

American Journal of International Law

INSIDE THIS ISSUE

- The Outer Limits of the Continental Shelf Under Customary International Law Kevin A. Baumert
- The New Debate on the Interpretation of MFN Clauses in Investment Treaties: Putting the Brakes on Multilateralization Simon Batifort and J. Benton Heath
- Notes and Comments by:

 Stephan W. Schill

 Theodor Meron

 John K. Veroneau and Catherine H. Gibson



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

Vol. 111	October 2017		No. 4
	CONTENTS		PAGE
The Outer Limits of the Cor			
Customary International Lav	V	Kevin A. Baumert	827
plished by peaceful means cence and approval," La nearly seventy years ago. V caveat, as the question of h not yet fully settled. This applicable for determinin	major change in international less more rapidly and amidst more uterpacht observed of continer. When considered today, this observed far the continental shelf externaticle explores the customary is gontinental shelf limits and a states to gain international according.	general acquies- ntal shelf claims ervation merits a nds into the sea is nternational law Iso examines the	
The New Debate on the Inte	rpretation of MFN Clauses	in	
Investment Treaties: Putting	the Brakes		
on Multilateralization	Simon Bati	fort and J. Benton Heath	873
This article challenges the conventional wisdom that MFN clauses in investment treaties can always be used to "import" substantive standards of treatment (e.g. FET). It argues that most tribunals permitting this use of MFN clauses have relied on presumptions and have ignored meaningful variations among clauses. It also points out that states are increasingly questioning the conventional view, and that a recent arbitral award has firmly rejected an attempt to use an MFN clause to import substantive standards. It concludes by sketching the terms of the new MFN debate.			
Notes and Comments			
	ommitments to Multilateralis	m:	
A Reply to Simon Batifor	t and J. Benton Heath	Stephan W. Schill	914
Shakespeare: A Dove, a Hav		Theodor Meron	936
Presidential Tariff Authority	•	John K. Veroneau and	
		Catherine H. Gibson	957
Current Developments			
·	nd Other Topics: The Sixty-		
Session of the Internation	nal Law Commission	Sean D. Murphy	970

International Decisions Edited by Ingrid Justice K.S. Puttaswamy (Ret'd) and Anr v. Union of India and Ors (Menaka Guruswamy)	l Wuerth 994
Supreme Court of India decision holding that the right to privacy is protected by the Constitution of India	
Inter-American Court of Human Rights Advisory Opinion OC-22/16 of Febr 2016 (Diego Mejía-Lemos)	ruary 26, 1000
Advisory Opinion of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights concerning the rights of legal persons, indigenous communities, and labor unions	
Prosecutor v. Al-Bashir (Manuel J. Ventura)	1007
International Criminal Court decision on the non-compliance by South Africa with the request by the Court for the arrest and surrender of Omar Al-Bashir	
Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International L Edited by Kristina Daugirdas and Julian Davis M	
Congress Enacts Sanctions Legislation Targeting Russia United States and Qatar Sign Memorandum of Understanding Regarding	1015
Terrorism Financing	1023
Trump Reverses Certain Steps Toward Normalizing Relations with Cuba United States Announces Plans to Withdraw from Paris Agreement on C Change	
President Trump Issues Trade-Related Executive Orders and Memoranda	
United States, Russia, and Jordan Sign Limited Ceasefire for Syria	1053
Trump Administration Recertifies Iranian Compliance with JCPOA	
Notwithstanding Increasing Concern with Iranian Behavior	1056
Recent Books on International Law	
Review Essay	
The Theory and Practice at the Intersection Between Human Rights and Humanitarian Law (Monica Hakimi)	
Jaffer, Jameel (ed.). <i>The Drone Memos: Targeted Killing, Secrecy and to</i> Ohlin, Jens David (ed.). <i>Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Rights</i> ;	
U.S. White House. Report on the Legal and Policy Frameworks Guidi United States' Use of Military Force and Related National Security Ope	_
Book Reviews	
Bodansky, Daniel, Jutta Brunnée and Lavanya Rajamani. <i>International Cleange Law</i> (Peter H. Sand)	1074
Shany, Yuval. Questions of Jurisdiction and Admissibility Before International	
(Lucy Reed) Kinneer Meg Caraldina P. Fischer Jara Minguez Almeida Luisa Formand	1079
Kinnear, Meg, Geraldine R. Fischer, Jara Mínguez Almeida, Luisa Fernand and Mairée Uran Bidegain (eds.). <i>Building International Investment Law First 50 Years of ICSID</i> (Stephen M. Schwebel)	
rum ou tears of (CSID CSIEDHEN IVI. Schwedel)	1087

Stark, Barbara (ed.). International Law and Its Discontents: Confronting Crises	
(Antony Anghie)	1087
Books Received	1090
International Legal Materials, Contents, Vol. 56, No. 4, No. 5	1093

BOARD OF EDITORS

Editors in Chief

JOSÉ ENRIQUE ALVAREZ New York University School of Law

Dapo Akande Oxford University Karen J. Alter

Northwestern University

Antony Anghie

National University of Singapore

Eyal Benvenisti

Cambridge University

Laurence Boisson de Chazournes University of Geneva School of Law

CURTIS A. BRADLEY

Duke University School of Law

CHRISTOPHER BRUMMER

Georgetown University Law Center

BHUPINDER SINGH CHIMNI

Jawaharlal Nehru University

HARLAN COHEN

University of Georgia School of Law

Gráinne de Búrca

New York University School of Law

James Thuo Gathii

Loyola University Chicago School of Law

Tom Ginsburg

University of Chicago Law School

Jack Goldsmith

Harvard Law School

Monica Hakimi

University of Michigan Law School

Benedict Kingsbury New York University School of Law

Laurence R. Helfer

Duke University Faculty of Law

Alexandra Huneeus

University of Wisconsin Law School

Karen Knop

University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Katerina Linos

Univ. of California, Berkeley School of Law

DONALD M. MCRAE

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

CATHERINE POWELL

Fordham Law School

KAL RAUSTIALA

Univ. of California (UCLA) School of Law

Natalie Reid

Debevoise & Plimpton

HENRY J. RICHARDSON III

Temple University Beasley School of Law

Annelise Riles

Cornell Law School

Anthea Roberts

Australian National University

Gregory Shaffer

Univ. of California, Irvine School of Law

Alan O. Sykes

Stanford Law School

Ingrid Wuerth

Vanderbilt Law School

ex officio Lucinda Low Mark David Agrast Honorary Editors

George H. Aldrich

St. Michaels, Maryland

Mahnoush Arsanjani

New Haven, Connecticut

RICHARD B. BILDER University of Wisconsin Law School

Charles N. Brower

The Hague, the Netherlands

EDITH BROWN WEISS

Georgetown University Law Center

Thomas Buergenthal

George Washington Univ. Law School

David D. Caron

The Hague, the Netherlands

CHRISTINE M. CHINKIN

London School of Economics

JAMES R. CRAWFORD

The Hague, the Netherlands

JOHN R. CROOK

Potomac, Maryland

ANTHONY D'AMATO

Northwestern University School of Law

RICHARD FALK

University of California, Santa Barbara

TOM J. FARER

University of Denver

MICHAEL J. GLENNON

Fletcher School, Tufts University

Senior Copyeditor Erin Lovall

Cite-checker
Catherina Valenzuela

Rosalyn Higgins

The Hague, the Netherlands

Frederic L. Kirgis

Washington and Lee Univ. School of Law

Cynthia Črawford Lichtenstein

Boston College Law School

DAVID A. MARTIN

University of Virginia School of Law

MICHAEL J. MATHESON

George Washington Univ. Law School

THEODOR MERON

The Hague, the Netherlands

John Norton Moore

University of Virginia School of Law

BERNARD H. OXMAN

University of Miami School of Law

W. MICHAEL REISMAN

Yale Law School

STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL

South Woodstock, Vermont

DINAH SHELTON

George Washington Univ. Law School

DAVID P. STEWART

Georgetown University Law Center

Peter D. Trooboff

Covington & Burling LLP RUTH WEDGWOOD

Johns Hopkins University

Assistant to the Editors in Chief
RACHEL JONES

Submissions Editor 2017–18 Sebastian Dutz

Associate Submissions Editors 2017–18
Sarah Coco
Nahuel Maisley
Claire Schupmann

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Journal of International Law (AJIL) has been published quarterly since 1907. It features articles, editorials, notes, and comments by pre-eminent scholars on developments in international law and international relations. AJIL contains summaries and analyses of decisions by national and international courts and arbitral or other tribunals, and of contemporary U. S. practice in international law. Each issue lists recent publications in English and other languages, many of which are reviewed in depth. The AJIL is indispensable for all professionals working in international law, economics, trade, and foreign affairs.

It is the policy of the American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the Society.

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law (ASIL) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan, educational membership organization founded in 1906 by U.S. Secretary of State Elihu Root and chartered by Congress in 1950. Headquartered in Washington, D.C., its mission is "to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice." ASIL holds Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations and is a constituent society of the American Council of Learned Societies.

ASIL's nearly four thousand members hail from more than one hundred nations with nearly 40 percent residing outside the United States. Its members include scholars, jurists, practitioners, government officials, leaders in international and nongovernmental organizations, students, and others interested in international law. Through its many publications, conferences, briefings, and educational events, ASIL seeks to serve the needs of its diverse membership and to advance understanding of international law among policymakers and the public.

ASIL is a volunteer-led organization governed by a sixty-member Executive Council elected by its membership. In partnership with the elected leadership, ASIL is led by an executive director and supported by a professional staff.

Become a member asil.org/membership

Join one of the Society's Partner Programs and receive complimentary ad space in AJIL asil.org/financial-support/sponsors-and-institutional-supporters

Follow the Society on Twitter twitter.com/asilorg

Like us on Facebook

facebook.com/AmericanSocietyofInternationalLaw

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2016–2017

President	Lucinda A. Low
President-Elect	Sean D. Murphy
Honorary President	Rosemary Barkett
Vice Presidents	. Catherine M. Amirfar, Edward Kwakwa, Sean D. Murphy,
	Kal Raustiala
	Mark David Agrast
Secretary	James A. R. Nafziger
Treasurer	
Assistant Treasurer	Ronald J. Bettauer

Past Presidents: José E. Alvarez, Charles N. Brower, Edith Brown Weiss, David D. Caron, James H. Carter, Lori Fisler Damrosch, Donald Francis Donovan, Lucy Reed, Arthur W. Rovine, Anne-Marie Slaughter, Peter D. Trooboff

Honorary Vice Presidents: Lori Fisler Damrosch, Donald Francis Donovan, David D. Caron

Council Members: Stanimir A. Alexandrov, Karen J. Alter, Angela M. Banks, R. Doak Bishop, Anna Spain Bradley, Todd F. Buchwald, Donald Earl Childress III, Sarah H. Cleveland, Olufemi Elias, Susan D. Franck, Chiara Georgetti, Dawn Yamane Hewett, Sandra L. Hodgkinson, Duncan B. Hollis, Meg Kinnear, Saira Mohamed, Blanca Montejo, Vincent O. Nmehielle, Jide Nzelibe, Jaya Ramji-Nogales, David L. Sloss, Beth Van Schaack, Carlos M. Vázquez, Samuel M. Witten

Counsellors: Daniel Bethlehem, Jeffrey L. Bleich, Hannah L. Buxbaum, Tai-Heng Cheng, Marcella David, Joan E. Donoghue, James T. Gathii, Harold Hongju Koh, Peter Mason, Elisa Massimino, M. Margaret McKeown, Mary McLeod, Joseph E. Neuhaus, Daniel M. Price, Hélène Ruiz-Fabri, Leila Nadya Sadat, Steven M. Schneebaum, Richard H. Steinberg, Jane E. Stromseth, Peter Tomka, Joel P. Trachtman, Paul R. Williams, Adrien K. Wing, Nassib G. Ziadé

PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The ASIL accomplishes much of its work through charitable support. The Society is grateful to its many members who contribute to the annual fund and the endowment, the foundations whose grants fund special programs, and the law firms, publishers, universities, and others that sponsor ASIL activity. The Society is particularly honored to receive contributions through the 21st century campaign and Patrons program and to be included in our members' estate plans through the ASIL Heritage Circle. We recognize these contributors below.

21ST CENTURY CAMPAIGN

Leadership (\$1,000,000) HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN

Leadership (\$250,000) CHARLES N. BROWER

Elihu Root Patron (\$50,000)

Anonymous DONALD K. ANTON Mahnoush H. Arsanjani and W. Michael REISMAN

GARY B. BORN

DAVID D. CARON AND SUSAN SPENCER LORI FISLER DAMROSCH Donald Francis Donovan and

IENNIFER LAKE

Lucinda A. Low and DANIEL B. MAGRAW

LUCY F. REED ARTHUR W. ROVINE

Cordell Hull Patron (\$25,000)

R. Doak Bishop JAMES H. CARTER TAI-HENG CHENG ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II JAMES LEITNER AND TRACY HIGGINS ABBY COHEN SMUTNY

James Brown Scott Patron (\$15,000)

MARK DAVID AGRAST AND DAVID M. HOLLIS JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ AND SUSAN DAMPLO CHARLES H. CAMP DAVID COLSON

O. THOMAS JOHNSON JUDD KESSLER BENEDICT KINGSBURY CHARLOTTE KU EDWARD KWAKWA GABRIELLE KIRK McDonald SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL Daniel M. Price Andrés Rigo Sureda JUDGE BRUNO SIMMA DON WALLACE JR.

LUCY F. REED

GLENN P. HENDRIX

PATRONS

Patrons of the Society have contributed \$10,000 or more to the Society. Patrons may also be recognized posthumously upon such a donation being made in their name.**

Domingo E. Acevedo GERALD AKSEN ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT George H. Aldrich Teymour A. Alireza José E. Alvarez and Susan Damplo Diane Marie Amann CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR JAMES G. APPLE Mahnoush H. Arsanjani Frank A. Bauman* Mrs. Richard Baxter* David J. Bederman* and LORRE B. CUZZE Daniel L. Bethlehem RICHARD B. BILDER R. Doak Bishop Andrea K. Bjorklund JOHN A. BOYD IOHN BRISCOE CHARLES N. BROWER IAN BROWNLIE* EDITH BROWN WEISS LEE C. BUCHHEIT THOMAS BUERGENTHAL William J. Butler Susana and Hugo Caminos CHARLES H. CAMP DAVID D. CARON AND Susan L. Spencer JAMES H. CARTER . David **A.** Colson JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD JOHN R. CROOK

LORI FISLER DAMROSCH AND JEAN BAUER FISLER ARTHUR H. DEAN* ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD* TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON Donald Francis Donovan and Jennifer Lake THOMAS A. DUBBS EDWARD DUMBAULD* RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR. Alona E. Evans* Benjamin B. Ferencz Donald Ferencz THOMAS M. FRANCK* ALWYN V. FREEMAN* JOHN KING GAMBLE Ronald E. M. Goodman CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD IOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE Victoria M. Hariri* Oona A. Hathaway RITA E. HAUSER JOHN N. HAZARD* Alice and Louis* Henkin ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN ROSALYN HIGGINS **К**ЕІТН **Н**ІБНЕТ* HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN* CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT JOHN H. JACKSON* Andrew J. Jacovides MARK R. JOELSON RICHARD A. JOHNSON KENNETH I. JUSTER

ANTHONY D'AMATO

Edward G. Kehoe FREDERIC L. KIRGIS CHARLOTTE KU IEFFREY LANG ELIHU LAUTERPACHT ROY S. LEE JEREMY I. AND CANDACE C. LEVITT Cynthia Crawford Lichtenstein Mrs. Richard Lillich LUCINDA A. LOW AND DANIEL B. MAGRAW A. Vaughan Lowe Andreas F. Lowenfeld* HOUSTON PUTNAM LOWRY Brunson MacChesney* ROBERT MACCRATE RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD* D. STEPHEN MATHIAS STEPHEN C. McCaffrey EDWARD WATSON McWHINNEY* ROBERT F. MEAGHER* THEODOR MERON HUSAM MESHAI W. Robert Morgan* SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER Ved P. Nanda Andre Newburg MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL Shigeru Oda BERNARD H. OXMAN Jan Paulsson

W. MICHAEL REISMAN SANG-MYON RHEE Andrés Rigo Sureda DAVIS R. ROBINSON WILLIAM D. ROGERS* ARTHUR W. ROVINE SEYMOUR J. RUBIN* PHILIPPE J. SANDS OSCAR SCHACHTER* STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL MORTIMER N.S. SELLERS ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER ABBY COHEN SMUTNY EARL A. SNYDER* BARBARA STARK ERIC STEIN* CHARLES W. T. STEPHENSON IOHN R. STEVENSON* DAVID P. STEWART LAURENCE STORCH Enrique P. Syquia GENEVIEVE E. TILLAR* Peter D. Trooboff BETH VAN SCHAACK DETLEV F. VAGTS* CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR. JILL McClanahan Watson RUTH WEDGWOOD BURNS H. WESTON* EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON BASIL S. YANAKAKIS ADRIEN K. WING Bruce Zagaris Nassib G. Ziadé

THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

Members who include the ASIL in their estate plans and so notify the Society may join the ASIL Heritage Circle.

Anonymous (2) FLIZABETH ANDERSEN JAMES G. APPLE FRANK A. BAUMAN* CHARLES N. BROWER JAMES H. CARTER

SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD* MICHAEL AND MARY ANN FARLEY THOMAS M. FRANCK* CHRISTIAN A. HERTER, JR.* CHARLOTTE KU

CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN

H. C. L. MERILLAT* SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL

Nancy I. Perkins

HERMAN PHLEGER*

Daniel M. Price

B. Donovan Picard

OSCAR SCHACHTER* STEPHEN SCHER FRIC STEIN* JOHN R. STEVENSON* GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR* RICHARD YOUNG*

* granted posthumously

IN MEMORIAM

CHERIF BASSIOUNI HENRY C. MORRIS JAMES BROWN SCOTT ARTHUR K. KUHN STANLEY P. SMITH

> More information about these and other ASIL philanthropic activities can be found at www.asil.org/financialsupport.cfm.

Susan L. Karamanian ** Since January 2012, Patron designation requires a contribution of \$15,000 or more.

JOURNAL INFORMATION

AJIL is published in print and digitally by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of International Law. The journal publishes quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and to reduce time between acceptance and publication, contributions may appear online as FirstView publications in advance of their scheduled publication in an issue. Discover the entire AJIL back archive at cambridge.org/ajil/issues.

Subscriptions

The electronic version of AJIL is available to all members of the American Society of International Law by login to the ASIL website www.asil.org. Print copies are also supplied to all members.

To subscribe as a non-member or recommend a subscription to your librarian go to cambridge.org/ajil.

Submission of Manuscripts

AJIL invites submission of manuscripts on international law subjects. AJIL's coverage extends beyond public international law to closely related issues of global governance, transnational law, and national or sub-state law. It generally does not publish manuscripts focused on purely private or commercial law or on comparative or foreign law, including the internal law of the European Union. AJIL will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this journal.

AJIL welcomes submissions for Lead Articles, and shorter Current Developments and Notes & Comments pieces via AJIL's electronic submission website mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ajil.

Editorial Comments are written by members of the Board of Editors. Content for the Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law section of AJIL is generated by the editors of that section and outside submissions are not accepted. The Recent Books on International Law section contains book reviews that are solicited by invitation of the editor, Richard Bilder. AJIL strongly encourages authors and publishers to submit books for review in hard copy to: AJIL Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, USA.

The **International Decisions** section, edited by Ingrid Wuerth, focuses on particularly significant decisions concerning important issues of (or developments in) international law. It consists of contributions that are mostly proposed to the editor by readers of the *AJIL*. Proposals for International Decisions should be sent to ingrid. wuerth@law.vanderbilt.edu.

AJIL Unbound, an online initiative to supplement *AJIL* by publishing short, original essays, periodically issues open calls for short contributions on specified topics.

AJIL is committed to publishing a diversity of authors, whether based in the United States or abroad, and to covering a wide range of subjects and approaches. Suggestions for topics for AJIL symposia or Agora should be sent to law.ajil.admin@nyu.edu.

All submissions must follow the AJIL Style Guide. Full instructions on how to prepare and submit your paper may be found here:

cambridge.org/ajil/ifc

Claims and Address Updates

subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada and Mexico) journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere)

Copyright and Permissions

cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

To Advertise in the Journal

ad_sales@cambridge.org

Abstracting and Indexing Services

cambridge.org/ajil/abstracting

For other ASIL Publications

www.asil.org

Proper Citation

AJIL shall be cited according to the following example: 111 AJIL 219 (2017)

ISSN: 0002-9300 E-ISSN: 2161-7953

© American Society of International Law