American Journal of International Law

INSIDE THIS ISSUE

- Centennial Essays
 W. Michael Reisman and
 Andrea Armstrong
 Theodor Meron
- Transformative Military
 Occupation: Applying the
 Laws of War and Human Rights
 Adam Roberts



PUBLISHED BY The American Society of International Law

New Titles from Transnational Publishers

TERRORISM AND ANTI-TERRORISM: A Normative and Practical Assessment

By Christopher L. Blakesley

This work addresses the problems relating to terrorism and the attempts to address and stop it. It challenges the premise of fighting fire with fire and devolves a working definition of terrorism that may be applied to whatever group or nation that uses terror or terrorism as a tactic or strategy. The work also covers occurrences of terrorism and counter-terrorism and analyzes international and domestic legislation, decisions, and actions taken to combat the enemy bent on using terrorism.

2006. 342 pages. ISBN 1-57105-332-8. \$125.00/hardcover.

INDIGENOUS AFRICAN INSTITUTIONS, 2d ed.

By George B.N. Ayittey

In this detailed and convincing picture of pre- and post-colonial Africa Dr. Ayittey argues that while colonialism was pernicious and brutal, the modern dictatorships under African elites are equally as pernicious and brutal, and perhaps even more bent on the wholesale destruction of African institutions.

2006. 598 pages. ISBN 1-57105-337-9. \$115.00/hardcover.

ACCOUNTABILITY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW: The Use of Collective Responsibility

By Shane Darcy

Accountability in International Law examines the extent to which the basic principle of individual responsibility accommodates liability for the acts of others. It examines the debates and legal developments surrounding collective responsibility under international law. The philosophical debates on collective responsibility provide an introduction to the examination of whether collective responsibility is ever appropriate or even lawful under international law.

2007. Approx. 350 pages. ISBN 1-57105-376-X. \$125.00/hardcover.

INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW: Origins, Challenges, Prospects

Edited by John Carey, William V. Dunlap, and R. John Pritchard

This set traces the origins of humanitarian law, how it has been shaped by world events, and why it can be employed to serve the future. At a time when war crimes are being examined by the International Criminal Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda and the new International Criminal Court, the role of international humanitarian law is seminal to the functioning of such attempts to establish a just world order.

Three-volume set: ISBN 1-57105-267-4. \$345.00/hardcover.

STATE SUCCESSION AND COMMERCIAL OBLIGATIONS

By Tai-Heng Cheng

The only major treatise in 50 years to appraise the global development of the law of state succession and commercial, obligations, this work makes a major breakthrough by illustrating how the policy considerations and decision-making processes are similar in both state and government successions.

2006. 504 pages. ISBN 1-57105-359-X. \$125.00/hardcover.

410 Saw Mill River Road Ardsley, NY 10502 Toll free 800 914 8186



F A X 914 693 4430 info@transnationalpubs.com www.transnationalpubs.com

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 100	July 2006		NO. 3
	CONTENTS		PAGE
Centennial Essays			
In honor of the 100th annive	ersary of the AJIL and the ASIL		
The Past and Future of the	e Claim of Preemptive Self-Defense <i>W. Michael Reisman a</i>	nd Andrea Armstrona	525
Reflections on the Prosecu	ution of War Crimes by International	Tribunals)2)
		Theodor Meron	551
Transformative Military O	occupation: Applying the Laws of Wa	ar and	
Human Rights		Adam Roberts	580
with the long-established ing laws of the territory human rights law and U lution of the law. Yet th	ons, as in Iraq, have aimed at transforming he "liberated" territory. This purpose appead laws of war rule that occupants should responder to transform JN Security Council resolutions—have full their value, and traditional rules retain their value, and traditically and legally problematic.	pect the exist- native acts— irthered evo-	
Notes and Comments			
Louis B. Sohn (1914–200	06)	Thomas Buergenthal	623
Correspondence			626
The Francis Deák Prize			627
Nominations for the Board	d of Editors		627
Current Developments			
-	of the International Court of Justice Protections for Sunken Military Craft	Stephen Mathias David J. Bederman	629 649
International Decisions	Edite	d by Daniel Bodansky	
Softwood Lumber Dispute	(2001–2006) (Chi Carmody)	<i>y</i>	664
	ons on alleged subsidization and dumping	of Canadian	
	Georgia & Russia (Maria Gavouneli) adition of Chechen rebels to Russia		674
Methanex Corp. v. United			683
4	ral award rejecting challenge to California e	environmen-	
Contemporary Practice of t	the United States Relating to Interna	tional Law ited by John R. Crook	
United States Issues New Mar	tional Security Document, Reaffirms Possi	-	
Force	nonai security Document, Reamrms Possi	bic rreeiiiptive Use of	690
Supreme Court Allows Impo	rtation of Substances Banned Under Treat	ty for Use in Religious	691

D.C. Circuit Finds Diego Garcia Displacement Claims Pose Nonjusticiable Political Question	s 692		
New Publications Close Multiyear Gap in Official U.S. Digest of U.S. Practice			
Ninth Circuit Dismisses Yahoo! Internet Auction Case, but Fragments on Reasons	694		
U.S. District Court Upholds Immunity of Iranian Consular Assets	695		
United States Votes Against New UN Human Rights Council	697		
United States Proposes Revised UN Assessment Process	699		
Continuing U.S. Navy Operations Against Indian Ocean Pirates	700		
Preliminary Settlement of Softwood Lumber Dispute	702		
United States' Periodic Report to Committee Against Torture	703		
President Would Like to End Guantánamo Bay Detentions; Criticism and Debate Regarding	<u>,</u>		
U.S. Operations There Continue	706		
Releases and Transfers of Uighurs, Saudis, Other Guantánamo Detainees	710		
Guantánamo Military Commission Proceedings Under Way; Additional Cases Planned	711		
Navy Investigating Intentional Killings of Civilians in Haditha, Iraq	713		
Further UCMJ Proceedings for Violations of Humanitarian Law	714		
UN Security Council Issues Presidential Statement on Iranian Nuclear Program; No Agree-			
ment on Next Steps	715		
U.SIndia Civil Nuclear Cooperation Faces Congressional Scrutiny	717		
United States Seeks Limits on Persistent and Non-detectable Landmines	719		
United States Seeks Extended Deadline for Chemical Weapons Destruction	720		
United States Tables Draft Treaty to End Production of Plutonium and Highly Enriched Ura-			
nium for Weapons	721		
Brief Notes	722		
Recent Books on International Law Edited by Richard B. Bilder	r		
Review Essay			
The Emergence of Transnational Labor Law			
Elliott, Kimberly Ann, and Richard B. Freeman. Can Labor Standards Improve	?		
Under Globalization?; Hepple, Bob. Labour Laws and Global Trade; Alston			
Philip (ed.). Labour Rights as Human Rights (David M. Trubek)	, 725		
Book Reviews	72)		
Alvarez, José E. <i>International Organizations as Law-Makers</i> (Mahnoush H. Arsan-	_		
	733		
jani)			
Paulsson, Jan. Denial of Justice in International Law (John R. Crook)	742		
Sands, Philippe. Lawless World: America and the Making and Breaking of Global Rule.			
from FDR's Atlantic Charter to George W. Bush's Illegal War (Steven J. Ratner)	746		
Lindblom, Anna-Karin. Non-governmental Organisations in International Law			
Martens, Kerstin. NGOs and the United Nations: Institutionalization, Profession-			
alization and Adaptation (Steve Charnovitz)	751		
Anghie, Antony. Imperialism, Sovereignty and the Making of International Law (Dar	1		
Danielsen)	757		
Briefer Notice			
Macdonald, Ronald St. John, and Douglas M. Johnston (eds.) Towards World			
Constitutionalism: Issues in the Legal Ordering of the World Community			
(Kelly Vinopal)	762		
Collected Essays	763		
Books Received	763 763		
International Legal Materials. Contents, Vol. XLV, No. 3 (July 2006)	767		
···· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			

BOARD OF EDITORS

Editors in Chief

LORI FISLER DAMROSCH
Columbia University School of Law

JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ

Columbia University School of Law

MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI

United Nations

DAVID J. BEDERMAN

Emory University School of Law

Daniel Bodansky

University of Georgia School of Law

JUTTA BRUNNÉE

University of Toronto School of Law

HILARY CHARLESWORTH

Australian National University

STEVE CHARNOVITZ

George Washington Univ. Law School

JAMES R. CRAWFORD University of Cambridge

JOHN R. CROOK

Potomac, Maryland BENEDICT KINGSBURY

New York University School of Law

DAVID A. MARTIN

University of Virginia School of Law

MICHAEL J. MATHESON

George Washington Univ. Law School

BERNARD H. OXMAN University of Miami School of Law

SEAN D. MURPHY

George Washington Univ. Law School

STEVEN R. RATNER

University of Michigan Law School

DINAH L. SHELTON

George Washington Univ. Law School

BETH A. SIMMONS

Harvard University

RICHARD H. STEINBERG

Univ. of California (UCLA) School of Law

JANE E. STROMSETH

Georgetown University Law Center

JOEL P. TRACHTMAN

Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy

RUTH WEDGWOOD

Johns Hopkins University

J. H. H. WEILER

New York University School of Law

EDITH BROWN WEISS

Georgetown University Law Center

DIANE P. WOOD

Chicago, Illinois

CHARLOTTE KU

ex officio

Honorary Editors

GEORGE H. ALDRICH

The Hague, the Netherlands

RICHARD B. BILDER

University of Wisconsin Law School

CHARLES N. BROWER

The Hague, the Netherlands

THOMAS BUERGENTHAL

The Hague, the Netherlands

ANTHONY D'AMATO

Northwestern University School of Law

RICHARD A. FALK

University of California at Santa Barbara

TOM J. FARER

University of Denver

THOMAS M. FRANCK

New York University School of Law

Louis Henkin

Columbia University School of Law

ROSALYN HIGGINS

The Hague, the Netherlands

JOHN H. JACKSON

Georgetown University Law Center

FREDERIC L. KIRGIS

Washington and Lee Univ. School of Law

Senior Associate Editor
ANNA ASCHER

CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN

Boston College Law School

ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD

New York University School of Law

THEODOR MERON

The Hague, the Netherlands

JOHN NORTON MOORE

University of Virginia School of Law

COVEY T. OLIVER

Easton, Maryland

W. MICHAEL REISMAN

Yale Law School

STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL

Washington, D.C.

LOUIS B. SOHN (1914-2006)

George Washington Univ. Law School

ERIC STEIN

University of Michigan Law School

DETLEV F. VAGTS

Harvard Law School

BURNS H. WESTON

University of Iowa College of Law

Associate Editor
STEPHEN SCHER

Managing Editor CARA M. SMITH

JOSEPH V. MCGRATH Assi.

Assistant Editors DOREEN G. YAMAMOTO

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law was organized in 1906 "to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice." Society membership is open to all persons of any nationality and profession who are interested in its objectives. Dues are: regular, \$165; special category, \$110; new professional, \$85; retired, \$110; student, \$30. Sustaining Memberships—contributing (\$275) and patrons (\$10,000)—are also available. Corporations may join ASIL as institutional sponsors (\$2,000). The Society is incorporated by Act of Congress approved September 20, 1950 (64 Stat. 869).

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2005–2006

Honorary President	Thomas Buergenthal
President	James H. Carter
President-Elect	José E. Alvarez
Vice Presidents	. DAVID CARON, LUCY REED, RUTH WEDGWOOD
Executive Vice President and Executive Director.	Charlotte Ku
Secretary	Frederic L. Kirgis
Treasurer	NANCY L. PERKINS
Assistant Treasurer	

Past Presidents: Charles N. Brower, Thomas M. Franck, Louis Henkin, Covey T. Oliver, William D. Rogers, Arthur W. Rovine, Anne-Marie Slaughter, Peter D. Trooboff, Edith Brown Weiss

Honorary Vice Presidents: THOMAS M. FRANCK, ARTHUR W. ROVINE, ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER

Council Members: Adeno Addis, Roger Alford, Peter E. Bass, Karima Bennoune, Franklin Berman, Daniel L. Bethlehem, Daniel Bodansky, Rosa E. Brooks, Charles H. Brower II, Hannah Buxbaum, Lan Cao, Douglass Cassel, Allison M. Danner, Eliana Davidson, Emanuela Gillard, Laurence R. Helfer, Charles Levy, Vaughan Lowe, D. Stephen Mathias, Balakrishnan Rajagopal, Miriam Sapiro, Michael P. Scharf, Beth A. Simmons, Paul Williams

Counsellors: James Bacchus, Rosemary Barkett, Ian Brownlie, Hilary Charlesworth, Pierre-Marie Dupuy, Tom J. Farer, John King Gamble, Jamie Gorelick, Conrad Harper, Rita E. Hauser, Rosalyn Higgins, Susan L. Karamanian, Martti Koskenniemi, Michael J. Matheson, Gay McDougall, Donald McRae, Sandra Day O'Connor, W. Michael Reisman, Stephen M. Schwebel, Dinah L. Shelton, Patricia Wald, J. Harvie Wilkinson III, Edwin D. Williamson

PROGRAM OF WORK

In addition to publishing the American Journal of International Law, the ASIL offers a variety of information resources and participation opportunities for members as well as nonmembers. These programs, best viewed at www.asil.org, include: publications such as International Legal Materials and Studies in Transnational Legal Policy; electronic bulletins such as ASIL Insights, International Law In Brief, and il. Post; events such as the Annual Meeting and other gatherings in Washington, DC, and around the world; OUTREACH programs for the justice sector, the media, and other audiences; an array of resources on the ASIL Web site, such as the Electronic Information System for International Law (EISIL) and the Guide to Electronic Resources for International Law (ERG); and opportunities to be part of an active network bridging expert and non-expert communities associated with the development of international law.

PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The ASIL accomplishes much of its work through charitable support. The Society is grateful to its many members who contribute to the annual fund and the endowment, the foundations whose grants fund special programs, and the law firms, publishers, universities, and others that sponsor ASIL activity. The Society is particularly honored to receive contributions through the Patrons program and to be included in our members' estate plans through the ASIL Heritage Circle. We recognize these contributors below.

PATRONS

Patrons of the Society contribute \$10,000 or more to the ASIL Endowment for International Law. Patrons may also be recognized posthumously upon such a donation being made in their name.

DOMINGO E. ACEVEDO GERALD AKSEN ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT GEORGE H. ALDRICH TEYMOUR A. ALIREZA JOSÉ ALVAREZ AND SUSAN DAMPLO JAMES G. APPLE MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI FRANK A. BAUMAN MRS. RICHARD BAXTER* DAVID J. BEDERMAN AND LORRE B. CUZZE DANIEL L. BETHLEHEM RICHARD B. BILDER JOHN A. BOYD CHARLES N. BROWER IAN BROWNLIE THOMAS BUERGENTHAL RODMAN R. BUNDY WILLIAM J. BUTLER SUSANA AND HUGO CAMINOS CHARLES H. CAMP DAVID D. CARON JAMES H. CARTER JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD IOHN R. CROOK ANTHONY D'AMATO LORI FISLER DAMROSCH AND JEAN BAUER FISLER ARTHUR H. DEAN* ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD* EDWARD DUMBAULD* RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR. ALONA E. EVANS* BENJAMIN B. FERENCZ

THOMAS M. FRANCK ALWYN V. FREEMAN* **JOHN KING GAMBLE** RONALD E. M. GOODMAN KATHERINE GOROVE CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD IOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE VICTORIA M. HARIRI RITA E. HAUSER JOHN N. HAZARD* ALICE AND LOUIS HENKIN ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN KEITH HIGHET* HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT JOHN H. JACKSON MARK R. JOELSON RICHARD A. JOHNSON SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN FREDERIC L. KIRGIS CHARLOTTE KU JENNIFER LAKE AND DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN JEFFREY LANG ELIHU LAUTERPACHT ROYS, LEE JEREMY I. AND CANDACE C. LEVITT CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN MRS. RICHARD LILLICH A. VAUGHAN LOWE ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD **BRUNSON MACCHESNEY***

HUSAM MESHAL W. ROBERT MORGAN* VED P. NANDA ANDRE NEWBURG SHIGERU ODA BERNARD H. OXMAN NANCY L. PERKINS HERMAN PHLEGER* LUCY F. REED W. MICHAEL REISMAN SANG-MYON RHEE ANDRÉS RIGO DAVIS R. ROBINSON WILLIAM D. ROGERS ARTHUR W. ROVINE SEYMOUR J. RUBIN* PHILIPPE J. SANDS OSCAR SCHACHTER* STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER ABBY COHEN SMUTNY EARL A. SNYDER* BARBARA STARK ERIC STEIN JOHN R. STEVENSON* ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA GENEVIEVE E. TILLAR* PETER D. TROOBOFF DETLEV F. VAGTS CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR. JILL MCCLANAHAN WATSON RUTH WEDGWOOD **EDITH BROWN WEISS** BURNS H. WESTON EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON BASIL S. YANAKAKIS NASSIB G. ZIADÉ

THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD

EDWARD WATSON MCWHINNEY

ROBERT MACCRATE

ROBERT F. MEAGHER

THEODOR MERON

Members who include the ASIL in their estate plans and so notify the Society may join the ASIL Heritage Circle.

ANONYMOUS JAMES G. APPLE CHARLES N. BROWER JAMES H. CARTER

SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD* CHARLOTTE KU

OSCAR SCHACHTER* CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN JOHN R. STEVENSON* H.C.L. MERILLAT RICHARD YOUNG

IN MEMORIAM

ALEXANDER FREEMAN ARTHUR K, KUHN

HENRY C. MORRIS

JAMES BROWN SCOTT STANLEY P. SMITH

WILLIAM D. ROGERS

More information about these and other ASIL philanthropic activities can be found at www.asil.org/aboutasil/financialsupport.html.

^{*} deceased

^{*} granted posthumously

ORDERS AND INQUIRIES

Subscriptions, Back Issues, and Cumulative Indexes: The American Journal of International Law (ISSN 0002-9300) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and is supplied to all members of the American Society of International Law. The annual subscription rate for nonmembers is \$180 (\$220 outside U.S.). Inquiries should be sent to the American Journal of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864; fax (202) 797-7133. Annual subscription orders should be sent to P.O. Box 164, Washington, DC 20055-0164. Order forms and other information are available online at http://www.asil.org. Claims for undelivered issues must be made in writing to the Society within three months of the mailing date specified online at http://www.asil.org/claims.htm. Volumes 1 (1907) to date are available from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209-1987, USA, toll-free (800) 828-7571. Cumulative indexes are also available from Hein: 1941–1960, 1961–1970, 1971–1980, and 1981–1990.

AJIL is also available in nonprint forms:

- Online, through: Hein Online, a service of William S. Hein & Co., Inc., at http://www.heinonline.org; Mead Data Central, Inc., provider of the LEXIS®/NEXIS® services, P.O. Box 933, Dayton, OH 45401, USA, toll-free (800) 227-9597; and West Publishing Company, provider of WESTLAW®, P.O. Box 64526, St. Paul, MN 55164-0526, USA, toll-free (800) 937-8529.
- On the Web in JSTOR, the archive/database of scholarly journals, either through individual subscriptions by ASIL members only ((202) 939-6000), or through institutional subscriptions (JSTOR, 149 Fifth Avenue, 8th Floor, New York, NY 10010, (212) 358-6400). See http://www.jstor.org for a current list of institutional subscribers.
- On microform, from: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209, USA, toll-free (800) 828-7571; and University Microfilms, 300 North Zeeb Road, Dept. P.R., Ann Arbor, MI 48106, USA, toll-free (800) 521-0600; or 30-32 Mortimer Street, Dept. P.R., London WIN 7RA, England.
- On CD-ROM format, from: University Microfilms.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use (beyond that permitted by sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law), or for the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by the American Society of International Law for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the base fee of \$5 per copy, plus 25¢ per page, is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. For organizations that have been granted a photocopy license by CCC, a separate system of payment has been arranged. The fee code for users of the Transactional Reporting Service is: 0002-9300/02 \$5.00+.25. Educational copying is permitted. Please address requests to CCC Academic Permission Service: tel. (978) 750-8400; fax (978) 750-4744.

Advertising: Inquiries should be sent to the Marketing Manager, ASIL, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, tel. (202) 939-6000; fax (202) 797-7133.

Periodicals postage paid at Washington, DC, and at additional mailing office. POSTMASTER: Send change of addresses to American Journal of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Ave., NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the American Society of International Law.

SUBMISSION OF MANUSCRIPTS

Manuscripts may be sent to the American Journal of International Law, at the American Society of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, USA, or by e-mail to AJIL@ASIL.org. Authors are requested to submit their manuscripts on computer disc or by e-mail attachment. If the manuscript is unavailable in electronic form, four paper copies should be submitted. Manuscripts and discs submitted will not be returned to the author. Please do not submit manuscripts via facsimile. The AJIL will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this Journal.

The AJIL uses both Word and WordPerfect. Please specify the word-processing program used for manuscripts submitted in electronic form.

Book reviews are by invitation: suggestions may be made to the Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864. **Books for review** should be sent to the same office.

Format and style guidelines: All manuscripts should be double-spaced, with double-spaced footnotes. The AJIL Author Style Guide is available online at http://www.asil.org/resources/ajilsubmissions.html. Subject to variations noted in that document, the AJIL conforms to The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation (18th ed. 2005) and the Chicago Manual of Style (15th ed. 2003). The style guide can also be obtained via e-mail requests to AJIL@ASIL.org. The Bluebook can be obtained from the Harvard Law Review Association, Gannett House, 1511 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138.

INDEXES CARRYING AJIL

The American Journal of International Law is included in: ABC POL SCI: A Bibliography of Contents: Political Science and Government; Current Law Index; IBR—International Bibliography of Book Reviews of Scholarly Literature; IBZ—International Bibliography of Periodical Literature; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals; International Political Science Abstracts; Public International Law: A Current Bibliography of Books and Articles; Social Sciences Index.