

Third Meeting, January 13th, 1888.

W. J. MACDONALD, Esq., M.A., F.R.S.E., President, in the Chair.

On Stirling's approximation to $n!$ when n is large.

By R. E. ALLARDICE, M.A.

The approximation is

$$n! = (n/e)^n \sqrt{2\pi n}.$$

We have

$$\begin{aligned} \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n &= \left(\frac{n-1}{e}\right)^{n-1} \cdot \frac{1}{e} \cdot \left(\frac{n}{n-1}\right)^n \cdot [n(n-1)]^{\frac{1}{2}} \cdot \left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &= \left(\frac{n-1}{e}\right)^{n-1} \cdot \frac{1}{e} \cdot \left(\frac{n}{n-1}\right)^{n-\frac{1}{2}} \cdot [n(n-1)]^{\frac{1}{2}}. \end{aligned}$$

Now assume

$$\begin{aligned} \left(\frac{n}{n-1}\right)^{n-\frac{1}{2}} &= e^x \\ \therefore x &= (n-\frac{1}{2}) \log \frac{n}{n-1} \\ &= (-n+\frac{1}{2}) \log \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}\right) \\ &= (-n+\frac{1}{2}) \left(-\frac{1}{n} - \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{n^2} - \frac{1}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{n^3} - \dots \dots \right) \\ &= 1 + \frac{1}{12} \cdot \frac{1}{n^2} + \frac{B}{n^3} + \dots \dots \\ &= 1 + \frac{A}{n^2} \end{aligned}$$

where A differs from $1/12$ by a quantity of the order of $1/n$, since the above series for x is convergent; and since n is large, A may be taken to be $1/12$.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Hence, } \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n &= \left(\frac{n-1}{e}\right)^{n-1} \cdot \frac{1}{e} \cdot e^{1+A/n^2} \cdot [n(n-1)]^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &= \left(\frac{n-1}{e}\right)^{n-1} \cdot e^{A/n^2} \cdot [n(n-1)]^{\frac{1}{2}}. \end{aligned}$$

Substituting for n in succession the values, $2n, 2n - 1 \dots \dots n + 1$, we get

$$\left(\frac{2n}{e}\right)^{2n} = \left[2n(2n - 1) \dots \dots (n + 1)(2n - 1) \dots \dots n\right]^{\frac{1}{2}} \cdot \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \cdot e^k$$

where
$$k = \frac{A}{(2n)^2} + \frac{A}{(2n - 1)^2} + \dots \dots + \frac{A}{(n + 1)^2}$$

$\therefore \sqrt{2\left(\frac{2n}{e}\right)^{2n}} = \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \cdot \frac{(2n)!}{n!} \cdot e^k$

$\therefore \sqrt{2\left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \cdot 2^n} = \frac{(2n)!}{n!} \cdot e^k$

$\therefore n! = \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \cdot \sqrt{2 \cdot 2^{2n} \cdot \frac{(n!)^2}{(2n)!}} \cdot e^{-k}$

Now, Wallis's formula for π is

$$\frac{\pi}{2} = \left[\frac{2 \cdot 4 \cdot 6 \dots \dots 2n}{1 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \dots \dots 2n - 1}\right]^2 \cdot \frac{1}{2n + 1}$$

or
$$\frac{\pi}{2} = \left[\frac{2 \cdot 4 \cdot 6 \dots \dots 2n}{1 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \dots \dots 2n - 1}\right]^2 \cdot \frac{1}{2n} \cdot \left(1 + \frac{1}{2n}\right)^{-1}$$

$\therefore \sqrt{\pi} = \frac{2 \cdot 4 \cdot 6 \dots \dots 2n}{1 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \dots \dots 2n - 1} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \cdot \left(1 + \frac{1}{2n}\right)^{-\frac{1}{2}}$

Hence we may write

$$\sqrt{\pi} = \frac{2^n (n!)^2}{(2n)!} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \cdot \left(1 - \frac{1}{4n}\right)$$

This result reduces the above equation for $n!$ to

$$n! = \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \cdot \sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{\pi n} \cdot e^{-k} \cdot \left(1 + \frac{1}{4n}\right)$$

Now, k lies between $nA/(2n)^2$ and $nA/(n + 1)^2$. Hence if we write $n! = \left(\frac{n}{e}\right)^n \sqrt{2\pi n}$, the ratio of the error to the value found for $n!$ is of the order of $1/n$.

It may now be shown that in the above approximation to π , the error made bears to π a ratio of the order of $1/n$.

In the value assumed for π

$$\frac{\pi}{2} = \left[\frac{2 \cdot 4 \cdot 6 \dots \dots 2n}{1 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \dots \dots 2n - 1}\right]^2 \cdot \frac{1}{2n + 1}$$

the factor u has been neglected, where

$$u = \frac{(2n + 2)^2}{(2n + 1)(2n + 3)} \cdot \frac{(2n + 4)^2}{(2n + 3)(2n + 5)} \dots \dots$$

Now,
$$\frac{(2n + 2)^2}{(2n + 1)(2n + 3)} = \frac{4n^2 + 8n + 4}{4n^2 + 8n + 3} = 1 + \frac{1}{(2n + 1)(2n + 3)}$$

$$\therefore u = \left[1 + \frac{1}{(2n+1)(2n+3)} \right] \left[1 + \frac{1}{(2n+3)(2n+5)} \right] \dots \dots$$

$$\therefore \log u = \frac{1}{(2n+1)(2n+3)} + \frac{1}{(2n+3)(2n+5)} + \dots \dots$$

$$- \frac{1}{2} \left[\frac{1}{(2n+1)(2n+3)} \right]^2 - \frac{1}{2} \left[\frac{1}{(2n+3)(2n+5)} \right]^2 - \dots$$

$$\text{Now } \frac{1}{(2n+1)(2n+3)} = \frac{1}{2} \left[\frac{1}{2n+1} - \frac{1}{2n+3} \right].$$

Hence, neglecting small quantities of a higher order than $1/n$, we may write

$$\log u = 1/2(2n+1)$$

$$\therefore u = e^{1/2(2n+1)}$$

$$= 1 + 1/2(2n+1) + \dots \dots;$$

which shows that the error made in the above approximation to π is of the order stated.

[Another elementary proof of Stirling's theorem, by Mr J. W. L. Glaisher, is given in the *Quarterly Journal of Mathematics*, vol. xv., p. 57.]

A Device for the Analysis of Intervals and Chords in Music.

By A. Y. FRASER, M.A., F.R.S.E.

§ 1. The device here described has been found to simplify greatly the "somewhat laborious discussion" of the different musical intervals as given, say, in Sedley Taylor's *Sound and Music* (chap. viii.) or in Helmholtz's *Sensations of Tone*. It has been found particularly helpful in giving an account, necessarily rapid, of the nature of harmony to classes studying sound as a part of physics, from whom much familiarity with musical terms and notation is not to be expected.

§ 2. The leading idea of the device is that the octave being what may be called a periodic phenomenon, should be represented on a circular or spiral curve, and not, as is usual, on a straight vertical line. Such a representation of four octaves is given in figure 14. (To read this and the other figures, begin at the extreme right and