



# A Locally Compact Non Divisible Abelian Group Whose Character Group Is Torsion Free and Divisible

Daniel V. Tausk

*Abstract.* It was claimed by Halmos in 1944 that if  $G$  is a Hausdorff locally compact topological abelian group and if the character group of  $G$  is torsion free, then  $G$  is divisible. We prove that such a claim is false by presenting a family of counterexamples. While other counterexamples are known, we also present a family of stronger counterexamples, showing that even if one assumes that the character group of  $G$  is both torsion free and divisible, it does not follow that  $G$  is divisible.

## 1 Introduction

Let  $G$  be an abelian group<sup>1</sup>. Given an integer  $n$ , we consider the subgroups of  $G$  defined by

$$nG = \{nx : x \in G\}, \quad G[n] = \{x \in G : nx = 0\}.$$

If  $G$  is an abelian topological group, then its *character group*  $\widehat{G}$  is the abelian group of all continuous homomorphisms  $\xi : G \rightarrow S^1$ , where  $S^1$  is the (multiplicative) circle group of unitary complex numbers; the group  $\widehat{G}$  is endowed with the compact-open topology. The celebrated *Pontryagin duality theorem* (see, for instance, [7]) states that if  $G$  is a Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological group, then its character group  $\widehat{G}$  is a Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological group as well and the character group of  $\widehat{G}$  is  $G$  itself; more precisely, the map that associates each  $x \in G$  with the evaluation map  $\widehat{G} \ni \xi \mapsto \xi(x) \in S^1$  is a homeomorphic isomorphism between  $G$  and the character group of  $\widehat{G}$ .

If  $H$  is a subgroup of  $G$ , then the *annihilator* of  $H$  is the subgroup  $\text{ann}(H)$  of  $\widehat{G}$  consisting of all characters  $\xi : G \rightarrow S^1$  that are trivial over  $H$ . Clearly, given an integer  $n$ ,

$$\text{ann}(nG) = \widehat{G}[n].$$

In particular, if  $G$  is divisible, *i.e.*, if  $nG = G$  for every nonzero integer  $n$ , then its character group  $\widehat{G}$  is torsion free, *i.e.*,  $\widehat{G}[n]$  is trivial for every nonzero integer  $n$ . It was claimed by Halmos [5] that the converse is true if  $G$  is Hausdorff locally compact. The argument presented in [5] has a gap: if  $\widehat{G}$  is torsion free, then  $\text{ann}(nG)$  is trivial for every nonzero integer  $n$ , but that, in principle, implies only that  $nG$  is dense<sup>2</sup> in

Received by the editors March 3, 2010; revised January 9, 2011.

Published electronically July 9, 2011.

AMS subject classification: 22B05.

<sup>1</sup> Except for the circle group  $S^1$ , abelian groups will be written additively.

<sup>2</sup> If  $\text{ann}(nG)$  is trivial, then  $nG$  is indeed dense in  $G$ . Otherwise, Pontryagin duality would give us a nontrivial character on the (nontrivial) quotient of  $G$  by the closure of  $nG$  and such nontrivial character would correspond to a nontrivial element of  $\text{ann}(nG)$ .

$G$ , not that  $nG = G$ . It should be observed, however, that the claim made by Halmos is true if  $G$  is either compact or discrete, and that the proof of his main result is not affected by the incorrect claim.

In Section 3, we will present a family of examples of Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological groups  $G$  such that  $nG$  is dense in  $G$  for every nonzero integer  $n$ , but such that  $nG \neq G$  for some nonzero integer  $n$ . In particular, any such group  $G$  is an example of a Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological group that is not divisible, but whose character group is torsion free. While other examples of that phenomenon are known (see [1, 4.16]), in Section 4 we will also present a family of examples of Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological groups  $G$  that are *both* divisible and torsion free, but such that  $\widehat{G}$  is (torsion free but) not divisible. In particular, by Pontryagin duality, it follows that  $\widehat{G}$  is a Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological group whose character group (which is isomorphic to  $G$ ) is *both* divisible and torsion free, but still  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible.

## 2 Extending the Topology of a Subgroup

Let us start by presenting a general construction of a topology on an abelian group from a topology on a given subgroup (the construction is well known; see, for instance, [2–4]). Let  $G$  be an abelian group and  $H$  be a subgroup of  $G$ . Assume that  $H$  is endowed with a topology that makes it into a topological group. We claim that there exists a unique topology on  $G$  such that

- (i)  $G$  is a topological group;
- (ii) the given topology of  $H$  is inherited from  $G$ ;
- (iii)  $H$  is open in  $G$ .

Such a topology is constructed as follows. Given  $g \in G$ , the coset  $g + H$  of  $H$  can be endowed with a topology by requiring that the translation map

$$L_g : H \ni x \mapsto g + x \in g + H$$

be a homeomorphism. The fact that the translation maps of  $H$  are homeomorphisms of  $H$  implies that the topology defined on the coset  $g + H$  does not depend on the representative  $g$  of the coset. We topologize  $G$  by making it the topological sum of the cosets  $g + H$ ,  $g \in G$ . That is, we say that  $U$  is open in  $G$  if  $U \cap (g + H)$  is open in  $g + H$  for every  $g \in G$ . One readily checks that such a topology is the only topology on  $G$  satisfying (i), (ii), and (iii). Notice that since the cosets of  $H$  are all homeomorphic to  $H$  and open in  $G$ , it follows that if  $H$  is Hausdorff, then so is  $G$ . Moreover, since every compact neighborhood of the neutral element in  $H$  is also a compact neighborhood of the neutral element in  $G$ , it follows that  $G$  is locally compact if  $H$  is locally compact.

## 3 The First Family of Counterexamples

Let  $A$  be a Hausdorff compact abelian topological group that is not divisible, and let  $B$  be a divisible abelian group such that  $A$  is a subgroup of  $B$  (for instance, let  $B = S^1$  and  $A$  be a nontrivial finite subgroup of  $S^1$  endowed with the discrete topology).

Let  $B^\omega$  denote the group of all sequences  $(x_k)_{k \in \omega}$  of elements of  $B$  and let  $G$  denote the subgroup of  $B^\omega$  consisting of those sequences  $(x_k)_{k \in \omega}$  such that  $x_k$  is in  $A$  for  $k$  sufficiently large. Let  $H = A^\omega$  denote the subgroup of  $G$  consisting of sequences in  $A$ . We endow  $H$  with the product topology and  $G$  with the unique topology satisfying (i), (ii), and (iii) of Section 2. Then  $H$  is a Hausdorff compact topological group and thus  $G$  is a Hausdorff locally compact topological group. If  $n$  is a nonzero integer, then the subgroup  $nG$  of  $G$  consists of those sequences  $(x_k)_{k \in \omega}$  such that  $x_k$  is in  $nA$  for  $k$  sufficiently large. If  $n_0$  is a nonzero integer such that  $n_0A \neq A$ , then  $n_0G \neq G$  and therefore  $G$  is not divisible. We will show that if  $n$  is a nonzero integer, then  $nG$  is dense in  $G$  and from this it will follow from the discussion in the introduction that the character group  $\widehat{G}$  is torsion free. Let  $J$  denote the subgroup of  $G$  consisting of sequences  $(x_k)_{k \in \omega}$  in  $B$  that are trivial for  $k$  sufficiently large. Since  $J$  is obviously contained in  $nG$  for any nonzero integer  $n$ , it suffices to prove that  $J$  is dense in  $G$  in order to establish that  $nG$  is dense in  $G$  for every nonzero integer  $n$ . Clearly,  $G = H + J$ , so that  $J$  intersects every coset of  $H$ . Now let us prove that  $J$  is dense in  $G$  by proving that  $J \cap (x + H)$  is dense in  $x + H$  for every coset  $x + H$  of  $H$  in  $G$ . Since the coset  $x + H$  intersects  $J$ , we can assume that  $x \in J$ . Thus, the translation map  $L_x: H \rightarrow x + H$  is a homeomorphism that carries  $J \cap H$  to  $J \cap (x + H)$ . From the definition of the product topology, it is obvious that  $J \cap H$  is dense in  $H$  and therefore  $J \cap (x + H)$  is dense in  $x + H$ . This concludes the proof that the subgroup  $J$  is dense in  $G$ .

#### 4 The Family of Stronger Counterexamples

We will now present an example of a Hausdorff locally compact abelian topological group  $G$  that is both divisible and torsion free, but such that its character group  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible. We need some preliminary lemmas.

**Lemma 1** *Let  $G$  be an abelian divisible topological group. If there exists an open subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ , a nonzero integer  $n$ , and a discontinuous homomorphism  $\phi: H \rightarrow S^1$  that is trivial over  $nH$ , then the character group  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible.*

**Proof** Since  $S^1$  is divisible,  $\phi$  extends to a (obviously discontinuous) homomorphism  $\phi': G \rightarrow S^1$ . Consider the homomorphism  $\xi: G \rightarrow S^1$  defined by  $\xi(x) = \phi'(nx)$ , for all  $x \in G$ . Then  $\xi$  is trivial over  $H$  and, since  $H$  is open,  $\xi$  is continuous. Assuming by contradiction that  $\widehat{G}$  is divisible, we can find a continuous homomorphism  $\alpha: G \rightarrow S^1$  such that  $\alpha(x)^n = \alpha(nx) = \xi(x)$  for all  $x \in G$ . Then  $\alpha$  and  $\phi'$  are equal over  $nG$  and since  $G$  is divisible, we obtain that  $\alpha = \phi'$ , contradicting the continuity of  $\alpha$ . ■

**Lemma 2** *Let  $K$  be an abelian group endowed with a topology<sup>3</sup>. If  $K$  admits a proper dense subgroup  $D$ , then there exists a discontinuous homomorphism from  $K$  to  $S^1$ .*

**Proof** Since  $K/D$  is a nontrivial abelian group, there exists a nontrivial homomorphism  $\phi: K/D \rightarrow S^1$  (start with a nontrivial  $S^1$ -valued homomorphism defined over

<sup>3</sup>It is not necessary that  $K$  be a topological group, i.e., the continuity of the operations of  $K$  is not used in the proof.

a nontrivial cyclic subgroup of  $K/D$  and then extend it to all of  $K/D$  using the fact that  $S^1$  is divisible). The composition of  $\phi$  with the quotient map  $K \rightarrow K/D$  is a nontrivial homomorphism that is trivial over  $D$ , and therefore it must be discontinuous. ■

**Corollary 3** *Let  $G$  be an abelian divisible topological group. If there exists an open subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  and a nonzero integer  $n$  such that  $H/nH$  (endowed with the quotient topology) has a proper dense subgroup, then the character group  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible.*

**Proof** By Lemma 2, there exists a discontinuous  $S^1$ -valued homomorphism over  $H/nH$ ; its composition with the quotient map  $H \rightarrow H/nH$  is a discontinuous  $S^1$ -valued homomorphism over  $H$  that is trivial over  $nH$ . The conclusion follows from Lemma 1. ■

The construction of our family of stronger counterexamples goes as follows. Let  $A$  be a Hausdorff compact abelian non divisible topological group and let  $B$  be a torsion free divisible abelian group such that  $A$  is a subgroup of  $B$ . A concrete example of groups  $A, B$  satisfying the required conditions will be supplied at the end of the section. Let  $H = A^\omega$  denote the group of all sequences in  $A$  endowed with the product topology, and let  $G = B^\omega$  be the group of all sequences in  $B$ , endowed with the unique topology satisfying (i), (ii), and (iii) of Section 2. The group  $H$  is Hausdorff compact and thus  $G$  is Hausdorff locally compact; moreover, like  $B$ , the group  $G$  is both divisible and torsion free. We use Corollary 3 to establish that the character group  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible. Let  $n$  be a nonzero integer such that  $nA \neq A$ . We claim that if  $H/nH$  is endowed with the quotient topology, then it has a proper dense subgroup. First, we check that the quotient topology of  $H/nH$  coincides with the product topology of  $(A/nA)^\omega$ , each factor  $A/nA$  being endowed with the quotient topology. Namely, if  $A/nA$  is endowed with the quotient topology, then the quotient map  $A \rightarrow A/nA$  is continuous, open, and surjective; therefore, if  $H/nH \cong (A/nA)^\omega$  is endowed with the product topology, then the quotient map  $H \rightarrow H/nH$  is also continuous, open, and surjective and therefore it is a topological quotient map. This observation proves that the product topology of  $(A/nA)^\omega$  coincides with the quotient topology of  $H/nH$ . Now it follows directly from the definition of the product topology that the subgroup of  $H/nH \cong (A/nA)^\omega$  consisting of sequences  $(x_k)_{k \in \omega}$  that are trivial for  $k$  sufficiently large is a (proper) dense subgroup. This concludes the proof that  $\widehat{G}$  is not divisible.

Finally, let us present a concrete example of groups  $A, B$  satisfying the required conditions. Let  $A$  be the group of  $p$ -adic integers (where  $p$  is some fixed prime number) and  $B$  be the  $p$ -adic field. We have  $pA \neq A$ , so that  $A$  is not divisible; moreover,  $B$  is a field of characteristic zero, so that it is both torsion free and divisible as an abelian group. The fact that  $A$  can be made into a Hausdorff compact topological group follows from the observation that  $A$  is (isomorphic to) the character group of the discrete  $p$ -quasicyclic group  $\mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  of elements of  $S^1$  whose order is a power of  $p$  (see, for instance, [6, Proposition 3.1]) and that the character group of a discrete topological group is compact.

## References

- [1] D. L. Armacost, *The Structure of Locally Compact Abelian Groups*. Monographs and Textbooks in Pure and Applied Mathematics 68. Marcel Dekker, 1981.
- [2] B. Clark, M. Dooley, and V. Schneider, *Extending topologies from subgroups to groups*. *Topology Proc.* **10**(1985), no. 2, 251–257.
- [3] B. Clark and V. Schneider, *The extending topologies*. *Internat. J. Math. Math. Sci.* **7**(1984), no. 3, 621–623. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/S0161171284000673>
- [4] ———, *The normal extensions of subgroup topologies* *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **97**(1986), no. 1, 163–166. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1090/S0002-9939-1986-0831407-9>
- [5] P. R. Halmos, *Comment on the real line* *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* **50**(1944), 877–878. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1090/S0002-9904-1944-08255-4>
- [6] D. K. Harrison, *Infinite abelian groups and homological methods*. *Ann. of Math.* **69**(1959), 366–391. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1970188>
- [7] S. A. Morris, *Pontryagin duality and the structure of locally compact abelian groups*. London Mathematical Society Lecture Note Series 29. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1977.

*Departamento de Matemática, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil*  
*e-mail:* tausk@ime.usp.br