Over- and undernutrition: challenges and approaches. 29 June-2 July 2009

The new UK body-fat references expose the overfat children classified as normal weight by the BMI

D. Samani-Radia and H. D. McCarthy

Institute for Health Research & Policy, London Metropolitan University, Holloway Rd, London N7 8DB, UK

It is widely known that the BMI has a number of limitations when used to assess overweight and obesity in children. This position is in part a result of its inability to differentiate between fat and fat-free masses, resulting in low sensitivity⁽¹⁾. Recently, references for body fatness using bioelectrical impedance analysis (BIA) have been developed for the UK childhood population⁽²⁾. The prevalence of overweight and obesity and the prevalence of overfat and obesity were compared in a sample of children from low-income schools within London.

A total of 1088 Caucasian children from schools predominantly in east London boroughs aged between 5 and 13 years were selected for analysis. Height and weight were measured and BMI calculated. Percentage body fat (%BF) was predicted using BIA (Tanita BC418; Tanita UK Ltd, Yiewsley, Middlesex, UK). Both measurements were converted to a standard deviation score based on the current UK reference data^(2,3). The percentage of children exceeding the International Obesity Task Force (IOTF) cut-off for overweight and the proportion exceeding the BIA cut-off for overfat was calculated^(2,4). The percentage of the original sample of children misclassified as either overweight and obese or normal weight by BMI was subsequently determined using %BF as the criterion.

In this sample 23 % (n 254) of children were classified as overweight and obese based on the IOTF BMI cut-off, which contrasted with 30 % (n 330) of the children classified as overfat and obese based on BIA. Further analysis of the data indicated that within the 23 % of children, twenty-seven did not have excess body fat. However, within the group of children classified as normal BMI (n 834) 103 children were identified as having excess body fat. On a whole-group basis these data equated to 2.5 % being misclassified as overweight and obese based on IOTF BMI and 9.5 % being misclassified as normal BMI.

This study is the first to quantify the misclassification of a sample of UK children by BMI using the UK %BF references. These results indicate that whilst a relatively small number are wrongly classified as overweight and obese, a substantial number of children with high body-fat levels are missed using BMI. These findings are in general agreement with an earlier study⁽⁵⁾. Whilst this group cannot be considered representative of UK children in general, the findings, if reproduced on a larger scale, would suggest current national data may seriously under-represent the true prevalence of children at risk of morbidity related to excess body fat. This widely-acknowledged but generally-ignored limitation of BMI should be considered when prevalence rates based on BMI are communicated and interpreted.

- 1. McCarthy HD (2006) Proc Nutr Soc 65, 385-392.
- 2. McCarthy HD, Cole TJ, Fry T et al. (2006) Int J Obesity (Lond) 30, 598-602.
- 3. Cole TJ, Freeman JV & Preece MA (1995) Arch Dis Child 73, 25-29.
- 4. Cole TJ, Bellizzi MC, Flegal KM et al. (2000) Br Med J 320, 1240-1243.
- 5. Reilly JJ, Dorosty AR, Emmett PM et al. (2000) Int J Obesity (Lond) 24, 1623-1627.