

WHITE AGAINST RED: THE LIFE OF GENERAL ANTON DENIKIN.
By *Dimitry V. Lehovich*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1974. 556 pp. \$12.50.

Mr. Lehovich fought in the anti-Bolshevik army of A. I. Denikin when he was seventeen years old. Many years later in America he got to know the old general well, and now he has produced a biography that is obviously an act of devotion.

His evident goal is to make a case for Denikin. He takes his ex-commander's side in the numerous disagreements which Denikin had within the White movement, and he describes events from his hero's point of view. It is rather strange to read Denikinist history published in America in 1974. After all, even in his own period Denikin was hardly a perceptive thinker, and he never fully understood the momentous events in which he participated. The political philosophy which was narrow in its own time is truly anachronistic when advanced fifty years later. Lehovich's failure is not in his research. Not only has he interviewed survivors, among them the general's widow, and acquainted himself with all of Denikin's voluminous writings, but he has also read widely the works of Western, émigré, and even Soviet historians. The product of his labor is a detailed book that is factually reliable yet unsatisfactory.

One can understand why Lehovich admires Denikin so much. Denikin was indeed an attractive person. He was loyal to his friends; his integrity was beyond doubt at a time when he was surrounded by corruption; he was modest, decent, and had a passion for honesty. His enormously detailed memoirs, which are also a study of the Civil War, provide a remarkable contrast to the reminiscences of other retired soldiers. Denikin told the truth even when the information he provided showed him in a bad light. Lehovich describes many small details which reveal what a fine human being Denikin was. To me the most poignant story comes from the period of emigration. During the Second World War the general lived with his wife in a small French town under German occupation. He refused all advances from the Germans. When the Free French Radio from England called on Frenchmen to show their opposition to occupation by marching in holiday attire in the streets on July 14, in this little town only the two Russian émigrés heeded the call.

But attractive personal qualities should not blind us to Denikin's failings as a leader. Denikin was not and never wanted to be a politician, and Lehovich sympathizes with his position. But this admission means that Denikin did not realize that his role was above all a political one, and therefore he was the wrong man for the job. He had no ability to make a realistic evaluation of the relation of forces; he could not tell what was genuinely important and what was ephemeral; and not only did he fail to create a functioning administration, he was not even aware of its importance. The idea of presenting an attractive political program was simply alien to his way of thinking. At times his appealing traits contributed to his failure. He was not the man to use harsh punishments against those who deserved such treatment. Although he condemned marauding and lawlessness, his lack of decisiveness in combating them made him responsible for some of the worst acts of mob violence in the Civil War.

Lehovich, an amateur historian, instead of asking important questions has personalized issues. He has little interest in class analysis; he has little patience for describing the functioning—or nonfunctioning—of administrative institutions. His analysis does not add up to much more than the assertion that the Bolsheviks were wicked and the Whites morally superior.

This book is to be recommended only to the unusual reader who would like to find out about Denikin's character and biography. Students of the Civil War will find little in it that is new.

PETER KENEZ

University of California, Santa Cruz

THE RUSSIAN ORTHODOX CHURCH UNDERGROUND, 1917–1970. By William C. Fletcher. New York and London: Oxford University Press, 1971. x, 314 pp. \$12.75.

Professor Fletcher draws several conclusions from his study of underground Orthodoxy: it is a response to Soviet persecution; persecution of Orthodoxy does not succeed, for it does not eradicate religion but drives it underground; this underground opposition serves as insurance that organized (presumably legal) religious institutions may continue to exist. The first two conclusions seem so obvious that they need no comment. Evidence for the third, however, is by no means conclusive. Indeed, judging by the final chapter, "The Continuing Crisis," one is left with the impression that the state has succeeded not only in closing more and more churches belonging to the "Patriarchal Church" but also in weakening underground Orthodoxy (*vide* pp. 198 and 262).

The book relies heavily on Soviet sociological research on religion, without which "this study could not have been written." Despite his impressive list of the great flaws in Soviet sociology, the author has decided that "there is a wealth of accurate information in these studies." But he provides no idea how he winnows these books to find the valuable kernels. For example, he describes the Soviet academician Mitrokhin as "careful and dispassionate" in his presentation of data and then quotes Mitrokhin (apparently as accurate) on the True Orthodox Christians: "[They] disseminated their blind and fanatical rumors by every means, 'testifying' to their prophecies. The very character of these rumours makes it possible to make a direct evaluation of the squalid clerical lives of these spiteful people, who were ready by any means to slander socialism. . . . Powerless to find support among Soviet people, [the leaders] linked the realization of their plans with imperialist aggression" (pp. 190–91). Such outbursts leave the reader wondering why Mitrokhin is described as careful and dispassionate and this "evidence" as a wealth of accurate information.

Fletcher's book nevertheless rightly corrects and dismisses the view popularized by Harrison Salisbury and others that the "Church indulges in no undercover activities."

ROBERT L. NICHOLS

St. Olaf College

STALIN UND HITLER: PAKT GEGEN EUROPA. Edited by J. W. Brügel. Vienna: Europaverlag, 1973. 349 pp.

This volume is a collection of documents on German-Soviet relations in the period of the Nazi-Soviet pact. Included are materials of various European Communist parties and diplomatic documents, mainly from the German foreign ministry. Almost nine-tenths of the documents have been published previously, many in complete texts rather than with omissions as here. Some have either not been published