October 2010 Volume 125 Number 4

P

Special Topic
Literary Criticism for the
Twenty-First Century



October 2010 Volume 125 Number 4



Publications of the Modern Language Association of America

Published five times a year by the association

THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

Organized 1883, Incorporated 1900

Officers for the Term Ending 9 January 2011

President: SIDONIE SMITH
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor
First Vice President: RUSSELL A. BERMAN
Stanford University
Second Vice President: MICHAEL BÉRUBÉ
Pennsylvania State University, University Park
Executive Director: ROSEMARY G. FEAL

Executive Council

FOR THE TERM ENDING 9 JANUARY 2011

CARLOS J. ALONSO Columbia University

JANE HARPER

Tarrant County College, Northeast Campus, TX FRANCIS ABIOLA IRELE Harvard University

FOR THE TERM ENDING 8 JANUARY 2012

SARA SCOTT ARMENGOT Rochester Institute of Technology GEORGE LEVINE Rutgers University, New Brunswick LYNNE TATLOCK Washington University

ALEXANDRA K. WETTLAUFER University of Texas, Austin

FOR THE TERM ENDING 6 JANUARY 2013

JENNIFER CREWE
Columbia University Press
KARIN C. RYDING
Georgetown University
KATHLEEN WOODWARD
University of Washington, Seattle

FOR THE TERM ENDING 12 JANUARY 2014

LAWRENCE I. BUELL
Harvard University
DOROTHEA HEITSCH
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill
RICHARD M. OHMANN
Wesleyan University
JONATHAN ARAC
University of Pittsburgh

Trustees of Invested Funds

Herbert Lindenberger San Francisco, California MALCOLM B. SMITH (Managing Trustee) New York, New York CATHARINE R. STIMPSON New York, New York PMLA (ISSN 0030-8129) is published five times a year, in January, March, May, October, and November, by the Modern Language Association of America. Membership in the association is open to persons who are professionally interested in the modern languages and literatures. Annual (calendar-year) dues, which include subscription to PMLA, are \$20 for graduate student members (up to a maximum of seven years) and for regular members are based on income: income under \$15,000, \$25; income \$15,000-\$20,000, \$40; income \$20,000-\$30,000, \$50; income \$30,000-\$40,000, \$70; income \$40,000-\$50,000, \$85; income \$50,000-\$70; income \$40,000-\$70,000, \$115; income \$70,000-\$80,000, \$130; income \$80,000-\$100; oncome \$100,000-\$120,000, \$15; income \$120,000-\$140,000, \$185; income \$140,000-\$160,000, \$255; income \$160,000-\$180,000-\$180,000, \$255; income over \$200,000, \$280. Joint membership, which provides one copy of the January, March, May, and October issues of PMLA but two copies of all other publications, is available to two individuals sharing the same household. The dues for a joint membership are \$40 above the dues that would be paid by the higher-income member alone. Foreign members pay the same as regular members (use the American-dollar equivalent to ascertain the dues category). Membership applications are available on request and at the MLA Web site (www.mla.org).

For libraries and other institutions, a subscription in 2011 to the electronic format alone is \$180 and to the print and electronic formats is \$200 (domestic and Canadian) or \$225 (foreign). Subscriptions include the annual volume of *Profession*, the MLA's journal of opinion about the modern language profession, in the same medium or media as *PMLA*. They also include online access to the 2002–10 volumes of both journals. For an additional \$170, institutional subscribers receive a clothbound edition of the 2011 volume of *PMLA*. Agents deduct four percent as their fee. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within six months of the publication date; thereafter the single-issue price will be charged. To order an institutional subscription, call or write the Member and Customer Services Office of the association (646 576-5166; subscrip@mla.org).

Single copies of the January, March, May, and October issues can be purchased for \$12 each; the November (Program) issue is \$35. Issues for the current year are available from the Member and Customer Services Office of the association (646 576-5161; bookorders@mla.org).

An online archive of *PMLA* issues from 1884 to 2004 is available through *JSTOR* (www.jstor.org). Volumes up to 2000 can be obtained on microfilm from NA Publishing, Inc., 4750 Venture Drive, Suite 400, PO Box 998, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-0998 (800 420-6272; www.napubco.com/umi.html).

The office of publication and editorial offices are located at 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789 (646 576-5000; pmlasubmissions@mla.org).

All communications concerning membership, including change-of-address notifications, should be sent to the Member and Customer Services Office, MLA, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789 (646 576-5151; membership@mla.org). If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation or a new e-mail address, that office should be informed of this fact at the same time.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

© 2010 by The Modern Language Association of America. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

MLA and the MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION are trademarks owned by the Modern Language Association of America.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040. United States Postal Service Number 449-660. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *PMLA*, Member and Customer Services Office, MLA, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789.

Contents

OCTOBER 2010

901 A Statement of Editorial Polic	y
------------------------------------	---

902 Forthcoming in PMLA

902 Features in PMLA

Special Topic: Literary Criticism for the Twenty-First Century Coordinated by Cathy Caruth and Jonathan Culler

905 Introduction: Critical Paradigms
JONATHAN CULLER

Thinking the Future

correspondents at large

916 Return to the Political JEAN-JACQUES LECERCLE

920 The Future of Literary Criticism
RICHARD KLEIN

924 Narratology in the Twenty-First Century: The Cognitive Approach to Narrative

Monika Fludernik

931 For a Poetics of Verse SIMON JARVIS

936 Haunted (by the) Gospel: Theology, Trauma, and Literary Theory in the Twenty-First Century
SHELLY RAMBO

942 "Just Want to Say": Performance and Literature, Jackson and Poirier
PEGGY PHELAN

New Archives, New Aesthetics: Talks from the Convention

948 Our Aesthetic Categories SIANNE NGAI

959 The Future of the Literary Past
Meredith L. McGill and Andrew Parker

968 Adapting to the Image and Resisting It: On Filming Literature and a Possible World for Literary Studies

Ian Balfour

Translations: Life, Language, Alterity

criticism in translation

977 Literature as Knowledge for Living, Literary Studies as Science for Living
OTTMAR ETTE

EDITED, TRANSLATED, AND WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY VERA M. KUTZINSKI

PUBLICATIONS OF THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

Published five times a year

VOLUMES ONLINE

VOLS. 1–119 (1884–2004), JSTOR VOLS. 117–25 (2002–10), MLAJournals.org

Online Index

Vols. 1–125 (1884–2010) MLA International Bibliography

PRINT INDEXES

Vols. 1-50, 1935; 51-60, 1945; 51-79, 1964

Editor

PATRICIA YAEGER

University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

Managing Editor
JUDY GOULDING

Associate Managing Editor ERIC WIRTH

Assistant Editors John D. Golbach, Vivian Kirklin, Barney Latimer

Advertising Manager and Submissions Associate
Annabel Schneider

Administrative Assistant ANGEL M. BUTTS

Editorial Board

NANCY BENTLEY, 2012
University of Pennsylvania
ROBERT L. CASERIO, 2011
Pennsylvania State University, University Park
JEAN E. HOWARD, 2012
Columbia University
KATHARINE ANN JENSEN, 2012
Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge
LUTZ KOEPNICK, 2011
Washington University
AGNES LUGO-ORTIZ, 2011
University of Chicago

Advisory Committee

RITA BARNARD, 2012 University of Pennsylvania JAMES P. BEDNARZ, 2012 Long Island University, C. W. Post Campus JANET BEIZER, 2012 Harvard University DON H. BIALOSTOSKY, 2011 University of Pittsburgh JOHN BISHOP, 2011 University of California, Berkeley CÉSAR BRAGA-PINTO, 2013 Rutgers University, New Brunswick STEPHEN BURT, 2012 Harvard University GLENDA R. CARPIO, 2012 Harvard University JANE CHANCE, 2012 Rice University MYRIAM J. A. CHANCY, 2012

Myriam J. A. Chancy, 2012 University of Cincinnati (continued)

Advisory Committee (continued)

CATHERINE CIEPIELA, 2013
Amherst College
STUART DAY, 2012
University of Kansas
GAURAV DESAI, 2011
Tulane University

ELIZABETH MADDOCK DILLON, 2013 Northeastern University

ROBERT RICHMOND ELLIS, 2011 Occidental College

> Joseph Entin, 2013 Brooklyn College Matt Erlin, 2013 Washington University Joseph Francese, 2013

Michigan State University María Antonia Garcés, 2011 Cornell University

Aníbal González-Pérez, 2011 Middlebury College

David J. Gorman, 2012 Northern Illinois University

Marshall Grossman, 2011 University of Maryland, College Park EDWARD M. GUNN, 2012

Cornell University
PAUL HOPPER, 2013
Carnegie Mellon University

CHRISTOPH IRMSCHER, 2013 Indiana University, Bloomington

JACQUELINE LABBE, 2012 University of Warwick

BARBARA LADD, 2011 Emory University

DEVONEY LOOSER, 2013
University of Missouri, Columbia
DEBORAH LEA MADSEN, 2012

DEBORAH LEA MADSEN, 2013 University of Geneva

Kristine Miller, 2012 Utah State University JEFFREY T. NEALON, 2013

JEFFREY T. NEALON, 2013 Pennsylvania State University, University Park

Margaret Noori, 2011 University of Michigan, Ann Arbor Gabriela Nouzeilles, 2011

Princeton University DAVID PAN, 2013 University of California, Irvine

PAULA RABINOWITZ, 2013 University of Minnesota, Twin Cities

MASOOD A. RAJA, 2012 University of North Texas KRISTA RATCLIFFE, 2011

Marquette University

JOHN PAUL RIQUELME, 2011 Boston University SYLVIE ROMANOWSKI, 2011

Northwestern University
LAWRENCE R. SCHEHR, 2011

University of Illinois, Urbana GORDON TESKEY, 2011

Harvard University CYNTHIA WALL, 2012 University of Virginia

CAROLYN S. WILLIAMS, 2013 Rutgers University, New Brunswick LYNDA ZWINGER, 2012

University of Arizona, Tucson

OCTOBER 2010

correspondents at large

994 From "95 Theses on Philology"
WERNER HAMACHER

criticism in translation

1002 The Language of the Other: Testimonial Exercises

Abdelkébir Khatibi

Introduction by David Fieni. Translation by Catherine Porter

Interview

theories and methodologies

1020 Interview with Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak
CATHY CARUTH

Literary History, Literary Revision, Literary Performance

1026 "What Is a Classic?": International Literary Criticism and the Classic Question

Ankhi Mukherjee

Rewriting *Moby-Dick*: Politics, Textual Identity, and the Revision Narrative

IOHN BRYANT

1061 Lafayette's Impossible Princess: On (Not) Making Literary History

NICHOLAS PAIGE

the changing profession

1078 Performance: The Blunders of Orpheus JOSEPH ROACH

1087 Afterword: Turning Back to Literature
Cathy Caruth

1096 Forum

Yves Bonnefoy, Warren Hoffman, Nicholas A. Theisen, and Nan Watkins

1101 Minutes of the MLA Executive Council

1112 In Memoriam

1114 Index of Advertisers

1118 Index of Authors Advertised

1148 Abstracts

1150 Contents of Volume 125 (2010)