

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

JOHN BALDWIN    ILIJAS FARAH    PHOKION KOLAITIS  
PENELOPE MADDY    MICHAEL RATHJEN    KATRIN TENT

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

STEVE AWODEY    JOHN BALDWIN    LEV BEKLEMISHEV  
MIRNA DŽAMONJA    DAVID EVANS    ERICH GRÄDEL  
DENIS HIRSCHFELDT    ROGER MADDUX    GRIGORI MINTS  
LUKE ONG    VOLKER PECKHAUS    SŁAWOMIR SOLECKI

VOLUME 13 · NUMBER 3 · SEPTEMBER 2007  
ISSN 1079-8986

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS

---

*Copyright ©2007 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

Describing groups, by ANDRÉ NIES .....	305
Relating first-order set theories and elementary toposes, by STEVE AWODEY, CARSTEN BUTZ, ALEX SIMPSON, and THOMAS STREICHER .....	340

### REVIEWS

L. Wos and G. W. Pieper, <i>A fascinating country in the world of computing—your guide to automated reasoning</i> . Reviewed by Robert K. Meyer .....	359	
J. L. Bell, <i>The continuous and the infinitesimal in mathematics and philosophy</i> . Reviewed by Philip Ehrlich .....	361	
P. Hinman, <i>Fundamentals of mathematical logic</i> . Reviewed by Eric J. Hall .....	363	
R. Tieszen, <i>Phenomenology, logic, and the philosophy of mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Kai Hauser .....	365	
J. Ferreirós and J. J. Gray (editors), <i>The architecture of modern mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Torsten Wilholt .....	368	
H. J. Gensler, <i>Historical dictionary of logic</i> . Reviewed by Roman Murawski .....	370	
S. Awodey, <i>Category theory</i> . Reviewed by Jiří Rosický .....	371	
N. J. Cutland, M. Di Nasso and D. A. Ross (editors), <i>Nonstandard methods and applications in mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Alasdair Urquhart .....	372	
2006–07 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, New Orleans Marriott and Sheraton New Orleans, New Orleans, Louisiana, January 7–8, 2007 .....		375
2007 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida, March 10–13, 2007 .....		386
2006 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada, May 17–21, 2006 — Addendum .....		409

(Continued on inside back cover)

---

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN 1079-8986) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604-0001, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Poughkeepsie NY and at additional mailing offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC; the 2007 annual subscription price for the two journals is US\$540. Online subscription is available from Project Euclid: visit <http://projecteuclid.org/bsl>. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic*, c/o American Mathematical Society, 201 Charles Street, Providence, RI 02904-2294, USA. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, Charles Steinhorn (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN and the JOURNAL are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in all aspects of symbolic logic. The BULLETIN encourages submission of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

*Articles* should be of broad interest and accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may be purely expository, survey, or historical articles, or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

*Continued on inside back cover*

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 12 11 10 09 08 07

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

JOHN BALDWIN    ILIJAS FARAH    PHOKION KOLAITIS  
PENELOPE MADDY    MICHAEL RATHJEN    KATRIN TENT

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

STEVE AWODEY    JOHN BALDWIN    LEV BEKLEMISHEV  
MIRNA DŽAMONJA    DAVID EVANS    ERICH GRÄDEL  
DENIS HIRSCHFELDT    ROGER MADDUX    GRIGORI MINTS  
LUKE ONG    VOLKER PECKHAUS    SŁAWOMIR SOLECKI

VOLUME 13  
2007

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

The four numbers of Volume 13 are copyrighted ©2007 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the BULLETIN by photostat, photoprint, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission, to be obtained from the Secretary of the Association, Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.

This BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U. S. Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME 13

### ARTICLES

AWODEY, S., BUTZ, C., SIMPSON, A., and STREICHER, T. Relating first-order set theories and elementary toposes .....	340
BELL, JOHN L. Incompleteness in a general setting .....	21
KANAMORI, AKIHIRO. Gödel and set theory .....	153
MATHERON, ÉTIENNE and ZELENÝ, MIROSLAV. Descriptive set theory of families of small sets .....	482
NEEMAN, ITAY. Inner models and ultrafilters in $L(\mathbb{R})$ .....	31
NIES, ANDRÉ. Describing groups .....	305
VON PLATO, JAN. In the shadows of the Löwenheim–Skolem theorem: Early combinatorial analyses of mathematical proofs .....	189
SEGERLIND, NATHAN. The complexity of propositional proofs .....	417
WEAVER, NIK. Set theory and $C^*$ -algebras .....	1

### COMMUNICATIONS

MONTALBÁN, ANTONIO. On the equimorphism types of linear orderings .....	71
RÖSSLER, MICHAL and JEŘÁBEK, EMIL. Fragment of nonstandard analysis with a finitary consistency proof .....	54
SHORE, RICHARD A. Local definitions in degree structures: the Turing jump, hyperdegrees and beyond .....	226

### REVIEWS

F. Widebäck, <i>Identity of proofs</i> . Reviewed by Sergei Soloviev .....	100
L. Corry, <i>Modern algebra and the rise of mathematical structures</i> . Reviewed by Thomas Drucker .....	102
P. C. Gilmore, <i>Logicism renewed: logical foundations for mathematics and computer science</i> . Reviewed by James H. Andrews .....	104
S. G. Simpson (editor), <i>Reverse Mathematics 2001</i> . Reviewed by Ulrich Berger .....	106
V. F. Hendricks, <i>Mainstream and formal epistemology</i> . Reviewed by Paul Égré .....	110
M. Burgin, <i>Super-recursive algorithms</i> . Reviewed by Martin Davis .....	240
T. Franzén, <i>Gödel's theorem: an incomplete guide to its use and abuse</i> . Reviewed by Lev D. Beklemishev .....	241
S. Galvan, <i>Einführung in die Unvollständigkeitstheoreme</i> . Reviewed by Andrea Reichenberger .....	243
A. Kock, <i>Synthetic differential geometry</i> . Reviewed by John L. Bell .....	244
M. Vorobej, <i>A theory of argument</i> . Reviewed by Douglas Walton .....	245
J. Flum and M. Grohe, <i>Parameterized complexity theory</i> . Reviewed by Thomas Schwentick .....	246

D. M. Gabbay and F. Guenther, editors, <i>Handbook of philosophical logic</i> , vol. 10. Reviewed by Theo M. V. Janssen .....	248
L. Wos and G. W. Pieper, <i>A fascinating country in the world of computing—your guide to automated reasoning</i> . Reviewed by Robert K. Meyer .....	359
J. L. Bell, <i>The continuous and the infinitesimal in mathematics and philosophy</i> . Reviewed by Philip Ehrlich .....	361
P. Hinman, <i>Fundamentals of mathematical logic</i> . Reviewed by Eric J. Hall .....	363
R. Tieszen, <i>Phenomenology, logic, and the philosophy of mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Kai Hauser .....	365
J. Ferreirós and J. J. Gray (editors), <i>The architecture of modern mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Torsten Wilholt .....	368
H. J. Gensler, <i>Historical dictionary of logic</i> . Reviewed by Roman Murawski .....	370
S. Awodey, <i>Category theory</i> . Reviewed by Jiří Rosický .....	371
N. J. Cutland, M. Di Nasso and D. A. Ross (editors), <i>Nonstandard methods and applications in mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Alasdair Urquhart .....	372
S. Hedman, <i>A first course in logic: an introduction to model theory, proof theory, computability, and complexity</i> . Reviewed by Alasdair Urquhart .....	538
R. Epstein, <i>Classical mathematical logic</i> . Reviewed by H. B. Enderton .....	540
G. Priest, <i>Doubt truth to be a liar</i> . Reviewed by Kevin Scharp .....	541
R. Brady, <i>Universal logic</i> . Reviewed by Greg Restall .....	544
K. Sigmund, J. Dawson, and K. Mühlberger, <i>Kurt Gödel: Das Album. The Album</i> . Reviewed by Volker Peckhaus .....	547
J. Barnes, <i>Truth, etc.</i> . Reviewed by Mirja Hartimo .....	549

## IN MEMORIAM

In memoriam: Saunders Mac Lane, 1909–2005. By STEVE AWODEY .....	115
--	-----

## MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

2006 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada, May 17–21, 2006 .....	120
2006 Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Logic Colloquium '06, Nijmegen, The Netherlands, July 27–August 2, 2006 .....	251
2006–07 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, New Orleans Marriott and Sheraton New Orleans, New Orleans, Louisiana, January 7–8, 2007 .....	375
2007 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida, March 10–13, 2007 .....	386
2006 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada, May 17–21, 2006 — Addendum .....	409
2007 Spring Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, The Palmer House Hilton Hotel, Chicago, Illinois, April 19–21, 2007 .....	553

## MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

13TH Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation (WoLLIC '06), CSLI, Stanford, USA, July 18–21, 2006 .....	410
Notices .....	146, 299, 412, 622
Officers and Committees of the Association for Symbolic Logic .....	561
Members of the Association .....	566