

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 25 NUMBER 1 1999

ARTICLES

STATE MEDICAL PEER REVIEW:
HIGH COST BUT NO BENEFIT
—IS IT TIME FOR A CHANGE?

Susan O. Scheutzow

MEDICARE+CHOICE APPEAL PROCEDURES:
RECONCILING DUE PROCESS RIGHTS AND
COST CONTAINMENT

Jennifer E. Gladieux

NOTES AND COMMENTS

SEX OFFENDERS, MENTAL ILLNESS AND
CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY: THE
CONSTITUTIONAL BOUNDARIES OF CIVIL
COMMITMENT AFTER *KANSAS V. HENDRICKS*

Adam J. Falk

DIRECT-TO-CONSUMER PRESCRIPTION
DRUG ADVERTISING

Tamar V. Terzian

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS
AND THE BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

A JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE (AJLM) is published by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and Boston University School of Law (BUSL). All decisions concerning the content of AJLM are made by a joint ASLME-BUSL editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or BUSL.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: 617-353-2912.

Address subscription or membership correspondence to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 15. Fax: 617-437-7596. Requests for permission to reproduce AJLM material should be addressed to the Publications Director, at the preceding address. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 13. Fax: 617-437-7596.

AJLM subscriptions are \$170 per year for institutions; and \$90 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. All foreign subscribers must remit an additional \$30 per year for foreign postage fees. ASLME members receive AJLM as part of their member benefits (see details in the back matter). AJLM is published quarterly: Spring; Summer & Fall; and Winter.

Missing copies of AJLM will be sent free of charge to ASLME subscribers or members provided that notice of such a claim is received by ASLME *within one month of receipt of the next issue published*. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$25 (members) and \$35 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$35 (members) and \$45 (nonmembers).

AJLM is online, indexed, or abstracted in *LEXIS*, *Westlaw*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *SSRN Health Law & Policy*, and *EMBASE/Excerpta Medica*.

Library of Congress Catalog No. 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, NE, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (nonprofit organization).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JON WESTLING, LL.D. (hon.), *President and Professor of Humanities*

JOHN R. SILBER, M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *Chancellor, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

FREDERICK M. LAWRENCE, J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

DANIEL J. FREEHLING, J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

JOHN LANTOS, M.D., *President*

PHILIP REILLY, J.D., M.D., *President-Elect*

SARA ROSENBAUM, J.D., *Secretary*

RUTH MICKELSEN, J.D., M.P.H., *Treasurer*

NANCY NEVELOFF DUBLER, LL.B., *Immediate Past President*

BENJAMIN W. MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD OF EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR/PUBL. DIRECTOR
Michael Vasko, M.A.
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

MEMBERSHIP DIRECTOR
Thomas Psipsikas
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT
Benjamin W. Moulton, J.D., M.P.H.
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College School of Law

Henry A. Beyer, J.D.
Fernald School Corp.
Waltham, Massachusetts

Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Dunn & Auton
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh Grad. School of Public Health

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.
Harvard University Kennedy School of Government

Timothy S. Jost, J.D.
Ohio State University College of Law

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D.
Boston College School of Law

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Washington School of Medicine

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D.
Indiana University School of Public & Environmental
Affairs

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.
Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Tufts University

Paul R. Tremblay
Boston College School of Law

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University Medical Center

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
St. Francis Central Hospital
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Monumental Life Insurance Co. of AGON

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Professor Koichi Bai
Director, Institute of Medical Humanities
Kitasato University School of Medicine
Japan

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Faculty of Law
University of Göttingen
Germany

Professor Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Faculties of Law and Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Dr. S.S. Fluss
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby
President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
Australia

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Professor Amos Shapira
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

Professor P.D.G. Skegg
Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director, Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS FOR
1998–1999

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Jeremy R. Johnson

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Jeremy A. Colby

MANAGING EDITORS

Alison Chen

Henry Park

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Amy Schoeffel

PROJECTS EDITOR

Tamar Terzian

ARTICLES EDITORS

Noel Bilitz

Kendra Carlson

Rebecca Galeota

Leigh Rubinstein

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Brian Green

Colin Kisor

Susan Seitz

Leann Westerhold

Angela Whitehead

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Jennifer Blake

Robert Chatham

Caroline Chen

Katie Collins

Rachelle De Gregory

Dylan Devito

Danielle Dooley

Andrew Eliseev

Adam J. Falk

John Gorzkowski

Jennifer Greaney

Julia Jacobson

Isidor Kim

Gabrielle Lipson

Jessika Moon

Laurie Moroff

Melissa Paddock

Geoff Repo

Rebecca Risse

Nathan Spatz

Karen Volmar

Jennifer Williamson

STAFF MEMBERS

Rodi Alexiadis

Allison Baker

Jason M. Brocks

Heather Burghardt

Megan L. Cleary

Jennifer Cohen

Dena Barakat Ebright

Sonil Gehani

Allan J. Gomes

Thomas P. Heim

Elizabeth A. Heinrich

Kristen Josefek

Ori Katz

Michelle R. Kohlmeier

Melissa J. Lopes

Ashley McMurry

Lee Michel

Kathleen Murray

Richa Nand

Vivian Ilana Orlando

Young M. Park

Andy T. Pho

Sarah E. Pinto

Justin B. Rand

Mary-Rachel Rosenfeld

Cecilia E. Rutherford

Shana L. Smith

Michael B. Stuart

Gilbert Manuel Swift

Tiffany Theodos

Joseph R. Zakhary

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 25 NUMBER 1 1999

ARTICLES

STATE MEDICAL PEER REVIEW: 7 Susan O. Scheutzow
HIGH COST BUT NO BENEFIT
—IS IT TIME FOR A CHANGE?

MEDICARE+CHOICE APPEAL PROCEDURES: 61 Jennifer E. Gladieux
RECONCILING DUE PROCESS RIGHTS AND
COST CONTAINMENT

NOTES AND COMMENTS

SEX OFFENDERS, MENTAL ILLNESS AND 117 Adam J. Falk
CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY: THE
CONSTITUTIONAL BOUNDARIES OF CIVIL
COMMITMENT AFTER *KANSAS v. HENDRICKS*

DIRECT-TO-CONSUMER PRESCRIPTION 149 Tamar V. Terzian
DRUG ADVERTISING

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 169

ANNOUNCEMENTS 182

Copyright 1999 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. and Boston University School of Law. All rights reserved. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, contact Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers MA 01923; tel. 978-750-8400; fax 978-750-4470; or contact the Publications Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Ste. 1634, Boston MA 02215; tel. 617-262-4990 ext. 13; fax 617-437-7596; email mvasko@aslme.org.