

BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary

Volume 34 | Issue 2 | April 2011 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Editorial Administrator

Ralph DeMarco

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 34 (2011) for *institutions* is US \$1136.00 for print and online, US \$957.00 for online only, and US \$1024.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £645.00 for print and online, UK £546.00 for online only, and UK £590.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$323.00 for print and online and US \$295.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £190.00 for print and online and UK £173.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$121.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £76.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$99.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £60.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$218.00 (UK £108.00) plus postage. *Institutional orders* may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 34:2 April 2011

Mercier H. & Sperber D.

Why do humans reason? Arguments for an argumentative theory 57

Open Peer Commentary

- Baumeister, R. F., Masicampo, E. J., & DeWall, C. N.** Arguing, reasoning, and the interpersonal (cultural) functions of human consciousness 74
- Connolly, T. & Reb, J.** Regret and justification as a link from argumentation to consequentialism 75
- De Neys, W.** The freak in all of us: Logical truth seeking without argumentation 75
- Dessalles, J.-L.** Reasoning as a lie detection device 76
- Evans, Jonathan St. B. T.** Reasoning is for thinking, not just for arguing 77
- Fox, J.** Artificial cognitive systems: Where does argumentation fit in? 78
- Frankish, K.** Reasoning, argumentation, and cognition 79
- Godfrey-Smith, P. & Yegnashankaran, K.** Reasoning as deliberative in function but dialogic in structure and origin 80
- Harrell, M.** Understanding, evaluating, and producing arguments: Training is necessary for reasoning skills 80
- Johnson, J. A.** The argumentative theory of reasoning applies to scientists and philosophers, too 81
- Khlentzos, D. M. & Stevenson, B.** True to the power of one? Cognition, argument, and reasoning 82
- Kuhn, D.** What people may do versus can do 83
- Narvaez, D.** The world looks small when you only look through a telescope: The need for a broad and developmental study of reasoning 83
- Oaksford, M.** Putting reasoning and judgement in their proper argumentative place 84
- Opfer, J. E., & Sloutsky, V.** On the design and function of rational arguments 85
- Pietraszewski, D.** What is argument for? An adaptationist approach to argument and debate 86
- Poletiek, F. H.** You can't have your hypothesis and test it: The importance of utilities in theories of reasoning 87
- Sternberg, R. J.** When reasoning is persuasive but wrong 88
- Stuppel, E. J. N., & Ball, L. J.** The chronometrics of confirmation bias: Evidence for the inhibition of intuitive judgements 89
- Uleman, J. S., Kressel, L. M., & Rim, S.** Spontaneous inferences provide intuitive beliefs on which reasoning proper depends 90
- Weber, E. U., and Johnson, E. J.** Query theory: Knowing what we want by arguing with ourselves 91
- Wiles, J.** Reasoning, robots, and navigation: Dual roles for deductive and abductive reasoning 92
- Wolfe, C. R.** Some empirical qualifications to the arguments for an argumentative theory 92
- Wu, K. C.-C.** Deliberative democracy and epistemic humility 93
- ### **Authors' Response**
- Mercier, H. & Sperber, D.** Argumentation: Its adaptiveness and efficacy 94