# ASYMPTOTIC FORMULAE FOR LINEAR EQUATIONS 

## by DON B. HINTON

(Received 23 November, 1970)
Numerous formulae have been given which exhibit the asymptotic behaviour as $t \rightarrow \infty$ of solutions of

$$
x^{\prime \prime}+F(t) x=0,
$$

where $F(t)$ is essentially positive and $\int^{\infty} t F(t) d t=\infty$. Several of these results have been unified by a theorem of F. V. Atkinson [1]. It is the purpose of this paper to establish results, analogous to the theorem of Atkinson, for the third order equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
x^{\prime \prime \prime}+F(t) x=0 \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

and for the fourth order equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
x^{(i v)}+F(t) x=0 \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

However, rather than assume that $F(t)$ is essentially positive, we shall instead assume that $F(t)$ is essentially of one sign. We assume that $F$ has a decomposition for either $l=1$ or $l=2$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
(-1)^{t+1} F(t)=f(t)+m(t) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $f(t)$ is a " smooth " part of $F(t)$ and $m(t)$ is a " small " part. It is assumed throughout that $f(t)$ and $m(t)$ are continuous on a ray $[a, \infty)$ with $f(t)>0$ and continuously differentiable. The analysis is similar to that used in [4] for a two term $n$th order equation with sufficiently smooth coefficients.

It is convenient to express (1) and (2) in the vector forms

$$
\begin{equation*}
S^{\prime}=M S \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
T^{\prime}=N T \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $S, M, T$, and $N$ are, respectively

$$
\left[\begin{array}{l}
x \\
x^{\prime} \\
x^{\prime \prime}
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 \\
-F & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{l}
x \\
x^{\prime} \\
x^{\prime \prime} \\
x^{\prime \prime \prime}
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\
-F & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right] .
$$

Theorem 1. Let

$$
\begin{equation*}
f^{\prime} f^{-4 / 3}=h(t)+h_{1}(t) \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

and suppose that the following conditions hold:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \int_{a}^{\infty} f^{-2 / 3}|m| d t<\infty  \tag{7}\\
& \int_{a}^{\infty} f^{1 / 3}\left|h_{1}\right| d t<\infty \tag{8}
\end{align*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\int_{a}^{\infty}\left|h^{\prime}\right| d t<\infty \quad \text { with } \quad h(\infty)^{2} \neq 27.4^{-1 / 3} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then there is a fundamental matrix $S(t)$ of (4) and a $t_{0}$ such that, as $t \rightarrow \infty$,

$$
\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
f^{1 / 3}(t) & 0 & 0  \tag{10}\\
0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & f^{-1 / 3}(t)
\end{array}\right] S(t)\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
\exp \left(-\Lambda_{1}(t)\right) & 0 & 0 \\
0 & \exp \left(-\Lambda_{2}(t)\right) & 0 \\
0 & 0 & \exp \left(-\Lambda_{3}(t)\right)
\end{array}\right] \rightarrow L
$$

where, for $i=1,2,3$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \Lambda_{i}(t)=\int_{t_{0}}^{t} f^{1 / 3}(\tau) \lambda_{i}(\tau) d \tau \\
& \lambda_{i}(\tau)=w_{i}(\tau)+h(\tau)^{2} / 27 w_{i}(\tau) \\
& w_{i}(\tau)=\mu_{i}\left[\left(1+\left\{1-4 h(\tau)^{6} / 3^{9}\right\}^{1 / 2}\right) / 2\right]^{1 / 3}
\end{aligned}
$$

$\mu_{1}, \mu_{2}, \mu_{3}$ are the cube roots of $(-1)^{l}$, and $L=\left\{l_{i j}\right\}$ is the $3 \times 3$ matrix given by $l_{1 j}=1, l_{2 j}=$ $\lambda_{j}(\infty)-h(\infty) / 3$, and $l_{3 j}=\lambda_{j}(\infty) l_{2 j}$ for $j=1,2,3$.

Proof. We first transform (4) by defining $Z=Q S$, where $Q$ is the diagonal matrix $Q=\operatorname{diag}\left[f^{1 / 3}, 1, f^{-1 / 3}\right]$. Then

$$
\begin{align*}
Z^{\prime} & =\left[Q M Q^{-1}+Q^{\prime} Q^{-1}\right] Z \\
& =f^{1 / 3}(A+B+C) Z \tag{11}
\end{align*}
$$

where

$$
A=\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
h(\infty) / 3 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 \\
(-1)^{l} & 0 & -h(\infty) / 3
\end{array}\right], \quad B=[h(t)-h(\infty)]\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
1 / 3 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & -1 / 3
\end{array}\right]
$$

and

$$
C=\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
h_{1}(t) / 3 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 \\
(-1)^{t} m(t) / f(t) & 0 & -h_{1}(t) / 3
\end{array}\right] .
$$

If $\int_{a}^{\infty} f^{1 / 3} d t<\infty$, it follows from (6), (8), and (9) that $\int_{a}^{\infty}\left|f^{\prime}\right| f \mid d t<\infty$; hence $\log f$ has a limit at $\infty$. Thus $f$ has a positive lower bound, contrary to $\int^{\infty} f^{1 / 3} d t<\infty$. Let $k(t)=$ $\int_{a}^{t} f^{1 / 3} d \tau$, and denote the inverse of $k$ by $g$. The change of variable $W(s)=Z(g(s))$ in (11) yields for $W$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
W^{\prime}(s)=[A+\widetilde{B}(s)+\widetilde{C}(s)] W(s) \tag{12}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\widetilde{B}(s)=B(g(s))$ and $\widetilde{C}(s)=C(g(s))$. By conditions (7) and (8),

$$
\int_{0}^{\infty}|\tilde{C}(s)| d s=\int_{a}^{\infty} f^{1 / 3}(t)|C(t)| d t<\infty
$$

By condition (9), $\widetilde{B}(s) \rightarrow 0$ as $s \rightarrow \infty$ and $\int_{0}^{\infty}\left|\widetilde{B}^{\prime}(s)\right| d s=\int_{a}^{\infty}\left|B^{\prime}(t)\right| d t<\infty$. Hence, if the characteristic roots of $A$ are distinct and the real parts of the roots of $A+\widetilde{B}(s)$ are well-behaved, we may apply the asymptotic theorem due to Levinson [3, Chap. 3, Theorem 8.1]. A calculation shows that the roots $\tilde{\lambda}(s)$ of $A+\widetilde{B}(s)$ satisfy the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lambda^{3}-\lambda h(g(s))^{2} / 9-(-1)^{1}=0 \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

By recalling that, if $w \neq 0$ satisfies the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
w^{3}=-q / 2 \pm \sqrt{q^{2} / 4+p^{3} / 27} \tag{14}
\end{equation*}
$$

then $z=w-p / 3 w$ satisfies the equation $z^{3}+p z+q=0$ (cf. [2, p. 112]), the roots of (13) may be written (for $l=1$ use the $-\operatorname{sign}$ in (14) and for $l=2$ use the $+\operatorname{sign}$ ), for $i=1,2,3$,
where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\tilde{\lambda}_{i}(s)=\tilde{w}_{i}(s)+h(g(s))^{2} / 27 \tilde{w}_{i}(s), \tag{15}
\end{equation*}
$$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\tilde{w}_{i}(s)=\mu_{i}\left[\left(1+\left\{1-4 h(g(s))^{6} / 3^{9}\right\}^{1 / 2}\right) / 2\right]^{1 / 3}, \tag{16}
\end{equation*}
$$

and $\mu_{1}, \mu_{2}$, and $\mu_{3}$ are the cube roots of $(-1)^{l}$. For $4 h(g(s))^{6}>3^{9}$ in (16), the exponent $1 / 2$ denotes the root in the upper half plane and the exponent $1 / 3$ denotes the first quadrant root. Thus the characteristic roots of $A$ are distinct and a short calculation shows that the columns of $L$ are characteristic vectors of $A$. From (13) and $h(\infty)^{2} \neq 27.4^{-1 / 3}$, it follows that the roots $\lambda_{i}(s)$ ( $s$ sufficiently large and $\leqq \infty$ ) must occur in one of the following combinations: (i) one negative root and a pair of complex conjugate roots with positive real part, (ii) one positive root and a pair of complex conjugate roots with negative real part, or (iii) three distinct real roots. In either case, we have, for each $i, j$, that either $\operatorname{Re}\left[\tilde{\lambda}_{i}(s)-\tilde{\lambda}_{j}(s)\right] \equiv 0$ or $\operatorname{Re}\left[\tilde{\lambda}_{i}(s)-\tilde{\lambda}_{j}(s)\right] \rightarrow$ a nonzero constant as $s \rightarrow \infty$; thus the theorem of Levinson applies. There is then a number $s_{0}$ and a fundamental matrix $W$ of (12) such that, as $s \rightarrow \infty$,

$$
W(s)\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
\exp \left(-\int_{s_{0}}^{s} \lambda_{1}(u) d u\right) & 0 & 0 \\
0 & \exp \left(-\int_{s_{0}}^{s} \tilde{\lambda}_{2}(u) d u\right) & 0 \\
0 & 0 & \exp \left(-\int_{s_{0}}^{s} \tilde{\lambda}_{3}(u) d u\right)
\end{array}\right] \rightarrow L
$$

Since $W(k(t))=Q(t) S(t)$ and (for $\left.t_{0}=g\left(s_{0}\right)\right)$

$$
\int_{s_{0}}^{k(t)} \lambda_{i}(u) d u=\int_{t_{0}}^{t} f^{1 / 3}(\tau) \lambda_{i}(\tau) d \tau
$$

the above asymptotic behaviour for $W$ yields (10) for $S$.
For the perturbed Euler equation

$$
x^{\prime \prime \prime}+\left(K / t^{3}+\xi\right) x=0
$$

Theorem 1 is applicable if $\int^{\infty} t^{2}|\xi| d t<\infty$ and $K^{2} \neq 4 / 27$. Also applicable to perturbations of the Euler equation is the result that, if $m(t)=0$ and $\int_{a}^{\infty}\left|\left(t f^{1 / 3}\right)^{\prime}\right| d t<\infty$, with $t f^{1 / 3}$ tending as $t \rightarrow \infty$ to a positive limit $L, L^{6} \neq 4 / 27$, then the hypothesis of Theorem 1 is satisfied with $h(t)=-3 /\left(t f^{1 / 3}\right)$ and $h_{1}(t)=3\left(t f^{1 / 3}\right)^{\prime} /\left(t f^{2 / 3}\right)$.

Theorem 2. Let

$$
f^{\prime} f^{-5 / 4}=h(t)+h_{1}(t)
$$

and suppose that the following conditions hold:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \int_{a}^{\infty} f^{-3 / 4}|m| d t<\infty \\
& \int_{a}^{\infty} f^{1 / 4}\left|h_{1}\right| d t<\infty
\end{aligned}
$$

and

$$
\int_{a}^{\infty}\left|h^{\prime}\right| d t<\infty
$$

with $h(\infty)^{2} \neq 16$ for $l=1, h(\infty)^{2} \neq 64 / 3$ for $l=2$. Then there is a number $t_{0}$ and a fundamental matrix $T$ of (5) such that, as $t \rightarrow \infty$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
Q(t) T(t) E(t) \rightarrow K \tag{17}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $Q(t)$ and $E(t)$ are the diagonal matrices

$$
\begin{equation*}
Q(t)=\operatorname{diag}\left[f(t)^{3 / 8}, f(t)^{1 / 8}, f(t)^{-1 / 8}, f(t)^{-3 / 8}\right] \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
E(t)=\operatorname{diag}\left[\exp \left(-\Lambda_{1}(t)\right), \ldots, \exp \left(-\Lambda_{4}(t)\right)\right]
$$

in which, for $i=1,2,3,4$,

$$
\Lambda_{i}(t)=\int_{t_{0}}^{t} f^{1 / 4}(\tau) \lambda_{i}(\tau) d \tau
$$

and the $\lambda_{i}(\tau)$ are the 4 roots of the equation

$$
\lambda^{2}=5 h(\tau)^{2} / 64 \pm\left\{(-1)^{l}+h(\tau)^{4} / 4^{4}\right\}^{1 / 2}
$$

Also $K=\left\{k_{i j}\right\}$ is given by $k_{1 j}=1, k_{2 j}=\lambda_{j}(\infty)-3 h(\infty) / 8, k_{3 j}=\lambda_{j}(\infty) k_{2 j}-h(\infty) / 8$, and $k_{4 j}=\lambda_{j}(\infty) k_{3 j}+h(\infty) / 8$ for $j=1,2,3,4$.

Proof. The proof is similar to that of Theorem 1. The transformation $Z=Q T$ with $Q$ as in (18) yields

$$
Z^{\prime}=f^{1 / 4}(A+B+C) Z
$$

where

$$
\begin{gathered}
A=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
3 h(\infty) / 8 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & h(\infty) / 8 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & -h(\infty) / 8 & 1 \\
(-1)^{l} & 0 & 0 & -3 h(\infty) / 8
\end{array}\right], \\
B=[h(t)-h(\infty)] \operatorname{diag}[3 / 8,1 / 8,-1 / 8,-3 / 8],
\end{gathered}
$$

and

$$
C=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
3 h_{1}(t) / 8 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & h_{1}(t) / 8 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & -h_{1}(t) / 8 & 0 \\
(-1)^{l} m(t) / f(t) & 0 & 0 & -3 h_{1}(t) / 8
\end{array}\right]
$$

Define $k(t)=\int_{a}^{t} f^{1 / 4} d \tau$, and let $g$ be the inverse of $k$. As in Theorem $1, k(t) \rightarrow \infty$ as $t \rightarrow \infty$ and, if $W(s)=Z(g(s))$, then

$$
W^{\prime}(s)=[A+\widetilde{B}(s)+\widetilde{C}(s)] W(s)
$$

where $\widetilde{B}(s)=B(g(s))$ and $\tilde{C}(s)=C(g(s))$. The characteristic roots $\tilde{\lambda}(s)$ of $A+\widetilde{B}(s)$ satisfy the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lambda^{4}-5 \lambda^{2} h(g(s))^{2} / 32+9 h(g(s))^{4} / 8^{4}=(-1)^{l} \tag{19}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (19) it follows that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lambda^{2}=5 h(g(s))^{2} / 64 \pm\left\{(-1)^{l}+h(g(s))^{4} / 4^{4}\right\}^{1 / 2} . \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

For $l=1$, the condition $h(\infty)^{2} \neq 16$ implies that (20) has, for $s$ sufficiently large and $\leqq \infty$ and $h(\infty)^{2}>16$, four distinct real roots; for $h(\infty)^{2}<16$, roots of the form $\alpha \pm i \beta$ and $-\alpha \pm i \beta$ with $\alpha>0, \beta>0$. For $l=2$, the condition $h(\infty)^{2} \neq 64 / 3$ implies that (20) has, for $s$ sufficiently large and $\leqq \infty$ and $h(\infty)^{2}>64 / 3$, four distinct real roots; for $h(\infty)^{2}<64 / 3$, roots of the form $\pm \alpha$ and $\pm i \beta$ with $\alpha>0, \beta>0$. Thus, as in Theorem 1, we have, for each $i, j$, that either $\operatorname{Re}\left[\tilde{\lambda}_{i}(s)-\tilde{\lambda}_{j}(s)\right] \equiv 0$ or $\operatorname{Re}\left[\tilde{\lambda}_{i}(s)-\tilde{\lambda}_{j}(s)\right]$ tends to a nonzero constant as $s \rightarrow \infty$. Application of the theorem of Levinson as in Theorem 1 yields (17).

## REFERENCES

1. F. V. Atkinson, Asymptotic formulae for linear oscillations, Proc. Glasgow Math. Assoc. 3 (1957), 105-111.
2. G. Birkhoff and S. MacLane, A Survey of Modern Algebra, 2nd edition (New York, 1953).
3. E. A. Coddington and N. Levinson, Theory of Ordinary Differential Equations (New York, 1955).
4. D. B. Hinton, Asymptotic behaviour of solutions of $\left(r y^{(m)}\right)^{(k)} \pm q y=0$, J. Differential Equations 4 (1968), 590-596.

University of Tennessee
Knoxville, Tennessee

