



THE JOURNAL
OF THE GILDED
AGE AND
PROGRESSIVE ERA

THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

Volume 16 • Number 2 • April 2017

<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537781416000657> Published online by Cambridge University Press

CONTRIBUTORS

EDITORS' NOTE

ARTICLES

Popular Magazines, New Liberal Discourse and American Democracy, 1890s–1914
Matthew Schneirov

Resistance to the Gilded Age: Robert Herrick's Radical Middle Class
Brynnar Swenson

In Search of a "A More Perfect Sympathy": Harvard's Phillips Brooks House Association
and the Challenges of Student Voluntarism
Emily Mieras

Liberal Intellectual Culture and Religious Faith: The Liberalism of the New York Liberal
Club, 1869–1877
Scott M. Shubitz

Councils, Petitions, and Delegations: Crow Creek Activism and the Progressive Era in
Central South Dakota
Robert Galler

REVIEWS

Published by the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era
www.jgape.org

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Additional sponsors: Illinois State University, the University of Illinois at Chicago,
Loyola University Chicago, and Duquesne University

Editors: Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois at Chicago;
Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago
Book Review Editor: Elaine Frantz Parsons, Duquesne University
Editorial Assistant: Timothy Herbert, University of Illinois at Chicago
Online Editor: Christopher McKnight Nichols, Oregon State University
Founding Editor, 2000–2003: Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University
Editor, 2004–2014: Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University

Editorial Board

Cara Caddoo Indiana University	LaShawn Harris Michigan State University
Christopher Cantwell University of Missouri–Kansas City	Sonia Hernandez Texas A & M University
Kornel Chang Rutgers University–Newark	Doug Kiel Northwestern University
Greg Downs University of California–Davis	Michele Mitchell New York University
Beverly Gage Yale University	Julia Ott The New School
C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa George Mason University	Laura Westhoff University of Missouri, St. Louis
Cristina Groeger Harvard University	Daniel Wortel–London New York University
Steven Hahn New York University	

Hal Moore, *ex officio*
Cambridge University Press

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *America: History and Life*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Scopus*, and in the Thompson Reuters *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, and *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, www.jstor.org, with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact alwood@ilstu.edu or go to <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 16, 2017, are \$188.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £122.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$147.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £92.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is \$50.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £31.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$42.5 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is £/\$17 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$500.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Single part: \$54.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £35.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: psc@periodicals.com

Manuscripts should be submitted electronically in MS Word or RTF format to the co-editor, Robert D. Johnston, at jgape@uic.edu. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained via email at jgape@uic.edu.

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2017. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), www.copyright.com, email: info@copyright.com.

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested. *Postmaster:* Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Dept., One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006. Send address changes elsewhere to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K.

CONTENTS

CONTRIBUTORS	v
EDITORS' NOTE	119
ARTICLES	
MATTHEW SCHNEIROV Popular Magazines, New Liberal Discourse and American Democracy, 1890s–1914	121
BRYNNAR SWENSON Resistance to the Gilded Age: Robert Herrick's Radical Middle Class	143
EMILY MIERAS In Search of a "A More Perfect Sympathy": Harvard's Phillips Brooks House Association and the Challenges of Student Voluntarism	163
SCOTT M. SHUBITZ Liberal Intellectual Culture and Religious Faith: The Liberalism of the New York Liberal Club, 1869–1877	183
ROBERT GALLER Councils, Petitions, and Delegations: Crow Creek Activism and the Progressive Era in Central South Dakota	206
REVIEWS	
DAVID GREENBERG <i>Republic of Spin: An Inside History of the American Presidency</i> (J. Michael Hogan)	228
JON GRINSPAN <i>The Virgin Vote: How Young Americans Made Democracy Social, Politics Personal, and Voting Popular in the Nineteenth Century</i> (Nicholas L. Syrett)	229
MARC-WILLIAM PALEN <i>The "Conspiracy" of Free Trade: The Anglo-American Struggle over Empire and Economic Globalisation, 1846–1896</i> (April Merleaux)	231
BRUCE E. BAKER AND BARBARA HAHN <i>The Cotton Kings: Capitalism and Corruption in Turn-of-the-Century New York and New Orleans</i> (Carin Peller-Semmens)	233
PETER KNIGHT <i>Reading the Market: Genres of Financial Capitalism in Gilded Age America</i> (Jessica Lepler)	235
JANET M. DAVIS <i>The Gospel of Kindness: Animal Welfare & the Making of Modern America</i> (Susan J. Pearson)	236
KRISTIN KOBES DU MEZ <i>A New Gospel for Women: Katharine Bushnell and the Challenge of Christian Feminism</i> (Janine Giordano Drake)	238
CHRISTOPHER D. CANTWELL, HEATH W. CARTER, AND JANINE GIORDANO DRAKE, eds. <i>The Pew and the Picket Line: Christianity and the American Working Class</i> (Matthew Bowman)	240

On the cover: Portrait of White Ghost, n.d., photo by Charles Milton Bell, INV 06647001 National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution. White Ghost, son of Bone Necklace (Yanktonai), was one of the most significant leaders at Crow Creek from the 1870s to 1905. He led delegations to Washington D.C., promoted the removal of a corrupt agent, and mobilized his community to push for enhanced economic opportunities. As Robert Galler argues in his article in this issue, such figures suggest that we see this period in Native history as a story of progressive activism and political adaptations in response to oppressive economic and political forces.