

## MEASURE CONVERGENT SEQUENCES IN LEBESGUE SPACES AND FATOU'S LEMMA

HEINZ-ALBRECHT KLEI

Let  $(f_n)$  be a sequence of positive  $P$ -integrable functions such that  $(\int f_n dP)_n$  converges. We prove that  $(f_n)$  converges in measure to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$  if and only if equality holds in the generalised Fatou's lemma. Let  $f_\infty$  be an integrable function such that  $(\|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)_n$  converges. We present in terms of the modulus of uniform integrability of  $(f_n)$  necessary and sufficient conditions for  $(f_n)$  to converge in measure to  $f_\infty$ .

### 1. INTRODUCTION

In [6] we proved the following result: let  $(\Omega, \Sigma, P)$  be a probability space and  $(f_n)$  a sequence of positive integrable functions such that  $(\int f_n dP)_n$  converges. Then  $(f_n)$  converges in norm to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$  if and only if equality holds in Fatou's lemma. This is a striking example of the well known fact that under suitable extreme point conditions, weak convergence in  $L^1$ -spaces (and even much less) implies strong convergence [1]. By means of the modulus of uniform integrability of  $(f_n)$  (to be defined later), we proved a generalisation of Fatou's lemma [6, Corollary 4]. In the present paper we pose the following question: when does  $(f_n)$  converge in measure to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ ? We show that this is the case if and only if for all subsequences of  $(f_n)$  equality holds in the generalised Fatou's lemma (Theorem 3). More generally we study the convergence in measure of a bounded sequence  $(f_n)$  to an arbitrary element  $f_\infty \in L^1(\mathbb{R})$  (Theorem 7). Both Theorem 3 and Theorem 5 enable us to give a straightforward proof of Lebesgue's convergence Theorem [3, p.122].

### 2. PRELIMINARIES

Throughout this paper,  $(\Omega, \Sigma, P)$  will be probability space. We shall consider the Banach space  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$  of all (classes of)  $P$ -Bochner-integrable functions from  $\Omega$  to  $\mathbb{R}$ .

---

Received 16 October 1995

Copyright Clearance Centre, Inc. Serial-fee code: 0004-9729/96 \$A2.00+0.00.

In [7] Rosenthal defined the modulus of uniform integrability  $\eta(H)$  of a bounded subset  $H \subseteq L^1(\mathbb{R})$ : For  $\varepsilon > 0$ , put

$$\eta(H, \varepsilon) = \sup \left\{ \int_A |h| dP : h \in H, A \in \Sigma, P(A) \leq \varepsilon \right\},$$

$$\eta(H) = \lim_{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0^+} \eta(H, \varepsilon).$$

Thus  $H$  is uniformly integrable if and only if  $\eta(H) = 0$ .

### 3. RESULTS

We start with a lemma proved in [4] and extended to Banach space valued integrable functions in [5].

**LEMMA 1.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$  converging in measure to an element  $f_\infty$  of  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$ . Then the following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f_n dP = \eta(f) + \int f_\infty dP$  and  $\eta(f') = \eta(f)$  for each subsequence  $f'$  of  $f$ ;
- (ii) the sequence of reals  $(\int f_n dP)_n$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}_+$ .

**COROLLARY 2.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$  converging in measure to  $f_\infty \in L^1(\mathbb{R})$ . Then  $(\|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)_n$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}$  if and only if  $\eta(f') = \eta(f)$  for each subsequence  $f'$  of  $f$  and in this case  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n - f_\infty\|_1 = \eta(f)$ .*

**THEOREM 3.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$  such that the sequence  $(\int f_n dP)$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}_+$ . Then the following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f_n dP = \eta(f) + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP$  and  $\eta(f') = \eta(f)$  for each subsequence  $f'$  of  $f$ ;
- (ii) the sequence  $(f_n)$  converges in measure to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ .

**PROOF:** The implication (ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (i) is a consequence of Lemma 1. Suppose now that (i) is true. Let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be a subsequence of  $f$ . On account of the generalised Fatou's lemma [6, Corollary 4], we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f_n dP \geq \eta(f) + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP.$$

By comparing this inequality with the hypothesis, we obtain the following relation:

$$\int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP \geq \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP.$$

It follows that  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n = \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n$   $P$ -almost everywhere. Hence

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP = \eta(f') + \int \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP.$$

So Theorem 10 of [6] applies to the sequence  $(f'_n)$  and says that there is a further subsequence  $(f''_n)$  of  $(f'_n)$  converging in measure to  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n$ , which equals  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$   $P$ -almost everywhere.

The proof is complete. □

**PROPOSITION 4.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$  and let  $f' = (f'_n)$  a subsequence of  $f$  such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP$ . Then the following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP = \eta(f') + \int \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP$  and  $\eta(f') = \eta(f'')$  for each subsequence  $f''$  of  $f'$ ;
- (ii) the sequence  $(f'_n)$  converges in measure to  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ .

**PROOF:** Suppose that (i) is true. Let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be a subsequence of  $(f_n)$  satisfying the hypothesis of Proposition 4. It follows that

$$(1) \quad \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP = \eta(f') + \int \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP \leq \eta(f') + \int \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP.$$

By the generalised Fatou's lemma [6, Corollary 4] we obtain

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP \geq \eta(f') + \int \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP.$$

Thus we have two equalities in (1). Since all subsequences of  $f'$  have the same modulus of uniform integrability, Theorem 3 applies to the sequence  $f'$ . Consequently  $(f'_n)$  converges in measure to  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n$ . Now  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n$  and  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$  are comparable and their integrals coincident because of the second equality in (1). This means that  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n(\omega) = \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(\omega)$   $P$ -almost everywhere.

Conversely, suppose that (ii) is true and let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be a subsequence of  $f$  such that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP.$$

As  $(f'_n)$  converges in measure to  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ , we can apply the implication (ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (i) of Lemma 1 to the sequence  $(f'_n)$ , and the proof is done. □

Let us consider a special case of Theorem 3. If  $\eta(f) = 0$ , then we obtain a result which was the starting point of our investigation. Note that it was used in the proof of Theorem 3.

**THEOREM 5.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$ . Then the following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $(\int f_n dP)$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}_+$  and  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f_n dP = \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP$ ;
- (ii)  $(f_n)$  converges in norm to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ .

PROOF: Suppose that (i) is true. By the generalised Fatou’s lemma we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f_n dP \geq \eta(f) + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP.$$

It follows that  $\eta(f) = 0$ . We know from Theorem 3 that  $(f_n)$  converges in measure to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ . Note that a measure convergent and uniformly integrable sequence converges in norm. □

REMARK. As pointed out in [6], the combination of Theorem 5 and Fatou’s lemma yields Lebesgue’s convergence theorem [3, p.122].

**LEMMA 6.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$  converging in measure to an element  $f_\infty$  belonging to  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$ . Then the sequence  $(\|f_n\|_1)$  converges if and only if  $(\|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)$  does and in this case we have  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n - f_\infty\|_1 = \eta(f) = \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} (\|f_n\|_1 - \|f_\infty\|_1)$ .*

PROOF: We know from Brezis and Lieb [2] that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} (\|f_n\|_1 - \|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)_n = \|f_\infty\|_1.$$

Suppose that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n\|_1$  exists. As  $(|f_n|)_n$  converges in measure to  $|f_\infty|$ , it follows from Lemma 1 of [4] that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n\|_1 = \eta(f) + \|f_\infty\|_1.$$

The combination of the last two equalities yields the first implication. To prove the opposite implication, suppose that the sequence  $(\|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)_n$  converges. We know from Lemma 1 of [4] that its limit is  $\eta(f)$ . An application of Brezis’ and Lieb’s equality completes the proof. □

**THEOREM 7.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$  and let  $f_\infty$  be an element of  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$ . Suppose that  $(\|f_n - f_\infty\|_1)_n$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}$ . Then the following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $(f_n)$  converges in measure to  $f_\infty$ ;

- (ii)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n - f_\infty\|_1 \leq \eta(f)$  and  $\eta(f) = \eta(f')$  for each subsequence  $f'$  of  $f$ .
- (iii)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f_n - f_\infty\|_1 = \eta(f)$  and  $\eta(f) = \eta(f')$  for each subsequence  $f'$  of  $f$ .

PROOF: We know from Corollary 2 that (i) implies (iii). Suppose now that (ii) is true and let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be any subsequence of  $f$ . Note that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \|f'_n - f_\infty\|_1 \leq \eta(f').$$

Hence Theorem 6 of [4] applies to the subsequence  $(f'_n)$  and says that there is a further subsequence  $(f''_n)$  of  $(f'_n)$  which converges in measure to  $f_\infty$ . Consequently assertion (i) follows. □

**PROPOSITION 8.** *Let  $f = (f_n)$  be a bounded sequence in  $L^1(\mathbb{R}_+)$  such that*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n \int f_k dP = \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP.$$

*Then the following statements hold:*

- (i)  $\left( \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n f_k \right)_n$  converges in norm to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ ;
- (ii) Let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be any subsequence of  $(f_n)$  satisfying  $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP = \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP$ . Then  $(f'_n)$  converges in norm to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ .

PROOF: Put  $m(f) = \left( \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n \int f_k dP \right)_n$ . Note that

$$\begin{aligned} \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n \int f_k dP \geq \eta(m(f)) + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n f_k dP \\ &\geq \eta(m(f)) + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP. \end{aligned}$$

The first of the preceding inequalities comes from the generalised Fatou's lemma. The second one is obvious. It follows that  $\eta(m(f)) = 0$  and that  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(\omega) = \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n f_k(\omega)$   $P$ -almost everywhere. Now the hypothesis can be written as follows:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n \int f_k dP = \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n f_k dP.$$

Theorem 5 applies and yields the assertion (i).

Let  $f' = (f'_n)$  be as in (ii). Note that

$$\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n \int f_n dP \leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^n \int f_k dP = \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP.$$

In particular we have  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP = \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP$ . On the other hand, we know that

$$\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int f_n dP = \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int f'_n dP \geq \eta(f') + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f'_n dP \geq \eta(f') + \int \varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n dP.$$

So the preceding inequalities reduce to equalities and it follows that  $\eta(f') = 0$ . Proposition 4 or Theorem 5 enable us to say that  $(f'_n)$  converges in norm to  $\varliminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n$ .  $\square$

#### REFERENCES

- [1] E.J. Balder, 'On equivalence of strong and weak convergence in  $L_1$ -spaces under extreme point conditions', *Israel J. Math.* **75** (1991), 21–47.
- [2] H. Brezis and E. Lieb, 'A relation between pointwise convergence of functions and convergence of functionals', *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **88** (1983), 486–490.
- [3] N. Dunford and J.T. Schwartz, *Linear operators, Part I* (Interscience Publishers, New York, 1962).
- [4] H.-A. Klei, 'Convergences faible, en mesure et au sens de Cesaro dans  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$ ', *C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris* **315**, Série I (1992), 9–12.
- [5] H.-A. Klei, 'Convergence and extraction of bounded sequences in  $L^1(\mathbb{R})$ ', *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* (to appear).
- [6] H.-A. Klei and M. Miyara, 'Une extension du lemme de Fatou', *Bull. Sci. Math. (2<sup>e</sup> série)* **115** (1991), 211–222.
- [7] H.P. Rosenthal, 'Sous-espaces de  $L^1$ ', (Lectures held at the University Paris VI, 1979).

Université de Reims  
 Département de Mathématiques  
 Moulin de la Housse  
 B P 347  
 51062 Reims Cedex  
 France  
 e-mail: heinz.klei@univ-reims.fr