

ONLINE DIGEST*

Chapter 15

Investor–State Arbitration and the Law of State Responsibility: Attribution, Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness and Reparation

<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>15.1 Attribution</i>	2
<i>15.2 Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness</i>	4
<i>15.3 Reparation</i>	6

Introduction

➤ Awards, decisions, judgments and opinions

- * *Masdar Solar & Wind Coöperatief U.A. v Kingdom of Spain* (ICSID Case No ARB/14/1) - Award (16 May 2018)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw9710.pdf>

➤ Other instruments and documents

- * Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts (2001)

Available at:

https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/draft_articles/9_6_2001.pdf

- * Draft articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, with Commentaries (2001)

Available at:

https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/commentaries/9_6_2001.pdf

* The textbook analyses a number of selected international investment agreements (IIAs), awards and other materials that illustrate the rules and practices of international investment law and arbitration as well as the nuances and differences that they display. To enable readers to use all these materials easily and swiftly and to have a holistic view of them, the on-line digest compiles them for each chapter and section; it also provides an internet link to access each of these materials.

15.1 Attribution

➤ Awards, decisions, judgments and opinions

- * *Ampal-American Israel Corporation, Egi-Fund (08-10) Investors LLC, Egi-Series Investments LLC, BSS-EMG Investors LLC and Mr David Fischer v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/12/11) - Decision on Liability and Heads of Loss (21 February 2017)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw8487.pdf>

- * *Bayindir Insaat Turizm Ticaret Ve Sanayi A.S. v Islamic Republic of Pakistan* (ICSID Case No ARB/03/29) - Award (27 August 2009)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0075.pdf>

- * *Bosh International Inc. and B & P Ltd Foreign Investments Enterprise v Ukraine* (ICSID Case No ARB/08/11) - Award (25 October 2012)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C380/DC2892_En.pdf

- * *Case Concerning Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro)*, Judgment of 26 February 2007

Available at:

<https://www.icj-cij.org/files/case-related/91/091-20070226-JUD-01-00-EN.pdf>

- * *Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v United States of America)* (Merits), Judgment of 27 June 1986

Available at:

<https://www.icj-cij.org/files/case-related/70/070-19860627-JUD-01-00-EN.pdf>

- * *Emilio Agustín Maffezini v Kingdom of Spain* (ICSID Case No ARB/97/7) - Decision of the Tribunal on Objections to Jurisdiction (25 January 2000)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C163/DC565_En.pdf

- * *Flemingo DutyFree Shop Private Limited v The Republic of Poland* (UNCITRAL) - Award (12 August 2016)

Available at:

https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7709_3.pdf

- * *Gustav F W Hamester GmbH & Co KG v Republic of Ghana* (ICSID Case No ARB/07/24) - Award (18 June 2010)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0396.pdf>

- * *Ioannis Kardassopoulos and Ron Fuchs v The Republic of Georgia* (ICSID Case No ARB/05/18 and ARB/07/15) - Award (3 March 2010)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C63/DC3353_En.pdf
- * *Jan de Nul N.V. and Dredging International N.V. v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/04/13) - Award (6 November 2008)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0440.pdf>
- * *Marfin Investment Group Holdings S.A., Alexandros Bakatselos and Others v Republic of Cyprus* (ICSID Case No ARB/13/27) - Award (26 July 2018)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10149.pdf>
- * *Metalclad Corporation v The United Mexican States* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/97/1) - Award (30 August 2000)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C155/DC542_En.pdf
- * *Mr Kristian Almås and Mr Geir Almås v The Republic of Poland* (PCA Case No 2015-13) - Award (27 June 2016)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7531.pdf>
- * *Noble Ventures, Inc. v Romania* (ICSID Case No ARB/01/11) - Award (12 October 2005)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0565.pdf>
- * *Saint-Gobain Performance Plastics Europe v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/12/13) - Decision on Liability and the Principles of Quantum (30 December 2016)
Available at:
https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw8286_0.pdf
- * *Southern Pacific Properties (Middle East) Limited v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/84/3) - Award on the Merits (20 May 1992)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C135/DC671_En.pdf
- * *Tenaris S.A. and Talta – Trading e Marketing Sociedade Unipessoal LDA v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/26) - Award (29 January 2016)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C1820/DC7492_En.pdf

- * *The Prosecutor v Dusko Tadic*, Case No IT-94-1-A, Appeals Chamber, Merits Judgment (15 July 1999)
Available at:
<https://www.icty.org/x/cases/tadic/acjug/en/tad-aj990715e.pdf>
- * *Tulip Real Estate Investment and Development Netherlands B.V. v Republic of Turkey* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/28) - Award (10 March 2014)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw3126.pdf>
- * *Tulip Real Estate Investment and Development Netherlands B.V. v Republic of Turkey* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/28) - Decision on Annulment (30 December 2015)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7037.pdf>
- * *UAB E Energija (Lithuania) v Republic of Latvia* (ICSID Case No ARB/12/33) - Award (22 December 2017)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw9481.pdf>
- * *Unión Fenosa Gas, S.A. v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/14/4) - Award (31 August 2018)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10061.pdf>

➤ Other instruments and documents

- * Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts (2001)
Available at:
https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/draft_articles/9_6_2001.pdf
- * Draft articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, with Commentaries (2001)
Available at:
https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/commentaries/9_6_2001.pdf

15.2 Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness

➤ IAs and other treaties

- * United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland–Republic of Argentina BIT (1990)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/126/download>

- * United States of America–Argentine Republic BIT (1991)

Available at:

<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/127/download>

➤ Awards, decisions, judgments and opinions

- * *Archer Daniels Midland Company and Tate & Lyle Ingredients Americas, Inc. v The United Mexican States* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/04/5) - Award (21 November 2007)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C43/DC782_En.pdf

- * *BG Group Plc and The Republic of Argentina* (UNCITRAL) - Final Award (24 December 2007)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0081.pdf>

- * *Cargill, Incorporated v United Mexican States* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/05/2) - Award (18 September 2009)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C60/DC1992_En.pdf

- * *CMS Gas Transmission Company v The Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/01/8) - Award (12 May 2005)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C4/DC504_En.pdf

- * *Corn Products International, Inc. v The United Mexican States* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/04/1) - Decision on Responsibility (15 January 2008)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C29/DC1012_En.pdf

- * *Enron Corporation and Ponderosa Assets, L.P. v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/01/3) - Award (22 May 2007)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0293.pdf>

- * *LG&E Energy Corp., LG&E Capital Corp., LG&E International Inc. v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/02/1) - Decision on Liability (3 October 2006)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C208/DC627_En.pdf

- * *Sempra Energy International v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/02/16) - Award (28 September 2007)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C8/DC694_En.pdf

- * *Sempra Energy International v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/02/16) - Decision on the Argentine Republic's Application for Annulment of the Award (29 June 2010)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C8/DC1550_En.pdf

- * *Unión Fenosa Gas, S.A. v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/14/4) - Award (31 August 2018)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10061.pdf>

- * *Urbaser S.A. and Consorcio de Aguas Bilbao Bizkaia, Bilbao Biskaia Ur Partzuegoa v The Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/07/26) - Award (8 December 2016)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C255/DC9852_En.pdf

➤ Other instruments and documents

- * Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts (2001)

Available at:

https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/draft_articles/9_6_2001.pdf

- * Draft articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, with Commentaries (2001)

Available at:

https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/commentaries/9_6_2001.pdf

15.3 Reparation

➤ IIs and other treaties

- * Australia–Oriental Republic of Uruguay BIT (2019)

Available at:

<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5853/download>

- * Canada–Republic of Moldova BIT (2018)

Available at:

<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5806/download>

- * Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific Partnership (CPTPP) (2018)

Available at:

<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5672/download>

- * Energy Charter Treaty (1994)
Available at:
<https://www.energycharter.org/fileadmin/DocumentsMedia/Legal/ECTC-en.pdf>
 - * Federal Republic of Nigeria–Republic of Singapore BIT (2016)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5410/download>
 - * Republic of Belarus–India BIT (2018)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5724/download>
 - * Republic of Mauritius–Arab Republic of Egypt BIT (2014)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/3285/download>
 - * Slovak Republic–Islamic Republic of Iran BIT (2016)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/3601/download>
 - * State of Israel–Japan BIT (2017)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/5849/download>
- Awards, decisions, judgments and opinions
- * *AES Corporation and Tau Power B.V. v Republic of Kazakhstan* (ICSID Case No ARB/10/16) - Award (1 November 2013)
Available at:
https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw8205_0.pdf
 - * *Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela, C.A. v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/00/5) - Award (23 September 2003)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C192/DC610_En.pdf
 - * *Biwater Gauff (Tanzania) Ltd v United Republic of Tanzania* (ICSID Case No ARB/05/22) - Award (24 July 2008)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0095.pdf>
 - * *Caratube International Oil Company LLP and Mr Devincci Salah Hourani v Republic of Kazakhstan* (ICSID Case No ARB/13/13) - Award (27 September 2017)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C2923/DC11204_En.pdf

- * *Case Concerning Elettronica Sicula S.p.A. (ELSI) (United States of America v Italy)*, Judgment of 20 July 1989

Available at:

<https://www.icj-cij.org/files/case-related/76/076-19890720-JUD-01-00-EN.pdf>

- * *Case Concerning the Factory at Chorzów (Germany v Polish Republic)* (Merits), Judgment of 13 September 1928

Available at:

https://www.icj-cij.org/files/permanent-court-of-international-justice/serie_A/A_17/54_Usine_de_Chorzow_Fond_Arret.pdf

- * *CMS Gas Transmission Company v The Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/01/8) - Award (12 May 2005)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C4/DC504_En.pdf

- * *Compañía del Desarrollo de Santa Elena, S.A. v The Republic of Costa Rica* (ICSID Case No ARB/96/1) - Final Award (17 February 2000)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C152/DC539_En.pdf

- * *Crystalllex International Corporation v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/11/2) - Award (4 April 2016)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7194.pdf>

- * *Desert Line Projects LLC v The Republic of Yemen* (ICSID Case No ARB/05/17) - Award (6 February 2008)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C62/DC791_En.pdf

- * *EDF International S.A., SAUR International S.A. and León Participaciones Argentinas S.A. v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/03/23) - Award (11 June 2012)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita1069.pdf>

- * *Europe Cement Investment & Trade S.A. v Republic of Turkey* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/07/2) - Award (13 August 2009)

Available at:

<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0311.pdf>

- * *Garanti Koza LLP v Turkmenistan* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/20) - Award (19 December 2016)

Available at:

http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C1700/DC9872_En.pdf

- * *Gold Reserve Inc. v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/09/1) - Award (22 September 2014)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw4009.pdf>
- * *Ioan Micula, Viorel Micula, S.C. European Food S.A., S.C. Starmill S.R.L. and S.C. Multipack S.R.L. v Romania* (ICSID Case No ARB/05/20) - Award (11 December 2013)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw3036.pdf>
- * *Koch Minerals Sarl, Koch Nitrogen International Sarl v The Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/19) - Award (30 October 2017)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw9397.pdf>
- * *Joseph Charles Lemire v Ukraine* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/18) - Award (28 March 2011)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/cases/614>
- * *Merrill and Ring Forestry L.P. v The Government of Canada* (ICSID Case No UNCT/07/1) - Award (31 March 2010)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0504.pdf>
- * *Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. S.A. v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/99/6) - Award (12 April 2002)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C182/DC595_En.pdf
- * *Mining Corporation v Republic of Perú* (ICSID Case No ARB/14/21) - Partial Dissenting Opinion of Prof Philippe Sands QC (30 November 2017)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10107.pdf>
- * *Monsieur Joseph Houben v Republic of Burundi* (ICSID Case No ARB/13/7) - Award (12 January 2016)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7220.pdf>
- * *Mr Franck Charles Arif v Republic of Moldova* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/23) - Award (8 April 2013)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw1370.pdf>

- * *MTD Equity Sdn. Bhd. and MTD Chile S.A. v Republic of Chile* (ICSID Case No ARB/01/7) - Award (25 May 2004)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita0544.pdf>
- * *Murphy Exploration & Production Company-International v The Republic of Ecuador* (UNCITRAL, PCA Case No 2012-16) - Partial Final Award (6 May 2016)
Available at:
<https://pcacases.com/web/sendAttach/2119>
- * *LG&E Energy Corp., LG&E Capital Corp., LG&E International Inc. v Argentine Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB/02/1) - Award (25 July 2007)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C208/DC786_En.pdf
- * *Novenergia II – Energy & Environment (SCA) (Grand Duchy of Luxembourg), SICAR v The Kingdom of Spain* (SCC Case No 2015/063) - Final Arbitral Award (15 February 2018)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw9715.pdf>
- * *Occidental Petroleum Corporation and Occidental Exploration and Production Company v The Republic of Ecuador* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/11) - Decision on Provisional Measures (17 August 2007)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C80/DC661_En.pdf
- * *Occidental Petroleum Corporation and Occidental Exploration and Production Company v The Republic of Ecuador* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/11) - Award (5 October 2012)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C80/DC2672_En.pdf
- * *Oko Pankki Oyj (formerly called OKO Osuuspankkien Keskuspankki OYJ), VTB Bank (Deutschland) AG (formerly called Ost-West Handelsbank AG) and Sampo Bank PLC v The Republic of Estonia* (ICSID Case No ARB/04/6) - Award (19 November 2007)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C33/DC1931_En.pdf
- * *Oxus Gold v The Republic of Uzbekistan* (UNCITRAL) - Final Award (17 December 2015)
Available at:
https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7238_2.pdf

- * *Quiborax S.A., Non Metallic Minerals S.A. v Plurinational State of Bolivia* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/2) - Award (16 September 2015)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw4389.pdf>
- * *Quiborax S.A., Non Metallic Minerals S.A. v Plurinational State of Bolivia* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/2) - Partially Dissenting Opinion of Brigitte Stern (16 September 2015)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw4388.pdf>
- * *Rusoro Mining Limited v The Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/12/5) - Award (22 August 2016)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7507.pdf>
- * *Sistem Mühendislik İnşaat Sanayi ve Ticaret A.Ş. v Kyrgyz Republic* (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/06/1) - Award (9 September 2009)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/ita1074.pdf>
- * *Tenaris S.A. and Talta – Trading e Marketing Sociedade Unipessoal LDA v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/11/26) - Award (29 January 2016)
Available at:
http://icsidfiles.worldbank.org/icsid/ICSIDBLOBS/OnlineAwards/C1820/DC7492_Eng.pdf
- * *Unión Fenosa Gas, S.A. v Arab Republic of Egypt* (ICSID Case No ARB/14/4) - Award (31 August 2018)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10061.pdf>
- * *UP and C.D Holding Internationale v Hungary* (ICSID Case No ARB/13/35) - Award (9 October 2018)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw10075.pdf>
- * *Vestey Group Limited v Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (ICSID Case No ARB/06/4) - Award (15 April 2016)
Available at:
<https://www.italaw.com/sites/default/files/case-documents/italaw7230.pdf>
- * *Yukos Universal Limited (Isle of Man) v The Russian Federation* (UNCITRAL PCA Case No AA 227) - Final Award (18 July 2014)
Available at:
<https://pcacases.com/web/sendAttach/420>

➤ Other instruments and documents

- * Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts (2001)
Available at:
https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/draft_articles/9_6_2001.pdf
- * Draft articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, with Commentaries (2001)
Available at:
https://legal.un.org/ilc/texts/instruments/english/commentaries/9_6_2001.pdf
- * Indian Model Bilateral Investment Treaty (2015)
Available at:
<https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaty-files/3560/download>