

# NINETEENTH-CENTURY Music Review

VOLUME 4, ISSUE 1 2007

## **ASHGATE**

Published in association with the Centre for Nineteenth-Century Music, Durham University, UK

*Letters to the Editor* For any communication concerning published articles or reviews, please send letters by email or hard copy to the General Editor:

Dr Bennett Zon School of Music Durham University Palace Green Durham DH1 3RL England

Email: bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk

Subscriptions For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Nicky Staszkiewicz Ashgate Publishing Limited Gower House Croft Road Aldershot Hants GU11 3HR England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 351804 Fax: +44 (0)01252 351839

Email: journals@ashgatepublishing.com

#### Themed Issues

The General Editor of *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* encourages proposals from individuals with ideas for themed issues, involving the commissioning of up to six main articles per issue, as well as one or more review articles for coverage of books, CDs and scores. Those applying to the journal for this purpose should initially provide the General Editor with a statement of no more than 500 words, outlining the thematic nature of the proposed issue, the names of contributing authors along with a working title for their papers, and a timetable for submission of work.

Proposers of themed issues work alongside the General Editor, and are designated Guest Editors. They are responsible for commissioning, organizing and preparing articles for publication, as well as working closely with review editors to locate suitable material and authors for relevant sections of the journal. Review sections of themed issues are not exclusively thematicized, and tend towards a balance of half themed, and half general material.

Articles commissioned for themed issues follow the same process of peerreview as general issues. No guarantee of publication can be given to specially commissioned authors.

### Nineteenth-Century Music Review

General Editor Bennett Zon

Book Reviews Editor Anna Celenza

CD Reviews Editor Jeremy Dibble

Score Reviews Editor Stephen Downes

#### **Editorial Board**

**Dr Bennett Zon**, Durham University UK (General Editor)

**Professor Anna Celenza**, Georgetown University, USA (Book Reviews Editor)

**Professor Jeremy Dibble**, Durham University (CD Reviews Editor)

**Dr Stephen Downes**, University of Surrey, UK (Scores Reviews Editor) **Professor William Weber**, California State University, Long Beach, USA

**Dr Phyllis Weliver**, Wilkes University, USA

#### **Advisory Board**

**Dr Rosamund Bartlett** 

**Professor Andrew Bowie**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Dr Geoffrey Chew**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor John Deathridge**, King's College, University of London, UK

Professor Annegret Fauser,

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

**Dr Peter Franklin**, University of Oxford, UK

Dr Sophie Fuller

**Professor Lydia Goehr**, Colombia University, USA

**Professor Thomas Grey**, Stanford University, USA

**Professor Hervé Lacombe**, Université Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France **Professor Roberta Marvin**, University of Iowa, USA

**Professor Simon McVeigh**, Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

**Professor Julian Rushton**, University of Leeds, UK

**Professor Jim Samson**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor Manuela Schwartz, Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

Professor Nicholas Temperley, University of Illinois, USA

#### © Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrival system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by

Ashgate Publishing Limited Ashgate Publishing Company

Gower House Suite 420

Croft Road 101 Cherry Street

Aldershot Burlington, VT 05401–4405

Hants GU11 3HR USA

England

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A.F. Leighton-Thomas.

Ashgate website: http://www.ashgate.com

ISSN: 1479-4098

Typeset by IML Typographers, Birkenhead, Merseyside

Printed by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

## Contents

### Volume 4, Issue 1

Notes on Article Contributors	ix	
Articles		
Brian Alegant and Don McLean On the Nature of Structural Framing	3	
Anastasia Siopsi Theorizing 'Death': The Meaning of Negation as a Hegelian Inheritance in Richard Wagner's <i>Musik als Idee</i>	31	
Marian Wilson Kimber Victorian Fairies and Felix Mendelssohn's <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> in England	53	
Thomas Muir 'Old Wine in New Bottles': Renaissance Polyphony in the English Catholic Church during the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries	81	
Donald C. Seibert  The Enchantress and Problems of Pacing in the Operas of Tchaikovsky:  An Informal Interview with David Lloyd-Jones	103	
Reviews		
Review Article		
Byron Adams Elgar Studies	121	
Book Reviews		
Marianne Betz  The Cambridge Companion to the String Quartet edited by Robin Stowell	131	
Ryan Ebright  Making Words Sing: Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Song by Jonathan Dunsby	133	
Helen Julia Minors  Musical Encounters at the 1889 Paris World's Fair by Annegret Fauser	135	
Patricia Puckett  Landscape and Gender in Italian Opera: The Alpine Virgin from Bellini to Puccini by Emanuele Senici	139	
Books Received	142	

### CD Reviews

William A. Everett	
York Bowen: Viola Concerto in C minor op. 25; Cecil Forsyth: Viola Concerto in G minor. Lawrence Power <i>va</i> , BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra, Martyn Brabbins <i>cond</i>	143
Margaret Notley Brahms: Cello Sonata No. 1 in E minor op. 38, Cello Sonata No. 2 in F major op. 99; Dvořák: Waldesruhe op. 68, no. 5, Rondo in G minor op. 94; Suk: Ballade in D minor op. 3, no. 1, Serenade in A major op. 3, no. 2. Steven Isserlis <i>vc</i> , Stephen Hough <i>pf</i>	146
Julian Horton Bruckner: String Quintet in F major*, String Quartet in C minor. Leipzig String Quartet, Andreas Seidel $vn$ , Tilman Büning $vn$ , Ivo Bauer $va$ , Matthias Moosdorf $vc$ , with Hartmut Rohde $va$	149
Lois Fitch Busoni: Lustspiel-Ouvertüre for Orchestra op. 38, Indianische Fantasie for Piano and Orchestra op. 44, Gesang vom Reigen der Geister op. 47, Die Brautwahl op. 45. Nelson Goerner pf, BBC Philharmonic Orchestra, Neeme Järvi cond	153
Stephen Downes Karłowicz: Returning Waves op. 9, A Sorrowful Tale op. 13, Episode at a Masquerade op. 14. BBC Philharmonic Orchestra, Gianandrea Noseda <i>cond</i>	157
Alexandra Wilson Puccini: La Bohème, sung in German (Munich 1951). Trude Eipperle (Mimi), Karl Terkal (Rodolfo), Wilma Lipp (Musetta), Alfred Poell (Marcello), Karl Hoppe (Schaunard), Hans-Hermann Nissen (Colline), Choir and Orchestra of the Bavarian Radio, Clemens Krauss cond	161
Michael Spitzer Rimsky-Korsakov: Four Operas: <i>The Snow Maiden*</i> – Fairy-tale Opera in a Prologue and Four Acts, <i>The Golden Cockerel</i> – Fairy-tale Opera in Three Acts#, <i>The May Night</i> – Opera in Three Acts¶, <i>Boyarinya Vera Sheloga*</i> – Opera in One Act*. Bulgarian Radio Symphony Orchestra*, Stoyan Angelov <i>cond</i> , Kölner Rundfunk-Sinfonie-Orchester¶, Alexander Lazarew <i>cond</i> , Sofia National Opera Orchestra#, Dimiter Manolov <i>cond</i>	164
CDs Received	167
Score Reviews	
Lars Franke Hermann Goetz, <i>Der Widerspänstigen Zähmung</i> , Study Score	168
Peter Franklin Franz Schreker, <i>Lieder</i> (Gesang und Klavier) with an introduction and editorial notes by Christopher Hailey	175

Contents	vii
Stephan D. Lindeman Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy, <i>Concerto in E minor for Violin and Orchestra, op. 64, 1844/1845</i> , edited by R. Larry Todd	177
Lisa Feurzeig Franz Schubert, <i>Lieder</i> , vol. 1, edited by Walther Dürr	179
Scores Received	183
Guidelines for Contributors	185