
The

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral

and Brain

Sciences

VOLUME 7
NUMBER 2
JUNE 1984

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

The language bioprogram hypothesis

Derek Bickerton

Multiple book review of *Elements of episodic memory*

Endel Tulving

Toward a triarchic theory of human intelligence

Robert J. Sternberg

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Multiple-level evolution" (Plotkin & Odling-Smee)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

ISSN 0140-525X

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Cognitive Neuroscience

Lynn Nadel/U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology

Charles J. Brainerd/University of Alberta

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/U. London

Neurobiology

Graham Hoyle/U. Oregon

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/U. Chicago

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 7 (1984) is US \$120.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£66.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$55.00 net (£33.00) for individuals; US \$32.00 net (£20.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$32.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$33.00 net (£19.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to BBS, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 7:2 June 1984

Bickerton, D. The language bioprogram hypothesis			173
Open Peer Commentary			
Bates, E. Bioprograms and the innateness hypothesis	188	Marshall, J. C. Pidgins are everywhere	201
Bloom, L. A bioprogram for language: Not whether but how?	190	Meier, R. P. Sign as creole	201
Cartmill, M. Innate grammars and the evolutionary presumption	191	Mufwene, S. S. The language bioprogram hypothesis, creole studies, and linguistic theory	202
Corne, C. On the transmission of substratal features in creolisation	191	Muysken, P. Do creoles give insight into the human language faculty?	203
Cromer, R. F. Language acquisition: Genetically encoded instructions or a set of processing mechanisms?	192	Posner, R. Creolization or linguistic change?	204
Goodman, M. Are creole structures innate?	193	Roberts, P. A. Problems with similarities across creoles and the development of creole	205
Gopnik, M. From pidgins to pigeons	194	Samarin, W. J. Socioprogrammed linguistics	206
Hornstein, N. Grades of nativism	195	Sampson, G. Do creoles prove what "ordinary" languages don't?	207
Jenkins, L. Pidgins, creoles, and universal grammar	196	Seuren, P. A. M. The bioprogram hypothesis: Facts and fancy	208
Keil, F. C. Of pidgins and pigeons	197	Slobin, D. I. Child language and the bioprogram	209
Lightfoot, D. W. The relative richness of triggers and the bioprogram	198	Wang, W. S-Y. Organum ex machina?	210
Marantz, A. Creolization: Special evidence for innateness?	199	Woolford, E. Why creoles won't reveal the properties of universal grammar	211
Maratsos, M. How degenerate is the input to creoles and where do its biases come from?	200		
		Author's Response	
		Bickerton, D. Creole is still king	212

Tulving, E. Précis of *Elements of episodic memory* **223**

Open Peer Commentary			
Baddeley, A. D. Neuropsychological evidence and the semantic/episodic distinction	238	Ohta, N. The source of the long-term retention of priming effects	249
d'Ydewalle, G. & Peeters, R. There is more going on in the human mind	239	Olton, D. S. Comparative analysis of episodic memory	250
Hintzman, D. L. Episodic versus semantic memory: A distinction whose time has come – and gone?	240	Raaijmakers, J. G. W. On falsifying the synergistic ephory model	251
Hirst, W. Factual memory?	241	Roediger, H. L., III Does current evidence from dissociation experiments favor the episodic/semantic distinction?	252
Jones, G. V. Analyzing recognition and recall	242	Seamon, J. G. The ontogeny of episodic and semantic memory	254
Kihlstrom, J. F. A fact is a fact is a fact	243	Tajika, H. Recognition and recall: The direct comparison experiment	254
Klatzky, R. L. Armchair theorists have more fun	244	Tiberghien, G. Just how does ephory work?	254
Lachman, R. & Naus, M. J. The episodic/semantic continuum in an evolved machine	244	Wolters, G. Memory: Two systems or one system with many subsystems?	256
Loftus, E. F. & Schooler, J. W. Recoding processes in memory	246		
McCauley, R. N. Inference and temporal coding in episodic memory	246	Author's Response	
Morton, J. & Bekerian, D. A. The episodic/semantic distinction: Something worth arguing about	247	Tulving, E. Relations among components and processes of memory	257
Nilsson, L.-G. Bridging gaps between concepts through GAPS	248		

Sternberg, R. J. Toward a triarchic theory of human intelligence **269**

Open Peer Commentary			
Baron, J. Criteria and explanations	287	Economos, J. Intelligent dissension among the Archói is good for the people	290
Berry, J. W. Cultural relativism comes in from the cold	288	Eysenck, H. J. Intelligence versus behaviour	290
Carroll, J. B. Some psychometric considerations	288	Ford, M. E. Finding the right tools for the task: An intelligent approach to the study of intelligence	291
Detterman, D. K. Understand cognitive components before postulating metacomponents, etc., part 2	289		

Humphreys, L. G. A rose is not a rose: A rival view of intelligence	292	three subtheories of Sternberg's triarchic theory of intelligence?	300
Irvine, S. H. The contexts of triarchic theory	293	Triandis, H. C. Speed and adaptivity in intelligence	301
Jackson, N. E. Intellectual giftedness: A theory worth doing well	294	Tyler, L. E. Some possible implications of Sternberg's triarchic theory of intelligence	301
Jensen, A. R. Mental speed and levels of analysis	295	Vernon, P. E. Intelligence: Some neglected topics	302
Olson, D. R. In what sense does intelligence underlie an intelligent performance?	296	Yussen, S. R. A triarchic reaction to a triarchic theory of intelligence	303
Pellegrino, J. W. & Goldman, S. R. Context and novelty in an integrated theory of intelligence	297	Zimmerman, B. J. Contextual and psychometric descriptions of intelligence: A fundamental conflict	303
Raaheim, K. How intelligent can one be?	298		
Richelle, M. N. Intelligence, adaptation, and inverted selection	299	Author's Response	
Rogoff, B. What are the interrelations among the		Sternberg, R. J. If at first you don't believe, try "tri" again	304

Continuing Commentary

On Plotkin, H. C. & Odling-Smee, F. J. (1981) A multiple-level model of evolution and its implications for sociobiology. *BBS* 4(2): 225–268.

Baerends, G. P. Evolution: Monolith or strawman – a matter of proper definitions and words	317	Authors' Response	
		Odling-Smee, F. J. & Plotkin, H. C. Evolution: Its levels and its units	318