Reintroducing group selection to the human behavioral sciences
David Sloan Wilson & Elliott Sober

Toward a theory of human memory: Data structures and access processes
Michael S. Humphreys, Janet Wiles & Simon Dennis

Multiple book review of Beyond Modularity
Annette Karmiloff-Smith

Also, Continuing Commentary on
“From an animal’s point of view: Motivation, fitness, and animal welfare”
(Dawkins/Singer)
“The nature of nurture: Genetic influence on ‘environmental’ measures”
(Plomin & Bergeman)
“A mobility gradient in the organization of vertebrate movement:
The perception of movement through symbolic language” (Golani)
“Psychophysical scaling: Judgments of attributes or objects?” (Lockhead)
“Multiple book review of Deduction” (Johnson-Laird & Byrne)
“Cultural learning” (Tomasello, Kruger & Ratner)
Editor
Stevan Harnad
E-mail: harnad@clarity.princeton.edu or harnad@pucx.bitnet
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor
Nancy Simon

Chief Copy Editor
Avis Kniffin

Behavioral Biology
Jack P. Hallinan/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior
Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development
Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Computational Neuroscience
Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology
Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior
A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems
Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition
Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders
Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics
Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology
Irving Koplenmann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics
Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology
Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleyoneurology
Stephen Jay Gould/ Harvard

Perception
Bruce Bridgeman/U. California

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy
Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science
Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primateology
Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology
Victor H. Dennenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence
Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy Behavioral and Brain Sciences (BBS) is an
international journal providing a special service called Open
Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology,
neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who
wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these
BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly signifi-
cant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for
Authors and Commentators, inside back cover.) The purpose
of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism,
stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the
behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology
to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropri-
ate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of com-
mentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to
provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and
pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a
full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted
commentaries, and the author’s response then appear si-
multaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any
qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences,
but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates
who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associ-
ates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Asso-
ciate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or arti-
cle accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is
available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as
BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM
03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

Copyright This journal is registered with the Copyright Clear-
ance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Or-
izations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC
may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by
sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to pay-
ment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on
the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to
multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISSI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia,
PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate
articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the
Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions Behavioral and Brain Sciences (ISSN
0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September,
and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription
price for institutions of Volume 17 (1994) is US $210.00 net
in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; £141.00 in the rest of
the world; for individuals US $85.00 net (£57.00); for BBS
Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and
Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US $49.00 net
(£36.00); for APA, APS, and ASA members US $68.00 net
(€36.00) with proof of eligibility with order. Subscription price
includes postage.

Single parts cost US $54.00 net (€36.00) plus postage.
Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in
the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University
Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the
U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The
Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU,
England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second
class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing
offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A.,
Canada, and Mexico to Behavioral and Brain Sciences, Cam-
bridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY
10011-4211.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the
Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or
New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

© 1994 Cambridge University Press

*Modelled on the ‘CA Comment’ service of the journal
Current Anthropology.
New Editorial Office Address

The BBS Editorial Office has moved to Southampton, United Kingdom. Please address all BBS correspondence to:

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Department of Psychology
University of Southampton
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

* * * * * * *

New Instructions for Authors and Commentators

Beginning in 1995:

(1) All Commentaries and Responses will, like Target Articles, have abstracts (~60 words). This is to ensure full coverage by abstracting services.

(2) In addition to the hard copies of all submissions, we will also require an electronic version, either by email or on disk. This is to prepare the way for electronic processing of all submissions.

BBS Email Address

bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk

BBS Associates: Those of you who have not done so are asked to send us your email address so you may receive electronic Calls for Commentators.
NEW IN 1995
Journal of the International Neuropsychological Society

JINS, a new bimonthly journal beginning publication in January 1995, will aim to further scientific and research activities in neuropsychology and enhance communication among its cognate member disciplines. The journal will publish scholarly, peer-reviewed articles and will include: Original Research Articles, Rapid Communications, Case Studies, Critical Reviews, Updates, Symposia, Dialogues, and Letters to the Editor.

The focus of articles may be primarily experimental, more applied or clinical. Contributions will broadly reflect the interest of all areas of neuropsychology, including but not limited to:

- development of cognitive processes
- brain-behavior relationships
- adult neuropsychology
- child neuropsychology
- developmental neuropsychology
- disorders of speech and language

And related topics such as:

- behavioral neurology
- neuropsychiatry
- neuroimaging
- electrophysiology

VOLUME 1, NUMBER 1, 1995 WILL INCLUDE:

Research Articles
Effects of Bilingualism on Verbal Learning and Memory in Hispanic Adults J.G. Harris, C.M. Cullum, and E.L. Gilkey
Learning of Name-Face Associations in Memory Impaired Patients: A Comparison of Different Training Procedures A.I.T. Thoene and E.L. Gilsky
The Naming Impairment of Living and Nonliving Items in Alzheimer’s Disease P. Montanes, M.C. Goldblum, and F. Bolier
Simple Reaction Time as a Measure of Global Attention in Alzheimer’s Disease M. Sano, Y. Stern, J. Rosen, and R. Mayeux
Weber Learning and Memory Following Pediatric Closed-Head Injury J.O. Yeates, E. Blumenthal, C.M. Patterson, and D.O. Delp

Rapid Communication
Episodic Memory Function in Advanced Aging and Early Alzheimer’s Disease CM. Cullum, C.M. Filley, and E. Kozora

Case Report
Semantic Memory and Reading Abilities: A Case Report L. Cipolotti and E.K. Wanington

Dialogue
Introduction: Systems Versus Processing Views of Memory J. Brandt
A Process-based View of Memory J.A. Blaxton
A Systematic View of Human Memory Processes J.E. Gabrieli

VOLUME 1, NUMBER 2, 1995 WILL INCLUDE:

ABSTRACTS PRESENTED AT THE 23RD ANNUAL MEETING OF THE INS (FEB. 8-11, 1995) SEATTLE, WA

In the United States, Canada and Mexico contact:
Journals Dept., Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
Telephone: 1-800-431-1580 ext. 154; Fax: 914-937-4712
email: journals_marketing@cup.org

Outside North America contact:
Journals Dept., Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
Telephone: +44(0)1223-325968; Fax: +44(0)1223-325959
email: journals_marketing@cup.cam.ac.uk

The Official Publication of the INS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF:
Igor Grant, M.D.
University of California, San Diego

THE INTERNATIONAL NEUROPSYCHOLOGICAL SOCIETY

JINS is an official publication of The International Neuropsychological Society, a scientific and educational organization of over 3,000 members. Members of the INS will receive the journal as part of membership. For further information on membership contact: Robert A. Bornstein, Ph.D. Executive Secretary
International Neuropsychological Society
Suite 550
700 Ackerman Road
Columbus, OH 43202
Tel. 614-263-4200
Fax: 614-263-4366

Bimonthly (ISSN 1355-6177).
Volume 1, 1995:
Institutions $160.00
$112.00 Outside North America
Individuals $80.00
$61.00 Outside North America
FREE SAMPLE ISSUE available on request.

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents  Volume 17:4  December 1994

Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. Reintroducing group selection to the human behavioral sciences 585

Open Peer Commentary
Afroy, J. & Levine, A. Driving both ways: Wilson & Sober's conflicting criteria for the identification of groups as vehicles of selection 608
Batson, C. D. Seeing the light: What does biology tell us about human social behavior? 610
Brace, C. L. The consequences of group selection in a domain without genetic input: Culture 611
Bradie, M. Metaphors and mechanisms in vehicle-based selection theory 612
Burghardt, G. M. Group selection and the group mind in science 613
Campbell, D. T. & Gatewood, J. B. Ambivalently held group-optimizing predispositions 614
Cloak, F. T. Unnecessary competition requirement makes group selection harder to demonstrate 615
Crow, J. F. In praise of replicators 616
Dawkins, R. Burying the vehicle 616
Dennett, D. C. E pluribus unum? 617
Dugatkin, L. A. Subtle ways of shifting the balance in favor of between-group selection 618
Dupr<5, J. Some philosophical implications of the rehabilitation of group selection 619
Frank, R. H. Group selection and "genuine" altruism 620
Gilbert, M. Me, you, and us: Distinguishing "egoism," "altruism," and "groupism" 621
Goodnight, C. J. Contextual analysis and group selection 622
Grantham, T. A. Putting the cart back behind the horse: Group selection does not require that groups be "organisms" 622

Griffiths, P. E. & Gray, R. D. Replicators and vehicles? Or developmental systems? 623
Heschl, A. Reconstructing the real unit of selection 624
Holcomb, H. R. III Empirically equivalent theories 625
Holsinger, K. E. Groups as vehicles and replicators: The problem of group-level adaptation 626
Hall, D. L. Taking vehicles seriously 627
Hyland, M. E. Different vehicles for group selection in humans 628
Lloyd, E. A. Rx: Distinguish group selection from group adaptation 628
MacDonald, K. Group evolutionary strategies: Dimensions and mechanisms 629
Miller, G. F. Beyond shared fate: Group-selected mechanisms for cooperation and competition in fuzzy, fluid vehicles 630
Moore, J. Hominids, coalitions, and weapons: Not vehicles 632
Nesse, R. M. Why is group selection such a problem? 633
Rapoport, A. Nongenetic and non-Darwinian evolution 634
Simpson, J. A. Adaptation and natural selection: A new look at some old ideas 634
Smith, E. A. Semantics, theory, and methodological individualism in the group-selection controversy 636
Thompson, N. S. Vehicles all the way down? 638
Wills, C. The maintenance of behavioral diversity in human societies 638

Authors' Response
Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. Group selection: The theory replaces the bogey man 639

Humphreys, M. S., Wiles, J. & Dennis, S. Toward a theory of human memory: Data structures and access processes 655

Open Peer Commentary
Clarke, T. L. Inorganic memory 667
Golden, R. M. Strong and weak formal specifications 668
Greene, R. L. Why do we need a computational theory of laboratory tasks? 668
Heath, R. A. The cognitive RISC machine needs complexity 669
Jacobs, A. M. On computational theories and multilevel, multitask models of cognition: The case of word recognition 670
Kashima, Y. Memory and social cognition 672
Kinoshita, S. Does a computational theory of human memory need intelligence? 673
Lewis, R. L. Task-specification language, or theory of human memory? 674
Murnane, K. Caught in a bind: Context information and episodic memory 675

Murray, D. J. What are the "goals" of the human memory system? 676
Myung, I. J. Is the representation meaningful? A measurement theoretic view 677
Oscar-Berman, M. Brain damage and cognitive dysfunction 678
Sloman, S. A. Progress within the bounds of memory 679
Tiberghien, G. Can we really dissociate the computational and algorithm-level theories of human memory? 680
van der Velde, F., Wolters, G. & van der Heijden, A. H. C. Marr versus Marr: On the notion of levels 681

Authors' Response
Humphreys, M. S., Wiles, J. & Dennis, S. Beyond the Tower of Babel in human memory research: The validity and utility of specification 682
Karmiloff-Smith, A. Précis of Beyond modularity: A developmental perspective on cognitive science

Open Peer Commentary

Bloom, P. & Wynn, K. The real problem with constructivism
Boden, M. A. Representational redescription: A question of sequence
Bodor, P. & Pélie, C. A Fodorian guide to Switzerland: Jung and Piaget combined?
Campbell, R. L. What's getting redescribed?
Carassa, A. & Tirassa, M. Representational redescription and cognitive architectures
Dartnall, T. Redescribing redescription
de Gelder, B. The risks of rationalising cognitive development
Donald, M. Representation: Ontogenesis and phylogensis
Estes, D. Developmental psychology for the twenty-first century
Foster-Cohen, S. H. Arguments against linguistic "modularization"
Freeman, N. H. Redescription of intentionality
Goldin-Meadow, S. & Alibali, M. W. Do you have to be right to redescribe?
Graham, G. Dissociation, self-attribution, and redescription
Grush, R. Beyond connectionist versus classical AI: A control theoretic perspective on development and cognitive science
Hampson, P. J. Representational redescription, memory, and connectionism
Johnston, T. D. Genes, development, and the "innate" structure of the mind
Kuhn, D. The power of explicit knowing
Losonsky, M. Beyond methodological solipsism?
Olsson, S. Representational change, generality versus specificity, and nature versus nurture: Perennial issues in cognitive research
Olson, D. R. Where redescriptions come from
Quarts, S. R. & Sejnowski, T. J. Beyond modularity: Neural evidence for constructivist principles in development
Rutkowska, J. C. Situating representational redescription in infants' pragmatic knowledge
Scholnick, E. K. Redescribing development
Shultz, T. B. The challenge of representational redescription
Smith, L. Modal knowledge and transmodularity
Vinter, A. & Perruchet, P. Is there an implicit level of representation?
Zelazo, P. D. From the decline of development to the ascent of consciousness

Author's Response

Karmiloff-Smith, A. Transforming a partially structured brain into a creative mind

Continuing Commentary


Bradshaw, R. H. & Bubier, N. E. The value of the consumer demand model to the science of animal welfare
Kiley-Worthington, M. Behavioural restriction, animal welfare, and choice experiments


Grinshteyn, G. & Bryden, M. P. Genetic influences on the environment
Lamb, M. E. Heredity, environment, and the question "why?"


Hadar, U. Implications of methodological rigor in movement analysis for the study of human communication
Shepard, J. K. & Dourish, C. T. Implications of Eshkol-Wachman movement notation for behavioural pharmacology

Author's Response

Golani, I. The practicality of using the Eshkol-Wachman movement notation in behavioral pharmacology and kinesics

Authors' Response

Plomin, R. & Bergeman, C. S. More on the nature of nurture

Authors' Response

Golani, I. The practicality of using the Eshkol-Wachman movement notation in behavioral pharmacology and kinesics

Allik, J. Is there any difference between attribute- and object-based psychophysics? 757

Booth, D. A. Recognition of objects by physical attributes 759

Pleh, C. The relative novelty of judgment relativity 760

Runeson, S. Psychophysics: The failure of an elementaristic dream 761

Sarris, V. Contextual effects in animal psychophysics: Comparative perception 763

Author’s Response

Lockhead, G. R. Psychophysical measures of objects and their features: It is time for a change 766


Authors’ Response

Martin-Cordero, J. & González-Labra, M. J. Amnesic mental models do not completely spill the beans of deductive reasoning 773

Smith, L. Mental models and modality 774

Johnson-Laird, P. N. & Byrne, R. M. J. Models, necessity, and the search for counterexamples 775


Authors’ Response

Chisholm, J. S. & Wescombe, N. Evolution, attachment, and cultural learning 778

Keller, H. & Chasiotis, A. "All I really need to know I learned in kindergarten" or is "cultural learning" anthropo-, ethno-, or adultocentric? 779

Pontevecro, C. Rethinking learning processes and products 780

Tomasello, M., Kruger, A. C. & Ratner, H. H. The role of emotions in cultural learning 782

Please Note

Erika Kors was the chief copy editor for Volume 17, Number 3 of BBS. We regret the omission of her name on the masthead of that issue.
### Essential Reading from Cambridge

#### Thinking and Deciding
*Second Edition*  
**Jonathan Baron**  
This exciting three-part introduction to current research and theory considers how we think, what keeps us from thinking that way, and how we can improve our thinking and decision making.  
- 43131-X Hardback $59.95  
- 43732-6 Paperback $24.95

#### The Poetics of Mind
*Figurative Thought, Language, and Understanding*  
**Raymond W. Gibbs Jr.**  
Establishes important links between the poetic structure of thought and everyday language usage in an attempt to overturn the traditional view that poetic language requires unique linguistic skills.  
- 41965-4 Hardback $59.95  
- 42992-7 Paperback $18.95

#### Tools, Language and Cognition in Human Evolution
*Edited by Kathleen R. Gibson and Tim Ingold*  
"...its subject matter is compelling, its presentation cogent, and its message important. For anyone with even a passing interest in the topic, the reward is worth the effort."  
— Roger Lewin, New Scientist  
1993 495 pp.  
- 41474-1 Hardback $69.95

#### The Computer User as Toolsmith
*The Use, Reuse and Organization of Computer-based Tools*  
**Saul Greenberg**  
"...thoughtfully and carefully written. It is well referenced, with over 100 citations. The author describes in clear and precise detail how he took his initial premises about tools and their reuse, and developed a research and analysis program to test them."  
— G.R. Mayforth, Computing Reviews  
- 40430-4 Hardback $44.95

#### Toys, Play, and Child Development
*Edited by Jeffrey H. Goldstein*  
Examines how toys and play contribute to the development of language, imagination, and intellectual achievement and how they can effectively be used in child psychotherapy.  
- 45062-4 Hardback $49.95  
- 45564-2 Paperback $14.95

#### Self-Awareness in Animals and Humans
*Developmental Perspectives*  
*Edited by Sue Taylor Parker, Robert W. Mitchell, and Maria L. Boccia*  
Focuses on controversies about how to measure self-awareness, which species are capable of self-awareness and which are not, and why.  
- 44108-0 Hardback $59.95

#### Behavioral Expression and Biosocial Bases of Sensation Seeking
*Marvin Zuckerman*  
Explore sensation seeking and the willingness to take risks for the sake of such experience.  
- 43200-6 Hardback $64.95  
- 43770-9 Paperback $32.95

#### Street Mathematics and School Mathematics
*Terezinha Nunes, David William Carraher, and Analucia Dias Schliemann*  
Provides a systematic comparison of mathematics used in school and out of school, describing the two forms of activity as different cultural practices that are based upon the same mathematical principles.  
- 38116-9 Hardback $49.95  
- 38813-9 Paperback $16.95

#### Beyond Adolescence
*Problem Behavior and Young Adult Development*  
**Richard Jessor, John E. Donovan, and Frances M. Costa**  
"...presents important data and analyses regarding crucial topics of drug use, problem behaviors, and psychosocial development from adolescence into young adulthood and provides some informative tests and expansion of problem behavior theory into young adulthood."  
— Contemporary Psychology  
- 46758-6 Paperback $16.95

---

Now in paperback...

#### Metaphors in the History of Psychology
*Edited by David E. Leary*  
"This contribution gives us much food for thought and whets the appetite for more."  
— Elizabeth Scarborough, Contemporary Psychology  
416 pp.  
- 42152-7 Paperback $17.95

---

Available in bookstores or from

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211
Call toll free 800-872-7423.
MasterCard/VISA accepted. Prices subject to change.