Correspondence


Salmonella enterica serovar Typhi and S. Paratyphi A: need to expand the QRDR region?

To the Editor:

In the article entitled ‘Molecular analysis of high-level ciprofloxacin resistance in Salmonella enterica serovar Typhi and S. Paratyphi A: need to expand the QRDR region?’ by Capoor and co-workers [1], the authors have described new substitutions in DNA gyrase subunit, GyrA. DNA gyrase (topoisomerase II) is a multimeric enzyme composed of two pairs of subunits, Gyr A (878 residues) and GyrB, and the enzyme is inhibited by quinolones, like nalidixic acid, and fluoroquinolones, such as ciprofloxacin [2]. Resistance to nalidixic acid is often mediated by substitutions in position Ser\(^{83}\) or Asp\(^{87}\) of GyrA while resistance to both nalidixic acid and ciprofloxacin frequently is the result of substitutions in both positions [3, 4]. The positions 83 and 87 are parts of the so-called quinolone resistance-determining region (QRDR) which has been defined by Yoshida and co-workers to cover the region between position 67 and 106 of GyrA [5], but Capoor and colleagues have proposed a highly relevant expansion of QRDR [1].

They have also described new amino-acid replacements in GyrA which are Phe\(^{31}\)→Tyr, Leu\(^{44}\)→Ile, Phe\(^{72}\)→Tyr, Asp\(^{76}\)→Asn, Glu\(^{133}\)→Gly [1] as well as previously described substitutions, i.e. Met\(^{52}\)→Leu [6], Ser\(^{83}\)→Phe, and Asp\(^{97}\)→Asn [7, 8]. The Leu\(^{44}\)→Ile, Phe\(^{72}\)→Tyr, Asp\(^{76}\)→Asn substitutions have previously been described by Capoor and colleagues [6]. Consensus is that e.g. Phe\(^{31}\)→Tyr denotes a replacement of the predominant Phe residue in position 31 by a Tyr residue.

With a nucleotide sequence encompassing nt 76–480 from the gyrA gene of Salmonella Typhimurium strain 14028S [GenBank acc. no. CP001363] as query sequence we searched the nr/nt, refseq_genomic, chromosome, and wgs databases of the NCBI GenBank (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) for hits by Megablast with an expected threshold of \(10^{-4}\). We also used Salmonella (taxid: 590) as the optional organism. Subsequently, we searched the nucleotide database by using the words ‘gyrA AND Salmonella’ and got additional hits.

In total, we achieved 358 entries (last accessed on 8 June 2010) all from different strains of divergent serovars of Salmonella. Owing to very low identity to GyrA or too short sequences only covering 11 positions including positions 83 and 87, 26 of the entries were discarded.

The resulting 332 sequences were analysed to determine the nature of the residues in positions 31, 44, 72, and 76 of GyrA. All 332 sequences contained the positions 72 and 76, but owing to paucity of sequence, 237 sequences also included position 44, whereas only 94 sequences also covered position 31. Ultimo 2007, 162 partial or complete sequences of GyrA from Salmonella have been released in the GenBank databases.

Each of the 332 sequences was carefully analysed, and our results showed that position 31 was inevitably occupied by Gly, residue 44 by Val, residue 72 by Asp, and position 76 by Lys (Fig. 1). These results are different from those reported by Capoor and colleagues [1] as seen in Table 1. Amino-acid replacements were not found in any of these four positions among all the analysed Salmonella sequences.

Amino-acid substitutions in GyrA from Salmonella are occasionally related to the sequence of GyrA from Escherichia coli, therefore we also examined the equivalent sequences of GyrA from this species. Of the 163 E. coli available sequences in the GenBank databases, we found in all instances Gly\(^{31}\), Val\(^{44}\), Asp\(^{72}\), and Lys\(^{76}\).

The discrepancies between our results and those reported by Capoor and colleagues [1, 6] could be caused by different numbering of the residues because the precursor GyrA protein may be processed into a signal...
The precursor GyrA thus remains unprocessed. function of GyrA which takes place in the cytoplasm. These predictions are consistent with the known knowledge. GenBank entries documenting the replacements characterized by Capoor et al. have not been released.

The positions of the described Met→Leu, Ser→Phe, and Asp→Asn substitutions are compatible with the Salmonella GyrA sequences (see Fig. 1). The Ser→Phe and Asp→Asn substitutions have also been reported in several other publications [8, 9].

We do not dispute the nature of described substitutions by Capoor et al. [1], but we have justifiable reservations about their correct positions in the GyrA sequence. Our analyses of the available 332 GyrA sequences have unequivocally shown that Phe31, Leu44, Phe72, and Asp87 themselves are substitutions. Therefore, we consider the reported Phe31→Tyr, Leu44→Ile, Phe72→Tyr, and Asp87→Asn substitutions in GyrA as controversial and possibly incorrect.

In their article, Capoor et al. [1] have corroborated the Phe72→Tyr substitution by referring to an Asp72→Gly substitution in Salmonella Senftenberg described by Eaves et al. [8]. The latter substitution is consistent with a dominant Asp residue in position 72 of GyrA (Fig. 1).

Regarding the Glu133→Gly substitution [1], it is correct that Glu is the prevalent residue in position
133 of GyrA among the different serovars of Salmonella, apart from Salmonella Typhi. Position 133 in GyrA is covered by 315 of the obtained GyrA sequences from GenBank, and 214 of these sequences are from serovars other than Typhi. However, only two sequences (GenBank acc. nos. AY302581 and AY302582) among the 214 sequences carry a Glu\textsuperscript{133}→Gly substitution indicating that Glu\textsuperscript{133} is the dominant residue in GyrA from these serovars. In E. coli, Glu\textsuperscript{133} is also found in all sequences.

This picture is reversed in GyrA from S. Typhi because only four of the 101 sequences that cover position 133 hold a Glu\textsuperscript{133} residue (GenBank acc. nos. AY302585, AY302588, GU190905, EF176634) while the remaining 97 sequences contain Gly\textsuperscript{133}. These findings make it reasonable to assume that the genuine substitution in position 133 of GyrA from S. Typhi is in fact Gly\textsuperscript{133}→Glu and not Glu\textsuperscript{133}→Gly. Among the 162 Salmonella GyrA sequences available in the GenBank database Ultimo 2007, 90 sequences were from S. Typhi, and 87 of these contained a Gly\textsuperscript{133} residue while only three had a Glu\textsuperscript{133} residue.

Some of the amino-acid replacements reported by Capoor and colleagues [1] form the basis of their conclusion on an expansion of QRDR, but owing to the dubious positions of some of the described substitutions as shown in this letter, this conclusion may need a reassessment.

**DECLARATION OF INTEREST**

None.

**References**


**The authors reply**

We congratulate Drs Walther-Rasmussen and Høiby on their work. As regards our article, which was accepted for publication in 2008, our findings were the result of collaboration of a group from the National Institute of Communicable Diseases (NICD) in New Delhi and the Pasteur Institute in Lille.

It may be that the variation in our data may be due to regional differences in isolates. Our sequencing was undertaken during 2005 and 2006. We had hoped to be able to repeat the sequencing and retrieve the data. Unfortunately, this has not proved possible; the laboratory at the Pasteur Institute has closed and two co-authors from NICD have moved to other countries.

**Correspondence**

DEEPTHI NAIR AND MALINI R. CAPOOR
(on behalf of the authors)

Department of Medical Microbiology, VM Medical College and Safdarjung Hospital, New Delhi, India

(Email: deepthinair2@gmail.com)