Contents

Guest Editorial
Renata Uitz – The Perils of Defending the Rule of Law Through Dialogue – 1

Articles
Mattias Wendel – Mutual Trust, Essence and Federalism – Between Consolidating and Fragmenting the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice after LM – 17
Pablo Castillo-Ortiz – The Illiberal Abuse of Constitutional Courts in Europe – 48
Dana Burchardt – The relationship between the law of the European Union and the law of its Member States – a norm-based conceptual framework – 73
Joost Sillen – The concept of ‘internal judicial independence’ in the case law of the European Court of Human Rights – 104
Edoardo Celeste – The Court of Justice and the Ban on Bulk Data Retention: Expansive Potential and Future Scenarios – 134

Case Note
Stijn Smet – Free Speech versus Religious Feelings, the Sequel: Defamation of the Prophet Muhammad in E.S. v Austria – 158

Book Review
Teresa Cabrita – Understanding the EU-led ‘pandemic’ of constitutional foreign policy objectives – 171

Contributions by
Mattias Wendel, Renata Uitz, Stijn Smet, Joost Sillen, Edoardo Celeste, Pablo Castillo-Ortiz, Teresa Cabrita, Dana Burchardt

Subjects
Rule of Law: Dialogue and the crises; Illiberal attacks to constitutional courts. European Union: Mutual trust and federalism; Relationships between national and EU law; Constitutional foreign policy objectives. Court of Justice: The data retention saga. European Court of Human Rights: Judicial independence; Religion and free speech.
**Board of Editors**

Leonard F.M. Besselink, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

Monica Claes, co-editor-in-chief
Maastricht University

Jan-Herman Rivetman, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

W.T. Eijbosch
University of Amsterdam

John W. Sap
Open University and VU Amsterdam

Thomas Biskupek
European University Institute, Florence

Jan Komárek
University of Copenhagen

Gerhard van der Schaff
University of Tilburg

Matthias Wendel
University of Bielefeld

Aida Torres Pérez
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona

François-Xavier Mille
Court of Justice of the European Union

Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme
University of Amsterdam

Bastian Michel, managing editor
University of Amsterdam

Matteo Bonelli, managing editor (a.i.)
University of Milan

Andrew Langman, language editor
Amsterdam

Special language advisers
Jeremy B. Birnbach
Amsterdam

Russell E.M. Lawton
Oxford

**Board of Advisers**

Andreas Auer
Professor emeritus of public law, Universities of Zurich and Geneva

Marta Cartabia
Vice-president of the Italian Constitutional Court and Professor of constitutional law, Università Milano-Bicocca

Paul Craig
Professor of English law, St. John’s College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca
Professor of law, New York University School of Law

Bruno De Witte
Professor of European Union law, Maastricht University, and part-time professor, European University Institute, Florence

Olivier Dubouloz
University Professor, IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis
Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerke
Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

J.J.G. Kaptein
Former judge at the Court of Justice

Rick Lawson
Professor of European law, Leiden University

Koen Lenaerts
President of the Court of Justice and Professor of European law, KU Leuven

Jit Peters
Professor emeritus of public law, University of Amsterdam

Lucas Prakhé
Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal
Judge at the Court of Justice and Professor of international and European institutional law, Utrecht University

W.H. Reubel
Professor emeritus of European history, University of Amsterdam

Dominique Roussau
Professor of public law, Université Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne

Wojciech Sadurski
Professor in jurisprudence, University of Sydney and professor extraordinarius, University of Warsaw

Andreas Sajó
University Professor, Central European University, Budapest

Mirosław Wyrzykowski
Professor of constitutional law, University of Warsaw

Peter G. Xuereb
Professor of European and comparative law, University of Malta

Jiří Zemánek
Judge at the Czech Constitutional Court and Professor of European Union law, Charles University, Prague
EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW
2019 Volume 15 Issue 1

Contents

Guest Editorial

Articles
Mattias Wendel – Mutual Trust, Essence and Federalism – Between Consolidating and Fragmenting the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice after LM – 17
Pablo Castillo-Ortiz – The Illiberal Abuse of Constitutional Courts in Europe – 48
Dana Burchardt – The relationship between the law of the European Union and the law of its Member States - a norm-based conceptual framework – 73
Joost Sillen – The concept of ‘internal judicial independence’ in the case law of the European Court of Human Rights – 104
Eduardo Celeste – The Court of Justice and the Ban on Bulk Data Retention: Expansive Potential and Future Scenarios – 134

Case Note
Stijn Smet – Free Speech versus Religious Feelings, the Sequel: Defamation of the Prophet Muhammad in E.S. v Austria – 158

Book Review
Teresa Cabrita – Understanding the EU-led ‘pandemic’ of constitutional foreign policy objectives – 171

Retraction Notice
Machiel van Bruggen – Democratic rights protection: the case for weak judicial review implicit in the democratic critique of judicial review – RETRACTED – 181

Online Only
Machiel van Bruggen – Democratic rights protection: the case for weak judicial review implicit in the democratic critique of judicial review – RETRACTED
EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The journal is edited in the Hogendorp Centre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is based in the University of Amsterdam. Published four times a year. In the tradition of the Hogendorp Centre, the European Constitutional Law Review (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of the member states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

Submitting an article, case note or book review
The editors of the European Constitutional Law Review are happy to receive contributions on relevant subjects at any time. Before submitting, authors should ensure that their contribution falls within the scope of EuConst as stated above.

Articles, case notes and book reviews can be sent by email to euconst@uva.nl. Manuscripts should be attached in Microsoft Word format (and not, specifically, in PDF format) to enable editing, anonymisation and comments. EuConst has an exclusive submission policy. Authors are required to state clearly, when submitting, that their contribution is not under consideration elsewhere.

Authors of article contributions are asked to aim for a length of no more than 10,000 words (including footnotes). Case notes and book reviews should not exceed 5,000 words. Upon request, the editors will consider whether relaxation of these limits is justified.

All submissions must be written in good English. Authors who are uncertain whether their English is of sufficient quality, should have their manuscript reviewed and edited by a native speaker with a background in law.

Copyright, licence to publish and open access policy
Contributors retain copyright. By submitting to EuConst, authors agree that upon acceptance of their contribution they will grant an exclusive licence to publish by signing and returning the appropriate Licence Form. Authors can make their contributions available through academic repositories. For more information, including terms and conditions of publication and authors' rights of reuse, see <journals.cambridge.org/EuConst_CTF>.

Revisions and house style
Accepted contributions will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to authors' approval. Authors should ensure that their submissions conform to the house style. A style sheet is available on the journal website, <journals.cambridge.org/euconst>.

The G.K. van Hogendorp Centre for European Constitutional Studies, short: Hogendorp Centre, is a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam. Founded in 1996, it promotes research and course development in the field of European Constitutional Studies, bringing together the disciplines of constitutional (including comparative) law, history, political theory. Gijsbert Karel van Hogendorp, 1762-1834, is the auctor intellectualis of the Dutch Kingdom's first constitution, of 1814.