, 403 and right to a healthy environment, Russia's expulsion from, 290, 304 See also Bern Convention; Group of Experts on Action against

Court of Justice of the European Union.

See European Court of Justice
customary international law, 51
component of international criminal
law, 387
monetary sovereignty, 228
prevention of harm, 41
prohibition of torture, 290
protection of cultural property, 445,
450–51
right to a remedy, 192

Downs, George W., 40 Duffy, Helen, 338 enforcement collective, 42 complementary to non-compliance procedures, 143 Kyoto Protocol as illustration of, 103, 151 of criminal law treaties, 399, 402 of environmental human rights, 362, under Escazú Agreement, 283 European Commission mechanism of, 252, 253 European Convention on Human Rights system of, 328, 329 of European Court of Human Rights judgments, 296, 325, 326 in human rights domain, 300 of ICSID arbitration awards, 480 influence on state participation in treaty systems, 331 in inter-American human rights system, 281 in international commercial arbitration, 472 of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 316-20, 325 under International Health

under International Health Regulations, 38 of international law on atmospheric protection, 65 vs managerial approach to

compliance, 38, 40, 411

Trafficking in Human Beings

multipronged ('mosaic'), 43 political economists' insistence on, 40 political use of term, 172 responsibility-based punition, 66 of right to a healthy environment, 267 through sanctions, 42 in South China Sea Arbitration, 482, 483, 484 in trade law, 172-75 treaty bodies' powers of, 299 under UNCLOS, 479 under WTO Agreement, 479 environmental disputes aptness of consent-based governance, 53 complementary role of adjudicative and treaty bodies, 95 and European Court of Human Rights, 59 importance of monitoring, 368 inter-state, 143 judicial settlement of, 58-60, 362-63 and UN human rights treaty bodies, 361, 382 Escazú Agreement, 265 Aarhus Convention's compliance mechanism as model for, 278 Committee to Support Implementation and Compliance, 103, 151, 273–76 access to, 281 domestic implementation of, 266–67, 270 implementation and compliance provisions, 271 and inter-American human rights system, 279, 280-83 Nagoya Protocol's compliance mechanism as model for, 278 need for regional oversight and compliance, 284 Paris Agreement's compliance mechanism as model for, 277 problem of access to justice, 272 public participation in noncompliance procedure, 102 rights established under, 265-66, 268 - 70

Espoo Convention, 4 dispute settlement under, 159 implementation committee, 152 monitoring bodies cautions issued by, 87, 91 interactive dialogue, 86 NGO participation in non-compliance mechanism under, 89 non-compliance procedures, 126, 128 Cijevna/Cem River, 112, 128 Romania/Ukraine (Bystroe Canal), 71, 82, 83, 86 EU environmental law compliance with, 247 European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of, 253 implementation of, 246 European Convention on Human Rights, 315 denunciation (Art. 58), 290 enforcement system, 325-27 impact on United Kingdom, 327-29, prohibition of torture (Art. 3), 293 respect for private and family life (Art. 8), 59 right to life (Art. 2), 59 United Kingdom's relations with, 10 United Kingdom's role in development of, 325 European Court of Human Rights, 326 and Aarhus Convention, 272, 283 cases Budayeva and Others v Russia, 379 Chowdury and Others v Greece, 335 CN v United Kingdom, 353 Cordella and Others v Italy, 379, 380 Cruz Varas and Others v Sweden, 304 Fadeyeva v Russia, 380 Hirst v United Kingdom, 329 Islamic Republic of Iran Shipping Lines v Turkey, 429 L.E. v Greece, 338 López Ostra v Spain, 380 M. Özel and Others v Turkey, 379

Mamatkulov and Askarov v

Turkey, 304

European Court of Human Rights expert review (cont.) Paris Agreement TER, 31 Öneryildiz v Turkey, 379 suppression conventions' reliance Rantsev v Cyprus and Russia, 335, on, 415 See also Group of Experts on Action 338, 350–51 Siliadin v France, 335, 354 against Trafficking in Human V.C.L. and A.N. v United Beings Kingdom, 339 Zoletic and others v Azerbaijan, facilitative compliance/ implementation, 3, 15, 37, 38, climate complaints before, 374 41, 42, 46 Aarhus Convention, 108 compared to treaty bodies, 288–93 comparative effectiveness, 310-11 advisory procedure, 65, 105, 109, compliance with decisions of, 110, 116, 118, 120 Basel Convention, 60 293 - 302decisions relating to prohibition of BBNJ Agreement, 118 complement to judicial dispute torture, 302-10 effect of judgments of, 296 settlement, 18 environmental disputes before, 59, Council of Europe Convention on 363, 379-80 the Prevention of Terrorism, exclusion of NGOs as complainants, 2.72. Escazú Agreement, 271, 276 execution of judgments of, 293-302 evolution in multilateral interim measures, 304 environmental agreements, 49 judgments on human trafficking, Kyoto Protocol, 103 335, 338-39 Montreal Protocol, 61, 102 stance on right to a clean multilateral environmental environment, 59 agreements, 121, 125 UK courts' relations with, in new-generation non-compliance 327 - 30procedures, 50 European Court of Justice non-confrontational nature of, 123 Paris Agreement, 17, 31, 32, 34, 35, access to, 247 Bern Convention case file system as 41, 46, 57, 61-64, 152, 278 complement to, 260 Protocol on Water and Health, 108, cases 117 Bank Mellat v Council, 437 vs punitive measures, 141 Commission v Bulgaria, 255, 256 Rotterdam Convention, 64 Post Bank Iran v Council, 436 as 'sanction', 414 conservation cases before, 252 submission procedures, 104, 107 effect of judgments of, 247 unsuitability in state-to-state and environmental protection, 239 procedures, 141 Iran's/Iranians' recourse to, 428, 436 Water Convention, 65, 68, 107, 110, jurisdiction over restrictive measures against individuals, 429 Facility-Specific Rapid Response Labor European nature protection law Mechanism, 182 Bern Convention, 244 fact-finding EU Birds and Habitats Directives, as aid to negotiations, 440 244 and Bystroe Canal Project, 88

contribution to global governance, incentives characteristic of management model, and International Atomic Energy Agency, 434 in international human rights and Iranian nuclear programme, 439 regimes, 302 and JCPOA Joint Commission, 422 as part of non-compliance procedure, 150 as tool to incentivise compliance with international law, 440 as part of political compliance and UNESCO protection of cultural processes, 424 property, 463 role in promotion of compliance, 414 UN missions, 135 Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 279, 280 and UNSC 1737 Committee, 427, cases and Water Convention, 116 Arctic Athabaskan Peoples, 374 and World Bank dispute resolution, José Pereira, 345, 349 environmental case law, 280 188, 201 and WTO dispute settlement panels, NGO complaints to, 281 Inter-American Court of Human Financial Action Task Force, 404-9 Rights, 263, 279 enforcement tools and consequences, advisory opinion on environment and human rights, 263, 269, review process 374, 376, 379, 381 money laundering, 405, 409 cases terrorist financing, 405, 409 Kaliña and Lokono Peoples, 280 Kawas Fernández, 379 Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project. See Lhaka Honhat Association, 263 International Court of Justice Mayagna (Sumo) Awas Tingni German Constitutional Court, 296 Community, 280 Global Health Threats Council, 28 Saramaka People, 280 Global Network for Human Rights and Trabalhadores Fazenda Brasil Verde, 347-48, 349 the Environment, 278 environmental case law, 280 Global Preparedness Monitoring Board, 23 and environmental disputes, 362, global public goods, 7 379 Goote, Maas, 270 jurisdiction of, 282 non-compliance function of, 280 Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, weakness of compliance 337, 351, 399, 401, 402, 415-16 mechanisms, 281 inter-American human rights system Hague Convention (1954), 453-54 access to, 281 as basis for Cambodia's Preah Vihear monitoring and accountability Temple claims, 446 function, 263 conciliation (Art. 22), 455-58 International Atomic Energy Agency UNESCO assistance (Art. 23), as nuclear non-compliance 459 - 61mechanism, 421 UNESCO assistance for compliance ineffectiveness of, 423 with, 469 for Iranian nuclear policy, 426, Hathaway, Oona, 314, 331 430, 431, 432, 434, 439-40, 441

International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID), 480 International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling, 156 International Court of Justice advisory opinion on climate change, 42 cases Aerial Incident of 3 July 1988, 434 Ahmadou Sadio Diallo, 116, 380 Alleged Violations of the 1955 Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations, and Consular Rights, 229, 435 Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 128, 380 Certain Activities Carried Out by Nicaragua in the Border Area, 59, 94, 143, 362 Certain Iranian Assets, 435 Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia, 148, 163 Dispute over the Status and Use of the Waters of the Silala, 114 Effects of Awards of Compensation, 192 Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project, 71, 72-81, 92-93, 114 Judgment No. 2867 of the Administrative Tribunal of the International Labour Organization, 380 Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Maritime Delimitation in the Indian Ocean, 164 Oil Platforms, 434 Questions Relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite, 380 Temple of Preah Vihear, 445-52, 464, 467–70 Whaling in the Antarctic, 79, 147, 148, 159-62, 362

consultation of experts by, 167 and environmental disputes, 58 and Iran/US disputes, 422 jurisdiction of, 158, 422 and monetary issues, 228-30 and multilateral environmental agreements, 130 transparency before, 139 international courts and tribunals advisory opinions, 99 compared to compliance committees, 141, 142 compared to IMF surveillance, 236 contribution to clarification of international law, 42 differentiation from non-compliance mechanisms, 8 effectiveness of no recourse to, 434 and environmental disputes, 59 and global monetary governance, and international economic disputes, 227 - 30and inter-state disputes, 135, 139 and Iranian nuclear crisis, 422 - 37nuclear disarmament proceedings before, 420 overlap with quasi-judicial noncompliance mechanisms, 5 and state responsibility, 41 - 44International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights compliance with, 317-19 monitoring under, 10 international criminal law complexity of, 386 compliance with, 412-19 definition of, 386-87 development of, 386 money laundering, 387, 389, 394, 396, 404 monitoring mechanisms in, 385-86, 388 - 89soft power mechanisms, 386, 411 terrorist financing, 389, 404 treaty compliance monitoring, 390

universal suppression conventions, international human rights law 389-95 compared to international monitoring of implementation environmental law, 365 environmentalisation of, 361, 362-65 and compliance, 395 international environmental law failure to protect against effect of compliance requirements, 270 climate change as violation of, courts' unease with, 59 377 evolution of non-compliance impact of Committee on the Rights of the Child decision on, 376 procedures in, 403 Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros judgment as International Law Commission step in evolution of, 92 protection of atmosphere, 65 general principles of, 78, 80, 87 protectoin of atmosphere goal of, 365 compliance approach favoured by human rights treaty bodies and, 363, Special Rapporteur, 66 state responsibility, 75 365, 368 inclusivity in implementation of, 278 International Monetary Fund compliance mechanisms, 230 legitimacy in, 52 non-compliance mechanisms in, 3, 5, amendment of Articles of Agreement, 231 principles of, 365 forced withdrawal, 230 suspension of financial/political right to a healthy environment, 264 Escazú Agreement, 266, 268-69, rights, 231 Financial Sector Assessment Programs, 27, 235, 407 Latin America and Caribbean, 262-64, 267 jurisdictional overlap with World proposed protocol to European Bank, 235 Convention on Human Rights, non-compliance mechanisms interpretation of Articles of recognition by UN Human Rights Agreement, 232–33 Council and General Assembly, surveillance, 217-27, 233-36 international monetary law, 218, 220 and International Court of Justice, 228 suitability of non-compliance mechanisms to, 60, 71 International Narcotics Control Board, sustainable development, 77 393, 419 use in international environmental international pandemic law compliance needs of, 28 disputes, 95 use of regional non-compliance factors to be introduced into compliance procedures, 46 mechanisms, 264 International Health Regulations need for improved compliance with, (2005)background to, 18 potential for advisory procedure in, 119 core capacity provisions of, 18-19 relevance of Paris Agreement's reporting processes under, 19-21 compliance machinery, 17, Review Committee on the 30-37, 41, 46 Functioning of, 19, 21, 24-25 value of facilitative compliance See also international pandemic law; processes to, 17 pandemic preparedness; World See also pandemic preparedness; Health Organization World Health Organization

International Treaty on Plant Genetic joint external evaluation, 20, 24, 25 Resources for Food and judicial dispute settlement, 145 Agriculture, 149 coexistence alongside non-International Tribunal for the Law of compliance mechanisms, 158 compliance committees as accessibility of pleadings, 139 alternative to, 102, 121 advisory opinions confrontational nature of, 145 BBNJ Agreement's proposed limits of, 79 non-compliance mechanisms as provision on, 118 request of 12 December 2022, 42, alternative to, 481 362, 370 non-compliance procedures as complement to, 18, 43 cases Bangladesh/Myanmar, 147, 148, treaty clauses providing for, 157, 158 Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire, 143, 158, 166 Kiev Protocol, 149 Mauritius/Maldives, 99, 116 Klabbers, Jan, 143 Koskenniemi, Martii, 44 dispute settlement option under UNCLOS, 147 Kyoto Protocol, 4, 17, 149 and environmental disputes, 58 advisory procedure, 109 See also UNCLOS Facilitative Branch, 133-34 International Whaling Commission, non-compliance mechanism, 49, 56, 147, 156 103 infractions subcommittee, 147 state-to-state procedure under, 126 Iran Nuclear Deal, 420, 422, 427, 432 EU court cases related to, 425 Law of the Sea Convention. See fact-finding mechanism, 440 UNCLOS silence on human rights sanctions, legal mobilization through Bern Convention, 240, 244, See also Joint Comprehensive Plan of 246, 253 Action; UN Security Council, Bern Convention and EU 1737 Committee Commission opportunities compared, 250, 254-61 Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action, conceptual approaches, 240, 241 420, 423, 428 Emilio Lehoucq and Whitney Taylor effectiveness of non-compliance on, 241 mechanisms, 437 and EU environmental law, 239 Iranian compliance with, 431, 432, through European Commission infringement system, 247, 251, Joint Commission, 421–23, 429–32, and European Court of Justice, 247 significance as global governance Frances Zemans on, 241 model, 441 meaning of, 240, 241 role of international courts and legitimacy, 50 tribunals, 438 Bodansky on, 51-52 US stance, 423, 425, 440 consent-based, 51 viability of non-compliance and legality, 52 mechanism, 434 procedure-based, 51 See also Iran Nuclear Deal results-based, 52

soft measures as element of, 69 source-based, 51 Wolfrum on, 50, 52

meetings of the parties (MOPs), 53–56 adoption of sanctions by, 100 facilitative approach of, 70 powers of, 54-56 procedure-based legitimacy of, 70 role in non-compliance procedures, under Water Convention, 106, 107 See also conferences of the parties (COPs) Milano, Valentina, 338 Minamata Convention, 4 implementation and compliance committee, 33, 103, 151 monitoring aid to compliance committees, 104 of anti-trafficking efforts, 335, 351 in Bystroe Canal case, 72, 86, 90-91, in Cijevna/Cem River advisory procedure, 65, 112-13 compared to judicial proceedings, 385, 412 of compliance with European Court of Human Rights judgments, 288, 302 of compliance with treaty body views, 299 conditions required for, 24 definition of, 385 element of non-compliance procedures, 60 evolution in international criminal law, 388, 391 horizontal, 401, 418 by Human Rights Committee, 303, IMF surveillance, 218, 222, 235 of implementation of criminal law treaties, 390 African Union Advisory Board on

facilitative approach, 411 Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 399, 402 Group of Experts on Action against Violence against Women and Domestic Violence, 400 Group of States against Corruption, 403, 416 International Narcotics Control Board, 393-94 intra- and interorganisational cooperation, 419 Lanzarote Committee, 397, 400 phases of, 418 sanctioning powers, 419 of implementation of human rights treaties, 363, 367 Committee against Torture, 303 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 332 of implementation of multilateral environmental agreements, 100, 103 Aarhus Convention, 87 Bern Convention, 256-57, 260 by compliance committees, Espoo Convention, 86–87 of implementation of regional criminal law treaties, 396, 399 NGO and civil society participation, 403 by Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 279 in inter-American human rights system, 263 and International Health Regulations, 19, 20 under international human rights regime, 287, 294, 311, 333 and Iranian nuclear programme, 422, 439 of money laundering, 394, 401 NGO support for, 90 non-judicial, 301 for nuclear non-proliferation

compliance, 432, 440

Committee against Torture, 394,

Corruption, 400

395

monitoring (cont.) value of tailored technical advice, and pandemic preparedness, 24 paucity in international criminal law, and water diplomacy, 114-16 in Bystroe Canal case, 72, 81-95 complementary to judicial phased process of, 402, 417, 418 shared ownership of, 411 procedures, 143 decisions from, 57 as soft power mechanism, 412 of treaty implementation, 388 establishment of, 58 under universal suppression evolution, 64, 70, 404 facilitative, 70 conventions, 395 vertical, 401, 418 independence from dispute and World Bank Dispute Resolution settlement processes, 115 Services, 209-11 Koskenniemi on state responsibility See also Financial Action Task Force: and, 44 Global Preparedness under Montreal Protocol, 61, 67 Monitoring Board; peer review nature of, 56 Montreal Protocol, 3, 16, 50, 58, 70 new generation of contemporary practice of nonfacilitation bodies, 50, 70 compliance procedure, 68 legitimacy of, 50 Implementation Committee, 103, nomenclature, 70 136, 138 soft approach of, 66 Meeting of the Parties under, 69 and multilateral environmental non-compliance procedure, 49, 61, 150 agreements, 56 non-compliance provision (Art. 8), overview, 105 under Paris Agreement, 58, 102 transparency of non-compliance 61 - 64procedure, 67, 140 potentiality for use under UNCLOS, multilateral environmental agreements 481 - 84advisory function of non-compliance public participation, 274 mechanisms in, 100, 108 soft approach to addressing communal obligations under, 131-32 compliance issues, 143 and state responsibility, 44 compliance/implementation committees under, 34, 100, submission procedure, 104 101-5, 276under Water Convention, 106 new generation of, 5, 16 suitability to environmental nonemphasis on practical facilitation compliance, 60 of compliance, 17 suitability to regional vs universal non-compliance procedures treaties, 395 compared to human rights treaty transparency, 140 bodies, 361, 368, 370, 371, 373, 375 triggering of, 101, 104, 121 relevance to UNCLOS, 480 non-governmental organisation(s) relevance of advisory procedure to, assistance with dispute resolution 116 - 19processes, 204 as complainants before human rights non-compliance procedures courts, 362 as compliance committee triggers, advisory procedure, 104 conciliatory function, 120 121, 124

and environmental protection, 263

non-inquisitorial nature, 120

exclusion as complainants at European Court of Human Rights, 267, 272 as guardians of biodiversity, 240, 241 involvement in anti-trafficking efforts, 341, 343, 350, 351 involvement in Bern Convention complaints system, 242-43, 248, 250, 254-58, 261 involvement in non-compliance mechanisms, 89, 93 involvement in UN human rights treaty bodies, 368 limited role before International Court of Justice, 79 participation in EU Commission complaints system, 251 participation in inter-American human rights system, 281 participation in monitoring processes of criminal law conventions, 403 as requesters of advisory opinions, 116 See also Birdlife International

OECD Anti-Bribery Convention, 416 OECD Anti-Bribery Recommendation (2021), 402 OECD Convention on Combating

Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions, 398

OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions, 400, 417

Organization of American States, 395 environmental protection role of, 280

human rights protection, 279 OSPAR Commission, 154

pandemic preparedness accountability mechanisms, 26 development of non-compliance machinery, 18 inadequacy of, 26 lessons from COVID-19, 21, 22, 25 proposal of convention on, 23
See also International Health
Regulations (2005);
international pandemic law;
World Health Organization
Paris Agreement, 4, 149
compliance system, 30–35, 68

compliance system, 30–35, 68 emphasis on reporting obligations, 36

Enhanced Transparency Framework, 31

facilitative approach to compliance, 16, 69

Global Stocktake, 31, 34 Implementation and Compliance Committee, 30, 32–34, 35, 36, 277 impartiality, 124

non-compliance procedure, 49 peer review, 416–17

Convention against Corruption, 391

Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 392 Financial Action Task Force, 404 pandemic preparedness, 27 suppression conventions' reliance on, 415

Permanent Court of Arbitration. See South China Sea Arbitration

Permanent Court of International Justice

Case Concerning the Factory at Chorzow, 60

Case Concerning the Payment of Various Serbian Loans Issued in France, 228

Case of the S.S. 'Lotus', 451
Territorial Jurisdiction of the
International Commission of
the River Oder, 79
plastic pollution treaty, 7, 16, 48, 120

potential for advisory procedure, 118

Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers. *See* Kiev Protocol

Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer. See Montreal Protocol

Protocol on Water and Health, 149

consultation process, 108, 109, 117

public participation in noncompliance procedure, 102, 107 Raustiala, Kal, 301 Regional Agreement on Access to Information, Public Participation and Justice in Environmental Matters in Latin America and the Caribbean. See Escazú Agreement reporting obligations under drug trafficking treaties, 393, and environmental non-compliance, as facilitative measures, 141 hindrances to, 415 under human rights regimes, 287 under International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 317, 321, 332 UK compliance with, 322, 324, 330 under International Health Regulations, 19–21, 35 under Kyoto Protocol, 56 under multilateral environmental agreements, 103, 123 under Paris Agreement, 31, 33, 41, streamlining under criminal law treaties, 419 under UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 395 reports on anti-corruption efforts, 401, 403, 405, 408, 415, 416, 417, 418 on anti-trafficking efforts, 337, 339, 348, 353, 359, 399 under Bern Convention, 253, 255-60 of Committee against Torture, 305 under Convention on Biological Diversity, 155

and environmental human rights, 366 on environmental human rights, 367–69, 370, 371, 372, 382 in environmental non-compliance procedures, 54, 103 under Escazú Agreement, 274, 275 of Human Rights Committee, 305 of Independent Evaluation Office (IMF), 235 in inter-American human rights system, 280 under International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 317, of International Monetary Fund, 221, on Iranian nuclear programme, 427, 439, 440 under Kyoto Protocol, 133 and pandemic preparedness, 27 under Paris Agreement, 31, 34 of scientific bodies, 155, 165 to treaty bodies, 299 of UN Special Rapporteurs, 359 under Water Convention, 107, 110 of World Bank Grievance Redress Service, 197 of WTO Dispute Settlement Body, 184, 478 review mechanisms Financial Action Task Force, 404 non-confrontational character of, OECD Working Group on Bribery, 417 regional vs universal treaties, 418 UN Convention against Corruption, 388, 391, 392, 417 UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 388, 392, 418 Rotterdam Convention, 4 facilitative approach to compliance, 16, 69 non-compliance procedure, 49 state-to-state trigger in, 123

in dispute settlement, 184

sanctions	South China Sea Arbitration, 471-88
characteristic of enforcement model, 184	cooperative compliance with award,
under Escazú Agreement, 267	484-88
FATF's 'soft sanctions', 408	non-compliance procedures as aid to
as feature of rationalist approach to	enforcement, 481–84
compliance, 40	Southern Bluefin Tuna Convention
in IMF dispute settlement, 230	dispute resolution, 158
and international criminal law, 412,	state-to-state compliance procedures
414, 419	communal objective of, 131
in international criminal law, 410	expertise, 135–37
in international human rights	procedural principles, 132
regimes, 302	evidence, 134–35
in Iranian nuclear context, 422,	impartiality and independence,
423–24, 427–28, 429, 430, 432,	137–38
435–37, 441	jurisdiction, 132–34
and multilateral environmental	outcomes, 140–42
agreements, 100	participation and transparency,
as non-compliance mechanism, 438	138–40
and non-compliance procedures,	state-to-state triggers
115, 150	under Aarhus Convention, 122, 125
omission from new generation	background to, 123-25
multilateral environmental	challenges faced by, 122
agreements, 17	under Espoo Convention, 126
and Paris Agreement compliance	evidence requirements, 134–35
committee, 35, 62, 68	under Kyoto Protocol, 126
as political measures, 421, 438	limited use of, 127–42
reputational effects as form of, 226	objective of, 122
stigmatization effect of, 101	positioning among existing
and trade dispute settlement, 185	procedures, 143
See also UN Security Council, 1737	proof of involvement/interest, 134
Committee	states' perceptions of, 127-30
scientific committee(s), 146–48, 153–57	tensions over, 123–25
under CITES, 155	before UN human rights treaty
of Commission for the Conservation	bodies, 126
of Southern Bluefin Tuna, 154	use between neighbouring states, 134
and International Court of Justice,	Stockholm Convention
159–62	lack of transparency, 139
of International Whaling	non-compliance procedures
Commission, 146, 153, 156	(Art. 17), 371
perceived bias of, 157	surveillance
role in treaty compliance, 167	IMF non-compliance mechanism,
See also UNCLOS, Commission on	217
the Limits of the Continental	alternatives to, 227-33
Shelf	development of, 233-35
self-reporting, 415, 483	legal basis, 221–22
simulation exercise, 20, 24	legal features characterising,
Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs,	225–27
393, 419	overview, 217–20

surveillance (cont.) Trabalhadores da Fazenda Brasil procedural framework, 235-36 Verde v Brazil, 347 process, 224-25 Cyprus, 349-52 Rantsev v Cyprus and Russia, 350 scope, 222-24 UN Special Procedures on, 351 and pandemic preparedness, 26 requirement of International Health domestic court decisions on, 337, Regulations, 18 358 European Court of Human Rights Technical Committee on Cultural judgments on, 335 Heritage, 470 human rights treaty bodies and, 358 Teitgen, Pierre-Henri, 288 Inter-American Court of Human trade agreement compliance Rights judgments on, 336 behind-the-border schemes NGO pressure, 341 assessment, 182-83 regional court decisions on, 338, 358 contribution to compliance sociocultural factors influencing theory, 183-85 decisions on, 340 practical issues raised by, 179-81 soft pressure as compliance transformative power of, 181-82 mechanism, 359 enforcement vs compliance, 173-74 UN Special Rapporteur innovations, 172 communications on, 335, 339, United States-Mexico-Canada 359 Agreement, 174–76 and UN treaty bodies, 335 United Kingdom, 352-58 United States-Peru Trade CN v United Kingdom, 353 Promotion Agreement, 177 shifts in, 177 domestic court decisions, 355 trade-plus, 174-78, 181-82, 185 UN Special Procedures on, 356, trafficking in persons 357 Argentina, 342-46 See also Council of Europe, case of Marita Verón, 343 Convention on Action against case of Montoya, 343 Trafficking in Human Beings Committee on Economic, Social treaty bodies and Cultural Rights under CITES, 155 recommendations on, 345 under Convention on Biological Committee on the Elimination of Diversity, 155 Discrimination against Women committees of the parties as, 55 and human trafficking, 335, 344 observations on, 344 Committee on the Protection of on Argentina, 345 the Rights of All Migrant on Brazil, 348 Workers and Members of Their on Cyprus, 351 Families recommendations on. effect of recommendations by, 345 individual communications to, 335 influence of judicial cases, 342 UN Special Procedures on, 344, proactive nature of, 359 345 on United Kingdom, 344 Brazil, 346-49 in human rights field, 126, 288, 289, Committee on the Rights of the 293, 333, 366, 368, 394 Child observations on, 348 action against climate change, 364, Iosé Pereira v Brazil, 347 372 - 73

**UN Charter** 

climate complaints before, 374-78 compared to European Court of Human Rights, 302, 307, 309, 310 compliance mechanisms for environmental protection, 361, 363, 365, 366, 368, 382 compliance with views of, 299–300, 302, 310, 319 courts' references to documents of, 379 - 81development of environmental rights by, 371 effect of pronouncements by, 295, environmental complaints before, follow-up procedure, 368 importance of judicial oversight, 330 independence of, 371 monitoring by, 367 soft law documents, 379 state-to-state complaints before, 369 as implementation and compliance facilitators, 3 in international criminal law field, 385 facilitative approach of, 411 monitoring of suppression conventions by, 395 monitoring under regional conventions, 402 under multilateral environmental agreements, 58 processes employed under, 6 quasi-judicial, 418 relationship with international courts and tribunals, 157, 159 role in Bystroe Canal case, 90 treaty parties' cooperation with, 101 See scientific committee(s) Treaty of the High Seas. See BBNJ Agreement

Ulfstein, Geir, 56 UN (Palermo) Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, 334, 342, 346–47, 350, 356, 389

and International Monetary Fund, peaceful settlement of disputes (Art. 33), 58, 127 UN Convention against Corruption, 388, 419 Implementation Review Group, 391 UN Convention against Illicit Traffic in Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances, 393, 394 UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 394 UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 389, 392 UN Development Programme, 213 UN Environment Assembly, 118 UN Environment Programme on compliance, 101 on implementation, 101 UN Framework Convention on Climate Change. See Kyoto Protocol; Paris Agreement UN Human Rights Committee, 289, 317 cases Daniel Billy and Others v

Australia, 378 Ioane Teitiota v New Zealand, 374-75, 379 Lilian Celiberti de Casariego v Uruguay, 381 Mabel Pereira Montero v Uruguay, Portillo Cáceres et al. v Paraguay, 370, 379 compliance with views of, 302-3, 305-7, 309, 320 enforceability of views of, 319 and environmental protection, 364 UN Independent Expert report on, 370 General Comments of, 319 No. 36 (Art. 6 ICCPR), 372 individual communications to, 292,

UN Human Rights Committee (cont.) investor-state arbitration compared Inter-American Court of Human to arbitration under, 480 Rights' references to, 381 lack of enforcement mechanism, 472, legal status of views of, 295 states parties' reports to, 317 marine environment protection United Kingdom's relations with, obligations, 478, 481, 483 321-25, 330 need for non-compliance procedure, UN Human Rights Council, 264, 268, 364 UN Office on Drugs and Crime, 392 See also International Tribunal for UN peacekeeping forces, 469 the Law of the Sea UN Protocol against Illicit and South China Sea Arbitration, 472 - 84Manufacturing of and Trafficking in Firearms, 389 and Southern Bluefin Tuna UN Protocol against Smuggling of Convention, 158 Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, UNESCO assistance in protection of cultural UN Security Council property, 454, 459-61, 468 1737 Committee, 421, 423, 433, 438, involvement in MINUSMA, 469 439, 441 Man and the Biosphere Programme, effectiveness, 434 82, 88 Panel of Experts, 427, 438 Preah Vihear Temple, 446-47, protection of Temple of Preah 452-53, 462-65, 466, 469 Vihear, 446, 465, 469 United Kingdom and European Convention on UN Special Commission, 433 UN Special Procedures, 339, 359 Human Rights, 315–16, 327–29, Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of slavery, 348, 356 Human Rights Act, 321–24, 327–30 impact of European Court of Human Special Rapporteur on promotion and protection of human rights Rights judgments in, 327, 329, 330 and fundamental freedoms and International Covenant on Civil while combatting terrorism, 357 and Political Rights, 315–16, 320-25, 330, 332 Special Rapporteur on promotion and protection of human rights in Supreme Court, 330 context of climate change, 364 universal periodic review mechanism in health domain, 24, 29, 35 Special Rapporteur on sale and sexual exploitation of children, 357 in human rights domain, 25, 300, Special Rapporteur on trafficking in 368 persons, 334, 335, 340, 344, 345, 351, 359 Water Convention, 4, 83, 105 **UNCLOS** advisory procedure, 100, 108, 109-11 Annex VII arbitration, 473 Cijevna/Cem River, 111-13 Commission on the Limits of the conclusions on, 120 Continental Shelf, 147, 162–67 contribution to water diplomacy, conciliation under, 472, 488 114–16 financial, technical or legal dispute settlement under, 158, 473, 479, 480, 481 support, 116-17 compared to WTO dispute potential utility for other multilateral treaties, 119 settlement, 479

facilitative approach to compliance, implementation committee, 64, 67, 106 - 7non-compliance procedure, 5, 50, 65 public participation in noncompliance procedure, 102 Wolfrum, Rüdiger, 50–53 World Bank accountability mechanism, 189-91, 193, 197, 205 Compliance Advisor Ombudsman, Dispute Resolution Services, 200–2 accessibility, effectiveness and independence of remedies, 202 - 16Financial Sector Assessment Programs, 27, 235, 407 Grievance Redress Service, 197-200 Inspection Panel, 188, 193–97 jurisdictional overlap with International Monetary Fund, rule of law indicator, 308

World Health Organization Independent Oversight and Advisory Committee, 23, 25 Independent Panel for Pandemic Preparedness and Response (IPPR), 23, 25-27 Working Group on Strengthening WHO Preparedness and Response to Health Emergencies (WGPR), 23 World Health Assembly intergovernmental negotiating body, 23 Resolution WHA73.1, 25 See also International Health Regulations (2005); international pandemic law; pandemic preparedness World Trade Organization, 215 dispute settlement, 139, 162, 215, 478 - 79and environmental disputes, 58 and monetary disputes, 229 Trade Policy Review

Mechanism, 29

