

Book Reviews

starting-point for teaching the history of medicine today. The translator is to be thanked for having made available such a precise and excellent rendering.

Christopher Lawrence
Wellcome Museum at the Science Museum

DAVID HAMILTON, *The healers. A history of medicine in Scotland*, Edinburgh, Canongate, 1981, 8vo, pp. xiii, 318, £12.95.

Most historians of medicine are aware of the contribution made by Scotland to medical progress from the rise of the Edinburgh medical school in the early eighteenth century to the present day, but fewer know of the process by which a small, poor, and relatively backward country by late seventeenth-century European standards could come from the rear of the pack and take over the lead in medicine for almost a century. The situation raises certain important questions for medical historians. Was this, for example, the result of a slow gestation over several centuries or a response to a set of circumstances unique to the early eighteenth century? A broad-based medical curriculum having been established, in which clinical teaching and instruction in anatomy played an important part, what effect did this have on the medical profession in Scotland's larger and more politically powerful partner, England? Conversely, what effect did Westminster-based politics have in shaping medical developments in Scotland? Given the importance of Scotland in medical history, it is surprising that until the publication of David Hamilton's book *The healers*, no short account of Scottish medicine from the early Middle Ages to the present day had been written. The present book goes a long way towards filling this gap in Scottish medical historiography. Of course Comrie's great two-volume *History of Scottish medicine* remains an invaluable reference guide, but Hamilton's book complements Comrie, being designed to fill a different niche and to give a concise, generalized view unobscured by too much detail, providing answers to the type of questions posed above.

Attractively presented, the book aims at being sufficiently readable to catch the interest of the non-specialist, while remaining a serious and scholarly account of the subject, a difficult task which for the most part the author manages to achieve very well. More than this, he makes a real attempt at relating developments in medicine to other social, economic, and even political events in Scotland at each period examined, never losing sight of the society which gave rise to the various medical factors he discusses. After a brief glance at pre-Christian Scotland, the book covers the period from the Dark Ages to the reorganization of the National Health Service in the mid-1970s, a time-span of around 1,500 years. To cope with this time-span and with the complexities of the topic, certain recurrent themes are used to hold the text together, for example, studies in each period of the main infectious diseases afflicting the population – leprosy, plague, cholera, and others – and the methods used to control them; the standard of medical service provided to pauper and to well-to-do; and the work performed by the different categories of medical practitioner. The author's interpretation of who could be regarded as a "healer" is unusual and includes not only the more orthodox men of medicine – physician, surgeon, and apothecary – but many who today would not be regarded as such, including local landowners, ministers of religion, quacks, and in the nineteenth century purveyors of patent medicines. This is an important reminder that for most of the period covered, the majority of Scotland's population obtained medical aid from a variety of sources including folk cures, healing wells, and magic. These early chapters give a very thorough account of Scottish medicine to the dawn of the Scottish Enlightenment, although the author's knowledge of medieval history sometimes appears shaky and he is too ready to fall back on famine and warfare as an explanation of the spread of epidemic disease, failing to face up to the fact that visitations of pestilence came and went in European societies often with little reference to prevailing conditions. The greater part of the book is devoted to the period from the rise of the Edinburgh medical school in the early eighteenth century to the present day. His account here is masterful and unusual in concentrating on more general aspects of medical history rather than on the peaks of achievement or on personalities. There is a useful analysis of the origins of Scotland's sudden rise to medical eminence, the impact this was to have on the English medical scene, the subsequent battle between the Scottish and English medical

Book Reviews

establishments for recognition of Scottish degrees, and the slow decline of the Scottish, clinically-based medical curriculum as its laboratory-based German counterpart rose to displace it in popularity. The final chapter on the twentieth century gives a valuable account of the development of state medicine in Scotland, including a section on the Highlands and Islands Medical Service, and the smooth introduction of the National Health Service from 1948.

The book has its faults. Hamilton seems happier when recounting the cut and thrust of medical politics and is less convincing on public health and poor law medical aid, where more detailed research might have been an advantage. A surprising omission is the cottage hospital movement which brought in-patient care to most rural communities in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. There is only a very cursory account of improvements in the care of the mentally sick, in which Scotland played an important part in the nineteenth century. In the pre-eighteenth-century chapters, the author fails to relate changes taking place in Scotland to the rest of the British Isles or to place Scotland in the perspective of Europe as a whole. In spite of these criticisms, the work is essential reading for all those wishing to understand major trends in British medicine to the present day and is likely to remain the standard short work on Scottish medical history for some time to come.

Stephanie Blackden
Wellcome Fellow in the History of Medicine
Edinburgh University

Volume commemorating the 75th anniversary of G. A. Lindeboom, Amsterdam, Medisch Encyclopaedisch Instituut, 1980, 8vo, pp. viii, 219, illus., Dfl. 30.00 (paperback).

It is appropriate that Professor Lindeboom's pre-eminent stature as the leader of the study of medical history in the Netherlands should be celebrated by not one but two volumes of *Festschriften*. His seventieth birthday was greeted with the volume *Circa Tiliam*, and now his seventy-fifth birthday by this republication of seventeen articles dedicated to him, and first issued in *Janus* 1980.

Perhaps Professor Lindeboom's greatest achievement is his major biography of Herman Boerhaave in 1968, together with further volumes of studies on him; and the British reader is particularly grateful that these works were written in English. But, as the continuation of the listing of his published works here reveals, it would be a mistake to suggest that Lindeboom's scholarly activity has been limited to Boerhaave studies.

Most of those who have paid tribute to him in the present volume have offered articles (in English and German) in Lindeboom's own special period, the eighteenth century, and his own special area, medicine in the Netherlands. Outstanding amongst these is one by Antonie Luyendijk-Elshout of Leiden entitled 'Samuel Musgrave's attack upon Stahl's and Boerhaave's doctrines in 1763'. The title is self-explanatory, but it belies the excitement of the contents; exemplary in approach and presentation, this paper is to be highly recommended. Richard Toellner of Münster, also taking a biographical theme, offers a very good study of Haller's early visit to England (1727), and the effect on him of the English adoration of Newton and of science. Similarly noteworthy is H. A. M. Snelders's piece on 'Lambertus Bicker (1732–1801): an early adherent of Lavoisier in the Netherlands'.

The contributions in German are more of a mixed bag. Professor Rothschild writes on the self-evident value of medical history, producing a diagram which comfortingly shows how medical history surrounds and embraces all other medical studies. D. A. Wittop Koning makes a reconstruction of the matriculation list of Harderwijk, and brings to our attention the existence of a composite listing of all the disputations, orations, and doctoral theses of the Dutch universities, drawn up by Professor van der Woude at Amsterdam. Marielene Putscher offers a consideration of Karl Jasper's view of Van Gogh as a schizophrenic, which she has subtitled 'illness and art' (*Krankheit und Kunst*).

But finally, let me take issue with one of the authors. Professor Leibowitz here contributes to a familiar tradition of attempting the impossible: retrospective diagnosis, this time of Lessing's final illness. As Leibowitz himself tells us, the contemporary postmortem report stressed a