



is a misleading oversimplification; Handel also employed many continental singers for his oratorios – Giulia Frasi, Elisabeth Duparc, Caterina Galli, Thomas Reinhold, Gaetano Guadagni, Elisabetta Gambarini (to name but a few) – and in some instances created roles specially for them.

As a work of scholarship, this book will be most valuable for readers who are already familiar with Handel biography and know that the arguments rehearsed therein represent the sometimes contentious views of its author. Since there is little by way of musical analysis, the text may be useful to a wider readership as a reference book, particularly for discussions of the social-historical environment in which Handel lived and worked. It represents good value at £30 for a hardback edition, though the quality of some of its illustrations (all of which are in black and white) could be improved. In writing this book the author has set himself a laudable but difficult task: 'to distinguish fact from fiction' (1) and expose the myths surrounding Handel's life for what they are. Unfortunately, so much speculation and suspect reasoning is applied in the process that he is in danger of replacing the old myths with new ones of his own.

CHERYLL DUNCAN

<cheryll.duncan@rncm.ac.uk>



Eighteenth-Century Music © Cambridge University Press, 2017
doi:[10.1017/S1478570616000361](https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570616000361)

ELISABETH LE GUIN

THE TONADILLA IN PERFORMANCE: LYRIC COMEDY IN ENLIGHTENMENT SPAIN

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014

pp. xxi + 383, ISBN 978 0 520 27630 7

Musicologists, particularly scholars of Iberian music, will already be familiar with Elisabeth Le Guin and her work on late eighteenth-century music through her previous book *Boccherini's Body: An Essay in Carnal Musicology* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006). Her most recent work, *The Tonadilla in Performance: Lyric Comedy in Enlightenment Spain*, continues within this period but shifts focus to dramatic music. Her book is valuable not only for its relatively unfamiliar content, which makes it an indispensable volume for scholars of both Spanish music and drama in general, but also for Le Guin's approach to her subject, examining and drawing conclusions from correspondence, censor reviews, contemporaneous newspaper articles, various types of libretto and the extant music.

The book is divided into an introduction and seven sections (five chapters and two shorter sections), followed by 133 pages of examples, endnotes, bibliography and index. The inclusion of both examples within the main text and longer scores in the Appendix is a significant benefit. These samples both help to prove her important points and give a taste of the richness and variety of the *tonadilla* genre. In a book about a better-known genre, such extensive examples might be considered excessive; however, this genre is so poorly known to today's audiences that the inclusion of numerous and lengthy examples can be justified.

Le Guin begins the book by introducing the *tonadilla*, a short, comic dramatic piece meant to be inserted into longer works and serving a similar purpose as the Italian intermezzo. The *tonadilla* was well known to audiences in the second half of the eighteenth century, but owing to a variety of circumstances discussed by Le Guin, the genre fell out of favour, and it is almost unknown today. Le Guin notes that many writers of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries found the *tonadilla* to be too influenced by Italianate styles to be part of the nationalist musical identity they were constructing. Other writers, conversely, thought the *tonadilla* embodied the unique folk flavour of Spanish comedy, but dismissed the genre because it was not weighty enough to be taken seriously. In both cases, the *tonadilla* was excluded from monographs and other studies on Spain's musical heritage.



Chapter 1 seeks to give the reader a sense of the time and place in which *tonadillas* were heard. In a literary flight of fancy, Le Guin creates a work of historical fiction based on an actual *tonadilla* performance. It is presented in the form of a letter addressed to an audience member's sibling, and describes various historical and invented audience members' reactions to the performance. The fact that this is a fictionalized narrative of her own creation and not a quotation from an archival source is only briefly mentioned at the end of the introduction. Readers who value this kind of historical re-creation are likely to find it informative and valuable in 'setting the scene' for the rest of the book. Those like me who find the invention of dialogue for historical characters within the confines of an academic monograph dubious at best may find chapter 1 tiresome and perhaps best skipped entirely. There is little factual information in the chapter that is not found elsewhere in the work.

In chapter 2 ('Players') Le Guin introduces the reader to the different kinds of theatre organizations involved in the performance of *tonadillas* and explains how each worked. This chapter, as well as the book as a whole, focuses more on the *tonadilla* performers than on the audiences. She briefly describes the duties of each member of a company and highlights some of the most important composers, actors and actresses working in eighteenth-century Madrid. Chapter 3 ('Rhythms') discusses many technical aspects of the *tonadilla*, including descriptions of *coplas*, *seguidillas* and *boleros*, three prevalent poetic forms used throughout the genre, and the galant musical style in which most eighteenth-century *tonadillas* were composed.

The following section, 'Intermedio', is not labelled as a separate chapter. Changing focus, it takes a different topic as its theme (not unlike a *tonadilla*): how the performers and Madrid audiences would have understood the colonialist references found in some *tonadillas*. Le Guin is careful to delineate the limits of her study, and thus the chapter treats the appearance of these themes within the confines of Madrid and does not attempt to draw conclusions about *tonadilla* performances in other centres of colonial Spain, for example Mexico City and Manila.

Chapter 4 ('Bandits') returns to the interior world of the *tonadilla* and one of its most important character types, the bandit. Le Guin traces the etymology of the word *bandido* and the development of the bandit character through early dramatic works by Lope de Vega, providing a fascinating history of the type and how it was portrayed in various musical styles. Chapter 5 ('Late *Tonadillas*') follows the genre through to the early nineteenth century. It was a difficult time for Madrid for a number of reasons, including, most obviously, the Napoleonic wars; Le Guin argues that the *tonadilla* reflected these difficulties in various ways, for example in subtly subversive texts and in pieces that were generally longer and closer to *zarzuelas* or operas.

In the concluding section, 'Fin de Fiesta' (The End of the Celebration), Le Guin discusses her two attempts at putting on performances of a particular *tonadilla* and the pros and cons of staging the works for a twenty-first-century audience. She believes it is nearly impossible to perform these works for today's public, citing a lack of understanding of eighteenth-century events and opinions crucial to the subtle jokes that fill the *tonadillas*. With these points of view unshared, perhaps impossible to share, the jokes fall flat or take on a kind of foreignness that she convincingly argues was anathema to the purpose of the genre. However, at the end of the section, she concedes that it might be possible for a knowledgeable audience to appreciate the piece if performed by a skilled group of highly trained professionals who have carefully rehearsed each point of humour. This is perhaps the point on which Le Guin and I disagree most. I believe it is possible for modern audiences to enjoy the types of *tonadillas* that Le Guin believes to be inaccessible without hours of rehearsing the jokes beforehand; however, I also think in order for this to work the piece must be 're-created' to appeal to moderns, as well as tailored to the particular public viewing the piece.

A recent personal experience can serve as an example. In July I attended the North American premiere of Florian Gassmann's *L'opera seria*, a comic opera which, like many *tonadillas*, was based on the trials and tribulations of putting on an opera. The production, mounted by Wolf Trap Opera in Vienna, Virginia, was a smashing success even with an audience unlikely to have been experts in the finer points of galant style or eighteenth-century culture. What they did understand, though, is diva culture and stage mothers, both



of which the director Matthew Ozawa put to excellent use. The first and second acts were set in modern times with cell phone gags and mics that malfunctioned. The 'opera' that takes place during the third act was in eighteenth-century dress. Works such as this, as well as the *tonadillas* featured in Le Guin's book, can still be performed if the piece is reconfigured to appeal to the attending public. What Le Guin hints at is the reason *tonadillas* are unlikely to make a comeback any time soon. The required revamping of a piece is very difficult and time-consuming, especially when one must start by making a modern performing edition.

Le Guin's *The Tonadilla in Performance* is an important book for many reasons. Perhaps most important, however, is that yet another reputable scholar has taken note of the huge influence of Italian styles, especially the galant, on eighteenth-century Spanish music without negative connotations or condescension. I hope other scholars adopt her approachably readable-yet-well-documented style as well as her desire to take on the less studied genres and shine light onto once controversial issues now ready to be revealed.

DIANNE L. GOLDMAN

<diannegoldman@gmail.com>



Eighteenth-Century Music © Cambridge University Press, 2017
doi:10.1017/S1478570616000373

DAVID SCHULENBERG

THE MUSIC OF CARL PHILIPP EMANUEL BACH

Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2014

pp. xv + 416, ISBN 978 1 58046 481 9

Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714–1788) was far more famous than his father, Johann Sebastian Bach, during the eighteenth century. During the nineteenth century, the two reputations were reversed: Sebastian attained a lofty and permanent place in the canon; Emanuel was forgotten except for a few compositions. The early twentieth century saw a gradual return of interest in Emanuel Bach's music, and since the middle of the century there has been a rapid increase of attention to his works. To coincide with the three hundredth anniversary of Bach's birth David Schulenberg has published *The Music of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach*, as part of the series Eastman Studies in Music, supplemented online by information about Bach's life and music and by musical examples. Schulenberg acknowledges in his Preface that he has had an advantage that two previous substantial accounts of Bach's works lacked (Carl Heinrich Bitter, *Wilhelm Friedemann und Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach und deren Brüder* (Berlin: Wilhelm Müller, 1868) and Hans-Günter Ottenberg, *Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach* (Leipzig: Reclam, 1982)). That advantage is access to much information about Bach's compositions and their origin from the *Gesamtausgabe* currently in progress: *Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach: The Complete Works*, a series with more than sixty-five volumes published by the Packard Humanities Institute since 2005. Schulenberg writes that he has attempted 'to say something useful about every major composition and all those that are frequently performed, as well as minor works that must be examined if we are to understand Bach's compositional choices' (x). Although he does not call his book a life-and-works, Schulenberg describes the circumstances that motivated the composition of much of Bach's oeuvre. And since most of these circumstances include biographical information, this book contains frequent and helpful elements of a life-and-works study. Thus, within its two covers and with its additional online material, Schulenberg's book contains more information about Emanuel Bach's music than does any other single published volume to date. It might be regarded as a summation of all that has been written about the composer's works in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, augmented by Schulenberg's own contributions.

The amount of information constitutes a problem as well as a strength. Bach's career as a composer did not proceed in a tidy manner: he experimented erratically, producing curious mixtures of genres, and he revised