

sentence, one can but find the meaning of necessity, and what other criterion is there of the meaning of the form?

The paper seems to be a very careful and critical collection of these verbals, but the author fails to draw even those simple conclusions which are suggested by comparing the number of forms, and

the relative character of the forms, under each heading. In the appendices he treats several topics suggested by his investigation, as accent, etymologies, adverbs in *-tus* (19), etc., and a long index of words makes this scholarly treatise convenient for reference.

ARTHUR FAIRBANKS.  
Dartmouth College.

To the Editor of the CLASSICAL REVIEW.

OXFORD, Jan. 1891.

SIR,—IN the last number of the *Classical Review* Mr. Page makes reference to a note of mine on Verg. *Aen.* vi. 567, as to which I should wish to say a word. The criticism concerns the following well-known lines:—

Castigatque auditque dolos subigitque fateri  
quae quis apud superos furto laetatus inani  
distulit in seram commissa piacula mortem.

On the first line Mr. Page attacks my view that *castigat* means 'punishes,' and says roundly that it is erroneous. He translates 'flogthem,' and explains that Rhadamanthus is an inquisitor who is torturing to procure confession. There is much that is attractive in this suggestion, and I have before now been favourably inclined towards it: but the real difficulty lies in the word itself, for as far as I know *castigare* never means to torture, but always has the idea of 'correction' or 'punishment.' This is no doubt the reason why it is so taken by Heyne, Conington, Gossrau, Forbiger, Wagner, and Ladewig, though they do not all agree about its relation to *audit*; and Heyne has a special excursus (Exc. xi.) where he argues at length that Rhadamanthus is not a judge or magistrate like Minos, but is entrusted with the duty of executing sentences, like the Tres Viri Capitaes: for (as I say in my note) he has only the guilty to deal with.

On the last line my note is as follows:—  
'Delayed till his late death the guilt he had contracted' [*i.e.* delayed to expiate it;] but the Latin is less harsh than the English, [because *piacula* though it means 'guilt,' as *commissa* proves, yet suggests the impending expiation, and so goes more easily with *distulit*].

In his criticism on this note Mr. Page omits the whole of what I have included in brackets, whereas it is obviously essential to the interpretation which I adopt of *piacula*. Servius took *piacula* to mean 'crimes,' and is followed by Conington, Forbiger, Gossrau and others. Mr. Page translates *commissa piacula* 'the due (incurred) atonement': a

possible rendering, but by no means so obviously right that it should be thus confidently given, or that the difficulties should be ignored. For *commissa piacula* agrees with *quae*, and is therefore (in Vergil's phrase) what the sinner *is forced to confess*, as well as what he *has deferred*. Now it would certainly be harsh (what Mr. Page would call 'nonsense') to say that a man 'confesses a due (incurred) atonement'; and this difficulty, which the critic neatly evades in his translation (and quite legitimately on his view), he has perhaps overlooked in dealing with the other versions. The truth I take to be that as *piacula* can be both 'expiation' and 'sins to be expiated,' and as *commissa* can mean both 'committed' and 'incurred' (the latter however is comparatively rare); the poet characteristically takes advantage of the double ambiguity, and compresses into one sentence the two facts that the sinner confesses the sin and that he has delayed the expiation. This is in reality what I meant in my note: though I see that it wants a more careful statement. It is an exaggeration, I admit, to say that *commissa* proves *piacula* to mean 'guilt.' It does not prove it: but the use of *committere* with *facinus*, *scelus*, *delictum*, *flagitium*, and the like, is so much commoner than the use with *paenam*, that the sense I give is most naturally regarded as the primary one.

In writing notes to a school-book, especially on an author much read by beginners, one is bound to avoid much discussion of alternatives, to select the version preferred, and expound it briefly: and perhaps in commenting on these difficult lines I have followed this rule to excess. But a critic in a journal for scholars cannot be so summary. Mr. Page is well known as a good scholar and an accomplished teacher; and I owe him thanks for directing my attention to a note which might certainly be improved, as well as for some appreciative words which he bestows on my school edition of Vergil. I hope he will not think me ungracious if I criticise him in turn, and

say that he talks rather too freely of 'blundering,' 'perversions,' 'erroneous interpretation,' 'the danger of jotting down notes at haphazard,' 'the sort of pabulum which the University presses send out,' and

so forth. If he is to dispose of Servius, Heyne, Forbiger, Gossrau, Conington and Ladewig, a little more recognition is required of the difficulties of Vergil, and a little more discussion.

A. SIDGWICK.

## LUCIANUS.

## IDEM LATINE REDDITUM.

Πλούτος ὁ τῆς ψυχῆς πλούτος μόνος ἐστὶν ἀληθής·  
τᾶλλα δ' ἔχει λύπην πλείονα τῶν κτεάνων.  
τὸν δὲ πολυκτέανον καὶ πλούσιόν ἐστι δίκαιον κλήξαι, ὃς χρῆσθαι τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς δύναται.  
εἰ δέ τις ἐν ψήφοις κατατήκεται, ἄλλον ἐπ' ἄλλῳ σωρεύειν αἰεὶ πλοῦτον ἐπειγόμενος, οὗτος ὅποια μέλισσα πολυτρήτοις ἐνὶ σίμβλοις μοχθήσει, ἐτέρων δρεπτομένων τὸ μέλι.

LUCIANVS.

Veras quaeris opes, nusquam nisi mente repertas:  
cetera habent curas, utilitate carent.  
divitiis quicumque suis bene calluit uti, ille unus locuples, ille beatus erit.  
qui tamen immoritur lucro, nummosque recenset,  
tristis inexpletas dum sibi cogit opes, sicut apis, gazas rimoso certat in alveo condere; cujusvis mella ferentis erunt.

E. D. S.

SWINBURNE: *ERECHTHEUS* 1494 foll.

But not long  
had the fresh wave of windy flight begun  
heaving, and all the surge of swords to  
sway,  
when timeless night laid hold of heaven, and  
took  
with its great gorge the noon as in a gulf,  
strangled, and thicker than the shrillwinged  
shafts  
flew the fleet lightnings ever; that our host,  
smit with sick presage of some wrathful  
God  
quailed, but the foe as from one iron throat  
with one great sheer sole thousandthroated  
cry  
shook earth, heartstaggered from their shout,  
and clove  
the eyeless hollow of heaven; and breached  
therewith  
as with an onset of strengthshattering  
sound  
the rent vault of the roaring noon of night  
from her throned seat of usurpation rang  
reverberate answer; such response there  
pealed  
as tho' the tide's charge of a storming sea  
had burst the sky's wall, and made broad a  
breach  
in the girth and ambient baston flanked  
with stars  
guarding the fortress of the Gods, and all

NO. XXXIX. VOL. V.

νέα μὲν ᾧδ' ἀρθείσα κινεῖται μάχη  
δυσχείμερος κλυδωνι σὺν πολλῷ δορός·  
ὄρφη δ' ἄωρος λαμπρὸν εἶλεν οὐρανόν,  
σκήψασα δ' ἔσχευ ὥσπερ ἀγχόνῃ φάος,  
ἄπειρον ἐμβαλοῦσα δίκτυον σκότον·  
ἰὼν δὲ κρείσσον ὀξέων κατ' αἰθέρα  
στεροπαὶ διήσσαν αἰὲν ὥσθ' ἡμεῖς τινὸς  
δείσαντες ὄργισθέντος ἐκ θεοῦ κότον  
ὀκνοῦμεν· οἱ δ' ἅπαντες ὡς χαλκόστομοι  
φωνῇ βόαμα μυριοπληθὲς μιᾷ  
ιέντες ἐκσείουσι γῆν μεσόμφαλον·  
διερράγη δ' ὁ τυφλὸς οὐρανοῦ πόλος  
παιᾶνος ὥσπερ ἐμβολῇ πανωλέθρον,  
ὥσθ' ἡ βία κρατοῦσα νύξ μεσημβρινῇ  
ἀντηλάλαξ' ἄνωθεν ἀντίῳ κτύπῳ·  
τοιοῦτο δ' ἀντηδύσεν ὥσπερ εἰ σάλου  
πλημμυρὶς ἐκρήξειεν οὐρανοῦ κύκλον  
στεφανοῖ τε πυργῶν φρούριόν τ' ἐπαλξέων  
ἄστροισι ποικιλείμων ὑψίστου Διὸς

F