# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

### VOLUME 4 NUMBER 3 FALL 1978

The Saikewicz Decision: A Medical Viewpoint

More on Regulation: A Reply to Stephen Weiner

Pain and Profit: The Politics of Malpractice, by Sylvia Law and Steven Polan

Report on the American Society of Hospital Attorneys of the American Hospital Association

Selected Recent Court Decisions

Highlights of Federal Legislative and Executive Action

Selected Book Releases, Annotated

Selected Articles from Various Journals

The "Brave New Baby" and the Law: Fashioning Remedies for the Victims of *In Vitro*Fertilization

Arnold S. Relman, M.D.

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

W. Thomas Berriman, LL.B.

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A. Pamela J. Anderson, J.D. Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.

Jim McMahon, J.D.

Mark E. Cohen, J.D. Candidate

Published by the MIT Press for the American Society of Law & Medicine

Editorial support provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE was founded in response to the need for a scholarly yet pragmatic publication encompassing all aspects of medicolegal relations. The JOURNAL seeks to provide a broad perspective on our complex health care system, to encourage interdisciplinary communication, and to stimulate creative solutions to the pressing medicolegal problems of our time.

In addition to serving as a forum for analyses and proposals in such areas as health law and policy, legal and insurance medicine, and bioethics, the JOURNAL offers a wide variety of pertinent reference materials in these and related areas.

The JOURNAL serves persons from a variety of fields who seek to understand and influence medicolegal developments: physicians, other health care providers, and health administrators; lawyers; health analysts and planners; researchers and educators in health specialties; judges, legislators, and government administrators; insurance officials; consumer advocates; and concerned members of the general public.

The JOURNAL is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter for the American Society of Law & Medicine by the MIT Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, and London, England. Editorial support is provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the Editor-in-Chief on behalf of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the Editors, the publishers, or the Society.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine, 454 Brookline Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 969-0100, ext. 4394.

Business correspondence, including subscription matters, should be addressed to American Journal of Law & Medicine, MIT Press, 28 Carleton Street, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02142. Claims for missing copies must be made immediately upon receipt of the next published issue.

Subscriptions: \$25.00 for individuals and \$35.00 for institutions (foreign subscribers add \$3.00 for postage). Back copies: \$9.00 apiece. For back issues from Volumes 1 and 2, write to 454 Brookline Avenue; for later issues, write to 28 Carleton Street.

Advertising: Price list available from Journals Department, MIT Press, 28 Carleton Street, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02142.

Copyright © 1978 by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. All or any part of materials appearing in the JOURNAL may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editorin-Chief.

Articles indexed and abstracted in *Index to Legal Periodicals, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences,* and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.* Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf Number K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts in accordance with Permit No. 54518 (Nonprofit Org.).

## AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

### BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.
Boston College Law School

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Harvard Medical School
Boston College Law School

MANAGING EDITOR Jim McMahon, J.D.

ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR Judy Lesser, J.D.

Mark D. Altschule, M.D. Harvard University

**Donald B. Barkan, M.D., F.A.C.P.** Health Director, Lynn Hospital School of Nursing

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D. Boston College Law School

Patrick Carroll, J.D.

Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel, Massachusetts Hospital Ass'n

Roger C. Cramton, J.D. Dean, Cornell Law School

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg. Harvard University

Douglas Danner, J.D. Trial Attorney

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M. General Counsel, Northwestern Memorial Hospital

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D. Attorney & Consultant in Health Law Harvard Medical School

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D. Duke University School of Law

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D. General Counsel, Am. Med. Ass'n Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Dean, Boston College Law School
Alan K. Kaplan, LL.B., M. Sci.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Georgetown Univ. Medical School

Jay Katz, M.D. Yale University

Sylvia A. Law, J.D. New York University School of Law

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch., M.R.C.P., D.C.H.

Harvard Medical School; Director, Genetics Division, Shriver Center

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D. Rutgers Medical School, College of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H. Attorney & Consultant in Health Law

Honorable Max Rosenn United States Court of Appeals E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D. Dean, New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D. Director, Medical Genetics Center University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S. Dean, Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.; Past Pres., ADA

Richard E. Speidel, J.D., LL.M. Dean, Boston University School of Law

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D. Director, Pittsburgh Inst. of Legal Med.; Coroner, Allegheny County

RESEARCH ASSOCIATES
Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT Cecily Anne Wells

### OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

### **PRESIDENT**

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. Boston College Law School Harvard Medical School

### FIRST VICE-PRESIDENT

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A. Attorney and Consultant in Health Law, Boston, Massachusetts Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine

### VICE-PRESIDENT

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D. Harvard Medical School President, American College of Legal Medicine

### SECRETARY

Michael D. Jusell Senior Claims Supervisor Employers Insurance of Wausau

### **TREASURER**

Barry C. Reed, LL.B. Trial Attorney

### EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D. Managing Editor, Medicolegal News

### HONORARY SECRETARY-TREASURER

J. Robertson Knowles, M.D. Former Secretary-Treasurer, Massachusetts Society of Examining Physicians

### **GENERAL COUNSEL**

Douglas Danner, J.D. Trial Attorney

### **AMERICAN JOURNAL**

VOLUME 4 NUMBER 3 FALL 1978

### **ARTICLE**

The Saikewicz Decision: A

Arnold S. Relman, M.D. 233

Medical Viewpoint

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

COMMENT

More on Regulation: A Reply to Stephen Weiner

243

**BOOK REVIEW** 

Pain and Profit: The Politics of Malpractice, by Sylvia Law

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

and Steven Polan 255

GUEST ORGANIZATION

Report on the American Society of Hospital Attorneys

of the American Hospital Association

W. Thomas Berriman, LL.B.

269

### MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

Selected Recent Court John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

Decisions Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Highlights of Federal Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

291

Legislative and Executive Action

Selected Book Releases.

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. Annotated 295

Selected Articles from Jim McMahon, J.D.

Various Journals 311

### **NOTES**

The "Brave New Baby" and the Law: Fashioning Remedies for the Victims of In Vitro **Fertilization** 319 Mark E. Cohen, J.D. Candidate