AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

Volume 42, Numbers 2 & 3 • 2016

SYMPOSIUM

GLOBAL INFECTIOUS DISEASES: NEW CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS

Symposium Authors

George J. Annas

Enrico Baraldi

J.K. Billington

Byron Carson

Francesco Ciabuschi

Mark Eccleston-Turner

Isha Ann Emhoff

Nir Eyal

Ellen Fugate

Gaëlle Groux

Steven J. Hoffman

Thomas J. Hwang

Thomas of Tracing

Aaron S. Kesselheim

Ross Leach

Ann Marie Marciarille

Wendy K. Mariner

Chantal M. Morel

Dina Nathanson

Trygve Ottersen

Wendy E. Parmet

Andrew S. Robertson

Christopher T. Robertson

Michael S. Sinha

Michael R. Ulrich

Alexandra Waluszewski

A Journal of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics www.aslme.org



Published by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics and Boston University School of Law. Copyright held by the Trustees of Boston University.





LAW & MEDICINE

Volume 42, Numbers 2 & 3 • 2016

BOARD OF EDITORS

Faculty Advisors

Kevin Outterson, J.D., LL.M. Abigail Moncrieff, J.D. Kathryn Zeiler, M.S., J.D., Ph.D. Boston University School of Law

Faculty Editor-in-Chief Emeritus

Frances H. Miller, J.D.

Boston University School of Law

Editor

Edward J. Hutchinson American Society of Law, Medicine \mathfrak{S} Ethics

Founding Editor

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A. Health Discovery Corp.

EDITORS

Gail B. Agrawal, J.D., M.P.H. University of Iowa College of Law

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D. Boston College Law School

Jay A. Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. *MetaStar Inc.*, *Madison*

Ernest M. Haddad, J.D. Boston University School of Law

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D. $Duke\ University\ School\ of\ Law$

Nathan Hershey, LL.B. University of Pittsburgh Graduate School of Public Health (Retired)

David A. Hyman, M.D., J.D.

University of Illinois College of Law

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D. Harvard University Kennedy School of Government

Timothy S. Jost, J.D. Washington and Lee University School of Law

Stephen Latham, J.D., Ph.D. Yale University Interdisciplinary Center for Bioethics

Silvia A. Law, J.D. New York University School of Law David T. Morris, J.D., M.B.A. *AbbVie, Chicago*

Joseph P. Newhouse, Ph.D. Harvard University

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D. University of Washington School of Medicine

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida

> Arti K. Rai, J.D. Duke University Law School

Philip R. Reilly, M.D., J.D. Third Rock Ventures, LLC

Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D. Suffolk University Law School

Mark A. Rothstein, J.D.
University of Louisville School of Medicine
Institute for Bioethics, Health Policy and Law

David S. Szabo, J.D.

Edwards Wildman Palmer LLP

Linda V. Tiano, J.D. Epstein Becker & Green

Sidney D. Watson, J.D. Saint Louis University School of Law

LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Koichi Bai

Director, Institute of Medical Humanities Kitasato University School of Medicine JAPAN

Erwin Deutsch

Faulty of Law University of Göttingen GERMANY

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.

Faculties of Law and Medicine
University of Toronto
CANADA

Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby

President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
AUSTRALIA

M.A.M. de Wachter Director, Institute of Bioethics

Pirector, Institute of Bioethic The Netherlands

Christopher Newdick

Reader in Health Law University of Reading UNITED KINGDOM

Amos Shapira

Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
ISRAEL

Peter D.G. Skegg

Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

LAW & MEDICINE

STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS 2015-2016

Editor-in-Chief

Melissa Rybacki

Executive Editor

Hannah Perlman

Managing Editors

Victoria Reines Ting Chiu

Projects Editors

Portia Keady Sudeshna Trivedi

Symposium Editors

Amanda Hesse Timothy Murphy

Administrative Editor

Omar Aniff

Articles Editors

Note Editors

Lauren Bentlage Hannah Levin Daryl Berke Dina Nathanson Cristina Cahn-Speyer Talene Ghazarian Christina Lau Sara Maldonado Tyler Patterson Daniel Risica

Third-Year Editors

Caitlyn Bingaman Jack Brodsky Hannah Chapel Colin Creager Jaime Margolis Christopher York

Staff Members

Gabriella Andriulli
Casey Baines
Adria Bonillas
Justin Cacciatore
Stephanie Calnan
Yelena Greenberg
Malavika Lobo
Oliver Mayor-Parker

Beatriz C. Menéndez Shea Miller Lewis Osterman Julie Pearlman Pradyuman Ramlochan-Tewarie Kristen Rogerson

Natalie Rowles

Lauren Rubin
Megan Saumier-Smith
Katie Smith
Maryanne Tomazic
Chelsie Vokes
Caitlin Zeytoonian

LAW & MEDICINE

is pleased to introduce its student board of editors for 2016-2017

Editor-in-Chief

Maryanne Tomazic

Executive Editor

Shea Miller

Managing Editors

Natalie Rowles Megan Saumier-Smith Justin Cacciatore

Projects EditorSymposium EditorsAdministrative EditorLewis OstermanCasey BainesMalavika Lobo

Gabriella Andriulli

Articles Editors Notes Editors

Yelena Greenberg Kristen Rogerson Adria Bonillas Caitlin Zeytoonian Sigourney LaBarre Lauren Rubin Stephanie Calnan Oliver Mavor-Parker Julie Pearlman Beatriz C. Menéndez

Third-Year Editors

Pradyuman Ramlochan- Katie Smith Chelsie Vokes
Tewarie

LAW & MEDICINE

Volume 42, Numbers 2 & 3 • 2016

ARTICLES

- **223** The Perils of Panic: Ebola, HIV, and the Intersection of Global Health and Law *Michael S. Sinha & Wendy E. Parmet*
- **256** Law and Politics, an Emerging Epidemic: A Call for Evidence-Based Public Health Law *Michael R. Ulrich*
- **Beyond Lifestyle:** Governing the Social Determinants of Health *Wendy K. Mariner*
- 310 Firm-Led Malaria Prevention in the United States, 1910-1920 Byron Carson
- **333** Ebola and Human Rights: Post-9/11 Public Health and Safety in Epidemics *George J. Annas*
- **Boola Again Shows the International Health Regulations Are Broken:** What Can Be Done Differently to Prepare for the Next Epidemic? *Trygve Ottersen, Steven J. Hoffman & Gaëlle Groux*
- **393 Managing Our Microbial Mark:** What We Can Learn About Pay for Performance From Ebola's Arrival at Our Shores *Ann Marie Marciarille*
- **Leveraging Novel and Existing Pathways to Approve New Therapeutics to Treat Serious Drug-Resistant Infections** Thomas J. Hwang ゼ Aaron S. Kesselheim
- 451 Exploring the Obstacles to Implementing Economic Mechanisms to Stimulate Antibiotic Research and Development: A Multi-Actor and System-Level Analysis Enrico Baraldi, Francesco Ciabuschi, Ross Leach, Chantal M. Morel & Alexandra Waluszewski
- **487** A New Product Development Partnership Model for Antibiotic Resistance J.K. Billington
- **524 Preserving an Incentive for Global Health R&D:** The Priority Review Voucher Secondary Market *Andrew S. Robertson*

LAW & MEDICINE

- **543** Vaccines and Airline Travel: A Federal Role to Protect the Public Health *Christopher T. Robertson*
- **572** The Economic Theory of Patent Protection and Pandemic Influenza Vaccines: Do Patents Really Incentivize Innovation in the Field?

 Mark Eccleston-Turner
- **1598** Is There a Moral Right to Nonmedical Vaccine Exemption? Isha Ann Emhoff, Ellen Fugate, ♂ Nir Eyal

NOTES

621 Herd Protection v. Vaccine Abstention: Potential Conflict Between School Vaccine Requirements and State Religious Freedom Restoration Acts *Dina Nathanson*