AMERICAN **IOURNAL** OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1997

MANAGED CARE PHASE TWO STRUCTURAL CHANGES AND **EQUITY ISSUES**

Foreword Frances H. Miller

Symposium Authors

Margaret G. Farrell Thomas L. Greaney Loretta M. Kopelman Lawrence E. Singer

NOTES AND COMMENTS Sarah C. Kellogg Wayne M. Serra

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND THE BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer & Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint ASLME/Boston University School of Law editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or the law school.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Common-wealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: (617) 353-2912.

Address subscription or membership correspondence to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Business telephone: (617) 262-4990. Requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material should be addressed to the Director of Publications, at the preceding address.

Subscription rates are \$170.00 per year for institutions; and \$90.00 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. Foreign subscribers remit an additional \$30.00 per year for foreign postage. Members of ASLME receive the JOURNAL as part of their annual dues (please see details in the back matter).

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of ASLME provided that notice of such a claim is received at ASLME's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$25.00 (members) and \$35.00 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$40.00 (members) and \$50.00 (nonmembers).

JOURNAL articles are indexed in LEXIS, WESTLAW, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (nonprofit organization).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JON WESTLING, B.A., LL.D. (hon.), President and Professor of Humanities

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), Chancellor, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., Dean and Professor of Law

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law FREDERICK M. LAWRENCE, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean and Professor of Law

DANIEL J. FREEHLING, B.S., J.D., Associate Dean and Professor of Law

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

ELLEN WRIGHT CLAYTON, M.D., J.D., President NANCY NEVELOFF DUBLER, LL.B., President-Elect ELENA A. GATES, M.D., Secretary JOHN LANTOS, M.D., Treasurer SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., Immediate Past President BENJAMIN W. MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., Executive Director ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., Founder and First President

AMERICAN OURNAL OF LAW 📾 & MEDICINE

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Frances H. Miller, J.D. Boston University School of Law

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS Michael Vasko, M.A. American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

CIRCULATION MANAGER T. Patrick Rewalt American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR Benjamin W. Moulton, J.D., M.P.H. American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D. Boston University School of Law

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D. Boston College School of Law

Henry A. Beyer, J.D. Fernald School Corp. Waltham, Massachusetts

Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M. Dunn & Auton Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D. Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D. Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D. University of Pittsburgh Grad. School of Public Health

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D. Hollowell & Silverstein Raleigh, North Carolina

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D. Cornell University Prog. on Science Technology & Society

Timothy S. Jost, J.D. Ohio State University College of Law

Jay Katz, M.D. Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D. Boston College School of Law Sylvia A. Law, J.D. New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H. Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida Jacksonville, Florida

Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D. Indiana University School of Public & Environmental Affairs

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. Founder, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D. New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B. Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S. Tufts University

Paul R. Tremblay Boston College School of Law

David G. Warren, J.D. Duke University Medical Center

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D. St. Francis Central Hospital Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. Monumental Life Insurance Co. of AGON

BOARD OF EDITORS

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Professor Koichi Bai Director, Institute of Medical Humanities Kitasato University School of Medicine Japan

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch Faculty of Law University of Göttingen Germany

Professor Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D. Faculties of Law and Medicine University of Toronto Canada

Dr. S.S. Fluss World Health Organization Switzerland

Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby President, Court of Appeal Supreme Court of New South Wales Australia Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde Universiteit van Amsterdam The Netherlands

Professor Amos Shapira Faculty of Law Tel Aviv University Israel

Professor P.D.G. Skegg Faculty of Law University of Otago New Zealand

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter Director, Institute of Bioethics The Netherlands

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS FOR 1996–1997

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Joan E. Reed

EXECUTIVE EDITOR Sara C. Bienkowski

MANAGING EDITORS Simon M. Canick Ashley E. Moller

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR Dianne McCarthy

ARTICLES EDITORS Matthew N. Kane Sarah C. Kellogg William H. Tobin Traci L. Vanek

> Harris T. Berenson Randi C. Berger Cathleen Cachero Jenny H. Cho Sara B. Davis Jeffrey P. Donohue

Erica Abate Theonie Alicandro Grace Bacon Kerri Catino Bethany Cooper Kristine Dimitrova Craig P. Druchl Robert Earley Jonathan Eichman Michelle M. Enfinger Alissa Epstein Kristen M. Green Jennifer Horner PROJECTS EDITOR Nicole L. Patterson

CASE & NOTE EDITORS Mark B. Adler

SuJin Cho Tammie C. Garner Ari B. Pollack L. Edward Ríos

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Amir Dotan Cecelia A. Gassner John J. Goss Antonino G. Hernandez Cori M. LaCasa

STAFF MEMBERS

Nicole Jerabek Catherine Kaczowka Rachelle A. Kagan Jason M. Levy Shana Lewinger Richard Liner Natalie Marjancik Ryan McDonald Judith Michelman Julia Nelson Mary Osterbauer Carl B. Massey, Jr. Brian P. McDonough Adam Michael Tamara E. Russell Wayne M. Serra Thomas M. Simpson

K. Shiek Pal Kathleen Paralusz Michael Portnoy Andrea Rathburn Bradley Rausa Randi Rivner Lou Ross David Rudin Sharon Schlesinger Betsi Silverman Jerome B. Tichner, Jr. Stephen D. Wilson Michelle Zamarin

AMERICAN **OURNAL** OF LAW & MEDICINE

The American Journal of Law & Medicine is pleased to introduce its Student Board of Editors for 1997-1998

> **EDITOR-IN-CHIEF** Michelle A. Zamarin

EXECUTIVE EDITOR Jerome B. Tichner Jr.

MANAGING EDITORS Kristine Dimitrova Bradley Rausa

Jennifer Horner

Michelle M. Enfinger Alissa Epstein Kristen M. Green Nicole Jerabek

Erica Abate Theonie Alicandro Kerri Catino Robert Earley Jonathan Eichman Catherine Kaczowka Rachelle A. Kagan

Jason M. Levy **Richard Liner** Ryan McDonald Judith Michelman Julia Nelson Mary Osterbauer K. Shiek Pal Kathleen Paralusz

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

PROJECTS EDITOR Bethany Cooper

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Grace Bacon Craig P. Druehl Shana Lewinger Natalie Marjancik Lou Ross

Michael Portnoy Andrea Rathburn Randi Rivner David Rudin Sharon Schlesinger Betsi Silverman Stephen D. Wilson

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

ARTICLES EDITORS

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0098858800010674 Published online by Cambridge University Press

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1997

Managed Care Phase Two-Structural Changes and Equity Issues

ARTICLES

Foreword: Managed Care Phase Two— Structural Changes and Equity Issues	187	Frances H. Miller
NIGHT LANDINGS ON AN AIRCRAFT Carrier: Hospital Mergers and Antitrust Law	191	Thomas L. Greaney
THE CONVERSION CONUNDRUM: THE STATE AND FEDERAL RESPONSE TO HOSPITALS' CHANGES IN CHARITABLE STATUS	221	Lawrence E. Singer
ERISA PREEMPTION AND REGULATION OF Managed Health Care: The Case for Managed Federalism	251	Margaret G. Farrell
RESOURCE ALLOCATION IN THE NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICE	291	Christopher Newdick
THE U.S. HEALTH DELIVERY SYSTEM: INEFFICIENT AND UNFAIR TO CHILDREN	319	Loretta M. Kopelman Michael G. Palumbo
NOTES AND COMMENTS		
THE DUE PROCESS RIGHT TO A SAFE AND HUMANE ENVIRONMENT FOR PATIENTS IN STATE CUSTODY: THE VOLUNTARY/ INVOLUNTARY DISTINCTION	339	Sarah C. Kellogg
Ensuring the Safety of Genotech Drugs Through Implied Warranty Theory	363	Wayne M. Serra
In Memoriam and Announcements	388	

Copyright 1997 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notifies the Director of Publications of ASLME; (2) the author(s) and the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyrights is affixed to each copy.